

# City of Ann Arbor Formal Minutes - Final

301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104 http://a2gov.legistar.com/ Calendar.aspx

**City Planning Commission** 

Tuesday, May 17, 2022

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

# This meeting will be broadcast on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and at a2gov.org/watchCTN

Public comment can be made in person, or by calling: 877 853 5247 or 888 788 0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

Please click this URL to join this hybrid meeting via Zoom.

https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/97766341226?pwd=akdzTVllcnBBaGJNSIZJdFpDdGUrdz09 Passcode: 882985

Or join by phone: Call: 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Webinar ID: 977 6634 1226

Please note it is possible that telephone or electronic public comment may encounter technical difficulties that prevent your participation. For the greatest assurance that your comments will be heard, submit them in writing ahead of the meeting or attend in person.

# 1. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Shannan Gibb-Randall called the meeting to order at 7:05 PM, in Council Chambers at City Hall of Ann Arbor.

# 2. ROLL CALL

Brett Lenart, City of Ann Arbor Planning Manager, called the roll.

All Commissioners attended the meeting in-person.

**Present** 7 - Gibb-Randall, Abrons, Hammerschmidt, Disch, Lee, Clarke, and Wyche

Absent 2 - Mills, and Sauve

#### 3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Wonwoo Lee, seconded by Donnell Wyche, to approve the Agenda. The Agenda was approved unanimously as presented.

# 4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

**4-a. 22-0892** May 4, 2022 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 5-4-2022 CPC Minutes.pdf

Moved by Lisa Disch, Seconded by Ellie Abrons, to Approve the May 4, 2022 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes.
Unanimously Approved and forwarded to the City Council.

- 5. REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER,
  PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN
  COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS
- 5-a. City Council

Councilmember Disch reported from last night's City Council meeting; Council passed the City's \$500 M budget, which includes \$700,000 for the Master (Comprehensive) Plan Update.

5-b. Planning Manager

Brett Lenart added that the approved budget might also contain an additional staff position.

Commissioner Donnell Wyche noted that Council also reappointed Commissioners Lee, Hammerschmidt, and Abrons, to the Planning Commission last night.

- 5-c. Planning Commission Officers and Committees
- 5-d. Written Communications and Petitions

**22-0893** Various Communications to City Planning Commission

<u>Attachments:</u> McDaniel-Hodges.pdf, Appleyard.pdf, Two Tracks

Acres.pdf, 330 Detroit Street Development Farmers Market Concerns.pdf, 330 Detroit St. Proposal - Request for Staging Area on Fifth.pdf, 330 N. Detroit St comment Lisa Young.pdf, Ann Arbor Planning Goetz letter.pdf, Westphal.pdf, Pittsfield Charter Twp - Draft Master

Plan.pdf

#### Received and Filed

6. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

Seeing no speakers, Vice Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Comment.

# 7. PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING

**22-0894** Public Hearings Scheduled for Tuesday, June 7, 2022 Planning Commission Meeting

Attachments: 6-7-2022 Notice of Public Hearing.pdf

Received and Filed

- 8. REGULAR BUSINESS Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing, and Commission Discussion of Each Item
- 8-a. 22-0895

  330 Detroit Street Site Plan for Planning Commission Approval Two existing buildings are proposed to be removed to accommodate a 5-story building that includes 14 residential units, 23 on-site parking spaces, and 1,850 square feet of ground floor retail space. Pedestrian and vehicular access will be from N. Fifth Avenue and Detroit Street. Zoning is D2 (Downtown Interface) the lot size is 9,879 square feet (0.23-acre parcel) and the site is located at 303, 312 and 314 Detroit Street. Staff Recommendation: Approval

Attachments: Staff Report 330 Detroit St w Maps 5-17-2022 CPC.pdf,

330 N Detroit St Site Plan 3-22-22.pdf, 330 N. Detroit St

Architectural Elev.pdf

PROJECT PRESENTATION:

The following individuals were available to answer any enquiries.

Greg Copp, P.E. MAVD, 2723 S State Street, Suite 250, Ann Arbor, Developer and Petitioner.

Thomas Fitzsimmons, Huron Contracting LLC, P.O. Box 3783, Ann Arbor, Contractor.

Marc Rueter, Architect.

Jim Scrivens, Rueter Architects,

Kathy Keinath, Macon Engineering LLC, PO Box 314, Chelsea, Michigan, Project Engineer.

#### STAFF REPORT:

Matt Kowalski, City Planner, was available for comments and questions.

#### PUBLIC HEARING:

Matthew Banks, Detroit Street Filling Station – Looking forward to working with development team on their terrific building. Our concerns are about our operation during the building is under construction. We are veterans of construction. Losing utilities is a huge problem for us, we support a lot of people that can't. Looking for a voice on construction staging, including hours, noise, etc. MAV has been very straightforward and understanding. We want everyone to do well.

Lisa Young, Chair of the Market Advisory Commission, read (attached) letter from Ms. Goetz. The construction phase of this could be adverse to the market. Many of the businesses in the city were lost in the City. If the City sees fit to approve, this should include Fifth Street for phasing and limited construction during mealtimes. It should not be developed at the sacrifice of these existing businesses.

Chair of the Public Market Commission – We are concerned about the construction phase of the project. The Ann Arbor farmer's market has been the heart of the local food economy for a century, and supports food and farming businesses. We are concerned about the construction, not the building. The construction should be minimized in the following ways. Develop a plan in conversation and regular meetings and pay specific attention to parking on Detroit Street.

Ken Garber, 28 Haverhill Court, Ann Arbor, urged the Commission to take the concerns of the public regarding construction staging. He read from a prepared statement, noting the proposed project will be LEED Gold, geothermal heating and cooling, and operable windows. Geothermal was not presented during the presentation this evening. Does the petitioner still intend to use geothermal heating. LEED gold does little by itself as compared to electrification.

Stefanie Stauffer, Market Manager – Want to highlight concerns about staging in Detroit Street as part of our market. Want to make sure no construction is happening during the Wednesday and Saturday markets.

We also use Detroit Street for our vendors to park and unload their facilities. Want to make sure this project doesn't have a detrimental impact on the market.

Seeing no further speakers, Vice-Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Wonwoo Lee, Seconded by Sara Hammerschmidt, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission approves the 330 Detroit Site Plan (303 Detroit Street) dated March 22, 2022, as the site plan complies with all applicable requirements of the Unified Development Code, and other applicable laws, ordinances, standards, and regulations.

# COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

#### AMENDMENT I:

Moved by Wonwoo Lee, Seconded by Lisa Disch to amend the motion as follows:

# Conditioned upon the following:

The petitioner and City Staff (including DDA, Parks and Recreation) proactively work to minimize the negative impacts to the Kerrytown business district during construction, through collaboration with existing businesses, routine stakeholder conversations, and updates, toward the goal of minimizing adverse impacts while supporting the construction of this building.

On a roll call vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 7 - 0

Yeas: 7 - Shannan Gibb-Randall, Ellie Abrons, Sara

Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira

Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Sarah Mills, and Elizabeth Sauve

8-b. <u>22-0896</u> Proposed Amendments to Ann Arbor City Code Chapter 55 Unified <u>Development Code</u> - Amendments to the Unified Development Code (UDC) Sections 5.16.1.A (Residential Occupancy), 5.16.2.A and B (Adult Day Care Center, Child Care Center), 5.16.3.J (Outdoor Recreation), 5.16.3.P (Transit Corridor Development), 5.16.4.B (Nonprofit Corporations), 5.16.6.C (Drive-Through Facilities), 5.16.6.G (Group Day Care Home), and Section 5.19 (Parking Standards) are being considered to eliminate minimum parking requirements for all uses, eliminate or consolidate some parking use categories, eliminate the option for off-site bicycle parking, change the weight limit for vehicles parked in driveways, simplify the requirements for electric vehicle parking, and change, reformat, and include the TC1 district in the special parking district regulations. These changes will enable reduced impervious surfaces, encourage land to be used more efficiently, incentivize the construction of new residential uses, reduce the cost of constructing new residential uses, and support transit services. Staff Recommendation: Approval

#### Attachments:

Staff Report for May 17 2022 Parking Amendments w Attachments.pdf, Ordinance to Amend UDC (Parking Standards).pdf

Commissioner Wonwoo Lee recused himself from taking part in the discussion and action of this agenda item, due to a conflict of interest, given that his employer owns property in this TC1 Zoning District. He removed himself from the Council Chambers.

# STAFF REPORT:

Jeff Kahan, Senior City Planner, provided the presentation of the proposed amendments.

### PUBLIC HEARING:

Brian Chambers, speaking about the TC1 zoning district said, I don't believe that Ann arbor residents envisioned parking decks going in the TC1 zoning districts. Remove that language that doesn't encourage parking decks.

Seeing no further speakers, Vice-Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Sara Hammerschmidt, Seconded by Lisa Disch, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the amendments to Chapter 55 Unified Development Code, Sections 5.16 and 5.19 regarding proposed modifications to the City's Off-Street Parking requirements.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented amendments and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

#### **AMENDMENT I:**

Moved by Donnell Wyche, Seconded by Ellie Abrons, to amend the motion as follows:

To strike Deferred Parking Regulations.

On a roll call vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 6 - 0

Yeas: 6 - Shannan Gibb-Randall, Ellie Abrons, Sara

Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Sadira Clarke, and Donnell

Wyche

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Sarah Mills, and Elizabeth Sauve

Recused: 1 - Wonwoo Lee

#### 9. OTHER BUSINESS

Commission Break at 9:40 pm.

Commission reconvened at 9:45 pm.

Wonwoo Lee rejoined the Commission in Council Chambers.

#### 9-a. 22-0897

Annual Comprehensive Plan Review - The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission and Planning & Development Services Unit review the City Comprehensive Plan on a regular basis. The City Comprehensive Plan consists of several plans, or "elements," that work together to describe a vision for the City's future and guide decisions about its land use, transportation, infrastructure, environment, housing, and public facilities. The adopted plan elements can be found on the City's website at <a href="https://www.a2gov.org/compplan">www.a2gov.org/compplan</a> - As part of an annual review, the Planning Commission is seeking comments about the City Comprehensive Plan, including elements that should be studied for possible change or new elements that should be added to the Plan. Staff Recommendation: Approval

<u>Attachments:</u> Comprehensive Plan Review Staff Report w Attachments-5-17-22.pdf

Planning Manager reviewed the process with the Commission.

Moved by Lisa Disch, Seconded by Sara Hammerschmidt, that the City Ann Arbor Planning Commission Approve the following resolutions:

# CITY OF ANN ARBOR PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION

#### 2022 - COMPREHENSIVE PLAN RESOLUTION

Whereas, The City Planning Commission is authorized by the Michigan Planning Enabling Act (P.A. 33 of 2008, as amended), to make and adopt a comprehensive plan for the City; and

Whereas, The City Comprehensive Plan serves as a guide for decisions and recommendations regarding the physical development of the City and for the implementation of related plans, policies and programs; and

Whereas, The Planning Commission held a public hearing on May 4, 2022 to gather input regarding the City Comprehensive Plan; and

Whereas, The Planning Commission has considered the documents below and concluded that based on many factors, including equity, climate change, and affordability, an extensive review and update to the City's Comprehensive Plan documents is warranted.

Resolved, The Planning Commission hereby affirms the following documents to constitute the elements of the City Comprehensive Plan:

- 1. Natural Features Master Plan (2004)
- 2. Downtown Plan (2009)
- 3. Land Use Element (2009)
- 4. South State Corridor Plan (2013)
- 5. Sustainability Framework (2013)
- 6. Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan (2016)
- 7. Treeline Allen Creek Urban Trail Master Plan (2018)
- 8. Moving Together Towards Vision Zero–Comprehensive Transportation Plan (2021);

Resolved, The Planning Commission recommends a full review and update to the City's Comprehensive Plan beginning in FY23 and commits to the Commission's leadership to undertake this process; and

Resolved, The Planning Commission recommends the allocation of city resources to solicit both consultant assistance and internal support of a comprehensive plan update process.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented plan and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

#### CITY OF ANN ARBOR PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION

# 2022 – COMPREHENSIVE PLAN RESOURCE DOCUMENTS RESOLUTION

Whereas, The Comprehensive Plan of the City of Ann Arbor is used by the City Planning Commission as a guide for decisions and recommendations regarding the physical development of the City and for the implementation of related plans, policies and programs; and

Whereas, several valuable studies and historical plans support the City Comprehensive Plan by providing additional detail for interpretation and implementation of the recommendations;

Resolved, the planning documents listed below shall be used by the Planning Commission and Planning staff as resource information in support of the City Comprehensive Plan:

- 1. Current Fiscal Year Capital Improvements Plan (2018-2023)
- 2. Fuller/Geddes/Conrail Corridor Study (1994)
- 3. Miller/Maple/Newport Traffic and Circulation Study (1995)
- 4. Briarwood Subarea Plan (1995)
- 5. Downtown Vision and Policy Framework (Calthorpe Study 2006)
- 6. Northeast Area Transportation Plan (2006)
- 7. Flood Mitigation Plan (2007)
- 8. Allen Creek Greenway Task Force Report (2007)
- 9. Washtenaw County Access Management Plan (2008)
- 10. Huron River and Impoundment Management Plan (2009)

- 11. Washtenaw Avenue Corridor Redevelopment Strategy (2010)
- 12. Downtown Design Guidelines (2011)
- 13. Connecting William Street Plan (2013)
- 14. Climate Action Plan (2013)
- 15. North Main Street/Huron River Corridor Vision for the Future Report (2013)
- 16. Reimagine Washtenaw Corridor Improvement Study (2014)
- 17. Washtenaw County Affordability and Economic Equity Analysis (2015);

Resolved, The Planning Commission recommends a full review and update to the City's Comprehensive Plan and the resource documents above in the coming years and commits to the Commission's leadership to undertake this process; and

Resolved, The Planning Commission recommends the allocation of resources to solicit both consultant assistance and internal support of a comprehensive plan update process.

On a roll call vote, the Vice Chair declared the resolutions passed unanimously. Vote: 7 - 0

Yeas: 7 - Shannan Gibb-Randall, Ellie Abrons, Sara

Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira

Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Sarah Mills, and Elizabeth Sauve

**9-b.** <u>22-0898</u> <u>2022-2023 City Planning Commission and Staff Work-Program</u> - Staff Recommendation: Approval

Attachments: FY23 Work Program Memo.pdf, CPC Work Program -

May 17 2022 Draft.pdf, CPC Work Program - Approved

May 17 2022.pdf

Planning Manager reviewed the Work-Program with the Commission.

Moved by Lisa Disch, Seconded by Donnell Wyche, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby adopts the City Planning Commission Work Program.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented Work-Program and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion,

please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the Vice Chair declared the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 7 – 0

Yeas: 7 - Shannan Gibb-Randall, Ellie Abrons, Sara

Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira

Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Sarah Mills, and Elizabeth Sauve

# 10. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)

None

# 11. COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

An overlay district that prohibits gas/in

# 12. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Lisa Disch, seconded by Wonwoo Lee, that the meeting be Adjourned at 10:10 pm. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

Shannan Gibb-Randall, Vice Chairperson

/mia gale

eComments for the Commission may be left via our Legistar calendar page (column to the very right) http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting.

Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.) Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website https://a2gov.org/watchctn . The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at https://a2gov.org/watchctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150

City Planning Commission regular meetings are transitioning to a hybrid meeting model. The City of Ann Arbor highly encourages the public to view and participate in public meetings remotely due to the high COVID-19 transmission rate in Washtenaw County. In order to prevent the transmission of COVID-19, protect the health of meeting attendees, minimize the possibility of disrupting the meeting, and thereby promote public participation by creating a safer meeting environment, City Council has established a regulation that all in-person attendees at meetings are required to wear a mask. See the Mask Requirement signage that is posted throughout City Hall. The City of Ann Arbor has existing COVID-19 safety rules that are required of visitors entering city facilities. If you choose to attend a meeting in-person, the following safety rules are expected to be observed. These include:

Masks - Required in Council Chambers. Masks are available at the guest services desk in the lobby of Larcom City Hall.

Physical Distancing - Individuals should be physically distanced from one another at least 6 feet.

Illness - Anyone diagnosed with COVID-19, who has symptoms of COVID-19, or has had recent close contact with someone with COVID-19, should not attend a public meeting.