



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Thursday, July 14, 2022

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

**This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and
online at a2gov.org/watchCTN**

**To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247
or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762**

Join from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device:

<https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/96536699762?pwd=KzhoREg5eHgyUCtjV0NWY0lhUIMvQT09>

Passcode: 880017

Or join by phone:

Call: 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099

Webinar ID: 965 3669 9762

A. CALL TO ORDER

*Vice Chairperson David Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm,
stating:*

*Welcome to the Thursday, June 9, 2022, in-person and electronic
(hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. The
meeting is being held in this mode to protect public health and safety due
to the COVID-19 virus and to comply with orders issued by the governor,
the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services and/or the
Washtenaw County Health Department and the City of Ann Arbor. We
intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person meeting.
However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public comment
will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of
the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or
213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762 This information is
also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of
the City website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel
16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.*

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Historic District Commission members, as noted, were physically present at City Hall of Ann Arbor, 301 E Huron Street, Ann Arbor, Michigan.

Present: 4 - David Rochlen, Kathryn Fortener, Robert White, and Beverly K Willis

Absent: 3 - Jessica Quijano, Chair Anna Epperson, and Jennifer Ross

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

None

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

F. HEARINGS

F-1. 22-1205 Robert & Erma Hayden House (1201 Gardner Ave) Study Committee Report Public Hearing

Attachments: Hayden House Preliminary Report 2022-04-26.pdf, 7-14-2022 Notice of Public Hearing.pdf, Hayden House Postcard PH Notice.pdf, 1201 Gardner Ave Aerial Map.pdf, 1201 Gardner Ave Aerial Map Zoom.pdf, 1201 Gardner Ave Zoning Map.pdf, Zabawa.pdf, Thomas.pdf, Meisler.pdf, Regional Bahá'í Council of the Midwest States.pdf

Timothy Boscarino presented the Preliminary Report of the Robert and Erma Hayden House, located at 1201 Gardner Avenue.

A quorum of the Robert and Erma Hayden House Study Committee was present at the meeting.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Michael Aman Tedla Sr. (grandson of Robert Hayden), 812 Holly Boulevard, Ann Arbor, spoke to the legacy of Robert and Erma Hayden House. He was in support of the proposed Hayden House Historic District.

Kemba Braynon, AIA Architect and Historic Preservationist working at Quinn Evans Architects, Ann Arbor, Chair of The Michigan State Preservation Ward, and personal friend of the Hayden family spoke of the importance of preserving the history and legacy of the Robert and Erma Hayden House and the Hayden Family and what they have meant to the community and this Country.

Daniel S Levin, 1508 Westminster, spoke in support of the Landmark House and gave his full support and approval of the proposed Hayden House Historic District.

Patrick Patillo, owner of the Robert and Erma Hayden House, and member of the Hayden family, was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Jill Thacher noted the Commission had also received three letters of support for this proposed Hayden House Historic District. (see all documents attached to this file).

Vice Chair Rochlen expressed appreciation for the in-depth preliminary report provided to the Commission and the public.

Received and Held. Request forwarded to City Council.

F-2. **22-1206** HDC22-1115; 221 Eighth; Rear Deck; OWSHD

Attachments: 221 Eighth Staff Report w Attach -Deck-rev.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and Beverly Willis visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 221 Eighth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a bilevel rear deck with a section 6'6" to 8'6" above grade (over a walkout basement) made of composite wood with an aluminum guardrail, and a section of composite wood deck at driveway grade. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for residential decks and patios, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for district or neighborhood setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, and Ross

F-3. [22-1207](#) HDC22-1136; 109 E Ann Street; Windows; F/AHD

Attachments: 109-119 E Ann Staff Report w Attach - Clad Windows.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and Beverly Willis visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beverly Willis, Seconded by Robert White, that the Commission approve the application at 109-119 East Ann Street, contributing properties in the Fourth/Ann Historic District, to remove all of the non-historic wood window sashes on the rear elevation of the building and replace them with aluminum-clad wood sash packs in the same openings, as proposed. The Commission finds that the work meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for windows and the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, and Ross

F-4. [22-1208](#) HDC22-1113; 223 E Ann Street; Windows; OFWHD

Attachments: 223 E Ann Staff Report w Attach - Clad Windows.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and Beverly Willis visited the site as part

of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission approve the application at 223 East Ann Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to replace any existing windows with the proposed Andersen 400 series clad windows in a traditional profile on the condition that the sashes are installed so the plane of the new glass matches the plane of the existing glass. The Commission finds that the work meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for windows and the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, and Ross

F-5. [22-1209](#) HDC22-1097; 223 E Ann Street; Window Trim; OFWHD

Attachments: 223 E Ann Staff Report w Attach - Composite Trim.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and Beverly Willis visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beverly Willis, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission approve the application at 223 East Ann Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to replace the deteriorated pine trim installed in 1996 with Azec trim in matching dimensions, as proposed. The Commission finds that the work meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for windows and wood repair, and the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for windows and wood siding, trim, and architectural details.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, Chair Epperson, and Ross

G. NEW BUSINESS

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [22-1210](#) June 9, 2022 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 6-9-2022 HDC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

The June 9, 2022 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. **Review Committee: Monday, August 8, 2022 at 5pm for the Thursday, August 11, 2022 Regular Meeting**

Jill Thacher noted that Commissioner Jennifer Ross volunteered for the August 11, 2022 HDC Review Committee, and Jill will reach out to other members for their availability.

Commissioner Kathy Fortener mentioned she could be added as a back-up volunteer.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

Jill Thacher noted she would be on vacation during the August HDC meeting and Matt Kowalski, City Planner would fill in for her.

She explained to the Commission that this week she had another commercial property ask to replace non-original wood windows, on the back alley-side of the building, with clad windows. She asked if the Commission would like to continue to review these types of applications or if they would feel comfortable making them part of the Staff Approval List for non-replica windows.

The Commission requested Thacher to move forward with added it to the Staff Approval List.

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

M. COMMUNICATIONS

M-1 [22-1211](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Attachments: Zabawa.pdf, Thomas.pdf, Meisler.pdf, Regional Bahá'í
Council of the Midwest States.pdf

Received and Filed

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:24 pm.

David Rochlen, Vice Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Mia Gale, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.