



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Park Advisory Commission

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Tuesday, October 17, 2017

4:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
Floor, City Council chambers

A ROLL CALL

Staff: C. Smith, E. Cooper, C. Pulcifer, J. Lawson, J. Landefeld, B. Meeks, B. Ruthven, and G. Hurn.

Present: 10 - Alan Jackson, Robert Galardi, David Santacroce, Paige Morrison, Stephen Borgsdorf, Julie Grand, Lauren London, Mike Appel, Ruth L. Kraut, and Graydon Krapohl

Absent: 1 - Praveena Ramaswami

B APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Approved as presented.

C PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Ethel Potts, 1014 Elder Boulevard, shared that the proposed location for the Fuller Park Train Station will have a great visual impact on the surrounding areas as well as an impact on the park. She also shared that the existing train station can be improved by adding an addition.

Vince Caruso, 556 Glendale Circle, expressed concerns about the Fuller Road Station site, citing parking, usage of park land, biking and pedestrian usage, and geographic location.

Rita Mitchell, 621 Fifth Street, thanked the Commission for their work keeping the parks in great shape. She shared that she is against the Fuller Road Train Station location due to its location and size.

Nancy Shiffler, speaking on behalf of the Huron Valley group of the Sierra Club, shared that using park land for transportation in Ann Arbor has never happened before. She added that a large impact would be created on the surrounding areas if a train station and a parking area is created where there is currently a park.

James D'Amour, shared that he was on the Parks Advisory Commission

from 2002-2003, and described that he finds the idea of selling park lands disturbing and encouraged the Commission to vote against a train station on park land.

Gwen Nystuen, 1016 Olivia Street, shared the significant impacts that would occur if the Fuller Road Train Station existed.

Barbara Bach, 2061 Day Street, shared that the Fuller Road Train Station would have significant impacts on the City of Ann Arbor and challenged the Commission to reclaim the space there to create a better park.

Scott Rosencrans, 3051 Lakeview Drive, gave details regarding Dolph Park and the Sister Lakes. He expressed support for the Sister Lakes Stormwater Improvement Project.

17-1767 Various Correspondence to the Parks Advisory Commission

Attachments: Document from Nystuen.pdf, Email and Attachment from Mitchell .pdf, Email from Baird.pdf, Email from Shiffler and Sierra Club Comments for PAC resolution regarding the Fuller Road Station.pdf, Request to PAC Defer Action on Ann Arbor Station from Mitchell.pdf

D APPROVAL OF MINUTES

D-1 17-1705 Park Advisory Commission Meeting Minutes of September 19, 2017

Attachments: 9-19-2017 Minutes with Live Links .pdf

Approved by the Board as Amended and forwarded to the City Council.

E SPECIAL PRESENTATIONS

E-1 17-1611 Review of 2017 Outdoor Pool Season

J. Landefeld, B. Meeks, B. Ruthven, and G. Hurn gave a presentation on the 2017 pool season. They highlighted improvements made this year, staff achievements, successes of the season, and upcoming improvements.

A. Jackson inquired about difficulties met by extending the pool season

relating to retaining staff. He also inquired about plumbing issues in some of the pool locker rooms.

G. Hurn answered that there were challenges relating to retaining staff, however it was worth extending the season.

B. Meeks answered that he is aware of and is working towards a solution to the plumbing issues.

C. Smith added that there will be a resolution regarding upgrades to mechanical infrastructure at the pools soon.

R. Kraut expressed appreciation for the extended pool season.

F NEW BUSINESS

- F-1 [17-1612](#) Resolution to Recommend Approval of the Purchase of Two Zamboni Ice Resurfacers with Frank J Zamboni & Co Inc. for \$193,856.00

Attachments: Resolution to Recommend Approval of the Purchase of Two Zamboni Ice Resurfacers .pdf, Amended Resolution to Recommend Approval of the Purchase of Two Zamboni Ice Resurfacers .pdf

C. Smith explained that the resolution is for the purchase of two Zamboni ice resurfacing machines, and to sell the two Zambonis that are being replaced. He explained the need to replace two Zambonis, stating that the existing Zambonis are in need of constant expensive repair.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission discussed alternatives to replacing the two existing Zambonis, including making repairs, and keeping one of the existing Zambonis to use as a spare, Zamboni Storage, and the selling price of a used Zamboni. They also discussed amending the resolution to include the sale of at least one Zamboni instead of the sale of both Zambonis.

A motion was made by London and seconded by Jackson that the Resolution be approved by the Commission as Amended.

Approved Resolution reads as follows:

Whereas, Ice resurfacers are an essential component of maintaining quality ice at both Veterans Memorial Park Ice Arena and Buhr Park Ice

Arena;

Whereas, Current Ice resurfacers are scheduled to be replaced in FY 2019;

Whereas, The Fleet & Facilities Unit needs to purchase replacement ice resurfacing machines for the City's fleet;

Whereas, Competitive bids were received by the National Joint Powers Alliance cooperative purchasing program;

Whereas, Frank Zamboni & Co. Inc. of Paramount, CA, received the contract for Ice Resurfacing Equipment;

Whereas, Frank Zamboni & Co. Inc. complies with the requirements of the City's Non-Discrimination Ordinances;

Whereas, Adequate funds for the purchase of these vehicles are available in the Fleet Services Fund FY18 budget and the Parks & Recreation Services General Fund FY18 operating budget; and

RESOLVED, That the Park Advisory Commission recommends City Council approves the issuance of a purchase order to Frank J Zamboni & Co. Inc. for two Zamboni Model 546 ice resurfacing machines in the total amount of \$193,855.95.

RESOLVED, That funds for the purchase of this equipment in the amount of \$187,652.07 comes from the Fleet Services Fund FY18 budget and in the amount of \$6,203.88 comes from the Parks & Recreation Services General Fund FY18 operating budget with funds to be available without regard to fiscal year; and

RESOLVED, That at least one of the two Zamboni ice surfacing machines being replaced be sold at the next City vehicle auction held after the vehicles are removed from service.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the resolution APPROVED.

Vote: 8-0

Yeas: 8 - Jackson, Galardi, Santacrose, Morrison, Borgsdorf, London, Appel, and RAC Rep. Kraut

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ramaswami

F-2 [17-1613](#) Resolution to Recommend Approval of a Contract with Aquatic Renovation Systems, Inc. to Install a PVC Pool Liner at Veterans Memorial Park Pool (\$134,805.00)

Attachments: Resolution to Recommend Approval of a Contract with Aquatic Renovation Systems, Inc. to Install a PVC Pool Liner at Veterans Memorial Park Pool.pdf

C. Smith explained the need for a new pool liner at Veteran's Memorial Park Pool stating that the current marcite lining material has reached the end of its useful life. He added that the pool is in a condition where it makes more financial sense to replace the liner instead of continuing to make repairs. He explained that the proposed PVC pool liner requires minimal upkeep and that it has a longer useful life than the marcite lining material.

A motion was made by Galardi, and seconded by Appel that the resolution be approved.

Approved Resolution reads as follows:

Whereas, The Parks and Recreation Open Space Plan recommends replacing the liner to prolong the integrity of the infrastructure and provide a better customer experience;

Whereas, The project supports the City sustainability goal of promoting active living and learning;

Whereas, Funding for construction is available in the approved FY2018 Park Maintenance and Capital Improvement Millage budget;

Whereas, Competitive bids were received by Purchasing on September 21, 2017 to replace the pool liner;

Whereas, Aquatic Renovation Systems, Inc. submitted the lowest responsive bid;

Whereas, Aquatic Renovation Systems, Inc. complies with the requirements of the City's Non-discrimination and Living Wage ordinances; and

RESOLVED, That the Park Advisory Commission recommend approval

of a contract with Aquatic Renovation Systems in the amount of \$134,805.00 and a construction contingency of \$13,480.00 (10%) to cover potential contract change orders for a total contract amount of \$148,285.00 for the life of the project without regard to fiscal year.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission discussed the feeling of the PVC material, the useful life, and the cost of the pool liner.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the resolution APPROVED.

Vote: 8-0

Yeas: 8 - Jackson, Galardi, Santacroce, Morrison, Borgsdorf, London, Appel, and RAC Rep. Kraut

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ramaswami

G UNFINISHED BUSINESS

G-1 [17-1622](#) Update on Sister Lakes Stormwater Improvement Project- Scheduling and Construction

J. Lawson explained the Sister Lakes Storm Water Improvement Project briefly to the Commission. She described the project, explaining that Stormwater and debris will be captured before entering First Sister Lake. She explained that there is currently not a system in place for storm water collection at that location.

The Commission asked questions regarding maintenance and basin design.

J. Lawson explained that the project will be maintained by volunteers, Public Works staff, and Stormwater staff. She added that it is a one basin design.

G-2 [17-1614](#) Resolution to Recommend Planning Commission and City Council initiate the Process to Adopt the Treeline - Allen Creek Urban Trail Master Plan

Attachments: The Treeline Allen Creek Urban Trail Summary Presentation.pdf, Treeline Master Plan Report Draft .pdf, Treeline Allen Creek Urban Trail Masterplan

Resolution.pdf

The Commission briefly discussed the Treeline -Allen Creek Urban Trail resolution.

A motion was made by Galardi, seconded by Morrison, that the Resolution be Approved by the Commission.

Commission Discussion:

S. Borgsdorf inquired about adding the project to the Master Plan. He also inquired about what about the Treeline Urban Trail project is being added to the Master Plan

C. Smith answered that when a project is part of a Master Plan there is greater access to the resources needed to implement the project, particularly grants.

C. Pulcipher responded that the plan is being included in its entirety; however, it is understood that the plan is aspirational/opportunistic and includes alternatives to aspects of the plan provided within the plan.

A. Jackson inquired about the priorities of PAC if the Treeline Urban Trail project is adopted to the Master Plan.

C. Smith answered that the priorities of the PAC and the LAC remain as they are.

M. Appel expressed that he would be voting against the resolution as he felt there could be a better Master Plan.

Approved Resolution reads as follows:

Whereas, The City of Ann Arbor aspires to provide non-motorized transportation options to connect neighborhoods, businesses, parks, and the Huron River;

Whereas, The idea for an urban trail that roughly follows the floor of the Allen Creek floodplain and the alignment of the Watco Companies/Ann Arbor Railroad has been discussed for decades within the community;

Whereas, The Parks, Recreation and Open Space (PROS) Plan and the Non-Motorized Transportation Plan, official planning documents for the City of Ann Arbor, recognize the future creation of the Allen Creek Greenway (now known as The Treeline—Allen Creek Urban Trail)

Whereas, In 2011, the Ann Arbor City Council passed a Resolution in Support of the Allen Creek Greenway (The Treeline) recognizing its ability to address existing inadequacies in non-motorized connections within the community and specifically to the Huron River;

Whereas, The Ann Arbor City Council directed staff to develop a scope of work for a “master plan approach” for The Treeline—Allen Creek Urban Trail;

Whereas, The Ann Arbor City Council passed a resolution to adopt the FY2016 budget which included funding for staff support and consulting services for development of a master Plan for The Treeline—Allen Creek Urban Trail;

Whereas, The project team identified various groups to be involved in the process, including a Project Management Team, Technical Advisory Committee, Citizen Advisory Committee, and Stakeholders/Community at Large;

Whereas, The planning process for The Treeline—Allen Creek Urban Trail engaged stakeholders, community leaders and residents in shaping the scope, content, and direction of the plan during participation at 13 public meetings;

Whereas, Additional opportunities for public comment will be available as part of the City Master Plan approval process; and,

Whereas, The Treeline—Allen Creek Urban Trail Master Plan provides a framework for an essential non-motorized, north-south connection through Ann Arbor’s richest cultural, recreational and economic assets, including surrounding neighborhoods and parks to the core of downtown Ann Arbor and University athletic facilities, while also linking to the Huron River, the regional Border-to-Border Trail and the state-wide Iron Belle Trail;

RESOLVED; That the Parks Advisory Commission supports The Treeline—Allen Creek Urban Trail Master Plan; and,

RESOLVED; That the Parks Advisory Commission recommends that the City Planning Commission and City Council initiate the process to adopt The Treeline—Allen Creek Urban Trail Master Plan as an element of the City Master Plan.

A motion was made that the Resolution be Approved by the Commission. On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the chair declaring the resolution APPROVED. Vote: 7-1

Yeas: 7 - Jackson, Galardi, Santacroce, Morrison, Borgsdorf, London, and RAC Rep. Kraut

Nays: 1 - Appel

Absent: 1 - Ramaswami

G-3 **17-1615** Resolution Regarding the Proposed Fuller Road Station

Attachments: AAS EA Appendices.pdf, AAS EA Compiled Sections Signed.pdf, 2017 PAC RESOLUTION REGARDING THE PROPOSED ANN ARBOR STATION 1013017.pdf, Amended PAC RESOLUTION REGARDING THE PROPOSED ANN ARBOR STATION 1013017 .pdf

E. Cooper explained the resolution regarding the Proposed Fuller Road Station stating that the purpose of the resolution is for the PAC to recommend the advancement of the project to City Council.

S. Borgsdorf discussed de minimis impact as it relates to the Fuller Road Station.

A. Jackson discussed the current use for the Fuller Road Station park land.

R. Galardi inquired about bike trails relating to the Fuller Road Station.

C. Smith clarified that the Border to Border trail is on the north side of Fuller Road.

A motion was made by Appel, and seconded by Galardi to approve the resolution as presented.

Resolution reads as follows:

Whereas, The City under agreement and in cooperation with the Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT) and the Federal Railroad Administration (FRA) has undertaken an intercity passenger rail

station planning and environmental review process to provide an Americans with Disability Act (ADA) compliant intermodal facility, accommodate existing and future intercity passenger rail service, improve intermodal connectivity, accommodate potential commuter rail service, add ADA compliant features including parking and improve integration of the station within the City;

Whereas, The planning process has followed FRA guidance for development of a project Purpose and Need, completion of an Alternatives Analysis, and preparation of a draft Environmental Assessment pursuant to the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) and its regulations, including public meetings and review of the above referenced materials;

Whereas, The planning process, including the development of a draft Environmental Assessment (EA), resulted in the detailed evaluation of a No Build Alternative and four (4) build alternatives;

Whereas, Detailed analysis, consistent with the requirements of the NEPA, concluded with the preliminary identification of a Preferred Alternative, described as Build Alternative 3A, Fuller Road Elevated Station;

Whereas, The Park Advisory Commission (PAC) has received presentations regarding the Alternatives Analysis and draft Environmental Assessment including the above preliminary Preferred Alternative;

Whereas, PAC's duties include providing a forum for advice and public input to the City Council on matters relating to the parks system, and specifically to provide advice and recommendations as they relate to major new development projects (residential, transportation, commercial, etc) which significantly impact park and recreation services;

Whereas, Building the proposed Ann Arbor Station Build Alternative 3A will create a permanent structure on parkland, occupying the existing footprint of an asphalt surface parking lot; and

Whereas, Parks and Recreation Services shall receive in FY2018 revenues in the amount of \$91,502.00 from the University of Michigan for leasing parking at Fuller Park, which is recognized in the Parks & Recreation Services General Fund Revenue Budget;

RESOLVED, PAC recognizes the need for an improved intermodal station in the community;

RESOLVED, PAC supports integration of active transportation systems including bicycling and walking elements as a fundamental component of meeting both park and intercity rail passenger needs

RESOLVED, PAC accepts the analysis and findings of the EA that define Option 3A as the Preferred Alternative; RESOLVED, PAC recommends the Ann Arbor Station project, if located on the site of the south parking lot of Fuller Park, include 150 parking spaces (as described with the EA document) that will be free and available to park users as long as necessary to meet existing and future park users' needs;

RESOLVED, PAC recommends City Council and staff insure that any use of the land in Fuller Park for uses such as a transit station or parking structure not result in any net reductions in the Parks General Fund Operating budget, and if possible, results in a net increase in park system revenue; and

RESOLVED, Subject to the impacts on the Parks & Recreation Services identified above being resolved, PAC supports Council executing appropriate de minimis documentation for use of the parking area on the south side of Fuller Road as the Preferred Alternative for Ann Arbor Station as described in the EA.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission discussed setting precedent, vehicle parking for park use, revenue, negative impacts on the park, features to improve the park experience, and traffic mitigation. The Commission discussed amending the resolution to include "that the design of any structure in Fuller Park for a transit station accommodate those needs" after the second resolve clause.

Moved by Morrison, seconded by Galardi, that a friendly amendment be made to add additional language. Amendment accepted.

Yeas: 6 - Jackson, Galardi, Santacroce, Morrison, Liaison Grand, London, Appel, and Liaison Krapohl

Nays: 2 - Borgsdorf, and RAC Rep. Kraut

Absent: 1 - Ramaswami

AMENDED RESOLUTION READS AS FOLLOWS:

Whereas, The City under agreement and in cooperation with the Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT) and the Federal Railroad Administration (FRA) has undertaken an intercity passenger rail station planning and environmental review process to provide an Americans with Disability Act (ADA) compliant intermodal facility, accommodate existing and future intercity passenger rail service, improve intermodal connectivity, accommodate potential commuter rail service, add ADA compliant features including parking and improve integration of the station within the City;

Whereas, The planning process has followed FRA guidance for development of a project Purpose and Need, completion of an Alternatives Analysis, and preparation of a draft Environmental Assessment pursuant to the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) and its regulations, including public meetings and review of the above referenced materials;

Whereas, The planning process, including the development of a draft Environmental Assessment (EA), resulted in the detailed evaluation of a No Build Alternative and four (4) build alternatives;

Whereas, Detailed analysis, consistent with the requirements of the NEPA, concluded with the preliminary identification of a Preferred Alternative, described as Build Alternative 3A, Fuller Road Elevated Station;

Whereas, The Park Advisory Commission (PAC) has received presentations regarding the Alternatives Analysis and draft Environmental Assessment including the above preliminary Preferred Alternative;

Whereas, PAC's duties include providing a forum for advice and public input to the City Council on matters relating to the parks system, and specifically to provide advice and recommendations as they relate to major new development projects (residential, transportation, commercial, etc) which significantly impact park and recreation services;

Whereas, Building the proposed Ann Arbor Station Build Alternative 3A will create a permanent structure on parkland, occupying the existing footprint of an asphalt surface parking lot; and

Whereas, Parks and Recreation Services shall receive in FY2018 revenues in the amount of \$91,502.00 from the University of Michigan for leasing parking at Fuller Park, which is recognized in the Parks & Recreation Services General Fund Revenue Budget;

RESOLVED, PAC recognizes the need for an improved intermodal station in the community;

RESOLVED, PAC supports integration of active transportation systems including bicycling and walking elements as a fundamental component of meeting both park and intercity rail passenger needs; and, that the design of any structure in Fuller Park for a transit station accommodate those needs;

RESOLVED, PAC accepts the analysis and findings of the EA that define Option 3A as the Preferred Alternative; RESOLVED, PAC recommends the Ann Arbor Station project, if located on the site of the south parking lot of Fuller Park, include 150 parking spaces (as described with the EA document) that will be free and available to park users as long as necessary to meet existing and future park users' needs;

RESOLVED, PAC recommends City Council and staff insure that any use of the land in Fuller Park for uses such as a transit station or parking structure not result in any net reductions in the Parks General Fund Operating budget, and if possible, results in a net increase in park system revenue; and

RESOLVED, Subject to the impacts on the Parks & Recreation Services identified above being resolved, PAC supports Council executing appropriate de minimis documentation for use of the parking area on the south side of Fuller Road as the Preferred Alternative for Ann Arbor Station as described in the EA.

H COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS

None.

I REPORT FROM PARKS AND RECREATION MANAGER

C. Smith reported that the Trick or Treat Paddle was successful, explaining that over 500 people attended. He attributed the success to the hard work of staff to create high quality programs.

J REPORT FROM RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION

R. Kraut informed the Commission of a Rec and Ed fundraiser where tickets to a Detroit Pistons basketball game are being sold.

K REPORTS FROM RELEVANT COMMISSIONS, COMMITTEES, BOARDS AND/OR TASKFORCES

None.

L PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

James D'Amour expressed dissatisfaction with the Commission approving the Resolution Regarding the Proposed Fuller Road Train Station

M CLOSED SESSION

N TRANSMITTALS

N-1 [17-1616](#) Park Planning Capital Project Update

Attachments: Park Planning Capital Project Update.pdf

Received and Filed

N-2 [17-1617](#) PAC Council Update

Attachments: PAC Council Update 10-2017.pdf

Received and Filed

N-3 [17-1618](#) Parks Project Status Table

Attachments: Parks Project Status Table .pdf

Received and Filed

O ADJOURNMENT