



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Thursday, September 8, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B. ROLL CALL

Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner called the roll.

Present: 4 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Benjamin L. Bushkuhl,
and John Beeson

Absent: 3 - Jennifer Ross, Evan Hall, and Max Cope

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

None

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS - HEARINGS

E-1. 16-1287 HDC16-157; 315-321 S Main - New Downtown Building - MSHD

*Revisions were resubmitted for the application at 315 South Main Street
to demo a noncontributing building and replace it with a new structure.*

Please reference the detail provided in the addendum by the applicant.

The revisions include:

- 1. A heavier cornice profile at level 3.*
- 2. More uniform coloration of the Mankato stone.*
- 3. Modified window aspect ratio on floors 4-6 and sun shades on the west-facing windows.*
- 4. Larger terrace setbacks from the front parapet.*
- 5. Added south elevation recesses to break up the wall surface visually.*

Staff believes the revisions to the project are appropriate and responsive to concerns of the HDC expressed at the August 11, 2016 meeting. For the applicable standards and guidelines, please see the attached August 11 Staff Report.

Jill Thacher presented the memo of revisions.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

The September Review Committee did not visit the site, since previous month's Committee had.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Richard Mitchell, Mitchell and Mouat Architects, IHC, 113 S. Fourth Ave., Ann Arbor, Architect and Applicant was present, along with the owner, to respond to enquiries of the Commission. Mitchell reviewed the revisions in detail.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by White, seconded by Bushkuhl, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 315-321 S. Main Street, a non-contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to demolish the existing one story building and construct a six floor mixed use building, as revised by the applicant for the September 8, 2016 Historic District Commission meeting. The revised work compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to adjacent and surrounding buildings and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to New Construction in Historic Commercial Settings.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, and Vice Chair Beeson

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

F. HEARINGS

F-1. **16-1289** HDC16-159; 338 Mulholland Avenue - Foundation & Driveway - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and White visited the site as part of their review.

Ramsburgh reported that the site represented the necessity of replacing the driveway in every way; the terrain, the slope, the house, the narrowness of the driveway, the condition of the driveway, all point to the fact that the best thing is to replace the existing with a cement paved driveway. She said the Commission likes to save two-track driveways whenever possible, but this one doesn't make sense to save, which is the same for the porch foundation which is clearly deteriorated and in need of replacement and meets the guidelines.

White agreed with Ramsburgh and the staff report and supported the project.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Robert Pulcipher, 338 Mulholland Street, Ann Arbor, owner, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 338 Mulholland Street, a contributing building in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a full concrete driveway and remove a concrete walk, and replace the front porch foundation, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets

the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for driveways and paved areas and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, and Vice Chair Beeson

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

F-2. [16-1290](#) HDC16-160; 203 Koch Avenue - Addition, Raising Roof, etc. - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. She noted that the Review Committee discovered concerns during their visit, prompting the owner to request time to further investigate the discoveries.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Ramsburgh reported that the application is lacking in many details and it makes it difficult for the Commission to make a decision when the application is incomplete. She noted that the drawings were also inaccurate and when standing in the backyard it was clear to see that the drawings were not representing the case with the house, so a postponement seems fair to the applicant.

She further explained that the cedar shake siding under the siding is in really good shape, as is the house. She noted that the house had pieces of plywood installed which they believed could be removed to expose brackets underneath.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by White, seconded by Beeson, to postpone taking action to allow applicant to provide more information.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

Chair Bushkuhl recommended that the Architect visit the site, because the drawings clearly had dimensions that were incorrect.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Item postponed.

Yeas: 4 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, and Vice Chair Beeson

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

F-3. [16-1291](#) HDC16-182; 115 West Washington Street - New Sign - LSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and White visited the site as part of their review.

White reported that he agreed with the staff report and he supports the project.

Ramsburgh agreed with White and the staff report, adding that she felt the revised sign plans blend better with the paint, and the reduction of the bracket is a big improvement. She said the proposed sign draws more attention than the existing, in a positive way, and while the Commission does not like to see signs get larger, in this case, with the reduced bracket size, it outweighs the enlargement of the sign and meets the guidelines.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Mark Chalou, Chalou Designs, 3458 East Pineview, Dexter, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White, that the Historic District Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 115 W. Washington Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a new business sign on the following conditions: the mounting bracket is installed through existing masonry penetrations, or through mortar joints, not through masonry units; and no additional signage may be added to the storefront. Additionally, this project will be detailed according to the handouts distributed at the meeting. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for signs, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, and Vice Chair Beeson

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

F-4. [16-1292](#) HDC16-197; 340 Eighth Street - Garage Replacement - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and White visited the site as part of their review.

Ramsburgh reported that four years ago she was on the Review Committee that visited the site when an earlier and different application came before them. She said the garage is large, but the lot is a very deep lot and the setback from the house will be considerable as will the setback from the rear property line. She stated that on this site, on this location, this size garage is okay, while in most cases it would not be, given that its' footprint is larger than the house.

White agreed with Ramsburgh and the staff report and supported the project.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Harold Kirchen, 340 Eighth Street, Ann Arbor, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission approve the application at 340 Eighth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a new one-and-a-half-story garage and wood privacy fence, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for building site and district or neighborhood setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, and Vice Chair Beeson

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

F-5. [16-1293](#) HDC16-198; 547 Detroit Street - New Addition - OFWHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Ramsburgh and White visited the site as part of their review.

Ramsburgh reported that the site is a very interesting site, being the last residential house on the west side of Detroit Street, noting it is a tall and narrow house. She said the shape of the lot dictates the shape of the proposed addition, and from the shown vantage point it will really not be visible and the removal of the fire escape will improve the historic part of the house, and she supports the application.

She said the Review Committee have concerns about the large tree that will be impacted by the addition, pointing out depending on the species of the tree it could need staff approval to be removed or it might have to come back to the HDC for their review.

Ramsburgh said the rear part of the lot drops off sharply.

Thacher said she has an appointment set up with the City's Forester to discuss the tree situation, adding that the diameter is larger than 18 inches so it would be considered a landmark tree and would need Commission approval to be removed. She suggested adding it to the current application for discussion and review.

White agreed with Ramsburgh and the staff report and supported the project.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Kevin Adkins, 4545 Pontiac Trail, Ann Arbor, Architect, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Zack Mintzias, 526 Sixth Street, Ann Arbor, co-owner, was also present.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 547 Detroit Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic

District, to add a two-story rear addition, as proposed. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2,5,9, and 10 and the guidelines for new additions and building site, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for new additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Bushkuhl, and Vice Chair Beeson

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Ross, Hall, and Cope

G. NEW BUSINESS

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [16-1294](#) Minutes of the July 14, 2016 HDC Meeting

Amended

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. Review Committee: Monday, October 17, 2016, at Noon for the October 20, 2016 Regular Meeting

Commissioner Beeson volunteered for the October HDC Review Committee. Thacher would contact Max Cope to see if he was available

to join as well.

K. **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

K-1. [16-1296](#) August 2016 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L. **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

M. **COMMUNICATIONS**

[16-1297](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:06 p.m.