#### ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

#### Staff Report

ADDRESS: 120 West Washington Street, Application Number HDC19-090

**DISTRICT:** Main Street Historic District

**REPORT DATE:** June 13, 2019

**REPORT PREPARED BY:** Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

**REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE:** Monday, June 10, 2019

Name: Address:	OWNER WWSA LLC 120 W Washington St Ann Arbor MI	APPLICANT WCCI 2790 Island View Rd Traverse City MI 49686
Phone:	(734) 604-0977	(231) 620-0136

**LOCATION:** The site is located on the north side of West Washington, near the corner of South Ashley, and on South Ashley north of West Washington.

**BACKGROUND:** The application is for one building but three different storefront addresses: 118 and 120 W Washington, and 117 South Ashley. The three-story L-shaped brick building was constructed in 1908 as 114, 116, 118 and 120 W Washington. The Old German restaurant was present in the building from 1928, first on the S. Ashley side and later in 118-120 W Washington. It had a large fire on April 1, 1975, and as a result the front façade was remodeled in 1976, with vertical windows replacing the double-hungs, and large brick and metal-roofed awnings above the remodeled storefronts. The *Downtown Streetscapes* survey indicates that 117 S Ashley, the foot of the L shaped building, was also remodeled in 1976.

Certificates of Appropriateness were issued by the HDC in 1995 to renovate the building for Grizzly Peak Brewing Company, which replaced the original Old German.

**APPLICATION:** The applicant seeks HDC approval to replace the three storefronts from 1976 with more sympathetic ones in proportions more typical of historic storefronts. They are brick and aluminium with transom windows, and two have accordion-folding display window glass.



#### **APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:**

#### From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (1) A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

## From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

#### Storefronts

<u>Recommended</u>: Designing and constructing a new storefront when the historic storefront is completely missing. It may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or be a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, material, and color of the historic building.

<u>Not Recommended</u>: Introducing a new design that is incompatible in size, scale, material, and color.

#### **Building Site**

<u>Not Recommended</u>: Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

#### From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines:

#### **Design Guidelines for Storefronts**

<u>Appropriate</u>: Designing and constructing a new storefront when the historic storefront is completely missing. It may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, ad physical documentation; or may be a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, and material of the historic building. New designs should be flush with the façade and be kept as simple as possible.

<u>Not Appropriate</u>: Installing a new storefront that is incompatible in size and material with the historic building and district.

#### **STAFF FINDINGS:**

- The three storefronts proposed to be replaced, at 118 and 120 W Washington, and 117 N. Ashley, all date to 1976 and are of a similar design. Their proposed replacements are similar to, but do not match exactly, the other Grizzly Peak storefront at 116 W Washington. The proportions are compatible with the adjacent storefronts (one of which is the very historic 122 W Washington). Some brick columns from the current storefront will remain, and a new low brick kickplate is proposed. The kickplate is slightly higher on the South Ashley storefront.
- 2. While this is not a historic re-creation, it is simple and compatible in design, size, scale, and material with historic resources nearby. No signs are proposed on these three storefronts at this time.
- 3. In summary, staff finds that the redesign of the storefront is appropriate and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

**POSSIBLE MOTIONS:** (Note that the motion is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 120 West Washington Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District to replace the storefront at 118 and 120 West Washington and 117 South Ashley, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines* for storefronts and windows, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* and *Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings,* in particular standards 1, 2, and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts and building site.

#### **MOTION WORKSHEET:**

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at <u>120 W</u> <u>Washington Street</u> in the <u>Main Street</u> Historic District

Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) *(circle all that apply)*: 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

**ATTACHMENTS:** application, photos, drawings

### 118-120 W Washington (2007 Staff Photo)





Appendix B Page 76



ADDRESS

\*\*122 120-118

116

112

114

WEST WASHINGTON STREET (north side, part I) Main Street Historic District DATE 1869 (1908) 1976 1908 1908 1869 ORIGINAL OCCUPANT Wagner/Schneider M. Staebler J. Livernois John W. Illi William Frey William Herz blacksmith groceries sausages bakery saloon painting & decorating CURRENT OCCUPANT Del Rio Bar Old German Art Deco Design Cracked Crab Cracked Crab STYLE Italianate Modern Chicago Style Chicago Style Italianate NUMBER OF STORIES three three three three two MATERIAL brick brick brick brick brick WINDOW TYPE double-hung, fixed panes double-hung, double-hung, double-hung, one-overfour-over-four eight-over-eight two-over-two one SPECIAL DETAILS ornate wrought-iron sign cornices, round & brick cornice, brick cornice, original cornices, segmented arches, stone trim stone trim segmented arches, stone pilasters, stone trim,

All States and	HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION	n and Taking	OFFICE USE ONLY
A DE ANN PR	PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES	Permit Number	HDC# 19-090
E S		1000 CO. 100	BLDG#
	City Hall: 301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104-6120	CI	
AICHIGAN	Phone:     734.794.6265 ext. 42608     ithacher@a2gov.org       Fax:     734.994.8460     734.994.8460		RECEIVED
APPLICA	ATION MUST BE FILLED OUT COMPLETELY		MAY 2 8 2019
		F	PLANNING AND
PROPERTY LOCATI	ON/OWNER INFORMATION	DEVEL	OPMENT SERVICES
NAME OF PROPERTY OV	VNER	HISTORIC DISTRICT	Margare - Parts
PROPERTY ADDRESS	ALLC		
10101			
ZIPCODE	DAYTIME PHONE NUMBER EMAIL ADDRESS		ANN ARBOR
UNIAU	May 16 My ASDA DNO2MISS	ION. COM	
PROPERTY OWNER'S AD	DRESS (IF DIFFERENT FROM ABOVE)	CITY	STATE, ZIP
		a president a	And State and Street and
PROPERTY OWNER	R'S SIGNATURE		
SIGN HERE	PRINT NAME JON	A. CARUST	J DATE 5 28/19
APPLICANT INFOR	MATION		
NAME OF APPLICANT	DIFFERENT FROM ABOVE)		
ADDRESS OF APPLICANT	-+-		СІТҮ
2790 I	STAJD VEEN RD		TRAVEIDSE
STATE	ZIPCODE PHONE/CELL# (231) (-20	-0136 (	No )
EMAIL ADDRESS	withsonwcci@gmail.com		
APPLICANT'S SIGN	ATURE (if different from Property Owner)		State of the second
SIGN HERE	mini PRINT NAME Garage	Wilson	DATE
BUILDING USE - C	HECK ALL THAT APPLY		
SINGLE FAMILY	DUPLEX RENTAL MULTIPLE FAMILY		
PROPOSED WORK		THE REAL PROPERTY OF	
Describe in detail e	ach proposed exterior alteration, improvement and/or repair (use addition	onal paper, if necess	ary).
FRUST 1	FACADE CHANGE CD Ashley - (	NAShin	TOJ ST.
Assum	BEAM DU PLACE TO SUPPORT	- w: 200-	us above
F NOT	- A NEN BEAM W. 11 DE REQUIR	den as	WRAPPEP
is Brid	ek Tumateh.		
DESCRIBE CONDIT	IONS THAT JUSTIFY THE PROPOSED CHANGES:		
		Section 2.	
For Further Article	a With Dequired Attrachments allows with users and the		
For Further Assistance	e with Required Attachments, please visit <u>www.azgov.org/noc</u>	States and	

G:\Community Services\CSA Shared\Planning & Development\Permit Application Forms

APPLICATION CONTINUED ON OTHER SIDE















# **GRIZZLY PEAK: FACADE RENOVATION**

# **120 WEST WASHINGTON STREET** ANN ARBOR, MICHIGAN

## ARCHITECTURAL SHEET INDEX:

FIRST LEVEL DEMOLITION PLAN	D101
FIRST LEVEL FLOOR PLAN	A101
DEMOLITION ELEVATIONS	D200
<b>EXTERIOR ELEVATIONS</b>	A200

ISSUE DATE 05.16.19

C † U

Φ

HF: archite HARMONY

512 NOK ITT .... ROYAL OAK 88 | 8563

FROJECT FACADE RENC LY PEAK:

GR

# FIRST LEVEL DEMOLTION PLAN

SCALE: 3/16" = 1'-0"

D101



SCALE: 3/16'' = 1'-0''

A101

EXISTING BRICK/WOOD/GLASS ——\_\_\_\_ FACADE SHOWN DASHED TO BE REMOVED



------ EXISTING BRICK/WOOD/GLASS -------FACADE SHOWN DASHED TO BE REMOVED







Ð D C t ₀ R × Φ rchit Т • • ш\_ Т - - -**D A U E** 05.1

>PROJECT PEAK: FACADE RENOV 120 WEST WASHINGTON STRFFT ANN APPOT

0

**D200** 

GRI







- NEW BRICK VENEER/LIMESTONE -SILL TO MATCH EXISTING

## ASHLEY ELEVATION SCALE: 3/16" = 1'-0"

## WASHINGTON ELEVATION SCALE: 3/16" = 1'-0"



A200

- Equal Leg Block Frame
- Poured And De-Bridged For Thermal Break
- Tempered Dual Pane Glass
- Fold-In Condition
- 2-Panels Fold Left / 2-Panel Fold Right
- Floor Load Hardware System
- 1.76" High Flush Threshold Sill

## B A Frame Size Height T T (T) T Frame Size Width Interior <u>Interio</u>r Exterior Exterior

Series 9500: Bi-Fold Door - (Thermal Break) - Floor Load Hardware Equal Leg Block Frame - (2L2R) - Fold In w/ Flush Threshold Sill

#### This Door Is Not Accessible From The Exterior





Series 9500: Bi-Fold Door - (Thermal Break) - Floor Load Hardware Equal Leg Block Frame - (2L2R) - Fold In w/ Flush Threshold Sill



Series 9500 Thermally Broken Bi-Fold Door (Floor Load HW - Fold-In)

Series 9500: Bi-Fold Door - (Thermal Break) - Floor Load Hardware Equal Leg Block Frame - (2L2R) - Fold In w/ Flush Threshold Sill



#### Kawneer Anodize finishes

Kawneer gives you a wide variety of anodized finishes with attractive alternatives. The benefit of a durable, anodized finish is married to the beauty of some very dynamic and exciting colors.

At the start of every design, there's a choice of how you want to finish. Contact your Kawneer sales rep for the information on these and other finishes available from Kawneer.

KAWNEER FINISH NO.	COLOR	ALUMINUM ASSOCIATION SPECIFICATION	OTHER COMMENTS
#14	CLEAR	AA-M10C22A41	Architectural Class I (.7 mils minimum)
#17	CLEAR	AA-M10C22A31	Architectural Class II (.4 mils minimum)
#18	CHAMPAGNE	AA-M10C22A44	Architectural Class I (.7 mils minimum)
#26	LIGHT BRONZE	AA-M10C22A44	Architectural Class I (.7 mils minimum)
#28	MEDIUM BRONZE	AA-M10C22A44	Architectural Class I (.7 mils minimum)
#40	DARK BRONZE	AA-M10C22A44	Architectural Class I (.7 mils minimum)
#29	BLACK	AA-M10C22A44	Architectural Class I (.7 mils minimum)

## Trifab<sup>™</sup> VG (Ve<u>rsaGlaze<sup>™</sup>)</u>

Trifab<sup>™</sup> VG 450, 451 & 451T (Thermal) Framing Systems & Trifab<sup>™</sup> 451UT (Ultra Thermal) Framing System

Design + Performance Versatility with **Unmatched Fabrication Flexibility** ville, KY 1.0.00 r & Associates A PLLC, Louisville, K tor: Kentucky N Glazing Cor ate Glass Company, ille, KY

Trifab<sup>™</sup> VersaGlaze<sup>™</sup> is built on the proven and successful Trifab<sup>™</sup> platform – with all the versatility its name implies. There are enough framing system choices, fabrication methods, design options and performance levels to please the most discerning building owner, architect and installer. The Trifab<sup>™</sup> VersaGlaze<sup>™</sup> family's newest addition, Trifab<sup>™</sup> 451UT (Ultra Thermal) framing system, is designed for the most demanding thermal performance and employs a "dual" Isolock<sup>™</sup> Thermal Break.

#### Aesthetics

Trifab<sup>™</sup> VersaGlaze<sup>™</sup> framing systems offer designers a choice of front-, center-, back- or multi-plane glass applications. Structural silicone glazing (SSG) and Weatherseal glazing options further expand the designers' choices, allowing for a greater range of design possibilities for specific project requirements and architectural styles. All systems have a 4-1/2" frame depth – Trifab<sup>™</sup> VersaGlaze<sup>™</sup> 450 has 1-3/4" sightlines, while Trifab<sup>™</sup> VersaGlaze<sup>™</sup> 451/451T and Trifab<sup>™</sup> 451UT have 2" sightlines.



With seamless incorporation of Kawneer entrances or windows, including GLASSvent<sup>™</sup> visually frameless ventilators, Trifab<sup>™</sup> VersaGlaze<sup>™</sup> can be used on almost any project. These framing systems can also be packaged with Kawneer curtain walls and overhead glazing, thereby providing a full range of proven, and tested, quality products for the owner, architect and installer from a single source supplier.

#### Economy

Trifab<sup>™</sup> VersaGlaze<sup>™</sup> 450/451/451T framing systems offer four fabrication choices to suit your project (Trifab<sup>™</sup> 451UT available as screw spline fabrication only):

- Screw Spline for economical continuous runs utilizing two piece vertical members that provide the option to pre-assemble units with controlled shop labor costs and smaller field crews for handling and installation.
- Shear Block for punched openings or continuous runs using tubular moldings with shear block clips that provide tight joints for transporting large pre-assembled multi-lite units.
- Stick for fast, easy field fabrication. Field measurements and material cuts can be done when metal is on the job.
- Type B Same fabrication benefits as shear block except head and sill run through.

All systems can be flush glazed from either the inside or outside. The Weatherseal option provides an alternative to SSG vertical mullions for Trifab™ VersaGlaze™ 450/451/451T. This ABS/ASA rigid polymer



extrusion allows complete inside glazing and creates a flush glass appearance on the building exterior without the added labor of scaffolding or swing stages. Additionally, High-Performance (HP) Flashing options are engineered to eliminate perimeter sill fasteners and associated blind seals.

#### For the Finishing Touch

Company, Inc., Rowley, MA

Brighton Landing, Cambridge, MA

Architects: ADD Inc., Cambridge, MA Glazing Contractors: Ipswich Bay Glass

Architectural Class I anodized aluminum finishes are available in clear and Permanodic™ color choices.

Painted finishes, including fluoropolymer, that meet AAMA 2605 are offered in many standard choices and an unlimited number of specially designed colors.

Solvent-free powder coatings add the green element with high performance, durability and scratch resistance that meet the standards of AAMA 2604.

Kawneer Company, Inc. Technology Park / Atlanta 555 Guthridge Court Norcross, GA 30092 kawneer.com 770 . 449 . 5555 Performance

Kawneer's Isolock™ Thermal Break process creates a composite section, prevents dry shrinkage and is available on Trifab™ VersaGlaze™ 451T. For even greater thermal performance, a "dual" Isolock™ Thermal Break is used on Trifab™ 451UT.



Trifab<sup>™</sup> 451UT uses a "dual" Isolock<sup>™</sup> Thermal Break (right) and features a new HP (High Performance) sill design, which incorporates a screw-applied end dam (left), ensuring positive engagement and tight joints between the sill flashing and end dam.

U-factor, CRF values and STC ratings for Trifab™ VersaGlaze™ vary depending upon the glass plane application. Project specific U-factors can be determined for each individual project. (See the Kawneer Architectural Manual or Kawneer.com for additional information).

Thermal simulations showing temperature variations from exterior/cold side to interior/warm side.



#### PERFORMANCE TEST STANDARDS

Air Infiltration	ASTM E 283
Water	AAMA 501, ASTM E 331
Structural	ASTM E 330
Thermal	AAMA 1503
Thermal Break	AAMA 505, AAMA TIR-A8
Acoustical	AAMA 1801, ASTM E 1425

#### Trifab™ VersaGlaze™ 450/451/451T glazing options

(note: Trifab™ 451UT available as center set glass plane only).





© Kawneer Company, Inc. 2007–2017 LITHO IN U.S.A. Form No. 17-2289.a Trifab™, VersaGlaze™, Insulclad™ and Permanodic™ are trademarks of Kawneer Company, Inc.

## 190, 350 and 500 Standard Entrances

Single Source Packages Generate Versatile First Impressions



Tough yet attractive, the clean lines of Kawneer's Standard Entrances are designed as a single-source package of door, door frame and hardware that is easily adaptable to custom requirements. Designed to complement new or remodel construction, modern or traditional architecture, they are engineered, constructed and tested to make good first impressions while withstanding the rigors of constant use by occupants and visitors.

#### Performance

To resist both lever arm and torsion forces that constantly act on any door, all three entrances feature welded corner construction with Sigma deep penetration and fillet welds plus mechanical fastenings at each corner – a total of 16 welds per door. Each door corner comes with a Limited Lifetime Warranty, good for the life of the door under normal use operation. It is transferable from building owner to owner and is in addition to the standard two-year warranty covering material and workmanship of each Kawneer Door.





#### Economy

Kawneer's Sealair™ bulb neoprene weatherstripping forms a positive seal around the door frame and provides a substantial reduction in air infiltration, resulting in improved comfort and economies in heating and cooling costs. The system is wear and temperature-resistant and replaces conventional weathering. Bottom weatherstrip at the interior contains a flexible blade gasket to meet and contact the threshold, enhancing the air and water infiltration performance characteristics.

#### For the Finishing Touch

Architectural Class I anodized aluminum finishes are available in clear and Permanodic™ color choices.

Painted finishes, including fluoropolymer, that meet AAMA 2605 are offered in many standard choices and an unlimited number of specially designed colors.

Solvent-free powder coatings add the green element with high performance, durability and scratch resistance that meet the standards of AAMA 2604.

- Thermoplastic elastomer weatherstrip in bladestop of frame jambs, header or transom bar.
- Integral polymeric fin is attached to adjustable astragal creating an air barrier between pairs of doors.
- Optional surface-applied bottom weatherstrip with flexible blade gasket. Extruded raised lip on threshold to provide a continuous contact surface for bottom weatherstrip.
- 4. Standard 1/4" beveled glass stops sheet water and dirt off without leaving residue.
- 5. Available in all finishes offered by Kawneer.

#### The 190 Narrow Stile Entrance

- Is engineered for moderate traffic in applications such as stores, offices and apartment buildings
- Vertical stile measures 2-1/8"; top rail 2-1/4" and bottom rail 3-7/8"
- Results in a slim look that meets virtually all construction requirements

#### The 350 Medium Stile Entrance

- Provides extra strength for applications such as schools, institutions and other high traffic applications
- Vertical stiles and top rails measure 3-1/2"
- Bottom rail measures 10" for extra durability

#### The 500 Wide Stile Entrance

- Creates a monumental visual statement for applications such as banks, libraries and public buildings
- Vertical stiles and top rail are 5"; bottom rail measures 6-1/2"
- Results in superior strength for buildings experiencing heavy traffic conditions

#### General

- Heights vary to 10'; widths range from approximately 3' to 4'
- Door frame face widths range to a maximum of 4", while depths range to 6"
- Door operation is single or double-acting with maximum security locks or Touch Bar Panics standard
- Architect's Classic one inch round, bent bar push/pull hardware is available in various finishes and sizes
- Infills range from under 1/4" to more than 1"



Kawneer Company, Inc. Technology Park / Atlanta 555 Guthridge Court Norcross, GA 30092 kawneer.com 770 . 449 . 5555



© Kawneer Company, Inc. 2012–2017 LITHO IN U.S.A. Form No. 17-2225 Sealair™ and Permanodic™ are trademarks of Kawneer Company, Inc.



\* An arc welding process known as Shielded Inert Gas Metal Arc (SIGMA) or also known as Metal Inert Gas (MIG).



bottom webs of the rail extrusion complete the

welded corner construction.

DOOR TYPES/SECTION DIMENSIONS

6

EC 97911-191

#### Additional information and CAD details are available at www.kawneer.com





#### **JANUARY, 2019**

### 190/350/500 Standard Entrances

#### EC 97911-191

#### CONSTRUCTION DETAILS

#### Additional information and CAD details are available at www.kawneer.com

#### NOTE:

- 1. SERIES 190 NARROW STILE DOORS ARE DETAILED, MEDIUM STILE 350 DOORS AND WIDE STILE 500 DOORS ALSO MAY BE USED.
- 2. TRIFAB<sup>™</sup> VG 450 CENTER, 1-3/4" X 4-1/2" (44.5 X 114.3) FRAMING IS DETAILED WITH THE DOORS FOR REFERENCE. OTHER KAWNEER FRAMING SERIES OR CURTAIN WALL SYSTEMS MAY BE USED. REFER TO THE CATALOG INDEX FOR THE APPROPRIATE DETAIL SECTION.

9







5



PAIR OF DOUBLE ACTING DOORS



PAIR OF SINGLE ACTING DOORS





© Kawneer Company, Inc., 2015

CONSTRUCTION DETAILS

Additional information and CAD details are available at www.kawneer.com





© Kawneer Company, Inc., 2015

Laws and building and safety codes governing the design and use of glazed entrance, window, and curtain wall products vary widely. Kawneer does not control the selection of product configurations, operating hardware, or glazing materials, and assumes no responsibility therefor.