



# City of Ann Arbor

## Formal Minutes

### Planning Commission, City

301 E. Huron St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/  
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

---

Tuesday, May 2, 2017

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second  
floor, City Council Chambers

---

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: [cityclerk@a2gov.org](mailto:cityclerk@a2gov.org); or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>) or on the 1st floor of City Hall on the Friday before the meeting. Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

#### **1 CALL TO ORDER**

*Chairperson Ken Clein called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.*

#### **2 ROLL CALL**

*Planning Manager Brett Lenart called the roll.*

**Present** 8 - Woods, Briggs, Clein, Milshteyn, Gibb-Randall, Trudeau,  
Weatherbee, and Ackerman

**Absent** 1 - Mills

#### **3 APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

**Moved by Weatherbee, seconded by Trudeau, that the Agenda be Approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

#### **4 INTRODUCTIONS**

*None*

#### **5 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

**6      REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

**6-a      City Council**

*Councilmember Zach Ackerman reported that Collegian North site plan was approved unanimously last night at the City Council meeting, as was 315-317 South Main Street site plan.*

*City Council presented explicit interest to City staff to explore options for Community Solar. He explained that Community Solar is a system to pool resources to build solar panels on properties that can allow for larger arrays or greater access to sun and is a benefit to people whose property or wallet don't support solar for themselves.*

*Additionally, Council laid out that sustainability measures (ranging from solar to insulation) should be examined when new capital construction is considered on City property.*

**6-b      Planning Manager**

*Adding 'carwashes' and 'service stations' to the City's zoning ordinance was also passed by Council at first reading. He reported that Council had also appointed a Study Committee to study and consider historic designation of the Inglis House, which is currently being considered for sale by the University of Michigan.*

*Lenart reported that at next week's Working Session he anticipated having follow-up from the Commission's retreat which will lead to the annual review and approval of the City's Master Plan as well as beginning to formulate programs (to include ordinance amendments) for the Commission's work plan for FY2017-2018.*

*Discussion is also planned to discuss how Planned Projects, Planned Unit Developments, and Conditional Zonings are different tools that the Commission has been seeing lately and this will give everyone an opportunity to explore definitions as well as presenting questions.*

**6-c      Planning Commission Officers and Committees**

*Chair Clein updated the Commission on the Ordinance Revision's Committee (ORC) meeting where they discussed solar issues.*

**6-d Written Communications and Petitions**

[17-0683](#) Various Correspondences to the City Planning Commission

**Received and Filed**

**7 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)**

**8 PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING**

**8-a** [17-0684](#) Public Hearings Scheduled for the May 16, 2017 City Planning Commission Meeting

*Planning Manager Lenart read the Public Hearing Notice as published.*

**Received and Filed**

**9 UNFINISHED BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

**9-a** [17-0685](#) Circle K Gas Station Site Plan for City Council Approval - A proposal to demolish the existing 2,360-square foot gas station/convenience store building, relocate the gas station pump island and construct a new 4,000-square foot retail building and pump island canopy on this 0.86 acre parcel. Two curb cuts are proposed to be removed: one on Packard and one on Stadium. A Landscape Modification is being requested to allow some of the existing landscaping to remain. Variances are being requested from the required rear setback, landscape buffer width and driveway widths. (Ward 4) Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Matt Kowalski presented the staff report. The parcel is split zoned between C3 (Fringe Commercial) and P (Parking) districts. The entire site is being demolished and replaced with a new, proposed 4,000 square foot building. They are proposing four pump islands under the canopy. 14 parking spaces are being provided in addition to those under the canopy. Two curb cuts are being proposed to be removed; one each from Packard Road and one from Stadium Avenue. A Landscape Modification is being required to retain several of the landmark trees on the site. Several variances are required for this plan, including curb cut width, rear yard*

*setback variance, and the 15 foot conflicting land use buffer. This plan has gone through various versions after feedback from Planning Commission, staff and the public. The staff report had an error that referenced a wooden fence; it is in fact a masonry fence. This project is scheduled to go to the Zoning Board of Appeals on May 24th.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Lindsey McDivitt, 1419 Iroquois Place, Ann Arbor, read a statement (included in the packet) outlining her regrets for the need for the City to provide variances; however, she thinks this plan is an improvement over all of the other plans that have come before the Commission, the neighbors, and staff. She asked the Planning Commission to continue to address light and traffic issues and she appreciates the provision of a 10 foot tall fence that will greatly help her parcel as well as her neighbors, whose properties are two feet higher than the Circle K property. She also hopes that the lights in the canopy will be recessed into the canopy to minimize seeing them by the neighbors. She expressed great concern with advertising noise coming from the pumps as well as from idling trucks that can sit idling for 30 minutes; she asked for these issues to be addressed.*

*Garrett Scott, 1421 Iroquois Place, Ann Arbor, said he wants to emphasize that faced with a variance or the 'by-right' plan, he supports this compromised plan, despite the need for variances. He said his neighbors and he believe the placement of pumps and building screens much of the activity, it improves traffic flow and makes it more safe, and moves delivery traffic away from the residents; additionally, the building is oriented more to the street than to the neighbors. He hoped this compromise plan can move forward, and he is happy to speak to neighborhood perspectives and on the evolution of this plan.*

*Scott Munzel, Attorney with Pear, Spearling & Eggan, spoke on behalf of Circle K, introduced the petitioner, owner, engineer and contractor. He agreed there has been a lengthy history with this site, pointing out that the City's code doesn't always work on real life sites in the real world. He thinks the placement of the building will help create a more functional site, minimizing impact on the neighbors. He reported that the commissioned noise study concluded that at the 8-foot masonry wall they would have a significant reduction on the noise level from what is on the site right now. He added that any and all noise levels would have to meet the City's noise ordinance at all times. He was confident that the Commission would pass this site plan, so the project can move on to the*

*Zoning Board of Appeals and the City Council.*

*Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Woods, seconded by Gibb-Randall that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Circle K Site Plan, subject to approval of variances (driveway width, rear setback, landscape buffer) from the Zoning Board of Appeals.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

*Ackerman appreciated everyone's involvement in this project process; he appreciated the extension of the masonry wall height. He said he still had concerns about the parking spaces that are not screened by the building itself. He felt the canopy lighting at example-site was less intrusive. He asked if the white light would be used.*

*Rianna Szatkowski, Quatro Construction LLC., 201 N Park Street, Ypsilanti, responded that the parking spaces would be at an elevation that will result in approximately 4-6 feet of wall above the anticipated headlight level.*

*Rich Lawrence, owner of Circle K, responded that the similar white light as the 'example-canopy' on Michigan Avenue and Carpenter Ave. In response to Commissioner Ackerman's question about the ads on the pumps he said they won't play when no one is at the pump and they won't be heard beyond 10 feet from the pumps.*

*Clein asked whether the lighting in the canopy will be recessed into the canopy.*

*Lawrence confirmed that the light color is 5700 Kelvin, and is a fairly blue/white light.*

*Gibb-Randall asked about the elevation of the top of the wall compared to the parking lot.*

*Lawrence reiterated it would be at an elevation that will result in*

*approximately 4-6 feet of wall above the anticipated headlight level.*

*Briggs expressed appreciation of the public comment that has been a part of the evolution of this plan and encourages the neighbors to provide ongoing feedback.*

*Kowalski confirmed that the photometric ranges are from 36-54 under the canopy, and they transitions from 9 at the canopy edge to 0 or 0.1 at the property boundary.*

*Clein expressed appreciation for the neighbors and petitioner for their work on this process.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote:8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Sarah Mills

**Moved by Woods, seconded by Gibb-Randall, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the proposed landscape modification in order to allow existing landscape elements to remain according to Chapter 62 (Landscape and Screening Ordinance), Section 5:608(2) (c)(iv).**

**On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote:8-0**

**10      REGULAR BUSINESS - Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

(If an agenda item is tabled, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a tabled agenda item will appear on a future agenda, please provide your email address on the form provided on the front table at the meeting. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org)).

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

- 10-a**      **17-0686**      Homewood Suites at 2457 South State Street for City Council Approval - A proposal to demolish an existing building on this 2.04- acre parcel and construct a five-story, 95,723 square foot extended stay hotel with 110 rooms. Access to the site will be provided through a driveway on South State Street. A Planned Project Modification is requested to exceed maximum height of 55 feet. (Ward 4) Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Kowalski presented the staff report. He explained it is currently zoned C3 (Fringe Commercial) and is the former Computer Medic building which is proposed to be demolished for a Homewood Suites Hotel. The Planned Project Modification is to exceed the height limitation of the C3 district. They are providing a green roof on the parking deck, and will include an understructure parking. Access to the site uses existing curbcut, which will continue to be shared by this site and the adjacent property. Two Cottonwood landmark trees are being proposed to be removed.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*David Diephuis, 2096 S. State Street, Ann Arbor, said in his view the benefits being offered in exchange for the height exception, he thought that a mid-block crossing would be a better improvement. He stated with improvements to the University of Michigan athletic complex under construction, there will be great demand for pedestrian movement between this hotel and the athletic complex. He appreciates the bus passes, but thinks they should be guaranteed.*

*Andy Andre, Bud Design & Engineering Services, Inc., 10775 S Saginaw Street, Suite B, Grand Blanc, Civil Engineer working for the project explained the owners of this project is the same owner that recently completed the Staybridge Suites project and Holiday Inn Express on*

*Research Park Drive; this is a Hilton affiliated extended stay hotel. He further noted there is a gap in the market which allows this hotel to come to the market, as the hotel brand is under represented. Andre said they have worked diligently with staff to maximize the potential of this property; the property includes two landmark trees, which will have to be removed, followed by mitigation. He said they don't need the green roof to meet the stormwater standards, noting this provision is in addition to the infiltration requirements by the Washtenaw County Water Resource Commissioner (WCWRC).*

*Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Briggs, seconded by Milshteyn, that the Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Homewood Suites Planned Project Site Plan subject to preliminary plan approval by the Washtenaw County Water Resources Commissioner.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

*Weatherbee said this is an area she has walked by several times, and is a great location for a hotel. She asked how the mandating of bus passes would function for employees and guests. She expressed support for solar to be considered on this project and believes that a midblock crossing is a good idea.*

*Ackerman asked the petitioner to walk through the stormwater system proposal with the Commission.*

*Andre responded there is an existing detention basin located to the east of the property, noting there are multiple properties that are a part of the drainage district. Andre said the plan is to use infiltration, retention, and release-restricted discharge into the area detention basin.*

*Ackerman asked if all of the proposed parking needs to be provided per code or could three spaces be eliminated. He also asked about market data.*

*Andre said that they could work with staff to eliminate the parking spaces*

*and potentially replace them with an additional bio retention. He confirmed that the basketball court is part of the impervious surface calculation.*

*Andre responded to Ackerman's question about market data and typical guest profile; the Market Study shows a gap of extended stay hotels, where the typical guests are business travelers, attendees at athletic events, staying likely from 3-30 days.*

*Ackerman asked if Homewood Suites is considered a shuttle to campus or downtown.*

*Andre responded yes, it's being considered.*

*Ackerman asked about the inexistant entrance and the plain design facing State Street. Ackerman asked if it were possible to further engage the street through design or the entry.*

*Andre responded that they would be open to architectural enhancements to the building.*

*Ackerman said he would like more information about the plan for a pedestrian crossing in the area.*

*Clein asked the petitioner to consider more transparency into the west elevation.*

*Andre indicated they could review the elevation and potential floor plan adjustments to look for possible additional glazing additions.*

*Clein stated that structuring parking is a good thing but additional changes may help the Planned Project requirements. Clein asked about materials and if the proposed brick would be full dimentional.*

*Andre responded it would be stone, brick, and EIFS (lighter colored material on top) and the brick would be full dimentional.*

*Woods recommended a postponement, adding she was not sure about the public benefit in this project.*

*Briggs asked for more clarity around the bus passes, and the transparency around the west elevation. She also would like to see bikes provided to the public.*

*Gibb Randall asked about the turn-round on top of the structure.*

*Andre responded that it provides guests and other users the opportunity to circulate, without having a cumbersome pattern of traffic, should the parking be full.*

*Gibb-Randall asked if a green circle could be incorporated into the middle, as the full diameter is needed for adequate circulation.*

*Andre said they would take it into consideration.*

*Woods expressed concern about how people will be able to cross the street, adding the Commission should have that information as part of their consideration of the site plan.*

**Moved by Woods, seconded by Briggs, to postpone taking action until a revised plan is available. On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote:8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Sarah Mills

- 10-b**      [17-0687](#)      Grace Bible Church Landscape Modification for City Planning Commission Approval - A Landscape Modification for Planning Commission Approval is being requested along the north property line. The request is associated with an Administrative Amendment to the site plan to add a 2,858-square foot addition to the front of the existing church, located on this 35.42-acre site at 1300 South Maple Road, is being reviewed by staff. Impervious surface will be removed and a storm sewer will need to be re-routed. (Ward 5) Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Kowalski presented the staff report with the location near Miller and Pauline. The church is located on the northern section, and is adjacent to Hansen Nature area. A Landscape Modification is being requested in conjunction with an Administrative Amendment to the Site Plan. They are asking for the existing landscape plan to remain given there are several landscape islands that have mature trees that would have to be removed to comply with current landscape requirements. The City's*

*Natural Resources Coordinator supports the request.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Rob Wagner, Midwestern Consulting, representing Grace Bible Church was present to answer questions from the Commission.*

*Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Briggs, seconded by Trudeau, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the proposed landscape modifications in order to maintain the previously approved landscape plan according to Chapter 62 (Landscape and Screening Ordinance), Section 5:608(2)(c)(vii).**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

*Gibb-Randall stated the City has rules in place that require additions to the site to comply with current standards; what makes this project different?*

*Kowalski responded that the City Forester considered the removal of existing trees for the sake of planting new trees.*

*Gibb Randall asked why doesn't the property have to meet the stormwater requirements.*

*Kowalski clarified that significant landscaping is being provided.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried.**

**Vote: 7-1**

**Yeas:** 7 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Alex Milshteyn, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 1 - Shannan Gibb-Randall

**Absent:** 1 - Sarah Mills

- 10-c**      **17-0688**      Geddes Lake Site Plan and Landscape Modification for City Planning Commission Approval - A proposal to construct 55 new parking spaces along Skynob and Watersedge Drives, provide a new infiltration basin, restore Lakehaven Drain, raise the top of South Pond embankment, extend water main with hydrant to serve office and community center at Geddes Lake Condominiums, located on this 62.45-acre site at 3000 Lakehaven Drive. (Ward 2) Staff Recommendation: Approval

*Kowalski provided the staff report. The petitioner is adding 57 parking spaces to the proposed development. They are adding a new infiltration basin from stormwater needs. They are proposing to restore Lake Haven by pulling out invasive species and restoring the creek, along with improving the dam system. They are providing 36 class A bike spaces throughout the site, and requesting a Landscaping Modification to keep existing parking lot areas and to enable the maintenance of existing mature trees, while not requiring additional landscaping islands in banks of the parking area through the site.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Ken Cousino, Engineering Technologies, representing the petitioner said this plan has numerous dimensions; it added parking which required the additional stormwater improvements.*

*Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed unless the item is postponed.*

**Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Weatherbee that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the Geddes Lake (3000 Lakehaven Drive) Site Plan for Planning Commission Approval.**

**On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 8-0**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

*Weatherbee asked about the need for so many additional parking spots.*

*Cousino responded that they performed a study that identified the areas to help relieve the high demand for parking on site.*

*Milshteyn stated that based on his experience, parking is an issue for this area, and the development would benefit from additional parking.*

*Woods asked for clarification on the dam improvements.*

*Cousino responded that the dam was functioning as a detention basin; however, the dam wasn't built at the right level and raising the level will help ensure the dam doesn't fail and compromise adjacent wetlands.*

*Gibb-Randall asked the petitioner to describe the restoration of the creek.*

*Cousino said they anticipate adding a sedimentation basin, and removing the vegetation that is compromising the flow of the creek.*

*Gibb-Randall asked the petitioner to consider native plantings rather than grass as part of the restoration process.*

**On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Sarah Mills

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Weatherbee that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the proposed landscape modifications according to Chapter 62 (Landscape and Screening Ordinance), Sections 5:607 (1)(2)(3) and 5:608 (2)(c)(iv)(v) (vii).**

**On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously. Vote: 8-0**

**Yeas:** 8 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Kenneth Clein, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Scott Trudeau, Julie Weatherbee, and Zachary Ackerman

**Nays:** 0

**Absent:** 1 - Sarah Mills

**10-d**     [17-0689](#)     Approval of the 2017-2018 Planning Commission Meeting Calendar

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**Moved by Milshteyn, seconded by Weatherbee to approve the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission Meeting Schedule July 2017- June 2018.**

**On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

**11**     **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)**

*David Diephius, commented that as the Commission reconciles the Homewood Suites property they should keep in mind that the South State Corridor Plan was completed prior to the University of Michigan purchase of the Edward’s Brothers Property.*

**12**     **COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

**13**     **ADJOURNMENT**

**Moved by Woods, seconded by Trudeau, to adjourn the meeting at 9:28 p.m. On a voice vote, the vote was as following with the Chair declaring the motion carried unanimously.**

Ken Klein, Chair  
mg

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Channel 16 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Thursdays at 8:00 AM and Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website ([www.a2gov.org](http://www.a2gov.org)).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.