



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, November 12, 2015

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Tom Stulberg called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Jill Thacher called the roll.

Staff Present: Jill Thacher

Present: 7 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Thomas Stulberg, Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, John Beeson, Jennifer Ross, and Evan Hall

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

C-1 **ELECTIONS**

Commissioner White moved to nominate Benjamin Bushkuhl as Chairperson, John Beeson as Vice Chair, and Jennifer Ross as Secretary. Seconded by Ramsburgh.

The nominees accepted, and the vote was unanimous.

Ben Bushkuhl took the position as Chairperson.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

None

E **HEARINGS**

E-1 **15-1393** HDC15-164; 201 Glen - New Hotel - OFWHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg reported that the site is vacant, and the staff report was very thorough.

Bushkuhl reported that tonight's presentation included many helpful pictures to help the Commissioners understand what is going on at the site.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Robert Carson, representing the applicant, Neumann/SMith Architecture, 400 Galleria Officecentre, Suite 555, Southfield, MI., was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission. He reviewed the application in detail with the Commission (see video of hearing).

Bob Lawson, Heritage Consulting Group, 1120 NW Northrup Street, Portland, OR., working for the applicant, reviewed their report of the project which was also provided to the Commission.

Scott Bonnie, working for the applicant reviewed a slide presentation of the Old Fourth Ward and explained how he felt the proposed project fit into the neighborhood.

Julie Ritter, 920 Catherine St, Ann Arbor, Old Fourth Ward Historic District, said she thinks she remembers that the previously mentioned residential PUD project did not get the approval of the HDC. She said the proposed project had no setback on the building which the University buildings all have with heavy landscaping. She spoke of sandy soils in the area noting that the contamination on the site can be removed by anyone who builds on the site, and that Glen was not portrayed to scale in the renderings, noting it was much narrower. She commented that UM creep was possible anywhere. She said the previous PUD was for residential but had no relevance because it is expired and it should be off the table.

Mary Ivers, 920 East Ann Street, agreed with Ritter that parcels identified on the applicant's slides as being rental properties are owner occupied.

She said they live in a historic district and rely on the Historic District Commission to help them protect it. She said the two 'modern buildings' mentioned by Ritter were put in before the historic district was formed and it was formed to stop that from happening to the entire neighborhood. She asked that the Commission not approve the application so that doesn't continue to happen. She liked the 1947 slide presented by staff and said the neighborhood looked a lot like that when they moved in and was mostly residential and they have worked hard to maintain the residential character of what remains and she doesn't like her neighborhood being referred to as being on the edge of the neighborhood as they are a vibrant neighborhood and very much a part of the Old Fourth Ward. She asked that the Commission not approve the application as presented tonight.

Christine Crockett, 506 E. Kingsley Street, Ann Arbor, President of The Old Fourth Ward Association, complimented staff on the very thorough staff report which repeatedly refers to the Period of Significance and is germane to any arguments whether this building should or shouldn't be built. She said it shouldn't be built, noting that it is a big wall and is as big as all of the modern buildings the University of Michigan has constructed, and that has nothing to do with the Old Fourth Ward. She said comments by the applicant that the building is designed to blend with other buildings in the area is not the purpose of the Historic District or its' organic context. She said this building does nothing to assist in that. She added that the applicant referenced the apartment building on Kingsley, but she wanted to point out that it is only three stories high. She said this building is too big, ostentatious, and inappropriate for the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, whether it's on the edge or not, it's still within in the district and therefore must abide by the rules here in Ann Arbor for the historic district. She said the PUD that was approved was not approved by the Historic Commission but by a judge. She read from the report presented to the Commission last month written by Ray Detter and her.

Ray Detter, 120 North Division Street, Ann Arbor, said the applicants reached out to the neighborhood to find out if they liked various options, but he realized that the issues they are dealing with has to do with major historic principles within the City and in dealing with the impact of the structure in relation to where they want to go in this community. He noted that the staff report clearly pointed out that the mass, scaling, design, and use, are not compatible with local, as well as the Interior Standard's of preservation. He said the City's Downtown Plan approved in 2009, stressed the need to protect the livability and residentially zoned neighborhoods adjacent to downtown. (He read from the approved Plan) He said he would like to see the whole building be residential. but this

proposed structure is simply too big and massive, too out of scale, and too intrusive into the historic neighborhood it is in, as well as adding traffic and parking problems to an already congested street. He said the federal guidelines try to recognize the nature of those types of directions and would recommend, as Jill Thacher (City Staff) has recommended that we reject this particular project. He further stated that the relationship to the existing neighborhoods was the issue.

Jill Schlosh, 1423 Iroquois Place, Ann Arbor, said she felt the use of the site seemed to be within the spirit of the area, since the families needing places to stay while relatives were hospitalized at the University of Michigan could benefit from this hotel and possible retail or restaurant. She noted that the developers are local and will listen to the community as they move forward which she felt was beneficial. She said the contamination on the lot would be expensive to clean up and she felt it was likely that the only other type of building that could go on this lot would be a University building, because of the associated costs with a clean-up.

Doug Kelbaugh, 227 E Ann Street, Ann Arbor, Architect and Historic Urban Planner who lives in a historic building, The Armory, said he loves the area and while he spoke out against the 413 E Huron building, he felt that this is a significantly different case. He said given the terrain of the site, down in a hollow it seems much more to belong to the medical campus than part of the Old Fourth Ward. He said it just doesn't feel like the Old Fourth Ward down there, and the two immediate neighboring apartment buildings are not of historic character. He said he would call them mediocre modern, at best, with mainly parking garages and a void in need of an in-fill of some sort. He commented that it is also not good planning practice to divide any type of districts down the middle of the street, as in this area, but rather in mid-blocks or alleys. He said this site is a good transit oriented site and will probably be on the connector route, when established and will potentially be a second stop on the medical center bus route, adding that density is needed along such corridors and will be 'greener' to have a higher density close to transit and the medical center, along with it just making sense to have a hotel there. He continued that he considered the building to be mid-rise and appropriate on a busy arterial such as Glen Ave, noting that the real height is taller than what it seems because it is down in a valley and will not cast one shadow on one building after 12.01 pm because of its' orientation. He said he also doubted if a smaller developer could absorb the \$1 Million cost of environmental clean-up of this site. He said this area was an old coal line, a drainage and railway ravine for a very long time, and not a meaningful

part of the neighborhood; he would rather that the City concentrate on saving the meaningful jewels that the City is so blessed with and not waste or misinterpreting it on areas that are radically different than what they were in the past and are rather architecturally and urbanistically ordinary now. He said this building could make it less mediocre, and if we want to retain Ann Arbor's true livable character, which it is so blessed with, we wouldn't want to freeze dry an area like this, as it is not a resilient Ann Arbor traditional area. He said, if necessary, he would suggest redrawing the line, to make this legally possible, because he didn't feel it would be of any loss to the Fourth Ward, if they excluded this building and the two modern apartment buildings behind it. He said there are many things he liked about the proposed building, but suggested one rose window would be enough and the vertical pilars seem to be designed by committee giving an overly decorative and excessive iconic building. He said he was sorry to differ with neighbors, whom he really likes and respects.

Jeff Crockett, 506 E. Kingsley Street, Ann Arbor, said he took issue with a couple of things said by previous speaker, Kelbaugh. He said while it will take money for the clean up, why not have condominiums, apartments, all residential, since the main issue they are arguing against is the commercial use. He said he was confused about the comments about putting boundaries in the middle of the streets, when that is the way they did it for a purpose. He commented on a previous speaker's comments, noting that she lives in a different neighborhood. He said she had stated that this building would benefit the hospital and the entertaining industry of downtown Ann Arbor and that is not what you need to be considering but the residents of this area. He also said the applicant's slide showing owner versus rental homes doesn't matter since most of the homes are all single-family homes and it is this aspect that contributes to the single-family neighborhood. He asked that the Commission reject this proposal for these reasons.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Bushkuhl, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for 201 Glen Avenue to construct a nine story hotel with ground floor retail and restaurant, as proposed. The proposed work is not compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and does not meet The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and The Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular

standards 1, 2, 9, and 10, and the guidelines for District/Neighborhood and Building Sites, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for all new construction, and new residential and commercial construction.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion failed.

VOTE: 3-4

Certificate of Appropriateness DENIED.

Yeas: 3 - White, Vice Chair Bushkuhl, and Secretary Beeson

Nays: 4 - Ramsburgh, Chair Stulberg, Ross, and Hall

Commission Break!

E-2 **15-1394** HDC15-212; 1533 Broadway - Rear Addition -- BHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg reported that while the old existing windows are cool and interesting, they do need to be replaced with something more efficient and functional. He said dropping the one window by 1 row of block wouldn't hurt, and given that there is already an addition on the rear, while unusable, he felt enlarging the addition over the existing basement foundation would be appropriate, and he supported the application.

Bushkuhl agreed with Stulberg, noting that the extending beams from the rear sunroom might be an indication of what the previous owners wanted to do originally, and what this application is proposing to do. He felt it was a positive that with the proposed changes one would still be able to look right through the building and see the trees; all of which contributes to the modern feel of the house.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Andrzej Dolata, 3675 Charter Place, Ann Arbor, owner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission. He reviewed the application in detail with the Commission (see video of hearing).

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Stulberg, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1533 Broadway Street, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to construct an addition over an existing rear walkout basement, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried.

VOTE: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Stulberg, Vice Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Beeson, Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

E-3 [15-1395](#)

HDC15-210; 815 W Jefferson - New Garage - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg reported that this existing garage is in really bad shape and the

condition is beyond repair.

Bushkuhl agreed, noting that the 3 degree slope of the existing roof and rafters, knowing the Michigan snow load, would not be safe, and he was surprised that it hadn't given in already, given how bowed it was. He said the existing garage couldn't be repaired given what was remaining and while it was sad to be losing a contributing structure, he didn't feel there were other options available.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Matt Johnson, 11594 Boyce Road, Stockbridge, MI, contractor and applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission. He reviewed the application in detail with the Commission (see video of hearing).

Kenneth Freeman, 815 W Jefferson, Ann Arbor, owner was present to respond to enquires from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Stulberg, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 815 W Jefferson Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to demolish the existing garage and reconstruct it without the parapet wall, and with roof overhangs, as necessary. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site and neighborhood setting, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential accessory structures.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried.

VOTE: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Stulberg, Vice Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Beeson, Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

- E-4** [15-1396](#) HDC15-211; 202-206-208 E Huron - Storefront Modifications -- MSHD
Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Stulberg visited the site as part of their review.

Stulberg reported that from the site visit they noted that you will not be able to see more than the front facades. He said the signage location on the right front building seemed appropriate.

Bushkuhl added that it was neat to think that this would include the pedestrian experience. He said there is an alley that goes all the way around.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Michael Poris, 36801 Woodward Avenue, Suite 200, Birmingham, MI., Architect and applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission. He reviewed the application with the Commission (see video of hearing).

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 202 204, 206, and 208 210 East Huron Street, two contributing and one non contributing structures in the Main Street Historic District, to modify the rooftop; and on 202 204 East Huron to replace the second floor fixed windows; add a 28 square foot wall sign on the first floor; replace a modern roll up garage door on the rear elevation and add a new person door next to it; and un brick three window openings on the rear elevation and install fixed sash aluminum clad wood windows; and on 208 210 East Huron, to add storefront and second floor windows in one new two story opening; and add a 20 square

foot vertical blade sign on the second floor. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts, signs, and barrier free accommodations, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for accessibility, storefronts, and neighborhood setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried.

VOTE: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Chair Stulberg, Vice Chair Bushkuhl, Secretary Beeson, Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

F UNFINISHED BUSINESS

G NEW BUSINESS

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

15-1400 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes of October 8, 2015

The minutes were approved by the Commission without objection, and forwarded to the City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J ASSIGNMENTS

Review Committee: Monday, December 7, 2015, at noon for the December 10, 2015 Regular Meeting

Hall and Ramsburgh volunteered for the December review committee, with Bushkuhl as the back-up.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

15-1398 October 2015 Staff Activities

Thacher asked the Commission to add residential signage to their work program.

The Commission unanimously agreed.

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Beeson asked about the railings located above Grizzly Peak. Commissioners believed they had been reviewed and approved by the Commission. Thacher would look into the matter.

Ramsburgh requested staff to do a site visit to Nichol's Arcade.

Ramsburgh asked for a volunteer to represent the Commission at the November 19th Allen Creek Greenway meeting, since she would be out of town.

M COMMUNICATIONS

15-1399 Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 11:00 p.m

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page

(<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.