

# City of Ann Arbor Formal Minutes - Final

301 E. Huron Street Ann Arbor, MI 48104 http://a2gov.legistar.com/ Calendar.aspx

**Historic District Commission** 

Thursday, June 8, 2023

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

Join from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device:

https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/96536699762?pwd=KzhoREg5eHgyUCtjV0NWY0lhUlMvQT09 Passcode: 880017

Or join by phone:

Call: 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099

Webinar ID: 965 3669 9762

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS \*9 TO RAISE HANDS AND \*6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

# A. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson David Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, June 8, 2023, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

# B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

**Present:** 4 - Chair David Rochlen, Kathryn Fortener, Anna Epperson,

and Jennifer Ross

Absent: 1 - Jessica Quijano

# C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

# D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

No Comment.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS \*9 TO RAISE HANDS AND \*6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

### E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

# F. <u>HEARINGS</u>

**F-1.** <u>23-0984</u> HDC23-0080; 422 S Seventh, Rear Addition; OWSHD

<u>Attachments:</u> 422 S Seventh Staff Report -Rear Addition.pdf, 422 S

Seventh Drawings.pdf, Photos of 422 S 7th St.pdf

**HEARINGS**:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jennifer Ross and Kathy Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

**PUBLIC HEARING:** 

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Kathy Fortener, Seconded by Commissioner Anna Epperson, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 422 South Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 550 square foot, one-and-three-quarter story, rear addition on a crawl space, on the following condition: that the windows have applied interior and exterior muntins. As conditioned the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

### **COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 3 - 1

# Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 3 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, and Epperson

Nays: 1 - Ross

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair Quijano

F-2. 23-0985 HDC23-0056; 215-217 S Main, Five Story Building Behind Facade; MSHD

<u>Attachments:</u> 215 S Main Staff Report - Rooftop Addition.pdf, 215-217

S Main Attachments 053023.pdf

Jill Thacher explained that she had received revisions from the Applicant, just a few hours before the meeting. The Commission expressed a need for a thorough review of the revisions in order to make a decision, so a postponement would be in the best interest for the important application before them.

**HEARINGS:** 

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the

staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

### REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jennifer Ross and Kathy Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

# **PUBLIC HEARING:**

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Move by Commissioner Anna Epperson, Seconded by Commissioner Jennifer Ross, that the Commission Postpone the application for 215-217 South Main Street, to the July 13, 2023 Historic District Commission meeting.

On a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously. Application Postponed.

### **ROLL CALL**

Chairperson David Rochlen recused himself from participating in the 522 Second Street hearing explaining he was the Architect on record for the project. He left the Council Chambers.

Secretary Kathy Fortener took over Chairing the meeting.

**Present:** 3 - Kathryn Fortener, Anna Epperson, and Jennifer Ross

Absent: 2 - Chair David Rochlen, and Jessica Quijano

F-3. 23-0986 HDC23-0082; 522 Second, Enclose Rear Balcony; OWSHD

<u>Attachments:</u> 522 Second Staff Report - Addition.pdf, 522 2nd St HDC

Set - 18 MAY 2023.pdf

**HEARINGS**:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

### REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jennifer Ross and Kathy Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

#### PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Noting no further speakers, Commissioner Fortener declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Anna Epperson, Seconded by Commissioner Jennifer Ross, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 522 Second Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to enclose a modern balcony on the rear elevation, remove the brick chimney and remove a non-historic trim board, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Secretary declaring the motion carried. Vote: 3 - 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 3 - Secretary Fortener, Epperson, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair Quijano

Recused: 1 - Chair Rochlen

# **ROLL CALL**

Chair Rochlen returned to continue Chairing the remainder of the meeting.

**Present:** 4 - Chair David Rochlen, Kathryn Fortener, Anna Epperson,

and Jennifer Ross

Absent: 1 - Jessica Quijano

**F-4.** 23-0987 HDC23-0083; 543 Detroit, Replace Siding; OFWHD

<u>Attachments:</u> 543 Detroit Staff Report - Siding.pdf, 543 Detroit St

Photos & Description of Proposed Work.pdf, Email re 543 Detroit St Siding Replacement.pdf, Detroit HDC Siding

Writeup.pdf

**HEARINGS**:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jennifer Ross and Kathy Fortener visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

**PUBLIC HEARING:** 

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Jennifer Ross, Seconded by Commissioner Kathy Fortener, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 543 Detroit Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to remove the wood siding and trim, re-insulate and install sheathing, then reinstall all salvageable exterior wood plus matching new custom milled cedar siding and cypress trim to match, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5 and 9

and the guidelines for building site and wood; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for wood siding, trim and architectural details.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 3 -1

# Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 3 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, and Epperson

Nays: 1 - Ross

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair Quijano

# G. NEW BUISNESS

# G-1. 23-0988 Election of Officers

Elections were held at the previous HDC meeting.

Jill Thacher asked who was voted in as Vice Chair and Secretary.

The Commission stated, Commissioner Jessica Quijano to the position of Historic District Commission Vice Chairperson, and Commissioner Katheryn Fortener to the position of the Historic District Commission Secretary. They noted the minutes needed to be corrected to reflect this selection.

Agenda item unanimously Withdrawn by Commission.

# **G-2.** 23-0989 2023 HDC Award Committee Nominations

Attachments: Awards Text 2023 draft 060223.pdf

Moved by Commissioner Jennifer Ross, Seconded by Commissioner Anna Epperson, that the Commission Approve the 2023 Historic District Commission Award Committee Nominations.

On a voice vote the motion passed unanimously.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Epperson, and Ross

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair Quijano

# H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. 23-0990 May 11, 2023 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

<u>Attachments:</u> 5-11-2023 HDC Approved Meeting Minutes-rev.pdf

The Commission noted the election results for Vice Chair and Secretary needed to be amended as noted.

The May 11, 2023 Historic District Commission meeting minutes, as amended, were unanimously approved by the Commission, and forwarded to City Council.

# I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

### J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. Review Committee: Monday, July 10, 2023 at 5:00 pm, for the Thursday, July 13, 2023 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Jennifer Ross and David Rochlen volunteered for the Monday, July 10, 2023 HDC Review Committee.

### K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

Commissioner Anna Epperson recused herself from a brief discussion about the Canterbury House since her employer is the Architect of record.

Jill Thacher reviewed the applicant's submittal with the Commission and asked for their feedback on a proposed stone-walled seating area close and patio area in the front of the non-residential building.

# L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Rochlen asked about the reference the Commission makes to ATT cable access at the beginning of their meetings.

Staff said they would find out and get back to the Commission about it.

# M. COMMUNICATIONS

### M-1. 23-0991 Various Communications to the HDC

None received.

Reviewed and Filed

# N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:23 p.m.

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Mia Gale, Administrative Assistant Courtney Manor, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website https://a2gov.org/watchctn.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at https://a2gov.org/watchctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.