



City of Ann Arbor

Meeting Minutes - Final

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Thursday, March 10, 2022

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

**This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and
online at a2gov.org/watchCTN**

**To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247
or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 978 6401 4515**

Join from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device:

<https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/97864014515?pwd=MXRoUjU0U1FKa3ZwSExKbmpmR1BvUT09>

Passcode: 590167

Or join by phone:

Call: 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099

Webinar ID: 978 6401 4515

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Anna Epperson called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm, stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, March 10, 2022, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. The meeting is being held in this mode to protect public health and safety due to the COVID-19 virus and to comply with orders issued by the governor, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services and/or the Washtenaw County Health Department and the City of Ann Arbor. We intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person meeting. However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 978 6401 4515 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher was present and called the roll.

Historic District Commission members, Epperson, Fortener, Quijano, Rochlen, Ross, White, and Willis, were physically present at City Hall of Ann Arbor, 301 E Huron Street, Ann Arbor, Michigan. Administrative Assistant Kristen Vander Lugt, was present via Zoom.

Present: 7 - David Rochlen, Jessica Quijano, Kathryn Fortener, Chair
Anna Epperson, Robert White, Jennifer Ross, and Beverly
K Willis

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

No comment.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

F. HEARINGS

F-1 [22-0462](#) HDC22-023 524 S First; Rear Addition; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 524 South First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to: construct a 195 square foot addition and a 15' by approximately 12' wood deck on the rear of the home. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for additions and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Yeas: 7 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, Ross, and K Willis

Nays: 0

F-2. [22-0463](#) HDC22-038 220 S Seventh; Rear Addition and Garage; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Garage:

Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission approve with conditions and issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 220 South Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace a modern garage with a taller garage in the same footprint, on the condition that the door details are reviewed by staff in a separate application. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for additions and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Ross expressed concern with the added height to the parcel if both the garage and house height additions were to be approved. She said she could support the garage, but not the house at this time.

White pointed out that this parcel is the lowest in the surrounding area with taller buildings around them, and everyone else around them will be looking down at their house, even with the added proposed heights.

Rochlen expressed struggling with the fact that the parcel, being in the floodplain, doesn't allow the owners to simply build a neat addition onto the back of the house, they are forced to use the same footprint and can only go up in height. All these limitations affect the percentage of additions to original house size. He asked if the proposed additions will minimize the historic character of the property or not.

Quijano agreed, adding that all the limitations given to this property, limits the property owners in their proposed desire to bring the house back to its historic origin, which she felt should have some weight in their decision.

Epperson agreed, noting it's a very tricky challenge; there is some

question as to how large the original house actually was (given that it was moved on site from another location). She expressed that the lot lends itself to a flexible spatial relationship, and the footprint won't expand. The roof height as it moves towards the back of the house becomes the problem for her. She felt otherwise they are meeting the majority of the guidelines. She felt the proposed design was very thoughtful.

Vote on Garage:

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Yeas: 7 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, Ross, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Addition:

Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 220 South Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a second-floor rear addition on top of existing modern rear additions, on the following conditions: that the clapboard siding is wood or cementitious with an exposure similar to the lap siding in the house's front gable; and that the addition's windows and door are reviewed by staff in a separate application. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for additions and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Vote on Addition:

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 – 1

Yeas: 6 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 1 - Ross

5 Minute Break

F-3. [22-0464](#) HDC22-039 530 N Division; Front Yard Patio; OFWHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and Anna Epperson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 530 North Division Street, a non-contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to alter the previously approved lower front entrance by constructing a front patio with a cut stone retaining wall, slightly realign the structure to be parallel to the street, make minor window modifications, and composite lap cladding on the front and fiber cement board cladding on the rear wing of the building, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to All New Construction and New Construction in Historic Residential Settings.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7 – 0

Yeas: 7 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Secretary Quijano, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, Ross, and K Willis

Nays: 0

- F-4. [22-0465](#) HDC22-040 808 W Washington; Replace Windows; OWSHD WITHDRAWN
Agenda item withdrawn by the Applicant.

G. NEW BUSINESS

- G-1. [22-0466](#) HDC Retreat Scheduling

The Commission agreed to hold their Annual HDC Retreat on Saturday April 16, 2022 from 9:00 am to Noon.

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- H-1. [22-0469](#) January 13, 2022 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

The January 13, 2022 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

- H-2. [22-0470](#) February 10, 2022 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

The Commission unanimously postponed the February 10, 2022 HDC meeting minutes to the next meeting.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J. ASSIGNMENTS

- J-1. **Review Committee: Monday, April 11, 2022 at 5pm for the April 14, 2022 Regular Meeting**

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Beverly Willis volunteered for the April 11, 2022 HDC Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

- K-1. [22-0467](#) February 2022 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

M. COMMUNICATIONS

- M-1. [22-0468](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:34 pm.

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Anna Epperson, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Mia Gale, Administrative Assistant