



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Draft

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, September 11, 2025

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

A. **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, September 11, 2025, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762. This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. **ROLL CALL**

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher called the roll

Present: 6 - Chair David Rochlen, Benjamin Calderon, Chip Smith, Steve Kaplan, Sarah Nisbett, and Jenna Carter

Absent: 1 - Jennifer Ross

Chair Rochlen noted that the Thursday, September 11, 2025 Historic District Commission meeting was Commissioner Carter and Commissioner Nisbett's first meeting and afforded them the opportunity to introduce themselves.

Others present:

*Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher
City Planner, Mariana Melin-Corcoran*

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher requested item F-7 be moved to item F-4. The agenda was unanimously approved as amended.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Seeing no speakers Chair Rochlen closed the Public Comment.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [25-1535](#) HDC25-0090; 224 Murray Ave, driveway; OWSHD

Attachments: 224 Murray SR with attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner, Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kaplan and Rocheln visited the the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

The applicant was present via Zoom to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

Moved by Commissioner Calderon seconded by Commissioner Rochlen

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 224 Murray Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to pave a driveway as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for paved areas and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, Kaplan, Nisbett, and Carter

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-2. 25-1536 HDC25-0126; 222 Murray Ave, driveway; OWSHD

Attachments: 222 Murray SR with attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner, Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kaplan and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

The applicant was present via zoom to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

**Moved Commissioner Steve Kaplan friendly amended by
Commissioner Chip Smith seconded Commissioner Steve Kaplan**

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 222 Murray Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to pave a driveway as proposed with the removal of the existing brick paver patio in replacement with concrete. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for paved areas and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, Kaplan, Nisbett, and Carter

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-3. [25-1547](#) HDC25-0100; 207 N Division St, new window; DSHD

Attachments: 207 N Division SR with attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner, Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kaplan and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

The applicant was present in person to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Calderon

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 207 N Division Street, a contributing property in the Division Street Historic District, to create a new opening on the north elevation to install an egress window. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, and 9, and the guidelines for building site and windows, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for windows.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, Kaplan, Nisbett, and Carter

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-4. [25-1541](#) HDC25-0129; 203 N Fourth Ave, new door; FAHD

Attachments: 203 N Fourth SR with attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner, Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kaplan and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

The applicant was present via zoom to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

Moved by Commissioner Steve Kaplan Seconded by Chip Smith

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 203 N Fourth Ave, a contributing property in the Fourth Ann Historic District, to install a door in a new opening on the south elevation of the one-story addition to provide barrierfree access on the condition that the awning above the door is fabric, does not extend more than 4 feet from the building face, and is at least 7 feet above the sidewalk. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for entrances and porches, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to doors and commercial awnings.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, Kaplan, Nisbett, and Carter

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-5. **25-1538** HDC25-0115; 317 S Division St, hyphen and rear addition; EWSHD

Attachments: 317 S Division SR and attachments REVISED.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kaplan and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

The applicant was present in person to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Chris and Jeff Crocket, Old Fourth Ward residents voiced their support for the project.

David Lewis, 440 South Main expressed his support for the project and spoke to how it will improve the city.

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

Moved by Commissioner Nisbett seconded by Commissioner Kaplan

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 317 S Division Street, a contributing property in the East William Historic District, to restore the historic house and add a 2,598-square foot rear addition. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site and additions, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. **Vote 6-0.**

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, Kaplan, Nisbett, and Carter

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-6. [25-1539](#) HDC25-0116; 333 Eighth St, rear addition; OWSHD

Attachments: 333 Eighth SR Bath Addition and attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kaplan and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

The applicant was present in person to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

Moved by Commissioner Carter seconded by Commissioner Smith

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 333 Eighth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 128 square foot bathroom addition off the rear elevation of the house as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting and New Additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, Kaplan, Nisbett, and Carter

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-7. [25-1540](#) HDC25-0128; 345 S Division, new and replacement windows; EWSHD

Attachments: 345 S Division SR with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kaplan and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

The applicant was present via Zoom to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

Moved by Commissioner Smith seconded by Commissioner Kaplan

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 345 S Division Street, a contributing property in the East William Historic District, to remove two windows and a door and infill the openings with wood siding; install four new windows (two singles and a pair) and a door in new openings; and enlarge two historic window openings and install new windows in them, on the following conditions: that the new door is approved by staff before permits may be issued, and that the window trim on all new and modified windows is differentiated in size from the historic trim by at least ½" . As conditioned, the work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site and windows, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, Kaplan, Nisbett, and Carter

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-8. [25-1542](#) HDC25-0131; 403 Second St, egress windows, porches, siding; OWSHD

Attachments: 403 Second SR with attachments REVISED.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner, Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kaplan and Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

The applicant was present in person to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format].

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Calderon

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 403 Second Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to create two new egress window wells, convert the basement door into an egress window, remove the non-original siding and trim and repair the original siding and trim, un-enclose the porches, replace the front door, replace the garage doors, add a paver patio, and remove the chain-link fence. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating

Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, windows, health and safety, district or neighborhood setting, and wood, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

[For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 6-0.

Yeas: 6 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, Kaplan, Nisbett, and Carter

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

G. NEW BUSINESS

G-1. [25-1551](#) Annual Retreat scheduling

The Annual Retreat is scheduled for Saturday, November 22, 2025

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [25-1516](#) July 10, 2025 HDC Meeting Minutes

Attachments: July 10, 2025 HDC Meeting Minutes.pdf

The July 10, 2025 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Commissioners noted that they will need to hold elections to fill the role of Vice Chair. Chair Rochlen expressed interest in holding the Chair position and Commissioner Calderon expressed interest in the Secretary position.

J. ASSIGNMENTS

- J-1.** [25-1514](#) Review Committee: Monday, October 6, 2025 at 12pm, for the Thursday, October 9, 2025 Regular Meeting
Commissioners Steve Kaplan and Sarah Nisbett volunteered for the Monday, October 6, 2025 HDC Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

None.

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Smith and Commissioner Carter noted that they will not be able to attend the Thursday, October 9, 2025 Historic District Commission meeting.

M. COMMUNICATIONS

- M-1.** [25-1515](#) Various Communication to the HDC

Attachments: Crocket Letter of Support for 317 S. Division Project.pdf, Crown Letter of Support 317 S. Division St.pdf, Garcia 317 S Division Letter of Support.pdf, Haray Sigrid Letter - 317 S Division.pdf, Hudolin Letter of Support 317 S. Division St., Ann Arbor.pdf, Osler Letter of Support Historic District Commission Review of 317 S. Division.pdf, Post Letter of Support Regarding 317 S. Division .pdf, Ritter Letter of Support 317 South Division.pdf, Tyler Letter of Support 317 S Division.pdf, Wilson Letter of Support 317 S Division Pantaleo project.pdf, Wineberg Letter of Support 317 Division.pdf

Received and filed.

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 10:04 PM.

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Brittany Alexander, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.