



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

City Planning Commission

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Tuesday, May 2, 2023

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

This meeting is accessible in person, via Zoom, or by phone, see agenda for details.

Please click the link below to join this hybrid meeting via Zoom:

<https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/97766341226?pwd=akdzTVllcnBBaGJNSlZJdFpDdGUrdz09>

Passcode: 882985

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 977 6634 1226

Please note it is possible that telephone or electronic public comment may encounter technical difficulties that prevent your participation. For the greatest assurance that your comments will be heard, submit them in writing ahead of the meeting or attend in person.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Shannan Gibb-Randall called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm, in Council Chambers at City Hall of Ann Arbor.

2. ROLL CALL

City of Ann Arbor Planning Manager, Brett Lenart, called the roll.

Present 8 - Mills, Gibb-Randall, Sauve, Abrons, Hammerschmidt, Disch, Lee, and Wyche

Absent 1 - Clarke

Staff Present in Council Chambers: Planning Manager, Brett Lenart, and City Planner, Alexis DiLeo.

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Moved by Commissioner Wonwoo Lee, seconded by Commissioner Sarah Mills, to Approve the Agenda as presented. On a voice vote, the Agenda was unanimously Approved.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

[23-0761](#) April 18, 2023 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 4-18-2023 CPC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

Moved by Commissioner Sarah Mills, Seconded by Commissioner Donnell Wyche, to approve the April 18, 2023 City Planning Commission meeting minutes and forward to City Council. The minutes were unanimously approved as presented.

5. REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS

5-a. City Council

Councilmember Lisa Disch reported on the previous Council meeting: Council voted to dissolve The Brownfield Plan Review Committee.

5-b. Planning Manager

No report.

5-c. Planning Commission Officers and Committees

Commissioner Ellie Abrons reported that the Ordinance Revisions Committee (ORC) had met to discuss Conflicting Land Use Buffers (CLUBs).

5-d. Written Communications and Petitions

[23-0684](#) Various Communications to the Planning Commission

Attachments: Res fr Renters Commission in Support of Ord to Ban Nat Gas Conn.pdf, Pritts re TC1.pdf, Linn re Premiums plan.pdf, Marks re 999 Maiden Ln.pdf, Pointer re 999 Maiden Ln.pdf, Dybdahl re 999 Maiden Ln.pdf, Dyahl re

999 Maiden Ln.pdf, Stulberg re 999 Maiden Ln.pdf

Received and Filed

6. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)

Tom Stulberg, said he was calling from Lowertown, spoke in support of The Renter's Commission Resolution (included in packet communication); spoke about the Northeast Area Transportation Plan for Lowertown as it relates to the Morningside plan; spoke in support of energy efficiency and affordable housing.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair closed the public comment portion.

7. PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT REGULAR MEETING

7-a. [23-0685](#) Public Hearings Scheduled for Tuesday, May 16, 2023 Planning Commission Meeting

Attachments: 5-16-2023 Notice of Public Hearing.pdf

Brett Lenart reported on upcoming public hearings for the next regular meeting.

ROLL CALL

7:07 PM Enter Commissioner Sadira Clark.

Present 9 - Mills, Gibb-Randall, Sauve, Abrons, Hammerschmidt, Disch, Lee, Clarke, and Wyche

8. REGULAR BUSINESS – Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing, and Commission Discussion of Each Item

8-a. [23-0735](#) 999 Maiden Lane Site Plan and Rezoning for City Council Approval - A project including a rezoning petition to amend the conditions of the C1A/R Campus Business Residential With Conditions zoning designation, by removing the condition that the property shall only be developed as the "1140 Broadway Planned Project Site Plan, as may be administratively amended" because two of the three approved buildings have been constructed; and a site plan application to construct a 180,200-square foot,

7-story residential building on the Building B site of the Beekman on Broadway development, replacing the previously approved building with similar dimensions in this location. Zoning district and development site are 6.4 acres. Building B site is 1.4 acres. Addresses include 1100, 1200 Broadway Street with 999 Maiden Lane.

Attachments: May 2, 2023 Staff Report, Site Plan - 999 Maiden Lane, Zoning Map, Aerial Map, Development Agreement Amendment - Draft April 27, 2023

PROJECT PRESENTATION:

The following individuals and representatives were available to answer any enquiries:

Ron Mucha, Morningside Lower Town, LLC, 223 W. Erie Third Street, Chicago, ILL., Owner and Developer.

David Strassberg, Morningside Lower Town, President.

Bob Carson, Carson Fischer Law Firm, Attorney (via Zoom).

Tom Covert, Midwestern Consulting LLC, 3815 Plaza Dr. Ann Arbor, MI, Civil Engineer and Consultant.

Adam Toma, HKM Architects & Planners, Inc., Architect.

Julie Kroll, Transportation Engineer.

STAFF REPORT:

Alexis DiLeo, City Planner, provided the staff report.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Dawn McKleski, 1306 Pontiac Trail, Ann Arbor, spoke in support of Ann Arbor's goals of limiting footprint, encouraging walkability and transportation. Spoke in opposition to proposed plan, as presented, noting it's dystopia in the making, as people need space to congregate. She said people in the area need shops, cafes, sidewalks where they can come together.

Steve Kaplan, 406 N Division, Ann Arbor, agreed with previous speaker; spoke of the need for more density, a critical mass of housing to support shops or anything that comes next. Supports these buildings.

Laura Strow, 1327 Broadway, Ann Arbor, spoke in opposition to the proposal, and lack of aesthetically pleasing buildings. Spoke against many losses to the neighborhood, the wind tunnel, shadows, compromised views and not being able to see the sky. Spoke about the

need for the third building to include retail, and more solar usage throughout the project. She spoke of the need to figure out how to increase housing without ruining the city.

Mary Undwerwood, 1219 Traver, Ann Arbor, agreed with previous speakers, Dawn and Laura. Spoke of the need to tell developers what we want for this town - we decide!

Andrew Strow, 1327 Broadway, Ann Arbor, spoke of larger issues that should affect thinking and decision. Spoke of the need for mixed use for this project, all electric powered, and affordable housing.

Ken Garber, Haverhill Court, Ann Arbor, spoke in support of sustainability for this project, holding developers to environmental impacts, noting this falls way short, and while the gas heating would be partially offset by reduced transit, it's still unacceptable. He questioned the affordable housing proposal.

Tom Stulberg, from Lowertown, Ann Arbor, spoke of the proposal not complying with the Comprehensive plan, sustainability response being unsatisfactory and insulting; parking no longer required, previous requirement to eliminate parking in exchange for affordable housing and the need to include mixed use.

Daniel Adams, 1016 Daniel St, Ann Arbor, spoke in support of the project; apartments versus condos being the strongest argument to approve it. Spoke of being in a housing crisis and we can't afford to turn this project down.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing.

Moved by Commissioner Lisa Disch, Seconded by Commissioner Donnell Wyche, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council to approve the rezoning of 1140 Broadway by accepting the offer to amend the Conditional Zoning Statement of Amended Conditions to remove tying development in the district to the 1140 Broadway Planned Project Site Plan and subsequent administrative amendments and accept the Conditional Zoning Statement of Second Amended Conditions, and

The Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 999 Maiden Lane Site plan, subject to addressing outstanding comments from engineering and

**transportation and First Amendment to 1140 Broadway
Development Agreement.**

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

**On a rollcall vote, the Chair declared the motions carried
unanimously. Vote: 9 - 0**

Yeas: 9 - Sarah Mills, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, Sara Hammerschmidt, Lisa Disch, Wonwoo Lee, Sadira Clarke, and Donnell Wyche

Nays: 0

9. OTHER BUSINESS

9-a **23-0750** Downtown Premiums Evaluation

Attachments: April 24, 2023 Carlisle Wortman Report - Policy Options for Stakeholder Consultation

Megan Masson-Minock, AICP, Carlisle Wortman Associates, Inc., 117 N Fifth Street, Suite 70, Ann Arbor, provided updates to a report on Assumptions, Goals, and Options for Downtown Premiums in Ann Arbor.

Alexis DiLeo, City Planner, was also present to respond to Commission enquiries.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented material and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

10. PUBLIC COMMENT (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)

None

11. COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

None

12. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Commissioner Ellie Abrons, Seconded by Commissioner Donnell Wyche, to adjourn the meeting at 10:06 PM. Without objection the meeting was adjourned.

Shannan Gibb-Randall, Chairperson

/mia gale

/courtney manor

eComments for the Commission may be left via our Legistar calendar page (column to the very right)
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Persons requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting.

Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org))

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.) Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>. The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150

City Planning Commission regular meetings have transitioned to a hybrid meeting model. The City of Ann Arbor highly encourages the public to participate in public meetings, either in-person or remotely.

The City of Ann Arbor has existing COVID-19 safety rules that are required of visitors entering city facilities. If you choose to attend a meeting in-person, the following safety rules are expected to be observed. These include:

- City Hall is mask-friendly to all guests at all times.
- Masks will be required for all meeting participants and guests when the local CDC Community Level in Washtenaw County is high. Check the current level for Washtenaw County through the CDC's website [here](#).
- Please do not attend if you are sick for any reason, including having symptoms or a diagnosis of COVID-19, or have recently been in close contact with someone with COVID-19. Several other attendance options are available when you are sick or in quarantine, or simply for your convenience.