

City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.

Ann Arbor, MI 48104

<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>



Meeting Minutes - Draft

Monday, July 27, 2020

7:00 PM

Special Session - This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN
Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at

a2gov.org/watchCTN

Electronic Meeting
To speak at public comment call: 877 853 5247 or 888 788 0099

Enter Meeting ID: 985 4951 9810

City Council

CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Christopher Taylor called the electronic special meeting of the City Council to order at 7:00 p.m. in accordance with Governor Whitmer's executive order, 2020-154.

READING OF ORDER AND NOTICE OF CALL OF SPECIAL SESSION

The notice of call of special session was read and ordered placed on file with the City Clerk:

Notice is hereby given that a special session of the City of Ann Arbor City Council will be held electronically on Monday, July 27, 2020 at 7:00 p.m. for the following purposes:

- *Resolution to Order Election and to Determine Ballot Question for Charter Amendment for the 2021 Affordable Housing Millage (7 Votes required)*

MOMENT OF SILENCE

Council stood for a moment of silence.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Mayor Taylor led Council in the recitation of the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL OF COUNCIL

Councilmember Ackerman arrived at 7:12 p.m.

Present: 11 - Councilmember Jane Lumm, Councilmember Jack Eaton, Mayor Christopher Taylor, Councilmember Julie Grand, Councilmember Zachary Ackerman, Councilmember Chip Smith, Councilmember Anne Bannister, Councilmember Jeff Hayner, Councilmember Kathy Griswold, Councilmember Elizabeth Nelson and Councilmember Ali Ramlawi

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

A motion was made by Councilmember Smith, seconded by Councilmember Ramlawi, that the Agenda be approved with the following changes:

Add Council Communications after Public Comment.

On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried.

PUBLIC COMMENT - GENERAL (3 MINUTES EACH)

Bridget Healy, with the United Way of Washtenaw County, spoke in support of the proposed millage for affordable housing.

Michelle Hughes, resident, spoke in support of the proposed affordable housing millage and urged Council to place the issue on the ballot.

Joe Spaulding spoke in support of the proposed affordable housing millage.

An unidentified speaker urged Council to keep the millage as a 20-year millage to ensure success.

A resident spoke in support of affordable housing.

Glenn Ziegler, Ward 5, expressed concerns about the process for presenting the proposed affordable housing millage, stating it was very rushed. He also expressed concern about development in the floodplain.

Ralph McKee, Ward 5, stated he supports affordable housing, but expressed concern about this millage. He stated affordable housing policies need to lead to home ownership.

A Ward 4 resident spoke in support of affordable housing.

Emily Canosa, resident, urged Council to table this item to a future meeting to allow for more conversation.

Jake Campbell, resident, spoke in support of a 20-year millage for affordable housing.

Kathy Boris, Ward 5, spoke in opposition to the proposed affordable housing millage, stating a new tax will adversely affect existing low-income homeowners and renters.

Lynn Dorset, resident, spoke about the proposed affordable housing millage.

Anna Foster, Ward 5, spoke in support of the proposed affordable housing millage.

David DeVarti, former Councilmember, spoke in support of a millage for affordable housing.

A Ward 1 resident spoke in support of a millage for affordable housing.

Evan Redmond, Ward 3 Council candidate, spoke in support of a millage for affordable housing.

Ian Robinson, Ward 4, spoke in support of the proposed affordable housing millage.

Chuck Warpehoski, former Councilmember, spoke in support of a ballot proposal for affordable housing.

Tom Stuhlberg, resident, talked about the history of racism in home ownership.

Tony Brown, Ward 3 Council candidate, expressed concern that there is no path to home ownership for some residents.

Jamie Magiera, Ward 4, spoke in support of a proposed affordable housing millage.

A Ward 1 resident spoke in support, but stated he is disappointed that UM is not helping.

COMMUNICATIONS FROM COUNCIL

COUNCILMEMBER GRISWOLD

Councilmember Griswold spoke about the historic vote this evening and the opportunities needed at the federal level for affordable housing.

Councilmember Griswold addressed the negative campaigning that has occurred at the local level in the City.

COUNCILMEMBER GRAND

Councilmember Grand spoke about her upcoming proposal for a ballot initiative for Ranked Choice Voting. She stated it would be ready for the August 6 meeting.

D MOTIONS AND RESOLUTIONS

DC Unfinished Business:

DC-1 20-1096 Enactment No:

Sponsors: Taylor, Nelson, Smith, Ramlawi and Griswold

A motion was made by Councilmember Smith, seconded by Councilmember Ackerman, that the Resolution be approved.

Resolution to Order Election and to Determine Ballot Question for Charter Amendment for the 2021 Affordable Housing Millage (7 Votes Required)

20-1096 Enactment No:

Amended

Sponsors: Taylor, Nelson, Smith, Ramlawi and Griswold

Amended

Resolution to Order Election and to Determine Ballot Question for Charter Amendment for the 2021 Affordable Housing Millage (7 Votes Required)

The proposed substitute resolution offered by Councilmember Eaton, seconded by Councilmember Ackerman, was considered friendly by the Body:

Resolution to Order Election and to Determine Ballot Question for Charter Amendment for the 2021 Affordable Housing Millage (7 Votes Required)

Whereas, City Council has adopted the strategic goal of being a warm, welcoming, and safe community and providing affordable housing options is essential to that goal;

Whereas, Ann Arbor's efforts to develop, maintain, support, or acquire sufficient affordable housing have not created an adequate supply of affordable housing;

Whereas, The market's efforts to develop, maintain, support, or acquire sufficient affordable housing have failed to create an adequate supply of affordable housing;

Whereas, The City of Ann Arbor adopted the Housing Affordability and Economic Equity Analysis in 2015 that establishes a goal of supporting 140 new affordable units each year;

Whereas, The City's current annual investment of \$880,000+ in the Affordable Housing Fund does not meet the financial need to develop and/or acquire a meaningful number of affordable units or to provide necessary supportive services; and

WHEREAS, THE CITY COUNCIL WANTS TO ADOPT POLICY GUIDELINES FOR THE USE OF THE FUNDS IF THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING MILLAGE IS APPROVED BY THE VOTERS AT THE NOVEMBER 3, 2020 ELECTION AND WANTS TO INFORM THE VOTERS OF THOSE POLICY GUIDELINES;

RESOLVED, It is the City's intention that it will continue to contribute General Fund money to the affordable housing fund regardless of any additional millage money;

RESOLVED, That the following amendment to the City Charter be placed on the ballot and submitted to the voters at the next general city election:

SECTION 8.25. In addition to any other amount which the City is authorized to raise by general tax upon real and personal property by this Charter or any other provision of law, the City shall, in 2021 through 2041, annually levy a tax of up to one mill on all taxable real and personal property situated within the City for the purpose of building, maintaining, and acquiring new affordable housing units [which are permanently affordable to] FOR low-income households making no income up to 60% of area median income and providing social services, not to exceed 20% of the millage revenues, for the residents of such housing.

RESOLVED, That November 3, 2020 is designated as the day for holding an election on the proposed Charter amendment;

RESOLVED, That the City Clerk shall transmit a copy of the proposed amendment to the Attorney General and the Governor of Michigan and shall perform all other acts required by law for holding the election;

RESOLVED, That the following amended charter provision shall appear on the ballot in the following form:

PROPOSAL 3

ANN ARBOR CITY CHARTER AMENDMENT

TAX FOR THE CONSTRUCTION, ACQUISITION, AND MAINTENANCE OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING

Shall the Charter be amended to authorize a new tax up to 1.000 mills for construction, maintenance, and acquisition of new affordable housing units for low-income individuals and families making less than 60% Ann Arbor Area Median Income, and for providing social services for the residents of such housing for 2021 through 2041, which will raise in the first year of levy the estimated revenue of \$6,550,505. In accordance with State law, a portion of the millage may be subject to capture by the Ann Arbor Downtown Development Authority and the Washtenaw County Brownfield Redevelopment Authority.

Yes

No

RESOLVED, That the proposed Charter amendment and proposed ballot question shall be published in full not fewer than two times in the Washtenaw County Legal News;

RESOLVED, That the City Clerk is directed to publish the proposed Charter amendment in full, together with the existing Charter provisions amended as required by law and in accordance with resolution of Council, post the proposed Charter amendment in full together with the existing Charter provisions to the City's website;

RESOLVED, That if the amendment is adopted, it shall take effect on January 1, 2021; and

RESOLVED, THAT CITY COUNCIL ADOPT THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING MILLAGE GUIDELINES AS SPECIFIED IN ATTACHMENT A.

*ALL CAPS indicate new language.
[Brackets] indicate deleted language.*

RECESS

Mayor Taylor declared a recess at 9:37 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 9:45 p.m.

20-1096 Enactment No:

Amended

Sponsors: Taylor, Nelson, Smith, Ramlawi and Griswold

Amended

Resolution to Order Election and to Determine Ballot Question for Charter Amendment for the 2021 Affordable Housing Millage (7 Votes Required)

Councilmember Ackerman moved the following amendments, seconded by Councilmember Grand:

Amend Third RESOLVED:

SECTION 8.25. In addition to any other amount which the City is authorized to raise by general tax upon real and personal property by this Charter or any other provision of law, the City shall, in 2021 through 2041, annually levy a tax of up to one mill on all taxable real and personal property situated within the City for the purpose of building, maintaining, and acquiring new affordable housing units WHICH ARE PERMANENTLY AFFORDABLE TO [for] low-income households making no income up to 60% of area median income and providing social services, not to exceed 20% of the millage revenues OVER THE ENTIRE TERM OF THE MILLAGE, for the residents of such housing.

Attachment A:

The intent of the affordable housing millage is to increase the number of [apartments] UNITS that are affordable and sustainable to provide long-term housing security for households earning zero income to 60% of Area Median Income ("AMI").

- 6. 6. The City prioritizes projects that will have [long-term] PERMANENT affordability commitments, which is achievable through:*
- a. Development of publicly owned properties*
 - b. Public ownership through the Ann Arbor Housing Commission and its affiliated non-profit development entities*
 - c. Mission-driven non-profits committed to [long-term] PERMANENT affordability restrictions*
 - d. COOPERATIVE HOUSING OR OTHER HOUSING OWNERSHIP MODELS WITH PERMANENT AFFORDABILITY RESTRICTIONS.*

*ALL CAPS indicate new language.
[Brackets] indicate deleted language.*

The proposed amendments were considered friendly by the Body.

20-1096 Enactment No:

Amended

A motion was made by Councilmember Ramlawi, seconded by Councilmember Eaton, that the Resolution be amended as follows:

SECTION 8.25. In addition to any other amount which the City is authorized to raise by general tax upon real and personal property by this Charter or any other provision of law, the City shall, in 2021 through 2041, annually levy a tax of up to one mill on all taxable real and personal property situated within the City for the purpose of building, maintaining, and acquiring new affordable housing units which are permanently affordable to low-income households making no income up to 60% of area median income and providing social services, not to exceed 20% of the millage revenues, for the residents of such housing. **NO MONEY COLLECTED PURSUANT TO THIS MILLAGE SHALL BE SPENT ON BUILDING, MAINTAINING, OR ACQUIRING NEW UNITS LOCATED IN THE FLOODPLAIN OR FLOODWAY.**

ALL CAPS indicate new language.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Mayor declaring the motion carried:

- Yeas:** 7 - Councilmember Lumm, Councilmember Eaton, Councilmember Bannister, Councilmember Hayner, Councilmember Griswold, Councilmember Nelson and Councilmember Ramlawi
- Nays:** 4 - Mayor Taylor, Councilmember Grand, Councilmember Ackerman and Councilmember Smith

Resolution to Order Election and to Determine Ballot Question for Charter Amendment for the 2021 Affordable Housing Millage (7 Votes Required)

SECTION 8.25. In addition to any other amount which the City is authorized to raise by general tax upon real and personal property by this Charter or any other provision of law, the City shall, in 2021 through 2041, annually levy a tax of up to one mill on all taxable real and personal property situated within the City for the purpose of building, maintaining, and acquiring new affordable housing units which are permanently affordable to low-income households making no income up to 60% of area median income and providing social services, not to exceed 20% of

the millage revenues, for the residents of such housing. NO MONEY COLLECTED PURSUANT TO THIS MILLAGE SHALL BE SPENT ON BUILDING, MAINTAINING, OR ACQUIRING NEW UNITS LOCATED IN THE FLOODPLAIN OR FLOODWAY..

20-1096 Enactment No: Amended

A motion was made by Councilmember Bannister, seconded by Councilmember Ackerman, that the Resolution be amended as follows:

Amend First RESOLVED Clause:

RESOLVED, It is the City's intention that it will continue to contribute General Fund, AND COUNTY PUBLIC SAFETY AND MENTAL HEALTH MILLAGE money to the affordable housing fund regardless of any additional millage money;

ALL CAPS indicate new language.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Mayor declaring the motion carried:

Yeas: 6 - Mayor Taylor, Councilmember Grand, Councilmember Ackerman, Councilmember Bannister, Councilmember Griswold and Councilmember Nelson

Nays: 5 - Councilmember Lumm, Councilmember Eaton, Councilmember Smith, Councilmember Hayner and Councilmember Ramlawi

Resolution to Order Election and to Determine Ballot Question for Charter Amendment for the 2021 Affordable Housing Millage (7 Votes Required)

20-1096 Enactment No: R-20-293 Approved as Amended

The question being, the motion that was made by Councilmember Smith, seconded by Councilmember Ackerman, that the Resolution be approved as amended. On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Mayor declaring the motion carried:

Yeas: 11 - Councilmember Lumm, Councilmember Eaton, Mayor Taylor, Councilmember Grand, Councilmember Ackerman, Councilmember Smith, Councilmember Bannister, Councilmember Hayner, Councilmember Griswold, Councilmember Nelson and Councilmember Ramlawi

Nays: 0

Resolution to Order Election and to Determine Ballot Question for Charter Amendment for the 2021 Affordable Housing Millage (7 Votes Required)

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Councilmember Smith, seconded by Councilmember Griswold, that the meeting adjourn. On a voice vote, the Mayor declared the motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 11:02 p.m.

COMMUNITY TELEVISION NETWORK (CTN) COMCAST CHANNEL 16, AT&T CHANNEL 99:

**LIVE: MONDAY, JULY 27, 2020 @ 7:00 P.M.
REPLAY: FRIDAY, JULY 31, 2020 @ 8:00 P.M.**

REPLAYS SUBJECT TO CHANGE WITHOUT NOTICE

Community Television Network live televised public meetings are also available to watch online live and on-demand from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/watchctn <<http://www.a2gov.org/watchctn>>, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Cable: Comcast Cable channel 16 or AT&T UVerse Channel 99

Videos are also available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to:

**City Clerk's Office
301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104**

Requests made with less than two business days' notice may not be able to be accommodated.

A hard copy of this Council packet can be viewed at the front counter of the City Clerk's Office.