



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Draft

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, March 14, 2024

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson David Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, March 14, 2024, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll

Present: 6 - Chair David Rochlen, Jessica Quijano, Kathryn Fortener, Benjamin Calderon, Chip Smith, and Steve Kaplan

Absent: 1 - Jennifer Ross

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Seeing no speakers Chair Rochlen closed the Public Comment.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

E-1. [24-0324](#) Recognition of Commissioner Jessica Quijano

Chair Rochlen recognized Commissioner Quijano's departure from the Historic District Commission.

ROLL CALL

Commissioner Ross entered the meeting at 7:06 pm

Present: 7 - Chair David Rochlen, Jessica Quijano, Kathryn Fortener, Jennifer Ross, Benjamin Calderon, Chip Smith, and Steve Kaplan

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [24-0325](#) HDC24-0007; 216 N State Street, Egress Windows, OFWHD

Attachments: 216 N State SR egress window.pdf, 216 N State attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathryn Fortener and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Quijano seconded by Commissioner Calderon:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 216 North State Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to enlarge three existing basement window openings and install wood casement egress windows and wells on the east and south elevations, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, windows, and health and safety, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

A friendly amendment was made by Commissioner Fortener to clarify the location of the window being at the east elevation to south of the door

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 7-0.

Yeas: 7 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

F-2. [24-0326](#) HDC24-0008; 707 Lawrence Street, Egress Window, OFWHD

Attachments: 707 Lawrence SR egress window.pdf, 707 Lawrence attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathryn Fortener and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Quijano:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 707 Lawrence Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to enlarge an existing basement window opening and install a wood casement egress window and well and bollard on the west elevation, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, windows, and health and safety, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote

Yeas: 7 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

F-3. [24-0327](#) HDC24-0011; 1003 West Liberty, Pave Driveway, OWSHD

Attachments: 1003 W Liberty SR pave driveway.pdf, 1003 W Liberty attachments driveway.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathryn Fortener and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was not present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Ross seconded by Commissioner Quijano:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1003 and 1005 W Liberty Street, contributing properties in the Old West Side Historic District, to pave the driveway with concrete from the public right of way to either or both garages, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for paved areas and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 7-0.

F-4. 24-0328 HDC24-0012; 309 W William, Enclose Rear Porch, OWSHD

Attachments: 309 W William SR enclose porch enlarge window.pdf, 309 William Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathryn Fortener and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Quijano seconded by Commissioner Kaplan:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 309 West William Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to enclose a rear screen porch and enlarge a window on the rear elevation, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for new additions and windows, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for new additions, neighborhood setting, building site, and windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

A friendly amendment was made by Commissioner Fortener that windows to be 9 over 1 as opposed to 6 over 1

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 7-0

Yeas: 7 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

F-5. [24-0329](#) HDC24-0013; 820 E Kingsley, OFWHD

Attachments: 820 E Kingsley SR egress window.pdf, 820 E Kingsley attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathryn Fortener and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Quijano that

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 820 E Kingsley Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to enlarge an existing basement window and install an egress window and well on the south elevation, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, windows, and health and safety, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. **Vote 7-0.**

Yeas: 7 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

F-6. [24-0330](#) HDC24-0014; 808 W Washington, New Garage, OWSHD

Attachments: 808 W Washington SR new garage.pdf, 808 W Washington attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathryn Fortener and Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Calderon:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 808 West Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a garage with a concrete apron and install a casement window with a false muntin in the rear-facing attic gable to meet egress requirements, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the

surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for windows, safety codes and residential accessory structures, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for windows, neighborhood setting, and health and safety codes.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 7-0.

Yeas: 7 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Fortener:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 808 West Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to widen the driveway from West Washington to 10'6", pave it with concrete and extend the driveway to the rear corner of the house, and remove a landmark tree as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for windows, safety codes and residential accessory structures, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for windows, neighborhood setting, and health and safety codes.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion,

please see available video format]

Moved by Chair Rochlen seconded by Commissioner Kaplan to postpone the item to the April 11, 2024 HDC meeting

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion to postpone carried. Vote 7-0.

Yeas: 7 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

G. NEW BUSINESS

G-1. [24-0331](#) HDC Awards Committee Liaison

Historic District Coordinator Jill Thacker discussed the HDC Award Liaison and Commissioner Fortener was appointed

G-2. [24-0332](#) Cobblestone Farm Liaison

Historic District Coordinator Jill Thacher discussed the Cobblestone Farm Liaison and Commissioner Calderon was appointed

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [24-0333](#) February 8, 2024 HDC Meeting Minutes

Attachments: February 8, 2024 HDC Meeting Minutes.pdf

The February 8, 2024 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

None.

J. ASSIGNMENTS

- J-1.** [24-0334](#) Review Committee: Monday, April 8, 2024 at 5pm, for the Thursday, April 11, 2024 Regular Meeting

Historic District Coordinator Jill Thacher noted she will not be present for the Monday April 8, 2024 Review Committee. Commissioners Jennifer Ross and Steve Kaplan volunteered for the Monday, April 8, 2024 HDC Review Committee

K. **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

- K-1.** [24-0335](#) Annual Retreat Planning Update

Historic District Coordinator Jill Thacher discussed choosing a date for the HDC Annual Retreat. April 13, 2024 was selected as the date of the retreat.

L. **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

None.

M. **COMMUNICATIONS**

- M-1.** [24-0336](#) Various Communication to the HDC

Received and filed

N. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:15 pm

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Courtney Manor, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.