



## MEMORANDUM

TO: Chair, Transportation Commission  
FROM: Howard S. Lazarus, City Administrator  
DATE: November 18, 2019  
SUBJECT: Response to Council Resolution R-19-460 – Resolution Directing Review of City Transportation Planning and Operations Management and Related Staffing

---

This memorandum is provided in response to approved Council Resolution [R-19-460](#) “Resolution Directing Review of City Transportation Planning and Operations Management and Related Staffing” which directed the City Administrator to provide an update on transportation related items. Specifically, the resolution requires the following:

- The City Administrator negotiate with Sam Schwartz Consulting to amend the existing contract to include an assessment of our pedestrian and cycling environment before December 31, 2019.
- The City Administrator provide Council with a description of how the City uses the resources provided to develop and operate the right of way to achieve safe and efficient movement of all modes of travel, including the status of hiring of the additional FTE added in the FY2020 budget. The City Administrator will present this description to the Transportation Commission in its November 2019 meeting, and to City Council not later than the first Council meeting in December 2019.
- The City Administrator identify current standing requirements and consolidate the reporting requirements into a single quarterly report concerning design, construction, operation (including safety and crash data) and maintenance to Council.

While the Council resolution does not establish a requirement for the Transportation Commission to provide a formal response, the Administrator’s intent is to capture comments and integrate them into the memorandum that will be sent to Council.

### ***Amendment of Sam Schwartz Consulting Agreement***

The attached proposed scope of services from Sam Schwartz to provide an assessment of the City’s pedestrian bicycling environment provides for the following tasks:

- Task 1 – Inventory of Current Facilities
- Task 2 – Documentation of Existing Resources
- Task 3 – Best Practices Research
- Task 4 – Develop Report

- Task 5 – Commission Presentation and Staff Meeting
- Task 6 – Additional Committee Meetings and Commission Presentation

The estimated total cost for all tasks is \$26,200. The contract amendment to perform this work will require Council approval and a budget amendment, and hence the December 31, 2019 time frame cannot be met. Staff anticipates the resolution for Council action will be presented in December, and the requested work will commence in January.

### ***Use of Transportation Resources***

The detailed discussion of resources dedicated to operation, maintenance, and improvement of the City's transportation network is provided in the paragraphs that follow. A staff organization chart is provided as an attachment to this memorandum.

### **Personnel**

City Administrator and City Legal - City Administrator, City Attorney, Mayor and City Council account for 11% of the expenditures of the FY2020 Municipal Budget.

- *City Administration* is responsible for oversight of the City's overall operation. This work includes but is not limited to: strategic direction development; coordination with community stakeholders and elected officials; and execution of City Council policy. It should also be noted that Human Resources support all staff but listing HR staff is less critical since those working directly on transportation issues in other departments are identified throughout this memo. Staff who may work on transportation issues: Administrators/Attorney = 3; City Attorneys = 10; Administrative Support/Paralegal = 5.

Public Services Area – Public Services accounts for 6% of the expenditures of the FY2020 Municipal Budget.

- *Area administration* is responsible for oversight of the division. This work includes but is not limited to: strategic direction; coordination with community stakeholders and elected officials; budget setting and tracking; oversight of personnel. Staff who may work on transportation issues: Area Administrator = 1; Administrative support = 1; Finance Specialists = 4.
- *Engineering* is responsible for the capital improvements to and operations of the public rights-of-way. This work includes but is not limited to: the planning, design, standards development, and construction oversight of improvements to the public rights-of-way including vehicular travel lanes, bicycle facilities, and pedestrian facilities as well as coordination on transit facilities; installation, operations and maintenance of traffic control devices including signs and signals; installation and maintenance of City-owned streetlights; review of private developments which impact the public rights-of-way; administration of the traffic calming program; and inspection of any work performed in the public rights-of-way. Staff who may work on transportation issues: Management = 3; Capital Project Management Engineers = 6; Private Development Engineers = 3; Design Engineers = 2; Transportation Engineers = 3; Transportation Planner = 1; Drafters and Inspectors = 12; Signs and Signals Team = 12.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> A fourth Transportation Engineer was included in the current fiscal year budget. The position description has been researched and finalized, and the recruitment process has been initiated.

- *Public Works* is responsible for the maintenance of the public rights-of-way. This work includes but is not limited to: winter maintenance of the roadways; street sweeping; pothole patching; and maintenance of vegetation in the rights-of-way. Staff who may work on transportation issues: Management = 2; Streets Team = 12.
- *Systems Planning* is responsible for the capital program planning, mapping, and public outreach coordination. This work includes but is not limited to: the development and maintenance of the Capital Improvements Plan; GIS inventory of assets; public engagement and stakeholder coordination. Staff who may work on transportation issues: Management = 1; Engagement Specialists = 2; GIS Specialists = 2; Capital Program = 1.
- *Fleet and Facility* is responsible for the Ann Arbor Airport and overseeing the maintenance of city-owned facilities. This work includes but is not limited to: support and maintenance of vehicles used by City staff to conduct work on the transportation network; operation and maintenance of the municipal airport. Staff who may work on transportation issues: Management = 1; Fleet maintenance staff = 10.

Community Services – Community Services account for 16% of the expenditures of the FY2020 Municipal Budget.

- *Planning and Development* is responsible for providing information to advise and guide development, redevelopment, improvements and preservation for those who live in, work in, and visit the City. This work includes but is not limited to: review of private development; development and maintenance the City's Master Plan; and development of land use codes and standards. Staff who may work on transportation issues: Management = 1; City Planners = 5.

Financial and Administrative Services – Financial and Administrative Services account for 7% of the expenditures of the FY2020 Municipal Budget.

- *Customer Service* is responsible for engaging the public and processing their requests and certain payments. This work includes but is not limited to: residential parking permit administration; street light outage reports to DTE; and routing customer concerns about transportation to the appropriate department. Staff who may work on transportation issues: Management = 1; Customer Service Representatives = 8.

Support from other departments – Financial and Budget Planning, Information Technology, and Risk Management Services all provide support to the other departments which work on transportation issues. This support is crucial but listing staff is less critical since those working directly on transportation issues from other departments are identified throughout this memo.

Safety Services – Safety Services account for 42% of the expenditures of the FY2020 Municipal Budget.

- *Community Standards* (within the Ann Arbor Police Department) is responsible for enforcing the city codes and ordinances that protect the public health, welfare and safety of residents. This work includes but is not limited to: parking enforcement of vehicles, bicycles, and e-scooters; vegetation/sight distance enforcement. Staff who may work on transportation issues: Management = 1; Enforcement Officers = 12.

- *Police Services* is responsible for providing protection and service. This work includes but is not limited to: enforcement of traffic laws and traffic control orders; serious crash investigations; and special event transportation operations. Staff who may work on transportation issues: 126 sworn officers.

## **Resources**

The Capital Improvements Plan outlines a schedule of public service expenditures over the ensuing six-year period (<https://www.a2gov.org/departments/systems-planning/programs/Pages/FY2016-2021-Capital-Improvements-Plan.aspx>). The categories related to transportation in the CIP are:

- Airport
- Active Transportation
- Bridges
- New Streets
- Other Transportation
- Parking Facilities
- Street Construction
- Transit

The City Budget sets the operating budget for the City over a two year period (<https://www.a2gov.org/departments/finance-admin-services/financial-reporting/budget-guide/Pages/BudgetPublicProcess.aspx>). The funds in the FY2020 budget related to transportation are:

- Major Street Fund (0021) = \$16,550,159
- Local Street Fund (0022) = \$7,778,783
- Metro Expansion (0036) = \$436,495
- Alternative Transportation (0061) = \$2,521,618
- Street, Bridge & Sidewalk Millage (0062) = \$22,638,465 (note: this funding also supports utility work and the entire amount should not be assumed to go towards transportation initiatives)
- General Fund - There are some activities related to transportation that are funded through the general fund. It fronts the money for design & public engagement for sidewalk gap projects; funds special transportation initiatives like the Transportation Plan Update; and is the funding source for paving gravel roads.

## **Reporting**

The requirement to provide a consolidated quarterly report is already being met. Staff provides a consolidated report concerning ongoing transportation issues to the Transportation Commission at its monthly meeting. That report is then forwarded to City Council as an attachment to the City Administrator's Update. Similarly, crash data is also included as a City Administrator Communication. However, these reports will be consolidated into a single document going forward to highlight their visibility.

As always, please do not hesitate to contact me if I can be of further assistance or if you have any questions.

## **ATTACHMENTS**

- 1 – Sam Schwartz Scope of Work
- 2 – Engineering and Transportation Organization Chart

cc: J Fournier  
R Hess  
S Higgins  
C Hupy  
N Hutchinson  
C Redinger

**Sam Schwartz**  
223 W. Jackson Blvd., Suite 1101  
Chicago, IL 60606  
(773) 305-0800  
samschwartz.com

**Sam  
Schwartz**

November 4, 2019

Eli Cooper, AICP  
Transportation Program Manager  
City of Ann Arbor

**RE: Transportation Plan Update Additional Work**

Dear Mr. Cooper:

Per our conversations, Sam Schwartz is submitting the enclosed proposal for additional work to be amended to the existing contract for the transportation master plan update.

This proposal includes tasks to assess the operations and maintenance of the city's pedestrian and bicycle infrastructure. Our estimated fee to complete Tasks 1 through 5 below is \$17,200 and the work can be completed within six (6) weeks from Notice to Proceed.

This proposal also includes tasks to add four (4) committee meetings and two (2) transportation commission meetings to the original scope. Our estimated fee to complete Task 6 is \$9,000 and will be completed within the overall timeframe of the transportation master plan update.

Total estimated fee for Tasks 1 through 6 is \$26,200 in labor, to be billed on an hourly basis. Direct expenses are not anticipated and are not included in the estimated fee.

We look forward to the opportunity to continue to support Ann Arbor through this work. Please feel free to reach out to discuss this proposal in more detail.

Sincerely,



Stacey Meekins  
Principal + Director of Transportation Planning

# Transportation Plan Update Additional Work

## Project Understanding

Sam Schwartz understands that the City of Ann Arbor desires to gain a better understanding of the procedures and resources necessary to operate and maintain safe transportation facilities, with an emphasis on the pedestrian and bicycle infrastructure throughout the city. We have outlined below an approach that will allow us to explore best practices and lessons learned and apply those to Ann Arbor. We anticipate this work, as outlined in Tasks 1 through 5 below, to take approximately 6 weeks to complete from the Notice to Proceed.

This proposal also includes a task to add additional advisory committee meetings and transportation commission presentations to the original scope. That work is detailed in Task 6 and will be completed within the overall timeframe of the transportation plan update.

## Scope of Work

### Task 1: Inventory of Current Facilities

In order to understand the scale of the operations and maintenance of these facilities, it is important to establish the foundation of the existing infrastructure. This task will use data available from the city and will not include field data collection. Sam Schwartz will prepare a technical memorandum summarizing the existing infrastructure and work with the city to make sure that everything of interest is being captured.

*Deliverable:*

- Technical memorandum summarizing existing infrastructure

*Estimated hours: 18*

### Task 2: Documentation of Existing Resources

To begin to identify how the existing resources are meeting the current needs, we will first need to understand the existing processes, staffing levels and responsibilities, data availability, and equipment and funding resources. We will conduct a document review of all relevant policies and procedures, focusing on policies around issues that have arisen through our outreach for the transportation plan update or are known concerns. Such issues may include vegetation management, pedestrian-scale lighting, street sweeping and maintenance of bikeways, pavement condition and pavement marking maintenance, snow clearance, and traffic signal maintenance. The document review will be supplemented by a series of key staff interview with representation across departments and/or agencies and will include staff at various levels of their organizations. We anticipate conducting up to 10 interviews by phone for this task.

*Deliverables:*

- Draft interview questions
- Final interview questions
- Memorandum summarizing existing resources

*Estimated hours: 44*

### **Task 3: Best Practices Research**

This task will consist of a best practices review of peer and aspirational cities. Sam Schwartz will conduct interviews with staff from 4-6 cities, as agreed upon by the City of Ann Arbor. Cities interviewed will include those known to have a strong safety record and that have similarities to Ann Arbor in characteristics such as size, population, population density, and climate. Peer cities may be found across the country and will include one or more city within Michigan.

Sam Schwartz will prepare a draft set of interview questions to be reviewed and commented on by the city and will subsequently conduct interviews with a target of one hour or less for each conversation. Sam Schwartz will compile notes from each interview and identify key findings from the series of interviews.

*Deliverables:*

- List of cities to be interviewed
- Draft interview questions
- Final interview questions
- Memorandum summarizing interview notes and key findings

*Estimated hours: 38*

### **Task 4: Develop Report**

Based on the findings from the first three tasks, Sam Schwartz will prepare a report highlighting recommendations for Ann Arbor to improve processes and procedures to consistently maintain a safer transportation network. The report will focus on the practices and procedures found to be the best approaches as well as the resources necessary to implement them.

*Deliverables:*

- Draft Operations and Maintenance Practices Report
- Final Operations and Maintenance Practices Report

*Estimated hours: 38*

### **Task 5: Commission Presentation and Staff Meetings**

With the draft report complete, Sam Schwartz will spend a day in Ann Arbor conducting small group meetings and/or one-on-one interviews with senior leadership and staff affected by the proposed changes



within the report. The purpose of these meetings will be to hear feedback and identify potential challenges to implementation. Input received from these meetings will inform revisions to the draft report.

During this visit, Sam Schwartz will also present the findings and draft recommendations to the transportation commission.

*Deliverables:*

- *Transportation commission presentation*
- *Meeting notes*

*Estimated hours: 24*

## **Task 6: Committee Meetings and Commission Presentations**

The original scope of the transportation plan update included four meetings with one advisory committee, however, the scope has been amended to include a second advisory committee. Presentations to the transportation commission were not included in the original scope.

This task adds two (2) meetings each for the technical and community advisory committees and two (2) presentations to the transportation commission as well as labor to prepare for those meetings.

*Deliverables:*

- *Meeting materials*
- *Meeting summary notes*
- *Transportation commission presentations*

*Estimated hours:*

- *Two (2) TAC meetings: 18*
- *Two (2) CAC meetings: 18*
- *Two (2) Transportation Commission presentations: 8*

Howard Lazarus  
City Administrator

Craig Hupy  
Public Services Administrator

Nick Hutchinson  
City Engineer

Raymond Hess  
Transportation Manager

**Transportation Planning:**  
Eli Cooper – Transportation  
Program Manager

**Transportation Engineering:**  
Cyrus Naheedy –  
Transportation Engineer II  
Cynthia Redinger –  
Transportation Engineer IV  
Luke Liu – Transportation  
Engineer IV  
Vacant – Transportation  
Engineer III or IV

**Signs and Signals:**  
Chuck Fojtik – Signs and  
Signals Supervisor

Kevin Braun – Technician V  
Dennis Fischer – Technician V  
John Tomich – Technician V  
Jeremy Sype – Technician V  
Steve Longworth – Technician  
IV  
Scott Hogan – Technician III  
Adam Michelson – Technician  
III  
Jerry Perrine – Technician III  
Derek Van Stone – Technician  
III  
Kevin Wachowiak – Technician  
III  
Vacant – Technician III  
Vacant – Technician III