



ANN ARBOR FIRE DEPARTMENT

111 North Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104-1405
(734) 794-6961 • a2gov.org/fire
Serving Since 1889

May 12, 2022

Scoring Breakdown for City of Ann Arbor for RFP 22-16.

The category points below are the averages for the RFP review done by Matt Kulhanek, Fleet and Facilities Manager and Mike Kennedy, Fire Chief. The proposals were also reviewed by the Greg Mason, Project Manager - NSA Architecture. NSA Architecture was awarded the RFP for design and engineering for this project. Mr. Mason did not score individual categories but provided useful feedback on the proposals relating to the project manual.

There were 100 possible points distributed over the five categories.

A.R. Brouwer – 67.5 points

- A. Qualifications, Experience and Accountability - 17.5 points
- B. Workplace Safety - 13.5 points
- C. Workforce Development - 11 points
- D. Social Equity and Sustainability - 11 points
- E. Schedule of Pricing/Cost – 14.5 points

A.Z. Shmina – 73 points

- A. Qualifications, Experience and Accountability - 18 points
- B. Workplace Safety - 17 points
- C. Workforce Development - 15 points
- D. Social Equity and Sustainability - 11 points
- E. Schedule of Pricing/Cost - 12 points

Below are the factors affecting scoring, which ultimately gave a higher point total to A.Z. Shmina.

- A.Z. Shmina is running the project as general contractor versus construction management.
- A.Z. Shmina will be self-performing some of the work while A.R. Brouwer does not self-perform any work.
- A.Z. Shmina offered a very detailed and complete safety program. While A.R. Brouwer's EMR is lower, this is expected since A.R. Brouwer does not self-perform any construction work. A.Z. Shmina affirms workers have completed the 10-hour OSHA course. A.R. Brouwer was silent the 10-hour OSHA course.
- A.Z. Shmina is a signatory to Labor and Carpenters Union and covered under the USDOL program.
- A.Z. Shmina had no bid qualifications or exceptions.
- A.Z. Shmina had less money going to general conditions / overhead (\$116 K vs \$205 K).
- A.Z. Shmina offered a more complete schedule of values.