

City of Ann Arbor Meeting Minutes - Final Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street Ann Arbor, MI 48104 http://a2gov.legistar.com/ Calendar.aspx

Thursday, April 11, 2019

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A CALL TO ORDER

Chair John Beeson called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 6 - John Beeson, Evan Hall, Max Cope, David Rochlen, Anna

Epperson, and Jessica Quijano

Absent: 1 - Robert White

C APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

<u>D</u> <u>AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)</u>

Jeff Crockett, 506 E. Kingsley, Ann Arbor, spoke in support of reconsideration of the status of 530-532 N Division Street. He said he walks past these houses every day, noting they look odd and are not compatible with surrounding houses. He spoke in support of the competence of Architect Marc Rueter, to create a redevelopment of the houses that would blend into the surrounding neighborhood. He continued speaking in support of the quality of work performed by Doug Selby on other sites, and felt the Historic District Commission should hold a public hearing on the consideration.

Ilene Tyler, 126 N Division Street, Ann Arbor, agreed with Crockett, adding that one resource change does not set a precedent. She spoke in support of reconsideration for sustainability and affordability, believing changes to 530-532 N Division Street would not alter historic districts.

Doug Selby, 711 Fountain Street, Ann Arbor, provided a handout to the Commission: a letter from Warren Widmayer, a property owner and

neighbor residing at 538 N Division Street. Selby explained his there have been lots of changes to the building and there is nothing remaining that one could tie to the other roof form. He spoke in support of reconsidering the ststus of 530-532 N Division Street.

E UNFINISHED BUSINESS

F HEARINGS

F-1 <u>19-0675</u> HDC19-023; 834 W Washington - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Evan Hall and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Ariel Adamson and James Jilek, 834 W Washington, owners were present to respond to enquiries.

Marc Rueter, Architect and applicant was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Max Cope, seconded by Evan Hall, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 834 W. Washington, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to enlarge an existing dormer, to build a new mudroom and porch behind an existing first floor bump out, to install two new skylights on the east and west roof surfaces, and to replace an existing vent in the south (front) gable with a window in the same opening. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for

Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, and District or Neighborhood Setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Vice Chair Cope, Rochlen,

Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - White

F-2 19-0676 HDC19-047; 309 S Main - New Storefront - MSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Evan Hall and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Chris Biggers, 127 E Commerce, Milford, applicant, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Max Cope, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 309 S. Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District to replace four single and two triple vinyl windows on the front elevation with aluminum clad windows; and

replace the current wood storefront with an aluminum storefront system, two metal doors, and stone cladding surrounding the windows; on the following conditions: that the triple windows replicate the existing proportions and style of windows shown in current photographs, and the owner supply samples of the cast stone and aluminum storefront, and that the architect provide jamb and sill details for staff review prior to permits being issued. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts, windows, and signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts, windows, and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the amended motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Vice Chair Cope, Rochlen,

Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - White

G NEW BUSINESS

G-1 19-0674 530 N Division Reconsideration of Contributing/Noncontributing Status

Moved by Max Cope, seconded by Jessica Quijano, that the Commission hold a public hearing to consider the matter further to determine if 530-532 N Division Street to classify the status of contributing or non-contributing resource.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and

discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Yeas: 6 - Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Vice Chair Cope, Rochlen,

Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - White

G-2 <u>19-0728</u> HDC Awards

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented material and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Evan Hall, that the Historic District Commission accept the HDC Annual Award Nominations as presented by staff and the Awards Committee 2019. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. Vote 6-0

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1 19-0677 Minutes of the March 14, 2019 HDC Meeting

The Minutes were unanimously Approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

<u>I</u> <u>REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS</u>

J ASSIGNMENTS

J-1 Review Committee: Monday, May 6, 2019 at 5 PM for the May 9, 2019 Regular Meeting

Anna Epperson and Jessica Quijano volunteered for the May HDC Review Committee.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

K-1 19-0678 March 2019 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Evan Hall reported that last week there was a sales team from Anderson Windows in his neighborhood that was canvassing in the Old West Side Historic District. Hall informed them that they were in a historic district where window replacements need HDC approval before being replaced. The sales team did not know about the historic district or associated pre-approvals.

John Beeson expressed concern about the height of a certain retaining wall approved by the Commission on Seventh Street. He requested staff and the Commission to keep an eye on it.

M COMMUNICATIONS

M-1 19-0679 Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:04 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

John Beeson, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/