

**ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION****Staff Report****ADDRESS:** 514 S First Street, Application Number HDC21-210**DISTRICT:** Old West Side Historic District**REPORT DATE:** August 12, 2021**REPORT PREPARED BY:** Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator**REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE:** Monday August 9, 2021

	<b>OWNER</b>	<b>APPLICANT</b>
<b>Name:</b>	Gabriel Ehrlich and Meredith Pedde	Same
<b>Address:</b>	514 S First St Ann Arbor, MI 48103	
<b>Phone:</b>		

**BACKGROUND:** Per information provided to the current owners, the house was built in 1892 by Eckhardt Stein. The Stein family lived in the house until 1911. Polk City Directories show Mr. Albert Prochnow occupying the house from 1912 to 1921, and Mr. Charles Allen from 1923 to 1966. The house is a two-story gable-fronter with a cut-stone foundation and decorative shingles in the gables.

In 2016 the HDC granted a certificate of appropriateness to rebuild the missing front porch, add a small addition and deck, and numerous other repairs and replacements.

**LOCATION:** The site is located on the west side of South First Street, south of West Jefferson and north of West Madison.

**APPLICATION:** The applicant seeks HDC approval to install a 275 square foot backyard patio; add brick on both sides and the center of the two-track driveway; construct a 6' wood vertical slat fence along the west and south property lines and across the side yard to the house; and install four 4' x 8' wood trellis panels intended for climbing plants to screen the view into the neighbor's yard.

**APPLICABLE REGULATIONS****From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:**

- (1) A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property will be unimpaired.

**From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):**

**Building Site**

*Recommended:* Retaining the historic relationship between buildings, landscape features, and open space.

Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

*Not Recommended:* Introducing new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture or which destroys historic relationships on the site.

Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building site so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

**From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Ann Arbor guidelines may also apply):**

**Landscape Features**

*Not Appropriate:* Introducing any new building, streetscape, or landscape feature that is out of scale or otherwise inappropriate to the district's historic character.

**Paved Areas**

*Appropriate:* On residential properties, retaining and maintaining existing historic driveways and curb cuts, including "two track" driveways and green space between the driveway and house.

**STAFF FINDINGS**

1. The 275 square foot backyard patio features bluestone pavers and red brick edging. Two new stepping stone paths set in crushed stone lead to either side of the house. Numerous new plantings surround the patio. The location, size and design of the patio are appropriate for this large backyard.
2. The current driveway features two concrete tracks from the apron (at the street) to the back wall of the house. These are not historic – in the 2008 file photo at the end of the staff report and on a 1947 aerial photo a walkway along the driveway is present but not the concrete tracks. Because they are not from the period of significance, staff has no objections to the use of bricks as pavers between and on the sides of the tracks. The driveway would not be made longer.

3. The 6' tall wood fence has vertical slats. It would meet City fence code requirements for 80% opacity along the side of the house and 100% opacity behind it. The fence cuts across the front yard for 12'4" and ties in to the front (southeast) corner of the house. This fence would have been approved by staff had there not been a commission application to include it on.
4. Along the south property line where screening is desired of a neighbor's accessory building, four 4' x 8' wood trellis panels are proposed on which to grown hydrangeas.
5. On the site plan a 10' x 10' box is shown for a future shed near the south property line. The box is a placeholder for a future shed has not yet been designed and is not part of this application.
6. Staff recommends approval of the application. The two concrete tracks are not from the period of significance, and the proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding neighborhood and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines* for paved areas and landscape features, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards 1, 2 and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

**POSSIBLE MOTIONS:** (Note that the motion supports staff findings and is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 514 S First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a 275 square foot backyard patio; add brick on both sides and the center of the two-track driveway; construct a 6' wood vertical slat fence along the west and south property lines and across the side yard to the house; and install four 4' x 8' wood trellis panels, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines* for paved areas and landscape features, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

application, description of work, photos, drawings.

514 S First St (May 2008 file photo)

