

**Ann Arbor City Council Regular Session: June 16, 2014
Email Redactions List Pursuant to Council Resolution R-09-386**

	A	B	C	D	E	F	G
	<u>Received</u>						
1	<u>Sent Time</u>	<u>Time</u>	<u>TO</u>	<u>From</u>	<u>CC</u>	<u>Redactions</u>	<u>Reason for Redaction</u>
2		7:13 PM	Jacqueline Beaudry	Stephen Postema	All City Council		
3		7:59 PM	John Hieftje, Steve Powers, Sabra Briere, Sumi Kailasapathy, Jane Lumm, Christopher Taylor, Stephen Kunselman, Jack Eaton, Margie Teall, Mike Anglin, Chuck Warpehoski, Sally Petersen, Tom Crawford	Kai Petainen		Email address	Privacy
4		8:44 PM	Sumi Kailasapathy	Will Hathaway		Email address	Privacy
5		8:46 PM	Sally Petersen	Will Hathaway		Email address, Phone Number	Privacy
6		10:27 PM	All City Council	Jacqueline Beaudry	Anissa Bowden, Steve Powers		
7		10:30 PM	Jacqueline Beaudry, all City Council	Jane Lumm	Anissa Bowden, Steve Powers		
8		10:35 PM	Jane Lumm	Jane Lumm			
9		11:58 PM	All City Council	Jacqueline Beaudry	Steve Powers, Anissa Bowden		

Alexa, Jennifer

From: Postema, Stephen
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 7:13 PM
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Cc: *City Council Members (All)
Subject: FW: File: A12-00217 Goldstone, Andrew K. v City and Kevin Warner, Injury Lawsuit
Attachments: 00032945.docx

CyAutold: 1535643
CycomPath: C:\CYCOMSQL\
CyMatterId: 1436609
CyMultiRecMemos: N
CyStaffId: SKP

From: Postema, Stephen
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 2:29 PM
To: Postema, Stephen
Subject: File: A12-00217 Goldstone, Andrew K. v City and Kevin Warner, Injury Lawsuit

** Attached file(s): Resolution Directing the City Attorney in the matter of Goldstone v (00032945.docx)

..Title

Resolution Regarding *Goldstone v. Warner*, Washtenaw County Trial Court Case No. 13-58 NO.

..Body

RESOLVED, That the City Council authorizes the City Attorney to resolve the case entitled *Goldstone v. Warner*, Washtenaw County Trial Court Case No. 13-58 NO, in the manner discussed in Closed Sessions. The Plaintiff has submitted a properly executed settlement and release containing the offer of settlement.

Alexa, Jennifer

From: Kai Petainen [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 7:59 PM
To: Hieftje, John; Powers, Steve; Briere, Sabra; Kailasapathy, Sumi; Lumm, Jane; Taylor, Christopher (Council); Kunselman, Stephen; Eaton, Jack; Teall, Margie; Anglin, Mike; Warpehoski, Chuck; Petersen, Sally; Crawford, Tom
Cc: rabhiy@ewashtenaw.org; smithd@ewashtenaw.org; info@markschauer.com
Subject: SPARK... my public comments at council. june 16, 2016
Attachments: Kai's Public Comment July162014.pdf

Dear Council members and media.

Attached are my public comments with respect to SPARK that I presented at the Ann Arbor city council on June 16, 2016.

SPARK was co-founded by Governor Snyder, so the non-profit has a state-wide interests.

Media,

You are welcome to publish it as an Op-Ed, Letter to the Editor, etc....

-kai petainen
ann arbor, michigan

Council members have asked SPARK multiple times for concrete numbers and data to back up SPARK's claims. I should not be doing SPARK's job, but it appears that I am. I got the audited financial statements for you, and now I bring some official job numbers to you.

I went to Dollar Bill Printing and printed out the official job report for you. The report is attached to a memo given by the ex-CEO of SPARK (the CEO of the MEDC), to the co-founder of SPARK (Governor Snyder). It is dated March 31st, 2014. So it is a new report and it covers the time between 2006 and 2013. The report covers the Pre-Seed, Angel and Microloan funds that SPARK managed and it shows how many jobs were created. The report was required by the Michigan Strategic Fund Act and the 21st Century Jobs Trust Fund legislation. To me, this is SPARK's official job report and they should have provided it to you when you were asking them questions, weeks ago. Council Member Lumm, you asked for some hard data about SPARK, and I have now provided you with that – SPARK should have given this to you long ago. If the report is missing some job numbers or some companies, then we should find out why and notify the appropriate officials that the report is incomplete. Otherwise, it is a complete and accurate report that was required in an Act. No job audit is needed, as this is the official data.

Here are some red flags I'd like to highlight.

SPARK's annual report claims it created 13,025 jobs, \$1.5 billion in investment and helped 547 new companies. But, the official report shows 630 jobs, \$229 million in investment and 129 companies. [in a speech I'll round these numbers for time]

The LDFA states that it is about helping local businesses, but in the official report, only 45% of the micro-loan companies are actually listed in the Ann Arbor/Ypsi area.

Council Member Petersen will note how many jobs are created, but the number she cites is the projected number of jobs and not the actual number of jobs created.

Projected job numbers are questionable. For example, in the Pre-Seed funds at SPARK, there was a forecast of 4,450 jobs, but only 304 jobs were created, and only 4% (194.5 jobs) of the projected jobs stayed in Michigan. [in a speech, I'll round these numbers for time]

According to SPARK's audit, their

"investments are all in start-up companies located in Washtenaw County"

Since all investments are reportedly in Washtenaw, should we notify taxpayers supporting SPARK in other counties that they were screwed?

The audit states that the companies are all in Washtenaw, but the official report appears to show that they are not. As such, I believe that an independent financial audit should be done.

I ask city council to vote 'no', or at least postpone the vote. If you vote 'yes' at this point, then you are rushing to a 'yes' vote without analyzing the official document and numbers, and as such I feel that it would be a misuse of public money. I know that some of you haven't even looked at this stuff. At the debate this past Saturday, even the LDFA Council Member Petersen stated, "I haven't looked at the data in the two reports". So, even Petersen hadn't looked at the data in the official report and in the SPARK Annual report.

I must give thanks to Council Member Taylor. At the debate on Saturday, Taylor said an incredibly good and mayoral thing. He stated:

"There is no question that the numbers that we receive from any of the entities with which we contract, ought to be held to a rigorous standard. I understand that some folks think that the numbers we've received are inaccurate. I would suspect that the folks who created the numbers have a counter argument. I would prefer myself be eager to hear a full articulation of both."

I have presented an official report of SPARK's numbers that was given to the Governor. This data provides evidence that SPARK may have inflated job numbers. I have presented an articulated official report with data. Vote 'no', or postpone the vote so you can take time to look at the data in the official report.

I am offended when people claim that SPARK is the only economic development entity in Ann Arbor. SPARK is not the only entity. This city is not about SPARK, but about the people. Economic development comes from many other sources as there are other venture capital firms, banks that can loan money, businesses that provide services, a University to teach about entrepreneurship, a chamber of commerce, the AAATA, the DDA, great non-profits such as the HRWC, and many others. But most importantly, it is about the people in Ann Arbor. It is not SPARK that you should thank, but thank the great people of Ann Arbor – as they (the people), are the ones that really create the economic development here.

Thank you.

Kai Petainen.

Ann Arbor, Michigan. Public Comments @ Ann Arbor City Council. 6/16/2014

Alexa, Jennifer

From: Will Hathaway [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 8:44 PM
To: Kailasapathy, Sumi
Subject: Re: Resolution on Redesigning Liberty Plaza

Thanks Sumi! I am out of town but I will be checking the coverage of the meeting to see how things go.

- Will

On Mon, Jun 16, 2014 at 9:20 AM, Kailasapathy, Sumi <SKailasapathy@a2gov.org> wrote:

Thanks Will. These are great suggestions.

I will take them into consideration when debating.

Thank you again.

Sumi Kailasapathy
First Ward Councilmember
Tel: [734-769-5698](tel:734-769-5698)

-----Original Message-----

From: Will Hathaway [REDACTED]
Sent: Fri 6/13/2014 4:41 PM
To: Kailasapathy, Sumi
Subject: Resolution on Redesigning Liberty Plaza

Sumi,

I read the Ann Arbor News article online:

http://www.mlive.com/news/ann-arbor/index.ssf/2014/06/liberty_plaza_redesign_ann_arb.html#cmpid=nwslthead

I subsequently read the text of the resolution.

We know that the adjacent property owned by First Martin is soon to be completely redeveloped. Mike Martin told my mother and me when we met with him last fall that they intend to tear down the Michigan Square building on Liberty (the former Pantree) and build anew on that site and the surface parking lot behind it. We greeted this as good news because the garden level of the Michigan Square building is the reason that Liberty Plaza is designed with tiers and ramps leading downward. However, First Martin has

not publicly announced its plans and has actually said "no comment" since our conversation with Mike Martin in October.

I would recommend amending the resolution for a couple of reasons:

1) To move forward with a design process with all these stakeholders in the absence of knowledge about exactly what First Martin intends to do seems like exactly the reason that Mayor Hieftje and Chris Taylor gave for opposing a design process for the park on Library Lane. They said that you couldn't possibly have a process for design of the public space without knowing how the adjacent development would occur. Unless First Martin is ready to unveil its plans, this redesign process is doing exactly what opponents of the Library Lane park called, "putting the cart before the horse."

2) To look at Liberty Plaza's redesign in isolation is a mistake. The Library Block should be studied and planned so as to integrate all its components. Liberty Plaza and how pedestrians get from it to the new park on Library Lane is just part of the puzzle. The other components are First Martin's redevelopment of its property, the possible development of the eastern portion of the Library Lane site, the public park on the western portion of the Library Lane site, the AADL's downtown library (at least its entrance, at most an entirely new building), and pedestrian pathways/easements that connect Liberty and William Streets to the interior of the block.

I would urge that the resolution be amended to take a broader, more inclusive look at the design of the Library Block. Lets think about how Liberty and Plaza and the new park will work together. Lets follow the recommendations from the Downtown Citizens Advisory Committee for multiple pedestrian connections through the block. If there are funds for a public process for Liberty Plaza, lets stretch them so that we get more for those limited dollars. Lets spend them wisely.

- Will

Alexa, Jennifer

From: Will Hathaway [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 8:46 PM
To: Petersen, Sally
Subject: Re: Resolution on Redesigning Liberty Plaza

Thanks Sally. I'm sorry not to have been more responsive. I am out of town and have only occasional access to internet or phone. I hope that the meeting goes well. I'll catch up on the coverage when I can.

I will pass along your greetings to my mom and to my sister. We're together at Camp Michigania this week.

- Will

On Sat, Jun 14, 2014 at 2:09 PM, Petersen, Sally <SPetersen@a2gov.org> wrote:

Amen! Headed out of town for the next day, back on Monday - do you have any suggested language? I am best reached by cell until Monday, [REDACTED] Thanks! And my best to your Mom and sister! Sally

-----Original Message-----

From: Will Hathaway [REDACTED]
Sent: Fri 6/13/2014 4:41 PM
To: Petersen, Sally
Subject: Resolution on Redesigning Liberty Plaza

Sally,

I read the Ann Arbor News article online:

http://www.mlive.com/news/ann-arbor/index.ssf/2014/06/liberty_plaza_redesign_ann_arb.html#cmpid=nwslthead

I subsequently read the text of the resolution.

We know that the adjacent property owned by First Martin is soon to be completely redeveloped. Mike Martin told my mother and me when we met with him last fall that they intend to tear down the Michigan Square building on Liberty (the former Pantree) and build anew on that site and the surface parking lot behind it. We greeted this as good news because the garden level of the Michigan Square building is the reason that Liberty Plaza is designed with tiers and ramps leading downward. However, First Martin has not publicly announced its plans and has actually said "no comment" since our conversation with Mike Martin in October.

I would recommend amending the resolution for a couple of reasons:

1) To move forward with a design process with all these stakeholders in the absence of knowledge about exactly what First Martin intends to do seems like exactly the reason that Mayor Hieftje and Chris Taylor gave for opposing a design process for the park on Library Lane. They said that you couldn't possibly have a process for design of the public space without knowing how the adjacent development would occur. Unless First Martin is ready to unveil its plans, this redesign process is doing exactly what opponents of the Library Lane park called, "putting the cart before the horse."

2) To look at Liberty Plaza's redesign in isolation is a mistake. The Library Block should be studied and planned so as to integrate all its components. Liberty Plaza and how pedestrians get from it to the new park on Library Lane is just part of the puzzle. The other components are First Martin's redevelopment of its property, the possible development of the eastern portion of the Library Lane site, the public park on the western portion of the Library Lane site, the AADL's downtown library (at least its entrance, at most an entirely new building), and pedestrian pathways/easements that connect Liberty and William Streets to the interior of the block.

I would urge that the resolution be amended to take a broader, more inclusive look at the design of the Library Block. Lets think about how Liberty and Plaza and the new park will work together. Lets follow the recommendations from the Downtown Citizens Advisory Committee for multiple pedestrian connections through the block. If there are funds for a public process for Liberty Plaza, lets stretch them so that we get more for those limited dollars. Lets spend them wisely.

- Will

Alexa, Jennifer

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 10:27 PM
To: *City Council Members (All)
Cc: Bowden (King), Anissa; Powers, Steve
Subject: DC-1 amendment

AMEND AS FOLLOWS IN CAPS:

RESOLVED, That City Council directs the City Administrator to work collaboratively with the property owners adjacent to and near Liberty Plaza, the general public, PAC, the Ann Arbor District Library, and the DDA to develop AN INTEGRATED PLAN FOR THE LIBRARY BLOCK EXTENDING FROM LIBERTY PLAZA TO THE LIBRARY LOT INCLUDING a conceptual design for an improved Liberty Plaza;

RESOLVED, That the conceptual design for an improved Liberty Plaza recognize and account for open space on the west boundary of the Library Lot;

RESOLVED, That the collaborative effort be funded by the Parks & Recreation Services FY2015 budget's \$23,577.00 from the Parks Millage Administrative Policy;

RESOLVED, That multiple opportunities for public input and participation be provided to help shape a vision for THE LIBRARY BLOCK, HOW THE TWO PARKS WOULD BEST COMPLEMENT EACH OTHER, AND POTENTIALLY INCLUDING A REDESIGNED [a re-imagined] Liberty Plaza;

RESOLVED, That staff provide PAC and Council funding scenarios and options for the capital construction costs;

RESOLVED, That staff provides PAC and Council a detailed estimated annual operating budget, along with funding scenarios, for the maintenance, security, and programming costs required to run TWO successful urban parkS at Liberty Plaza AND THE LIBRARY LOT; and

RESOLVED, That the INTEGRATED PLAN, conceptual design, construction cost estimates, and estimated annual operating budget be shared with PAC by December 2014 and Council in January 2015.

Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104
734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) |
jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

Alexa, Jennifer

From: Lumm, Jane
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 10:30 PM
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline; *City Council Members (All)
Cc: Bowden (King), Anissa; Powers, Steve
Subject: RE: DC-1 amendment

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 10:27 PM
To: *City Council Members (All)
Cc: Bowden (King), Anissa; Powers, Steve
Subject: DC-1 amendment

AMEND AS FOLLOWS IN CAPS:

RESOLVED, That City Council directs the City Administrator to work collaboratively with the property owners adjacent to and near Liberty Plaza, the general public, PAC, the Ann Arbor District Library, and the DDA to develop AN INTEGRATED PLAN FOR THE LIBRARY BLOCK EXTENDING FROM LIBERTY PLAZA TO THE LIBRARY LOT INCLUDING a conceptual design for an improved Liberty Plaza;

RESOLVED, That the conceptual design for an improved Liberty Plaza recognize and account for open space on the west boundary of the Library Lot;

RESOLVED, That the collaborative effort be funded by the Parks & Recreation Services FY2015 budget's \$23,577.00 from the Parks Millage Administrative Policy;

RESOLVED, That multiple opportunities for public input and participation be provided to help shape a vision for THE LIBRARY BLOCK, HOW THE TWO PARKS WOULD BEST COMPLEMENT EACH OTHER, AND POTENTIALLY INCLUDING A REDESIGNED [a re-imagined] Liberty Plaza;

RESOLVED, That staff provide PAC and Council funding scenarios and options for the capital construction costs;

RESOLVED, That staff provides PAC and Council a detailed estimated annual operating budget, along with funding scenarios, for the maintenance, security, and programming costs required to RUN TWO SUCCESSFUL URBAN PARKS AT LIBERTY PLAZA AND THE LIBRARY LOT; and

RESOLVED, That the INTEGRATED PLAN, conceptual design, construction cost estimates, and estimated annual operating budget be shared with PAC by December 2014 and Council in January 2015.

Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104
734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) |
jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

Alexa, Jennifer

From: Lumm, Jane
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 10:35 PM
To: janelumm@comcast.net
Subject: FW: DC-1 amendment

From: Lumm, Jane
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 10:30 PM
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline; *City Council Members (All)
Cc: Bowden (King), Anissa; Powers, Steve
Subject: RE: DC-1 amendment

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 10:27 PM
To: *City Council Members (All)
Cc: Bowden (King), Anissa; Powers, Steve
Subject: DC-1 amendment

AMEND AS FOLLOWS IN CAPS:

RESOLVED, That City Council directs the City Administrator to work collaboratively with the property owners adjacent to and near Liberty Plaza, the general public, PAC, the Ann Arbor District Library, and the DDA to develop AN INTEGRATED PLAN FOR THE LIBRARY BLOCK EXTENDING FROM LIBERTY PLAZA TO THE LIBRARY LOT INCLUDING a conceptual design for an improved Liberty Plaza;

RESOLVED, That the conceptual design for an improved Liberty Plaza recognize and account for open space on the west boundary of the Library Lot;

RESOLVED, That the collaborative effort be funded by the Parks & Recreation Services FY2015 budget's \$23,577.00 from the Parks Millage Administrative Policy;

RESOLVED, That multiple opportunities for public input and participation be provided to help shape a vision for THE LIBRARY BLOCK, HOW THE TWO PARKS WOULD BEST COMPLEMENT EACH OTHER, AND POTENTIALLY INCLUDING A REDESIGNED [a re-imagined] Liberty Plaza;

RESOLVED, That staff provide PAC and Council funding scenarios and options for the capital construction costs;

RESOLVED, That staff provides PAC and Council a detailed estimated annual operating budget, along with funding scenarios, for the maintenance, security, and programming costs required to RUN TWO SUCCESSFUL URBAN PARKS AT LIBERTY PLAZA AND THE LIBRARY LOT; and

RESOLVED, That the INTEGRATED PLAN, conceptual design, construction cost estimates, and estimated annual operating budget be shared with PAC by December 2014 and Council in January 2015.

Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104

734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) |

jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

Alexa, Jennifer

From: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 11:58 PM
To: *City Council Members (All)
Cc: Powers, Steve; Bowden (King), Anissa
Subject: FW: File: A12-00217 Goldstone, Andrew K. v City and Kevin Warner, Injury Lawsuit
Attachments: 00032945.docx

CyAutold: 1535643
CycomPath: C:\CYCOMSQL\
CyMatterId: 1436609
CyMultiRecMemos: N
CyStaffId: SKP

Jacqueline Beaudry, City Clerk

Ann Arbor City Clerk's Office | Guy C. Larcom City Hall | 301 E. Huron, 2nd Floor · Ann Arbor · MI · 48104
734.794.6140 (O) · 734.994.8296 (F) |
jbeaudry@a2gov.org | www.a2gov.org



Think Green! Please don't print this e-mail unless absolutely necessary.

From: Postema, Stephen
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 7:13 PM
To: Beaudry, Jacqueline
Cc: *City Council Members (All)
Subject: FW: File: A12-00217 Goldstone, Andrew K. v City and Kevin Warner, Injury Lawsuit

From: Postema, Stephen
Sent: Monday, June 16, 2014 2:29 PM
To: Postema, Stephen
Subject: File: A12-00217 Goldstone, Andrew K. v City and Kevin Warner, Injury Lawsuit

** Attached file(s): Resolution Directing the City Attorney in the matter of Goldstone v (00032945.docx)