

## ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

### Staff Report

**ADDRESS:** 118 E Washington Street, Application Number HDC21-294

**DISTRICT:** Main Street Historic District

**REPORT DATE:** October 14, 2021

**REPORT PREPARED BY:** Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

**REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE:** Tuesday, October 12, 2021

#### OWNER

**Name:** Edward Shaffran  
**Address:** 209 S Fourth Ave  
 Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
**Phone:** (734) 665-1200

#### APPLICANT

Reuben Torres, Ben Torres Agency LLC  
 118 ½ E Washington  
 Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
 (734) 646-4912

**BACKGROUND:** This two-story, brick, commercial, Italianate building was constructed in 1876 and features segmented arches, stone trim, pilasters, and one-over-one windows. The first occupant was Ernestine Roehm millinery.

**LOCATION:** The site is located on the south side of East Washington Street, between South Main Street and South Fourth Avenue.

**APPLICATION:** The applicant seeks HDC approval to install a 20" by 28" pedestrian-scale bracket sign at the entrance to the upper level business.

#### APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

##### From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.



- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):**

**Storefronts**

*Not Recommended:* Introducing a new design that is incompatible in size, scale, material, and color; using inappropriately scaled signs and logos or other types of signs that obscure, damage, or destroy remaining character-defining features of the historic building; using new illuminated signs.

**From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines:**

**Signs**

*Appropriate:* Attaching signage through masonry joints or through materials that can be easily repaired, such as wood, when signage is removed.

Installing signage that is compatible in size, style, material, and appearance to the historic resource and district.

Installing signage that is subordinate to the overall building composition.

**Pedestrian Scale Signs**

*Pedestrian scale signs should be:* Located near the business's entry, at least 8' from the ground on the first floor.

Mounted on an arm or arms or hung from a bracket.

Aligned with similar signs on the block.

Sized not to exceed 4.5 square feet per side. This is roughly a 28" diameter circle, or 25" square. Odd shapes are welcomed and will be reviewed on a case by case basis.

**STAFF FINDINGS:**

1. The pedestrian scale sign is shown at an appropriate height and is aligned appropriately to the Amadeus sign, the only other projecting sign on the block. It is metal with vinyl graphics, hanging from a steel bracket, and is 3.9 square feet. The location, on one of the wood columns flanking the door, is appropriate.
2. Staff believes the sign is appropriate and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*.

**POSSIBLE MOTIONS:** (Note that the motions are only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will visit the site and make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 118 East Washington Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a new pedestrian scale sign, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines* for signs, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

### **MOTION WORKSHEET:**

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 118 E Washington Street in the Main Street Historic District

\_\_\_\_\_ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

**ATTACHMENTS:** application, photos, drawings, lighting information.



118 E Washington (2017 Google Street View)





# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION


## PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

City Hall: 301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104-6120  
Mailing: P.O. Box 8647, Ann Arbor, MI 48107-8647  
Phone: 734.794.6265 ext. 42608  
Fax: 734.994.8460  
[ithacher@a2gov.org](mailto:ithacher@a2gov.org)


OFFICE USE ONLY	
Permit Number	HDC#
	BLDG#
DATE STAMP	

APPLICATION MUST BE FILLED OUT COMPLETELY

### PROPERTY LOCATION/OWNER INFORMATION

NAME OF PROPERTY OWNER <u>Edward Shaffran, member HBE Washington Associates LLC</u>		HISTORIC DISTRICT	
PROPERTY ADDRESS <u>118 1/2 E Washington ST.</u>		CITY <u>ANN ARBOR</u>	
ZIP CODE <u>48104</u>	DAYTIME PHONE NUMBER <u>(734) 665 1200</u>	EMAIL ADDRESS <u>edward@shaffran.com</u>	
PROPERTY OWNER'S ADDRESS (IF DIFFERENT FROM ABOVE) <u>209 S. Fourth Ave. 1C</u>		CITY <u>Ann Arbor</u>	STATE, ZIP <u>MI, 48104</u>
PROPERTY OWNER'S SIGNATURE 			
SIGN HERE		PRINT NAME <u>EDWARD A. SHAFFRAN</u>	DATE <u>8/22/21</u>

### APPLICANT INFORMATION

NAME OF APPLICANT (IF DIFFERENT FROM ABOVE) <u>Reuben Torres; Ben Torres Agency LLC</u>			
ADDRESS OF APPLICANT <u>118 1/2 E Washington</u>		CITY <u>Ann Arbor</u>	
STATE <u>MI</u>	ZIP CODE <u>48104</u>	PHONE / CELL # <u>(734) 646 4912</u>	FAX No <u>(734) 457 5878</u>
EMAIL ADDRESS <u>Ben@BenTorresAgent.com</u>			
APPLICANT'S SIGNATURE (if different from Property Owner) 			
SIGN HERE		PRINT NAME <u>X Reuben Torres</u>	DATE <u>08/19/2021</u>

### BUILDING USE - CHECK ALL THAT APPLY

<input type="checkbox"/> SINGLE FAMILY	<input type="checkbox"/> DUPLEX	<input type="checkbox"/> RENTAL	<input type="checkbox"/> MULTIPLE FAMILY	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> COMMERCIAL	<input type="checkbox"/> INSTITUTIONAL
--	---------------------------------	---------------------------------	--	--	--

### PROPOSED WORK

Describe in detail each proposed exterior alteration, improvement and/or repair (use additional paper, if necessary).

Small Metal Sign, unlighted  
See attached Proposed Image

### DESCRIBE CONDITIONS THAT JUSTIFY THE PROPOSED CHANGES:

Business sign in similar character and size as others on the same block.

For Further Assistance With Required Attachments, please visit [www.a2gov.org/hdc](http://www.a2gov.org/hdc)





# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION APPLICATION

## FEE CHART

DESCRIPTION	
<b>STAFF REVIEW FEES</b>	
Application for Staff Approval	\$35.00
Work started without approvals	Additional \$50.00
<b>HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION FEES</b>	
All other proposed work not listed below	\$100.00
Work started without approvals	Additional \$250.00
<b>RESIDENTIAL – Single and 2-story Structure</b>	
Addition: single story	\$300.00
Addition: taller than single story	\$550.00
New Structure - Accessory	\$100.00
New Structure – Principal	\$850.00
Replacement of single and 2-family window(s)	\$100 + \$25/window
<b>COMMERCIAL – includes multi-family (3 or more unit) structures</b>	
Additions	\$700.00
Replacement of multi-family and commercial window (s)	\$100 + \$50/window
Replacement of commercial storefront	\$250.00
<b>DEMOLITION and RELOCATION</b>	
Demolition of a contributing structure	\$1000.0
Demolition of a non-contributing structure	\$250.00
Relocation of a contributing structure	\$750.00
Relocation of a non-contributing structure	\$250.00

## FOR COMMISSION REVIEWS:

- Application withdrawals made before public notice is published will qualify for a 50% refund of the application fee.
- Application withdrawals made after public notice is sent but before the public hearing will qualify for a 25% refund of the application fee.

## INSTRUCTIONS FOR SUBMITTING APPLICATIONS

All HDC applications must be signed by the property owner and the applicant, if different, with the exception of staff approvals, which may be signed by only the applicant.

All completed HDC applications and their attachments may be submitted to Planning and Development Services by mail, in person (paper or digital), faxed, or via email to [building@a2gov.org](mailto:building@a2gov.org).

We accept CASH, CHECK, and all major credit cards. Checks should be made payable to "City of Ann Arbor"

HDC applications that are incomplete or not submitted with the required documentation or payment will not be processed or approved.

## APPLICATION EXPIRATION

HDC applications expire three (3) years after the date of approval.

## OFFICE USE ONLY

Date of Hearing:		
Action	<input type="checkbox"/> HDC COA	<input type="checkbox"/> HDC Denial
	<input type="checkbox"/> HDC NTP	<input type="checkbox"/> Staff COA
Staff Signature		
Comments		
Fee:	\$ _____	
Payment Type	<input type="checkbox"/> Check: # _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Cash <input type="checkbox"/> Credit Card	





Existing Conditions





Double Sided Hanging Metal Sign  
With Printed Vinyl Graphics  
20"h x 28"w (3.9 Sq. Ft.)  
On Steel Bracket  
Secured To Wood Column  
By Way of Lag/Shield Installation  
8' From Sidewalk to Bottom of Sign