

# City of Ann Arbor Formal Minutes - Draft City Planning Commission

301 E. Huron St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104 http://a2gov.legistar.com/ Calendar.aspx

Tuesday, February 6, 2024

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Wonwoo Lee called the meeting to order at 7:02 pm in Council Chambers at City Hall of Ann Arbor.

### 2. ROLL CALL

Deputy Planning Manager Hank Kelley called the roll.

Others present:

Deputy Planning Manager Hank Kelley City Planner Alexis DiLeo

Present 6 - Mills, Hammerschmidt, Disch, Lee, Clarke, and

Weatherbee

Absent 2 - Abrons, and Wyche

### 3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Commissioner Mills seconded by Councilmember Disch to approve the agenda. On a voice vote, the motion carried unanimously.

### 4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

**4-a. 24-0133** January 16, 2024 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

<u>Attachments:</u> January 16, 2024 City Planning Commission Meeting

Minutes.pdf

Moved by Commissioner Mills seconded by Councilmember Disch to approve the January 16, 2024 City Planning Commission meeting minutes. On a voice vote the minutes were unanimously approved and forwarded to City Council.

### **ROLL CALL**

Commissioner Wyche entered the meeting at 7:04 pm.

**Present** 7 - Mills, Hammerschmidt, Disch, Lee, Clarke, Wyche, and

Weatherbee

Absent 1 - Abrons

## 5. REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS

### 5-a. City Council

Councilmember Disch stated there was nothing to report from the previous night's City Council meeting.

### 5-b. Planning Manager

Deputy Planning Manager Hank Kelley noted two items:

- Daniel Adams was approved by City Council to join the Planning Commission
- At the February 13, 2024 Working Session meeting there will be a presentation by OSI's Zach Waas-Smith talking about finer points of electrification. Not yet confirmed, may have a project preview for 777 Eisenhower Arbor South project.
- We received over 2,000 responses for the Comprehensive Plan Community survey

### 5-c. Planning Commission Officers and Committees

None.

### 5-d. Written Communications and Petitions

24-0134 Various Communication to the Planning Commission

Attachments:

Amy G Email of Opposition SI Complex.pdf, Beth Email of Opposition SI Complex.pdf, Caruso Email of Opposition High Rise Buildings.pdf, Chambers email Zoning Atlas Chart.pdf, Floyd email of opposition 1208 South University.pdf, Goldberg email of support 711 Church Street.pdf, Lewis Email of Support SI Complex.pdf, Linn letter of opposition 711 Church.pdf, Schmanski email of opposition 1208 South University with attachments.pdf, Wresche Email of Opposition SI Complex.pdf, Zimmer Email of Opposition SI Complex.pdf

Received and filed.

- <u>6.</u> PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)
  - Tom Stulberg, 1202 Traver Street, spoke to the Comprehensive Plan and the relationship to zoning.

Seeing no additional speakers, Chair Lee closed the Public Comment.

### 7. PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING

7-a. 24-0135 Public Hearings Scheduled for Thursday, February 22, 2024, Planning Commission Meeting

> 2-22-2024 CPC Notice of Public Hearing.pdf Attachments:

Deputy Planning Manager Hank Kelley reported:

- 3380 Nixon Road Rezoning and Site Plan for Owl Creek Phase 2 - A proposal to rezone the property from R4A to R4D on the condition that the building height is capped at 75 feet, and to build 131 housing units in one 99,985 square foot building on the site of Owl Creek Phase 1.

#### <u>8.</u> **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

None.

### 9. REGULAR BUSINESS – Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing, and Commission Discussion of Each Item

### 9-a. 24-0136 711 Church Street PUD Zoning and Site Plan

A request to rezone a 1.1-acre site from R4C (Multiple-Family Dwelling) to PUD (Planned Unit Development) and adopt Supplemental Regulations to allow development up to 450,000 square feet, and a site plan to construct a 17-story apartment building with ground floor commercial. Primary proposed public benefits of the PUD district include contributions to affordable housing and enhanced sustainability. Building would have 273 proposed apartments with over 1,000 bedrooms. Amenities would include on-site vehicle and bicycle parking and streetscape improvements. The site includes six lots: 703, 707, 709-713, 715 and 721 Church Street and 1208 Willard Street. Staff recommendation: denial.

### Attachments:

2024-02-06\_CPC\_711 Church\_Staff Report.pdf, Zoning Map (711 Church), Aerial Map (711 Church), Supplemental Regulations 2024-01-30 (711 Church).pdf, Development Agreement 2024-01-29 (711 Church).pdf, V4 Abbreviated Site Plan, Applicant Master Plan Conformance and PUD Justification.pdf, Applicant 711 Church Street - Zoning Comparison.pdf, Letter to PC 02062024 signed.pdf

### PROJECT/PRESENTATION:

Brad Moore, Christopher Johnson, Brad Strader, and Eduardo Illanes presented the proposed request.

### STAFF REPORT/PRESENTATION:

City Planner Alexis DiLeo presented the proposed request.

### **PUBLIC HEARING:**

Marc Gerstein, 1321 Forest Court, spoke in opposition to the proposed project.

Eleanor Linn, 1321 Forest Court, spoke in opposition to the proposed project.

Dennis Tice, resident and business owner, spoke in support of the proposed project.

Brad Moore, resident and applicant team, spoke in support of the

proposed project.

Adam Jaskiewicz, 1526 Las Vegas Dr, spoke in support of the proposed project.

Eric, 4th Ward resident, spoke in support, of the proposed project.

Michelle Hughes, resident, spoke in support of the proposed project.

Meredith Kahn, 921 Church Street IHAA, spoke in support of the proposed project.

Adam Goodman spoke in support of the proposed project.

Tom Stulberg,1202 Traver Street, spoke in opposition to the proposed project.

Ellen Ramsburgh, 1503 Cambridge Road spoke in opposition to the proposed project.

Brandon Dimcheff, 1401 Harpst Street spoke in support of the proposed project.

Ross Smith, 5th Ward resident, spoke in support of the proposed project.

Eric Zechar, Prairie Street spoke in support of the proposed project.

Seeing no additional speakers Chair Lee closed the Public Hearing.

Two motions taken together were moved by Commissioner Wyche, seconded by Commissioner Mills that:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 711 Church Street Planned Unit Development Zoning District and Supplemental Regulations, subject to necessary revisions as directed by the City Planning Commission.

### and that:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 711 Church Street Planned Unit Development Site Plan and Development Agreement, subject to

**February 6, 2024** 

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

**City Planning Commission** 

The Commission took into consideration the proposed request and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

A first friendly amendment was made moved by Commissioner Mills seconded by Commissioner Wyche, to amend the original two motions to include public art as a requirement, with language crafted by staff, and adjust bicycle parking to require two bicycle parking spots per unit.

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Deputy Planning Manager declaring the motion carried. Vote 7-0.

**Yeas:** 7 - Sarah Mills, Sara Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira Clarke, Donnell Wyche, and Julie Weatherbee

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ellie Abrons

A second friendly amendment was made moved by Commissioner Clarke seconded by Commissioner Wyche to amend the original two motions to require in the supplemental regulations 17% of dwelling units or equivalent in payment in lieu be provided as affordable housing dwelling units. The supplemental regulations would remove reference to 6 workforce housing units, along with other mentions of workforce housing.

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Deputy Planning Manager declaring the motion as amended carried. Vote 7-0.

**Yeas:** 7 - Sarah Mills, Sara Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo

Lee, Sadira Clarke, Donnell Wyche, and Julie Weatherbee

**Nays**: 0

Absent: 1 - Ellie Abrons

A third friendly amendment was made moved by Councilmemebr Disch seconded by Commissioner Weatherbee to amend the original two motions to require in the supplemental regulations 20% of dwelling units or equivalent in payment in lieu be provided as

affordable housing dwelling units. The supplemental regulations would remove reference to 6 workforce housing units, along with other mentions of workforce housing.

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Deputy Planning Manager declaring the motion failed. Vote 3-4.

Yeas: 3 -Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, and Julie Weatherbee

Nays: 4 -Sarah Mills, Sara Hammerschmidt, Sadira Clarke, and

Donnell Wyche

Ellie Abrons Absent: 1 -

The final vote on the amended motions was moved by **Commissioner Wyche seconded by Commissioner Mills that:** 

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 711 Church Street Planned Unit **Development Zoning District and Supplemental Regulations**, subject to necessary revisions as directed by the City Planning Commission:

- 1. The parking standard is revised to require a minimum of 2 Class A bicycle parking spaces for each dwelling unit.
- 2. The additional requirements are revised to include a public art standard.
- 3. The affordable housing requirements are revised to require a minimum of 17% of dwelling units be dedicated to affordable housing and remove reference to workforce housing.

and that:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 711 Church Street Planned Unit Development Site Plan and Development Agreement, subject to addressing outstanding review comments.

On a roll call vote the vote was as follows with the Deputy Planning Manager declaring the motion failed. Vote 2-5.

Yeas: 2 - Sadira Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 5 - Sarah Mills, Sara Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo

Lee, and Julie Weatherbee

Absent: 1 - Ellie Abrons

### 10. OTHER BUSINESS

None.

### 11. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)

Adam Goodman, resident, noted he was disappointed by outcome. Would like to bring economic development report to the attention of commissioners, in particular protecting tax base from capture by university.

Tom Stulberg, 1202 Traver Road, appreciate conversation. Could benefit from some legal review.

Eric, resident, disappointed. Project is good for city, planet and working class. Wish the commission would've voted in the other way and sided with sustainability.

Seeing no additional speakers Chair Lee closed the Public Comment.

### 12. COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

None.

### 13. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Commissioner Wyche, Seconded by Commissioner Mills, to adjourn the meeting at 11:01 pm. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

Wonwoo Lee, Chairperson

/courtneymanor

eComments for the Commission may be left via our Legistar calendar page (column to the very right) http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Persons requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting.

Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.) Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website https://a2gov.org/watchctn . The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at https://a2gov.org/watchctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150

City Planning Commission regular meetings have transitioned to a hybrid meeting model. The City of Ann Arbor highly encourages the public to participate in public meetings, either in-person or remotely.