



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Planning Commission, City

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Tuesday, July 18, 2017

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

1 **CALL TO ORDER**

Commissioner Clein called the meeting to order at 7:03 p.m.

2 **ROLL CALL**

Planning Manager Brett Lenart called the roll.

Present 9 - Woods, Briggs, Clein, Mills, Milshteyn, Gibb-Randall,
Trudeau, Weatherbee, and Ackerman

3 **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Moved by Mills, seconded by Gibb-Randall, to approve the agenda as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion unanimously approved.

4 **INTRODUCTIONS**

None.

5 **MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

6 **REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATOR, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER,
PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN
COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

6-a **City Council**

Commissioner Zach Ackerman provided updates from City Council, explaining that the items seen by the City Planning Commission; 143 Hill Street Planned Project, and the Design Guidelines have been passed by City Council.

6-b **Planning Manager**

Lenart explained that the street vacation of the former alley behind 3500 Washtenaw, the Washtenaw Commons development, was also approved by City Council. He also informed the Commission of new Planning administrative staff.

6-c Planning Commissions Officers and Committees

Commissioner Sarah Mills informed the Commission about the Allen Creek Greenway Citizen's Advisory meeting that took place on July 19th, 2017.

6-d Written Communications and Petitions

[17-1086](#) Various Correspondences to the City Planning Commission

7 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

8 PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING

Lenart shared that the next Planning Commission Meeting would be August 1st, stating that there are no new public hearings scheduled. He explained that the 1140 Broadway project is returning and will be the only agenda item on that date. He provided details regarding the upcoming Ordinance Revisions Committee meeting and commented on the insight they will provide on medical marijuana in light of recent State legislative changes.

9 UNFINISHED BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearings and Commission Discussion of each Item

- 9-a 17-1083** Homewood Suites at 2457 South State Street for City Council Approval - A proposal to demolish an existing building on this 2.04- acre parcel and construct a five-story, 95,723 square foot extended stay hotel with 110 rooms. Access to the site will be provided through a driveway on South State Street. A Planned Project Modification is requested to exceed maximum height of 55 feet. (Ward 4) Staff Recommendation: Approval
City Planner, Matt Kowalski presented the staff report and described the proposed site plan.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Andy Andre, Bud Design and Engineering, 10775 S Saginaw Street Suite B, Grand Blanc, MI, representing the petitioner, discussed the upgrades made to the plan since 2016 as well as some of the original aspects, including details about bicycles, shuttle, car charging stations, and solar panels.

Moved by Weatherbee, seconded by Milshteyn, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Homewood Suites Planned Project Site Plan subject to preliminary plan approval by the Washtenaw County Water Resources Commissioner.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission inquired about vehicle and bicycle parking, the windows, and exterior appearance of the proposed building, and about pedestrian safety near the site.

Andre responded to inquiries by providing details about parking, the building's appearance, and pedestrian safety.

On a voice vote, the vote was as following, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:

9-0

Yeas: 9 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

Nays: 0

17-1084 Sprint Temporary Cellular Facility (trailer) for City Planning Commission Approval - A proposed temporary cellular tower trailer to be located at 214 E. Madison Street for a three-month period from August 28, 2017 to November 28, 2017. (Ward 4) Staff Recommendation: Approval
City Planner, Matt Kowalski presented the staff report.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Wallace Haley, 10059 Bergin Road, Howell, MI, representing the petitioner commented on the floodplain. He stated that the water displacement of this proposed temporary cell tower would be equivalent to two milk crates. He addressed the possibility of a flood potentially

moving the proposed temporary cell tower and stated that his structural engineer developed an analysis and plan for that possibility. He clarified that the tower is not being placed to improve cell phone usage for people attending the football games nearby; he gave examples of first responders, existing sprint customers, and businesses that would benefit from the temporary cell tower.

Beverly Strassman, 545 South 5th Avenue, Ann Arbor, President of Germantown Neighborhood Association, discussed information in the staff report and expressed surprise that the temporary cell tower is being considered. She described the Fingerle floodplain. She expressed concern for the diesel noise, fumes, and that the temporary cell tower placement is being targeted at specific communities. She listed inconsistencies in the staff report and in the application for the temporary cell tower.

Claudiaus Vincent, 545 South 5th Avenue, Ann Arbor, expressed concern regarding the temporary cell tower being up for 6 months and inquired about environmental effects of the temporary cell tower.

Richard Jacobson, 538 South 5th Avenue, Ann Arbor, spoke of concerns about the length of time that the temporary cell tower would be running. He expressed concerns about noise, pollution, and other disturbances in the neighborhood.

Moved by Briggs, seconded by Woods that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission finds the petition to substantially meet the standards contained in Chapter 55 (Zoning Ordinance), Section 5:82 (Wireless Communication Facilities), and therefore approves the Temporary Telecommunications Facility – Cell On Wheels at 214 E. Madison Street for a monopole designed without the ability to co-locate additional antennae subject to approval by the Building Department.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON MAIN MOTION:

The Commission inquired about the targeted user of the temporary cell tower. They also inquired about future strategies to mitigate the problem of compromised service on game days.

Haley responded to inquiries.

AMENDMENT I

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Mills to restrict operation to

University of Michigan home football game days only, and further restrict operation to no more than 4 hours prior to home football game start time and 2 hours after home football games.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON AMENDMENT I:

The Commission discussed safety concerns related to the proposed location of the temporary cell tower.

Haley responded to concerns.

AMENDMENT II

Moved by Trudeau, seconded by Mills, that any approval shall expire on December 31, 2017.

DISCUSSION ON AMENDMENT II:

Ackerman inquired about fencing around the proposed site.

Haley responded that they are working to design a fence that would be attached to the trailer.

Ackerman also inquired about finding a permanent solution.

Haley responds to inquiries discussing the changes in technology and describing how temporary cell towers may not be needed in the future.

Ackerman describes his discomfort with supporting this project.

VOTE ON AMENDED MOTION

Moved by Briggs, seconded by Woods that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission finds the petition to substantially meet the standards contained in Chapter 55 (Zoning Ordinance), Section 5:82 (Wireless Communication Facilities), and therefore approves the Temporary Telecommunications Facility – Cell On Wheels at 214 East Madison Street for a monopole designed without the ability to co-locate additional antennae subject to approval by the Building Department.

A motion was made that the Resolution/Public Hearing be Approved by the Commission as Amended. On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:

7-2

Yeas: 7 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, and Julie Weatherbee

Nays: 2 - Alex Milshteyn, and Zachary Ackerman

10 **REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearings and Commission Discussion of each Item**

10-a **17-1085** Proposed Amendment to Chapter 55 (Zoning Ordinance) For City Council Approval- An amendment to add standards and requirements for ground based Solar Energy Systems (SES) located in single or two family districts or associated with single family uses in the R3 (Townhouse) or R4C (Multiple-Family) Zoning Districts. At this time, all SES are regulated the same as accessory buildings. This ordinance will create a dedicated section with code requirements specifically for SES and related equipment. With this code amendment, a SES will be required to be screened in the front yard and will not be permitted within the required front setback area of a parcel. Staff Recommendation: Approval.

Matt Kowalski presented the staff report, described the amendment, and explained the changes made to the current draft.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Irma Majer, 2809 Brockman Boulevard, Ann Arbor, expressed concern, as well as a request to postpone the proposed amendment to allow for more community discussion.

Earnesto Figueroa, 2815 Brockman Boulevard, Ann Arbor, explained that he has great care for the quality of his neighborhood and has no intention of creating an eyesore. He discussed climate change and concluded that his intentions are environmental.

Michael Fahn, 1531 Packard #7, Ann Arbor, expressed concern regarding lack of public involvement for this issue and requested postponement.

Moved by Briggs, seconded by Woods that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the amendments to Chapter 55, the addition of Section 5:83 (Solar Energy Systems) regarding solar panels and related equipment in residential zoning districts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission discussed the importance of alternative energy, and the coverage and vegetation aspects that are associated with having structures in front yards.

**Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Milshteyn, to postpone taking action until a future meeting. On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried
9-0**

10-b [17-1092](#) Organizational Meeting

1. Approval of City Planning Commission/Staff FY2017-2018 Work Program
2. Review of Bylaws
3. Vote of Officers

1. Approval of City Planning Commission/Staff FY2017-2018 Work Program

Lenart explained the prioritization of the proposed work program.

Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Weatherbee, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves of the fiscal year 2017-2018 Planning Commission Work Program as presented.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON APPROVAL OF THE FISCAL YEAR 2017-2018 PLANNING COMMISSION WORK PROGRAM:

Mills commented that the the prioritization of the list is satisfactory. She pointed out that the dates for the Downtown Zoning A2D2 Amendments –Edge Properties and R4C/R2A Amendment Zoning Amendments have passed and inquired about the next step for working with those projects

Lenart suggested changing the Downtown Zoning A2D2 Amendments –Edge Properties timeframe to be completed by June 30th, 2018 and suggested leaving the timeframe for the R4C/R2A Zoning Amendments blank.

AMENDMENT I

To amend the the project time frames for the Downtown Zoning A2D2 Amendments –Edge Properties project timeframe to June 30th, 2018 and to remove the timeframe for the R4C/R2A Zoning

Amendments.*COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON AMENDMENT I:*

Clein suggested that the commission plan a work session or an ORC meeting to review the Edge Properties.

Woods inquired about the use of a consultant for the R4C/R2A Amendment Zoning Amendments.

Lenart responded that there is a possibility of having a consultant working on that project.

Weatherbee commented on the importance of working on the R4C/R2A Amendment Zoning Amendments.

A motion was made that the fiscal year 2017-2018 Planning Work Program be Approved by the Commission as Amended. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

9-0

Approval of Committee Assignments

Lenart explained the Planning Commission Assignment draft.

Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Mills that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves, the fiscal year 2017-2018 Planning Commission Committee Assignments as presented including the elimination of the Capital Improvements and Citizen Outreach Committees.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION ON COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENTS:

Clein discussed the removal Citizen Outreach Committee as related to the motion, stating that it has run it's course and he supports removing it.

On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion unanimously approved.

2. Review of Bylaws

Lenart explained that the Bylaws need to be reviewed every year in July. He also stated that the City Attorney's office does not recommend any changes to the bylaws at this time. The commission Agreed, retain their current Bylaws.

3. Vote of Officers

Lenart explained the process of voting for officers.

Moved by Ackerman, seconded by Trudeau, to retain the current slate of officers until July 2018.

DISCUSSION ON VOTE OF OFFICERS:

Ackerman expressed satisfaction with the officers in their current positions.

On a voice vote, Lenart declared the motion unanimously approved.

Approval of Committee Member Attendance at the Michigan Association of Planning Conference

Lenart explained the benefits for new Planning Commission members to attend the MAP conference and shared that Weatherbee is interested in attending the conference. Lenart also shared that the conference is taking place on Mackinac Island.

Moved by Clein, seconded by Milshteyn to approve the attendance of Commissioner Weatherbee at the Michigan Association of Planning Conference.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION OF COMMITTEE MEMBER ATTENDANCE AT THE MICHIGAN ASSOCIATION OF PLANNING CONFERENCE:

The Commission took into consideration the attendance of Weatherbee at the MAP conference and discussed the benefits of Weatherbee attending. They also discussed the location of the conference.

On a voice vote, the vote was the following with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 9-0

11 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item)

None.

12 COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

None.

13 ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Weatherbee, to adjourn the meeting at 9:57 p.m. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

Ken Clein, Chair

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Wednesdays at 10:00 AM and Sundays at 2:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website (www.a2gov.org).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.