



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, December 13, 2018

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Vice Chair Max Cope called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 4 - Robert White, Max Cope, David Rochlen, and Anna Epperson

Absent: 3 - John Beeson, Evan Hall, and Jessica Quijano

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D **PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

Jennifer Hoy and daughter Shannon Hoy, 3461 Burbank Drive, Ann Arbor, were present. Jennifer Hoy said her daughter was taking a government class and would like to know if the Commission reviewed any environmental improvements within the Historic District.

Commissioner Bob White responded that the Commission reviews (and approves if appropriate) solar panels which will help the dependance on fossil fuels.

Thacher said lead based paint is a subject that comes up where the Commission has to walk a fine line between looking out for safety of the inhabitants of historic structures as well as looking out for the historic features and character of those structures.

Commissioner Max Cope said the Commission looks at preserving historic windows with their materials, and they strongly recommend windows be refurbished. He said they also review and approve storm

windows that help with energy efficiency on older homes.

Thacher said if you install a new window in your home, it might last 20 years and then end up in a landfill, while if you live in a 100-year old house with 100-year old, hard growth lumbar windows, in many cases, those older windows can be cleaned up and make them work for another 100 years instead of throwing them out like inferior windows.

Commission David Rochlen said when one looks at all the embodied energy (the energy it takes to make the building materials and transport to the site of a house) and the operational energy (using energy to cool, heat, and light the home) over the lifespan of the home 80% of all that energy is used just to build the home in the first place. In preserving the original materials one is not only keeping the materials out of a landfill, but also the embodied energy of building a new home or materials does not need to be expended.

Commissioner Anna Epperson said preserving what is there becomes highly important from a cultural standpoint as well as from an environmental standpoint; that there are really viable things that we can still use and adapt from a historic context. Part of what the Historic District Commission does here is see if it still fits within those historic contexts, as well as to maintain certain size and scale to what is existing and not encroaching more and more into the landscape that is surrounding the area. She said the Commission also looks at historic trees and landscape to consider them as well.

Commissioner Cope said the Commission tries to preserve as many trees as possible and when applications come before them for garages, they try to make sure foundations won't disturb permeable root systems and to keep the district looking nice.

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

F **HEARINGS**

F-1 **18-2090** HDC18-261; 519 W Washington Street - Convert Rear Window to Slider - OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review. Cope reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 519 West Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to convert a rear window into a door, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 9, and the guidelines for entries, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Cope, Rochlen, and Epperson

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Quijano

F-3 [18-2092](#) HDC18-264; 315 South Main Street - Storefront Alteration - MSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review.

Cope reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Dick Mitchell, Michell and Moat Achitects, Applicant, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Anna Epperson, seonded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 315 South Main Street, a non-contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to remove a center recessed entrance in the middle bay of the building, and remove four vertical mullions on the large display windows and transoms on the two storefronts, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Cope, Rochlen, and Epperson

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, and Quijano

Enter Commissioner John Beeson

Present: 4 - Robert White, John Beeson, Max Cope, and Anna Epperson

Absent: 3 - Evan Hall, David Rochlen, and Jessica Quijano

F-2 [18-2091](#) HDC18-263; 454 Second Street - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Vice Chair Max Cope noted Commissioner Rochlen's recusal from the following agenda item (co-owner of primary residence).

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Beeson and Cope visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Lauryn Rochlen, 454 Second Street, Ann Arbor, applicant, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission. A handout was provided to the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by John Beeson, scnded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 454 Second Street, a contributing structure in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace five basement hopper windows, install a basement egress window in an enlarged opening, construct a single-story rear addition, and replace an asphalt driveway with a two-track concrete driveway and a parking area/patio, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions, windows, and safety codes, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for new additions, district or neighborhood settings, windows, and health and safety.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - White, Vice Chair Beeson, Cope, and Epperson

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Hall, Rochlen, and Quijano

G **NEW BUSINESS**

H **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

H-1 **18-2095** Minutes of the October 11, 2018, HDC Meeting

Without objection the Minutes were Approved and forwarded to City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

H-2 **18-2096** Minutes of the November 15, 2018, HDC Meeting

Without objection the Minutes were Approved and forwarded to City Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

J **ASSIGNMENTS**

J-1 **Review Committee: Monday, January 7, 2019 at NOON for the January 10, 2019 Regular Meeting**

Commissioner Max Cope and Anna Epperson volunteered for the January HDC Review Committee.

K **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

K-1 **Discussion of 2018-2019 Policies for City Council Consideration**

Jill Thacher reviewed the agenda item with the Commission.

K-2 **18-2093** November 2018 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

M COMMUNICATIONS

18-2094 Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:04 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

John Beeson, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/

**THERE WILL BE A WORKING SESSION IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING THE
REGULARLY SCHEDULED HDC MEETING**

1. **18-2089** 611 S Ashley Presentation