



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

City Planning Commission

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Tuesday, May 16, 2023

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

This meeting is accessible in person, via Zoom, or by phone, see agenda for details.

Please click the link below to join this hybrid meeting via Zoom:

<https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/97766341226?pwd=akdzTVllcnBBaGJNSlZJdFpDdGUrdz09>

Passcode: 882985

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

Please note it is possible that telephone or electronic public comment may encounter technical difficulties that prevent your participation. For the greatest assurance that your comments will be heard, submit them in writing ahead of the meeting or attend in person.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Shannan Gibb-Randall called the meeting to order at 7:02 pm in Council Chambers at City Hall of Ann Arbor.

2. ROLL CALL

Planning Manager, Brett Lenart, called the roll.

Others present:

Planning Manager Brett Lenart, City Planner Alexis DiLeo, City Planner Jeff Kahan.

Present 7 - Mills, Gibb-Randall, Sauve, Abrons, Disch, Lee, and Wyche

Absent 2 - Hammerschmidt, and Clarke

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Commissioner Wyche, seconded by Councilmember Disch, to Approve the Agenda as presented. On a voice vote the motion carried unanimously.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

- 4-a. [23-0849](#)** May 2, 2023 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 5-2-2023 CPC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

Moved by Councilmember Disch, seconded by Commissioner Mills, to approve the May 2, 2023 City Planning Commission meeting minutes and forward to City Council. On a voice vote the minutes were unanimously approved as presented.

5. REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS

- 5-a. City Council**

Councilmember Disch reported on Council action at their previous meeting:

On first reading City Council passed the 721 South Forest project, but promised to have a robust discussion at their second reading. Council passed a half billion dollar budget which contains provision for a new Planner and lots of incredible work on sustainability.

ROLL CALL

Commissioner Clarke entered the meeting at 7:06 pm.

Present 8 - Mills, Gibb-Randall, Sauve, Abrons, Disch, Lee, Clarke, and Wyche

Absent 1 - Hammerschmidt

- 5-b. Planning Manager**

Planning Manager Brett Lenart reported on the 5/23/2023 Ordinance Revisions Committee meeting; they met to discuss proposed, somewhat minor, but hopefully clarifying, adjustments to the Planned Unit Development (PUD) Ordinance.

5-c. Planning Commission Officers and Committees

Chair Gibb-Randall reported from the Downtown Development Authority (DDA) meeting; the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) is gearing up for a transition for being able to make a 30 minute trip from Ypsilanti to Ann Arbor.

An interesting pilot program, looking at public restroom facility options, is on going with a company called 'The Throne'.

5-d. Written Communications and Petitions**23-0847** Various Communications to the Planning Commission

Attachments: OFWA Spring 2023 Newsletter.pdf, Crockett re Citizens Advisory Committee.pdf, OFW Assoc, A2 Hist Found w Spring Newsltr.pdf, McCleskey re Setbacks, High Density.pdf, Cai-Zheng re 3680 Packard Rd.pdf, Stoll re Southtown.pdf, Yax re Southtown.pdf, Chang re Southtown.pdf, Weatherbee re Southtown.pdf, Allen re SouthTown 1.pdf, Allen re SouthTown.pdf, Jaskiewicz re SouthTown.pdf, Phipps re SouthTown.pdf, Rogers re SouthTown.pdf, Southtown Support Letter from Douglas Allen of NOMA RES.pdf, Green re SouthTown 1.pdf, Green, Hess re Southtown .pdf, Eyer, Green, re SouthTown, Intersection Stimson.pdf

Received and Filed**6. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)**

Ken Garber, 28 Haverhill Court, thanked reappointed commissioners for their service to the community.

Tom Stulberg, Lowertown resident, raised sustainability issues at Council previous night. Discussed 4 zoning categories (D1, D2, C1, C1A/R) grouped together. What would City get by building Southtown as a PUD?

Luis Vasquez, Upper Lowertown resident, please 721 S Forest passed first reading at City Council. Disappointed developer wants to scale back size.

Seeing no additional speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Comment.

7. PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING

- 7-a. [23-0848](#) Public Hearings Scheduled for Tuesday, June 6, 2023 Planning Commission Meeting

Attachments: 6-6-2023 CPC Notice of Public Hearing-Tue.pdf

Planning Manager Brett Lenart presented on the upcoming Public Hearings at the June 6, 2023 Planning Commission meeting;

- Proposed Amendments to Chapter 55 (Unified Development Code) Section 5.15, Permitted Use Tables, and Section 5.16, Use Specific Standards, to permit and regulate Event Space use in additional zoning districts, and Section 5.20 Landscape, Screening, and Buffering, to amend the requirements related to Conflicting Land Use Buffers

- 2195 East Ellsworth Lockwood Planned Unit Development (PUD) Text Amendment – Proposal to adjust the east side setback by 4 feet from 144 feet to 140 feet and the south side setback by 4 feet from 68 feet to 64 feet. No new construction is proposed.

- 3945 - 3957 South State Site Plan and Special Exception Use – A proposal to reduce the size of the existing building at this location by 1,384 square feet and add a drive through lane along the rear of the building.

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

9. REGULAR BUSINESS – Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing, and Commission Discussion of Each Item

- 9-a. [23-0843](#) South Town Rezoning, Site Plan, and Street Vacation (1601 S State St) - A project with three petitions to redevelop the block bounded by South State Street, White Street, Henry Street, and Stimpson Street: 1) A petition to rezone a block of 10 parcels from R4C (Multi-Family Dwelling) to C1A/R With Conditions (Campus Business Residential) with an offer to reduce the

maximum height limit to 100 feet, set a maximum vehicle parking limit of 0.25 per dwelling unit, and set a minimum active open space requirement of 50 square feet per dwelling unit; 2) A site plan for City Council approval to construct a 220,000-square foot mixed-use building with ground floor retail, office and child care space, and approximately 215 apartments; and 3) A petition to vacate the public alley in the block. Site includes addresses 1601 S State St, 1605 S State St, 1607 S State St, 1609 S State St, 1611 S State St, 1606 White St, 1608 White St, 1610 White St, 1612 White St, and 714 Henry St. Site is 72,148 square feet. (1.7 acres). Zoned R4C. Staff Recommendation: Postponement

Attachments: 2023-5-16 Corrected Staff Report (South Town).pdf, The State-Henry-White-Stimson Block Zoning Map.pdf, The State-Henry-White-Stimson Block Aerial Map.pdf, The State-Henry-White-Stimson Block Aerial Map Zoom.pdf, REZ22-0002 Conditional Zoning Statement Draft 3-17-23.pdf, 2023-5-10 Draft Dev Agmt (South Town).pdf, Site Plan v3 (South Town).pdf

Commissioner Sauve recused herself from the discussion based on her involvement with the proposed project and left the Chambers.

Adam Smith, Designer, presented the proposed request.

STAFF REPORT:

City Planner, Alexis DiLeo, provided the staff report for the Southtown project.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Michael Lewendowski, representing owners of 1513 White Street, spoke in opposition of project expressing concerns with parking.

Alex Goodman, 400 Virginia Avenue, spoke in favor of project.

Ken Garber, 28 Haverhill Court, raised concerns about zoning.

Lauren, 801 Rose, spoke in favor of project, with a few concerns raised about retail needs.

Abdulraham, resident, spoke in favor of proposed project.

Luis Vasquez, resident, spoke in favor of project.

Cynthia, 810 White Street, expressed concerns about parking with project.

Brandon Dimcheff, 1401 Harp Street, spoke in favor of proposed project.

Alex Lowe, resident, not a fan of PUDs, but feels project could be a PUD.

Seeing no additional speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Commissioner Lee, seconded by Commissioner Abrons, that

Motion 1:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the South Town Rezoning Petition to C1A/R (Campus Business Residential) district and accept the conditions that the maximum building height is limited to 100 feet, the maximum vehicle parking limit is one space per four dwelling units, and the minimum active open space requirement is 50 square feet per dwelling unit, subject to executing a Conditional Zoning Statement of Conditions,

and

Motion 2:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the South Town Site Plan at 1601 South State Street and Development Agreement, subject a variance granted by the Zoning Board of Appeals to exceed the maximum FAR of the C1A/R district due to the enclosed parking garage and combining all lots prior to issuance of any permits,

and

Motion 3:

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council vacate the unimproved platted alley in Block 3 of the Hamilton, Rose and Sheehan's Addition to the City and Town of Ann Arbor.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the proposed requests and proposals and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Mills, seconded by Commissioner Gibb-Randall, to postpone taking action on Agenda item until the June 21, 2023 City Planning Commission meeting.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4 - 3. Item Postponed

Yeas: 4 - Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Lisa Disch, and Sadira Clarke

Nays: 3 - Ellie Abrons, Wonwoo Lee, and Donnell Wyche

Absent: 1 - Sara Hammerschmidt

Recused: 1 - Elizabeth Sauve

Commissioner Sauve was invited back into Chambers to join the rest of the Commissioners in the meeting.

- 9-b.** [23-0844](#) The City of Ann Arbor petitioned the State of Michigan to approve the annexation of a number of township island parcels in Ann Arbor Township. The Director of the State of Michigan's Licensing and Regulatory Affairs (LARA) department recently approved the annexation of the following 11 parcels: 2775 Newport Rd, 2737 Newport Rd, 2466 Newport Rd, 2318 Newport Rd, 2354 Newport Rd, 2108 Newport Rd, 1375 Bird Rd, 1429 Bird Rd, 2114 Victoria Circle, 2118 Victoria Circle, 2126 Victoria Circle. The City of Ann Arbor is now initiated the rezoning of these parcels to R1A (single-family detached). After the Planning Commission public hearing, this rezoning petition will be sent to City Council for final approval. Staff Recommendation: Approval

Attachments: Staff Report Round 2 Zoning.pdf, Annexation Parcels from 19-AR-1 Zoning Map.pdf, Annexation Parcels from 19-AR-1 Aerial Map.pdf

STAFF REPORT:

City Planner Jeff Kahan provided the staff report on the proposed City initiated annexations.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Robert Marans, spoke in opposition to annexations expressing concern

of environmental damage to the area.

Alex Lowe, resident, spoke in opposition to annexations.

Seeing no additional speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Hearing.

Moved by Commissioner Lee, seconded by Commissioner Sauve, to modify the recommendation from the Planning Commission to rezone the eleven parcels from R1A to R1D.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the proposed requests and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the motion carried.

Vote 6 - 2

Yeas: 6 - Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, Sadira Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 2 - Lisa Disch, and Wonwoo Lee

Absent: 1 - Sara Hammerschmidt

Moved by Commissioner Lee, seconded by Commissioner Sauve, that

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve 2775 Newport Road, 2737 Newport Road, 2466 Newport Road, 2354 Newport Road, 2318 Newport Road, 2108 Newport Road, 1429 Bird Road, 1375 Bird Road, 2116 Victoria Circle, 2118 Victoria Circle, and 2114 Victoria Circle for rezoning to R1D (Single Family Dwelling).

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the proposed requests and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 8 - 0

- Yeas:** 8 - Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira Clarke, and Donnell Wyche
- Nays:** 0
- Absent:** 1 - Sara Hammerschmidt

10. OTHER BUSINESS

None.

11. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)

Adam Goodman, 400 Virginia, spoke in support of Southtown.

Georgia Washington, 1440 Fuller Road, spoke in opposition to mixed-use development.

Scott Trudeau, 526 North Main, spoke in support of Southtown development.

Alex Lowe, resident, spoke in support of Southtown.

Seeing no additional speakers, Chair Gibb-Randall closed the Public Comment.

12. COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

Add to Work Plan;

Annotation to add R4C table to Southtown Report,

Short Term Rentals in C1A/R

13. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Commissioner Mills, seconded by Commissioner Wyche, to adjourn the meeting at 11:06 pm. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

Shannan Gibb-Randall, Chairperson

/mia gale

/courtney manor

eComments for the Commission may be left via our Legistar calendar page (column to the very right)
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Persons requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting.

Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org))

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.) Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>. The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150

City Planning Commission regular meetings have transitioned to a hybrid meeting model. The City of Ann Arbor highly encourages the public to participate in public meetings, either in-person or remotely.

The City of Ann Arbor has existing COVID-19 safety rules that are required of visitors entering city facilities. If you choose to attend a meeting in-person, the following safety rules are expected to be observed. These include:

- City Hall is mask-friendly to all guests at all times.
- Masks will be required for all meeting participants and guests when the local CDC Community Level in Washtenaw County is high. Check the current level for Washtenaw County through the CDC's website [here](#).
- Please do not attend if you are sick for any reason, including having symptoms or a diagnosis of COVID-19, or have recently been in close contact with someone with COVID-19. Several other attendance options are available when you are sick or in quarantine, or simply for your convenience.