



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, July 12, 2018

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Vice Chair Max Cope called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 5 - Robert White, Evan Hall, Max Cope, Anna Epperson, and Jessica Quijano

Absent: 2 - John Beeson, and David Rochlen

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was approved as presented without objection.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

None

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

None

F **HEARINGS**

F-1 **18-1156** HDC18-129; 303 North Division - New Detached Garage - OFWHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Epperson and Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the

Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Jake Latton, representative from applicant Fireside Home Construction, LLC., PO BOX 307, Dexter, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Quijano, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the amended application at 303 N. Division Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to construct a single-story garage, on the following conditions: that the windows and door feature true divided lites, or applied exterior muntins, or no muntins at all. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential accessory structures.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Hall, Cope, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Vice Chair Beeson, and Rochlen

F-2 [18-1157](#) HDC18-026; 112-114 W Liberty - Replace numerous windows, Roofdeck -- MSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Epperson and Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Chris Figures, Biggdesigns, LLC., 127 E. Commerce Street, Suite 201, Milford, Architect, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Epperson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the application at 112-114 West Liberty Street, a contributing building in the Main Street Historic District, to:

- replace three modern windows on the third-floor front of 114 W Liberty with replicas of the third-floor front windows of 112 W Liberty**
- restore two contributing front windows (labeled C)**
- install wood replicas, based on matching surviving sashes, of 1) the third-floor lower sash of window E1 on 112 W Liberty; 2) the east lower sash of rear window G; and 3) the upper sash of rear window H2**
- install a new transom above the center front door, on the condition that staff approves the design at the building permit level**
- install a new wood center front door on the condition that the design is approved by staff and matches historic photos of the building**
- remove a non-original wood storefront trim band and repair the underlying bricks, or install a new cast stone trim band if staff determines that the bricks cannot be repaired**
- tuckpoint and repair damaged bricks**

- construct a new rooftop stair enclosure and deck, after staff approval of drawings
- install three new mechanical rooftop units
- install 10 steel bollards along the east elevation of the building, in the alley, contingent upon full approval by the City of Ann Arbor and/or the Downtown Development Association
- replace a steel non-original door with a matching door on the rear elevation.

As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 1, 2, 5, 6, 9, and 10 and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Hall, Cope, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Vice Chair Beeson, and Rochlen

Moved by Quijano, seconded by White, that Commission deny the portion of the application at 112-114 W Liberty Street in the Main Street Historic District to:

- replace six contributing windows on the front of 112 W Liberty
- replace nine contributing windows on the alley side of 112 W Liberty
- replace four windows on the rear elevation

as proposed because the windows are repairable and the work is not generally compatible in size, scale, massing and materials with the building and does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guideline for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standard 6 and the guidelines for windows, and does not meet the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Yeas: 5 - White, Hall, Cope, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Vice Chair Beeson, and Rochlen

G **NEW BUSINESS**

G-1 **18-1165** 1044 W Liberty Street - Historic Marker Request

Thacher provided the following application:

M E M O R A N D U M

To: Historic District Commissioners

From: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

Date: July 12, 2018

Re: Historic Plaque for 1044 W Liberty Street

This month staff received one application for a historic building plaque for the house at 1044 W Liberty Street, across from Eberwhite Boulevard. This one-and- three-quarter story gable fronter first appears in the 1919 Polk City Directory as the home of Jacob F. and Carolyn Fahrner. Jacob is listed as an Attorney-at-Law and Prosecuting Attorney. The home features a full-width, hip-roofed front porch with tapered round columns and square lattice skirting, original one-over-one windows and front door, wood lap siding, and shed dormers on the east and west elevations. It is in the National Register Old West Side Historic District.

The Historic District Commission will consider all of the following when reviewing an application for a historic property plaque.

- a) The building must be at least fifty years old, as documented by a combination of records (title search, tax records, wills, etc.).*
- b) The building must have been maintained, over time, in its original condition, or must have undergone historically appropriate restoration or rehabilitation.*
- c) The building may not have historically inappropriate features, enclosures or repairs.*
- d) The principal facades of the building visible from the street or any public right of way must maintain integrity of form, materials, and architectural features consistent with the dominant period of the building.*

The house is 99 years old. It has maintained its historic integrity and has had no significant exterior changes. The design of the house is ubiquitous in Ann Arbor, and its familiarity lends to its charm. It is an excellent, intact example of what an Ann Arbor home looked like a century ago.

Staff feels that a historic plaque is appropriate for the Jacob F. & Carolyn Fahrner House, located at 1044 W Liberty Street, based on the age of the house and the unaltered appearance of its character-defining architectural features.

Moved by Cope, seconded by White, that the 1919 Jacob F. & Carolyn Fahrner House at 1044 W Liberty Street meets the criteria for a City of Ann Arbor Historic Building marker based on its age, historic and architectural significance, and contribution to the history of Ann Arbor.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Application Approved

Yeas: 5 - White, Hall, Cope, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Vice Chair Beeson, and Rochlen

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

I **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS****J** **ASSIGNMENTS**

J-1 Review Committee: Monday, August 13, for the August 16, 2018 Regular Meeting

Thacher would follow-up with absent Commissioners for their availability.

Commissioner Max Cope volunteered for the August HDC Review Committee.

K **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

K-1 [18-1158](#) June 2018 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS****M** **COMMUNICATIONS**

M-1 [18-1159](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned without objection at 8:45 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794 6150.

Max Cope, Vice Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/

