



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, October 13, 2022

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

Join from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device:

<https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/96536699762?pwd=KzhoREg5eHgyUCtjV0NWY0lhUIMvQT09>

Passcode: 880017

Or join by phone:

Call: 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099

Webinar ID: 965 3669 9762

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Anna Epperson called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, October 13, 2022, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. The meeting is being held in this mode to protect public health and safety due to the COVID-19 virus and to comply with orders issued by the governor, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services and/or the Washtenaw County Health Department and the City of Ann Arbor. We intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person meeting. However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 978 6401 4515 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 7 - David Rochlen, Jessica Quijano, Kathryn Fortener, Chair
Anna Epperson, Robert White, Jennifer Ross, and Beverly
K Willis

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

No comment.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

F. HEARINGS

F-1. 22-1688 HDC22-1195; 1317 Broadway, New Siding; BHD

Attachments: 1317 Broadway Staff Report - Siding.pdf, 1317 Boadway Attachments.pdf, 1317 BROADWAY OWNERS MOTION REPORT.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners David Rochlen and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1317 Broadway Street, a contributing property in the

Broadway Historic District, to install vinyl siding over existing asphalt siding, without covering the scallops and leaving the historic wood trim exposed. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for synthetic replacement siding.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:4 - 3

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 3 - Secretary Quijano, Fortener, and Ross

F-2. [22-1689](#) HDC22-1196; 1341 Traver, Gazebo and Deck; BHD

Attachments: 1341 Traver Staff Report - Deck Gazebo.pdf, 1341 Traver Gazebo Attachments.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners David Rochlen and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, Seconded by Bob White, that the

Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1341 Traver, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to add a 10' x 10' backyard gazebo on a 12' x 14' paver patio, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for residential patios and decks and residential accessory structures, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2 and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:7 - 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, Ross, and K Willis

Nays: 0

F-3. [22-1690](#) HDC22-1198; 121 Crest, Rear Addition & Rotate Garage; OWSHD

Attachments: 121 Crest Staff Report - Addition, Move Garage.pdf, 121 Crest Attachments.pdf, 121 Crest - Porch Steps.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners David Rochlen and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

MOTION ON ADDITION, etc.

Moved by Beverly Willis, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the application at 121 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a two-story rear addition and deck, and an air conditioning unit on the north side of the house, and remove the chimney. The work as amended is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for additions, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

VOTE ON ADDITION, ETC.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the amended motion carried. Vote:7 - 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 7 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, Ross, and K Willis

Nays: 0

MOTION ON GARAGE AND DRIVEWAY:

Moved by Jessica Quijano, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the application at 121 Crest Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to rotate the garage to face south instead of west and add a new asphalt driveway and curb cut from West Washington Street, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and

Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for residential accessory structures and paved areas.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

VOTE ON GARAGE AND DRIVEWAY:

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 1 - 6

Request was denied.

Yeas: 1 - White

Nays: 6 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, Ross, and K Willis

F-4. [22-1691](#) HDC22-1200; 514 W Madison, Rebuild Front Porch; OWSHD

Attachments: 514 W Madison Staff Report - Front porch rebuild.pdf, 514 W Madison Attachments.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners David Rochlen and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please

see available video format]

Application was withdrawn by property owner at the meeting.

- F-5. [22-1692](#) ~~HDC22-1201; 543 Detroit, Alter Windows and Doors; BHD -~~
POSTPONED

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher noted the Public Hearing needed to be held since it was advertised, while the Application would be postponed to a future meeting given it was incomplete.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Application was unanimously postponed.

- F-6. [22-1693](#) HDC22-1202; 404 S First, Rear Addition; OWSHD

Attachments: 404 S First Staff Report - Addition.pdf, 404 S First Attachments.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners David Rochlen and Jennifer Ross visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 404 South First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct an addition on the southwest corner of the house with a second story that extends modestly over the rear of the garage, install a concrete parking pad, and remove the chimney, as proposed. The work is compatible in

exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for additions, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Yeas: 7 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, Ross, and K Willis

Nays: 0

G. NEW BUSINESS

G-1. [22-1694](#) Annual Election of Officers - Nominating Committee Report

Commissioner Bob White provided the Nominating report.

He noted that Anna Epperson, current Chairperson, Dave Rochlen, current Vice Chairperson, and Jessica Quijano, current Secretary, are all serving their first terms in their positions. If they are willing to continue for a second year, he suggested the Commission could vote on that, or if anyone else was interested in stepping into their positions, the Board would entertain their wishes and move in that direction.

The current slate of Officers agreed to continue for another year.

Jill Thacher explained that at next October's HDC elections the current Vice Chairperson and Secretary could agree to be nominated to Chairperson and Vice Chairperson, since the HDC Bylaws only allow Officers to serve a maximum of two terms in each position; but they aren't obligated to step up if other members are willing to serve in those positions.

The Historic District Commission unanimously approved the current slate of Officers to serve in their current positions for another term;

**Anna Epperson as the HDC Chairperson, David Rochlen as the
HDC Vice Chairperson, and Jessica Quijano as the HDC Secretary.**

Yeas: 7 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair
Epperson, White, Ross, and K Willis

Nays: 0

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [22-1695](#) August 11, 2022 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 8-11-2022 HDC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

**The August 11, 2022 Historic District Commission meeting minutes
were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to
City Council.**

H-2. [22-1696](#) September 8, 2022 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 9-8-2022 HDC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

**The September 8, 2022 Historic District Commission meeting
minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and
forwarded to City Council.**

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

*Jessica Quijano, HDC Representative to the Cobblestone Farms
reported that the City will take on refurbishing all of the windows as well as
the shutters on the Cobblestone Farm house. After refurbishing, the
shutters will be fully operational and will be able to be used to protect the
windows. She explained the City estimates this work will happen over the
coming year.*

J. ASSIGNMENTS

**J-1. Review Committee: Monday, December 5, 2022 at 12 Noon for the Thursday,
December 8, 2022 Regular Meeting**

*Beverly Willis and Anna Epperson volunteered for the December 5th,
2022 HDC Review Committee meeting at 12:00 noon.*

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

None

L. **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS****M.** **COMMUNICATIONS****M-1.** **22-1697** Various Communications to the HDC**Attachments:** 1317 BROADWAY OWNERS MOTION REPORT.pdf**Received and Filed****N.** **ADJOURNMENT****The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:57 pm.**

Anna Epperson, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Mia Gale, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.