



City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Meeting Minutes Park Advisory Commission

Tuesday, December 18, 2012

4:00 PM

City Hall, 301 E. Huron Street

A CALL TO ORDER

Chair Grand called the meeting to order at 4:07 p.m.

B ROLL CALL

Colin Smith called the roll.

Staff Present:

C. Smith, J. Straw, A. Kuras, D. Borneman, T. Rossele, G. Hearn; 6

Present: 9 - Timothy Berla, Chair Julie Berson Grand, John McCoy Lawter, Mike Anglin, Christopher Taylor, Karen Levin, Ingrid Ault, Alan Jackson, and Bob Galardi

Absent: 2 - Tim Doyle, and Melissa Stults

C APPROVAL OF AGENDA

A motion was made by Ault, seconded by Galardi, that the Agenda be Approved. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Tom Miree, 2710 Tuebingen Parkway, spoke in opposition of the location of the proposed dog park, which would be neighboring their New Hope Baptist Church. He praised the City's park system and showed an aerial view of the church's properties and outreach in the area.

Lawrence Brown, Trustee of New Hope Baptist Church, spoke in opposition of a dog park being located opposite to their church. He requested the City reconsider the placement of a dog park within West Park.

Sammie Hagan, Trustee of New Hope Baptist Church, spoke in opposition of the location of the dog park opposite their church. He asked the City to consider the safety of their people when visiting their church, since their parking lot would be neighboring the dog park.

Jhnita Porter, 2163 Champagne Drive, New Hope Baptist Church, spoke in opposition of the dog park location. She brought safety issues noting that they have church visitors that use the park. She said they have collected 130 signatures from their congregants who are in opposition to the dog park location. She said they would feel more comfortable if the dog park location were pushed further back into West Park.

Patricia Bova, 202 Lyn Ann Court, stated that she was speaking as a representative of 20 individuals who live across from Vet's Park Skate Park. She said Friends of Veteran Park, is requesting that the skate park be moved to the southwest corner of the park, noting the need for a buffer between the skate park and them.

Young man spoke of the need for a dog park in the Old West side area.

Cloyd Peters, 355 Skydale Drive, Trustee of New Hope Baptist Church, spoke in opposition of the location of the dog park. He brought safety concerns, noise issues, and the possibility that dog owners won't clean up after their dogs.

Virginia Gordon, 521 Cherry Drive, spoke in favor of a dog parks in local neighborhoods, noting that they create a sense of community.

Charles Straw, 1905 Timber Trail, New Hope Baptist Church, spoke in opposition of the location of the dog park and asked if the Project Grow location could be switched with the proposed location of the dog park.

Emmett Hodge, 1994 Pauline Blvd, groundskeeper for New Hope Baptist Church buildings, spoke in opposition to the location of the dog park and pointing out possible trash issues with the addition of the dog park.

Johndie Stevensson, 1645 Arbordale Drive, spoke in opposition to a dog park in West Park, and across from her church.

Carol Potter, 276 Lyn Anne Court, had questions on proposed noise and what the possibility was for skate-borders to use the newly created pedestrian paths in Vet's park.

Alan Haber, 531 Third Street, spoke in support of the library lot being a gathering place or community center for the community. He suggested an ice rink be installed in the winter and paid for by private funds. He said Wooster Park would also be a good location for a dog park.

E APPROVAL OF MINUTES

E-1 [12-1609](#) Park Advisory Commission Meeting Minutes of October 16, 2012

A motion was made by Berla, seconded by Levin, that the Minutes be Approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

E-2 [12-1610](#) Park Advisory Commission Special Meeting Minutes of December 4, 2012

A motion was made by Berla, seconded by Levin, that the Minutes be Approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

F SPECIAL PRESENTATIONS

F-1 [12-1611](#) Volunteer of the Year - Community High School

Dave Borneman presented the Mayoral Proclamation honoring Community High School Natural Area Preservation Volunteer of the Year 2012.

WHEREAS, Community High School students and staff have dedicated themselves to volunteering in the assistance of the Ann Arbor Parks through Natural Area Preservation; and

WHEREAS, Community High School students and staff have worked enthusiastically to improve City parks and natural areas by participating in a biannual day of service focused on invasive plant removal, trail maintenance, and tree planting; and

WHEREAS, The City of Ann Arbor appreciates the tireless work of volunteers in assistance in our parks;

AND WHEREAS, In honor of Community High School students and staff helping to promote and preserve natural areas we recognize Community High School as a Natural Area Preservation Volunteer of the Year.

NOW THEREFORE, I, John Hieftje, Mayor of Ann Arbor, Michigan, in recognition of these personal and volunteer endeavors, conducted to the greater good of everyone in our community, do hereby proclaim a commemoration of Community High School on October 24, 2012, in the City of Ann Arbor, and acknowledge the school as a Natural Area Preservation Volunteer of the Year.

*I hereby set my hand and seal
This the 24th day of October, 2012*

John Hieftje, Mayor

F-2 [12-1612](#) Volunteerism in the Parks - 2012

D. Borneman, along with Tina Rossele and Gayle Hearn gave an overview of the Natural Area Preservation and GIVE 365 programs and their volunteer efforts in the City's parks, throughout the year.

The Commission thanked staff for all of their great efforts and work.

G **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

G-1 [12-1613](#) Resolution to Recommend Approval of the Design for the Skate Park in Veterans Memorial Park

C. Smith gave a re-cap of the proposed Skate Park in Veterans Memorial Park, reviewing the process from its inception, six years ago, to the present time.

Trevor Staples, Chair of the Friends of Ann Arbor Skate Park, gave an up-date on their current efforts for the Skate Park in Vet's Park.

Amy Kuras, reviewed the location of the proposed skate park with the Commission and introduced Wally Holiday.

Wally Holiday, Designer of the skate park, gave a presentation and reviewed the design of the skate park with the Commission.

T. Berla said that he thought the skate park would be fenced in and not open.

Holiday said that the park is open with fencing around the skate 'bowls'.

T. Berla said that he can imagine kids riding their bikes through the park.

Holiday said the idea is to invite people into the park, giving it the feel of a community center.

A. Kuras said that there will be signage warning people of skaters in the park.

T. Berla asked if there will be benches in the skate park.

Holiday responded that they have incorporated rocks and benches in the shaded area of the park.

C. Smith made comparisons with the Argo Cascades and the Skate Park in that it will become a community facility for users as well as spectators.

A. Jackson asked if there would be amenities such as drinking fountains and waste receptacles.

C. Smith said, yes, and reviewed the plan with the Commission.

Jackson asked about the durability of the materials proposed and if choices are being made to minimize maintenance.

Holiday said that there will be landscaping in the park that will need maintenance, pointing out various materials they propose to incorporate.

Staples clarified terminology for the Commission.

Kuras explained that the City will pre-qualify contractors, that knows how to do the work right, which will insure durability. Kuras said they will be working with the Skate Park committee to make sure any possible trash and graffiti issues are kept under control.

Jackson asked about proposed color.

Holiday said colors in the concrete will be incorporated in the specs and will come down to budget availability.

Galardi asked how the concrete holds up in the cold.

Holiday said it does fine, since they are proposing to use a 4000 psi concrete with a re-bar construction base.

C. Smith commented that when the City considered designers, a pre qualifier was experience in building skate parks in similar weather conditions as Michigan.

C. Smith read the resolution as follows, noting that per the Memo of Intent the resolution would go to City Council for final approval ;

RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVING THE DESIGN FOR THE SKATE PARK IN VETERANS MEMORIAL PARK

Whereas, Prior to the design of the skate park in Veterans Memorial Park, a Memorandum of Intent (MOI) was agreed upon between the City of Ann Arbor and the Ann Arbor Skatepark Action Committee;

Whereas, the MOI states that PAC and City Council must approve the final Facility design prior to its construction;

Whereas, The design will exceed City storm water standards per Chapter 63 of the City Code;

Whereas, An extensive public process was conducted to obtain input into the location and design of the facility; and

Whereas, the design of the Facility is essentially complete,

RESOLVED: That the Park Advisory Commission recommends approval of the design of the Skatepark Facility to be located at Veterans Memorial Park.

A motion was made by Jackson, seconded by Levin, that the Resolution be Approved by the Commission.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

T. Berla commented that PAC was making a recommendation of approval to City Council and anyone interested in bringing concerns, were welcome to bring them to City Council.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried.

Yeas: 7 - RAC Rep. Berla, Chair Berson Grand, Lawter, Levin, Vice Chair Ault, Jackson, and Galardi

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Doyle, and Stults

G-2 [12-1614](#)

Resolution to Designate a Fenced Off-Leash Dog Park Area in West Park

A. Kuras gave a review of the proposed Skate Park in Veteran's Memorial Park, reviewing the process with the Commission.

C. Smith read the following resolution;

RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND DESIGNATING A FENCED OFF-LEASH DOG PLAY AREA IN WEST PARK

Whereas, Creation of additional dog parks within the City, and especially near the downtown area is a high priority of the Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan;

Whereas, the City Charter, Chapter 107, Section 9:45 requires that a dog play area be '...as designated by the Community Services Area Administrator, and upon approval by City Council', and;

Whereas, West Park on Chapin Street was chosen as a location that would best meet desired criteria for establishment of an off leash fenced dog play area,

RESOLVED, That the Park Advisory Commission recommend designating a fenced off leash dog play area in West Park as identified by the Community Services Area Administrator.

A motion was made by Lawter, seconded by Ault, that the Resolution be

Approved.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

C. Taylor asked staff about the safety concerns that were brought to the Commission, regarding the location of the dog park. He asked if there would be a fence around the dog park with a double gate.

A. Kuras said yes, and explained how the double gate with internal coral would work.

C. Taylor asked how tall the fence would be.

A. Kuras said approximately 4-5 foot tall.

M. Anglin asked about how usage limits would be set.

A. Kuras said it would be informal, and more of a dog park where dogs can socialize, given the size limitation of this specific location.

J. Lawter noted that size limits what can be done, but it doesn't limit the activities that can happen in terms of socializing. Lawter addressed concerns of noise and aggression, explaining that past experience has shown that those people who bring their dogs to a dog park are loving and caring pet owners who end up policing each other when issues arise. He said dog parks are often used as educational opportunities even for those who don't own dogs.

J. Lawter said the idea of switching places with the Project Grow site was interesting but the proposed dog park site has several large, mature trees which wouldn't be good for the gardens of Project Grow.

J. Lawter explained that the monetary investment in this dog park is not very much and if issues arise over noise, the City can always make the park go away. He asked those opposed to the dog park, to please give it a try and see if it works.

J. Grand asked if notices could be posted for hours of usage, taking into consideration the time of church services.

C. Smith said the problem with signage becomes enforcement, in that it might not be followed, without having staff in the park.

A. Jackson asked about noise in relation to distances and proximity of the proposed park location and if the other dog parks had experienced noise issues.

C. Smith said there hasn't been complaints in the other locations. He noted that there could be noise from other park activities in the parks as well. He offered a field trip to the dog parks for those interested.

I. Ault said her experience in using the dog parks is that dogs are busy doing other things and not necessary barking; she hoped that would be the case in this location as well.

T. Berla said he too, hasn't noticed noise or odor issues; and recognized the need to go creating the dog park responsibly and deal with issues if they arise. He said he felt it was important to follow up with the neighbors in the area to make sure their concerns are addressed so that this park doesn't become a problem.

K. Levin said she has visited several dog parks in New York and agreed with the self

policing that occurs, and that she hadn't notice any noise issues.

C. Taylor suggested that the resolution could be amended to include follow up from staff with interested neighbors and the church on the one year anniversary of the park.

The Commission agreed.

A. Kuras said that the City could do a trial run with temporary fencing, for a few months to see how it works, before investing in more permanent fencing.

C. Smith agreed, explaining that the Commission is voting on a designated area in West Park at this time with construction phase to come at a later date. He said there are alternatives through less permanent facilities, on a trial basis, that would allow them to work with the church to find a palatable solution.

M. Anglin said Parks has always been open to community concern and when there are noise issues in current parks, they are addressed through policing and complaints are acted on. He said the one-year follow-up doesn't mean that they won't act on complaints as they are documented within that period.

J. Lawter said that the proposed dog park is somewhat of an experiment and agreed that the resolution include language that the dog park be continuously monitored, re-visited or temporarily constructed.

A. Jackson asked that a sound level test be done as part of the one-year anniversary follow-up in order to have objective information available if noise does become a problem.

C. Smith read the following amended resolution:

RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND DESIGNATING A FENCED OFF-LEASH DOG PLAY AREA IN WEST PARK

Whereas, Creation of additional dog parks within the City, and especially near the downtown area is a high priority of the Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan;

Whereas, the City Charter, Chapter 107, Section 9:45 requires that a dog play area be '...as designated by the Community Services Area Administrator, and upon approval by City Council', and;

Whereas, West Park on Chapin Street was chosen as a location that would best meet desired criteria for establishment of an off leash fenced dog play area,

RESOLVED, *That staff and the Park Advisory Commission dog park sub-committee work with New Hope Baptist Church to discuss a trial run basis for the dog park;*

RESOLVED, *That staff will report back to PAC on the one-year anniversary of the implementation of the dog park with results including noise levels; and*

RESOLVED, *That the Park Advisory Commission recommend designating a fenced off leash dog play area in West Park as identified by the Community Services Area Administrator.*

On a voice vote, the Chair declared the amended resolution passed.

Yeas: 7 - RAC Rep. Berla, Chair Berson Grand, Lawter, Levin, Vice Chair Ault, Jackson, and Galardi

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Doyle, and Stults

G-3 [12-1615](#)

Resolution to Recommend Approval of a Contract with Renaissance Restorations, Inc. to Replace Roofs at Cobblestone Farms on the Event Barn and the Tincknor - Campbell House (\$120,450.00) and Appropriate Funds.

C. Smith presented the need for roof replacements at Cobblestone Farms.

C. Smith read the following resolution;

RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF A CONTRACT WITH RENAISSANCE RESTORATIONS, INC. TO REPLACE ROOFS AT COBBLESTONE FARM ON THE EVENT BARN AND THE TINCKNOR CAMPBELL HOUSE (\$120,450.00) AND APPROPRIATE FUNDS

Whereas, The event barn and the Tincknor Campbell House at Cobblestone Farm are both in need of major roof repair;

Whereas, An assessment of the structures at Cobblestone Farm rated the replacement of the roofs on these two structures as high priorities to preserve the integrity of the buildings;

Whereas, The project is an identified need in the current Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan;

Whereas, Competitive bids were received by Purchasing on November 5, 2012;

Whereas, Renaissance Restorations, Inc. submitted the lowest responsible bid;

Whereas, Renaissance Restorations, Inc. received Human Rights approval on November 5, 2012; and

Whereas, Funding for the project is available in unobligated fund balance from the existing Parks Maintenance and Capital Improvements Millage;

RESOLVED, That the Park Advisory Commission recommends the appropriation of \$120,450.00 from the unobligated fund balance in Park Maintenance and Capital Improvements Millage to fund the contract budget and construction contingency;

RESOLVED, That the Park Advisory Commission recommend approval of a contract with Renaissance Restorations, Inc. to replace the roofs on the Cobblestone Farm event barn and the Tincknor Campbell house, and approve a construction contingency of \$10,950.00 (10%) to cover potential contract change orders for a total contract amount of \$120,450.00 for the life of the project without regard to fiscal year.

A motion was made by Lawter, seconded by Ault, that the Resolution be Approved.

A. Jackson asked about the replacement cedar shake shingles.

A. Kuras said she is working with the Historic District Commission and Cobblestone

Farms on which type of cedar material will be acceptable replacements, which is reflected in the price contingency.

On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

Yeas: 7 - RAC Rep. Berla, Chair Berson Grand, Lawter, Levin, Vice Chair Ault, Jackson, and Galardi

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Doyle, and Stults

H NEW BUSINESS

I COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

I-1 [12-1616](#) Summary of PAC Retreat

J. Grand pointed the Commission to the PAC Summary of the Retreat in their packets.

B. Galardi asked if minutes of the retreat were available.

J. Grand said, yes, and that she would forward them to the Commission.

I-2 [12-1618](#) Appointment of Melissa Stults as PAC Representative to the Environmental Commission

J. Grand appointed Melissa Stults as PAC Representative to the Environmental Commission.

I-3 [12-1617](#) Approval of 2013 PAC Meeting Schedule

C. Smith presented the 2013 PAC Meeting Schedule.

J REPORTS FROM PARKS AND RECREATION MANAGER

C. Smith gave an update on the Traver Creek construction going on at Leslie Park. He offered to arrange a tour with the Washtenaw Water Resources Commission, if anyone was interested.

C. Smith reported that modifications were being worked on the last drop of the Argo Cascades in order to smooth it out, along with easing the navigation path between drops 4 and 5.

C. Smith reported that they had withdrawn the permit application for the white water features on November 9, 2012. He said since then, City staff have productively met with MDEQ and MDNR to work in collaboration to attempt to come up with an alternative design, to satisfy all parties.

C. Smith explained the Golf Fund memo included in the Commission packet.

K REPORT FROM MANAGER OF FIELD OPERATIONS

L REPORTS FROM RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION

M REPORTS FROM RELEVANT COMMISSIONS, COMMITTEES, BOARDS AND/OR TASK FORCES

J. Grand reported that City Council had approved two grant applications for 721 N. Main Street.

I. Ault reported that the Downtown Open Space Sub-Committee met and will be doing a walk-through of the Liberty Plaza together with the DDA, in an attempt to identify issues that have been raised.

J. Grand noted that this was Commissioner John Lawter's last meeting on PAC. She thanked him for his hard work on PAC and his work as a true advocate on behalf of the citizens of Ann Arbor.

Lawter thanked the Commission for a great learning experience over his past six years. He said he looks forward to continue the relationship with PAC and the City as a park steward or any other citizenry need they might have.

N PUBLIC COMMENTARY - GENERAL (3 Minutes per Speaker)

O CLOSED SESSION

P TRANSMITTALS

**P-1 [12-1619](#) City Council Items Update

 Received and Filed**

**P-2 [12-1620](#) Park Projects Update

 Received and Filed**

**P-3 [12-1621](#) City of Ann Arbor 2008-2013 Park Maintenance and Capital
 Improvements Millage Status

 Received and Filed**

**P-4 [12-1622](#) Memorandum Regarding Golf Courses and Enterprise/General Fund

 Received and Filed**

Q ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Berla, seconded by Jackson, that the Meeting be Adjourned. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx
- Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.