

MEMORANDUM

To: Historic District Commissioners

From: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

Date: April 13, 2023

Re: 200 S Main Street, application HDC23-0007

A portion of an earlier application to retile the front entry floor and column, paint the enameled steel paneling at the northwest corner of the building, and install food lockers for restaurant takeout was postponed from the February 9, 2023 HDC meeting. The applicant opted to extend the application's 60-day review period for another month to capture the April 13, 2023 HDC meeting.

Updated information has been submitted for this work. The column mosaic tile and entry tile would replace similar non-original tile, and non-original wood on the column base would be replaced with similar wood. The enameled metal panels would be painted grey. The pickup locker is mounted inside of the first row of panels, and the drawings note that panels removed would be saved and stored. The locker says it is 6" off of grade, but what happens in that 6" is not specified. The flooring of the vestibule containing the lockers is proposed to be stamped concrete. Overhead lighting would be replaced in the same location.

Staff believes the work is appropriate. The tile and entry work use appropriate materials. The food lockers are in an inconspicuous location, the unit fills the space while keeping an enameled steel panel wrapping the corner, and activating this small space will be a positive for the street. The applicable standards and guidelines are included in the February 9, 2023 staff report, attached.

POSSIBLE MOTION: (Note that the motion is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will visit the site and make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 200 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to add a food pickup locker in the vestibule near the northwest corner of the building; reclad a tiled column at the northeast corner of the first floor with new tiles and wood, and replace the tile floor; and paint enameled steel paneling at the northwest corner of the building to match the EFIS on the front of the building, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines* for storefronts, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 200 S Main Street, Application Number HDC23-0007

DISTRICT: Main Street Historic District

REPORT DATE: February 9, 2023

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: Monday, February 6, 2023

| | OWNER | APPLICANT |
|-----------------|---|---|
| Name: | Harvey L. Shapiro Trust | Hobbs + Black Architects Jonathan Pearn |
| Address: | 229 Belvedere Ave, Unit 5 Charlevoix, MI 49720 | 100 North State Street Ann Arbor, MI 48103 |
| Phone: | | (734) 663-4189 |

BACKGROUND: The original three-story commercial vernacular building on this corner probably dated to the late 1800s. In 1926 it was remodeled and a floor removed to create the Spanish Revival Kresge Dollar Store. In 1949, this building and the 1916 one-story Kresge 5 & 10 Cent Store next door to the south were remodeled to form one new large store with porcelain enamel panels above the storefront and tan brick above a limestone string course. After several decades as Kiddieland, the store was subdivided once again in 1994 with the north half becoming the Mongolian Barbecue. Café Felix opened in the south half in early 1997. In December of 2002, the Commission approved a request to remove the porcelain enamel panels and replace them with an exterior insulated finishing system and to make other storefront modifications.

In 2007 an application to the HDC to replace 25 original double-hung wood windows with clad windows was denied.

LOCATION: The site is located at the southwest corner of South Main Street and West Washington Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to lower the sill on one storefront window; replace all storefront windows and entry doors with new aluminum storefront system; replace glass block window with new aluminum storefront system on the existing sill; expand the storefront on the north/W Washington elevation to remove a narrow window; replace a failing limestone base with cast stone; add rooftop dunnage and mechanical units; add a food pickup locker near the storefront at the rear of the store on W Washington; reclad a tiled column at the northeast corner of the first floor with cast stone; and paint Maul-Macotta paneling at the northwest corner of the building to match the EFIS. In addition, the following repair and removal work is included: remove the canopy; patch and paint existing EFIS; and remove lighting on the north elevation and repair/replace the affected brick.

Proposed signage locations are shown on the drawings for informational purposes only. Details are not provided, and signage is not included as part of the application.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (1) A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Storefronts

Not Recommended: Introducing a new design that is incompatible in size, scale, material, and color.

Architectural Metals

Recommended: Replacing in kind an entire architectural metal feature that is too deteriorated to repair – if the overall form and detailing are still evident – using the physical evidence as a model to reproduce the feature. Examples could include cast iron porch steps or steel sash windows.

If using the same kind of material is not technically or economically feasible, then a compatible substitute material may be considered.

Windows

Not Recommended: Removing or radically changing windows which are important in defining the historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other guidelines may also apply):

Storefronts

Appropriate: Designing and constructing a new storefront when the historic storefront is completely missing. It may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or may be a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, and material of the historic building. New designs should be flush with the façade and be kept as simple as possible.

Not Appropriate: Installing a new storefront that is incompatible in size and material with the historic building and district.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The history of this building is well photo-documented in the application packet. It is unknown how much of the original material remains. Per the Downtown Historic Districts Study Committee Report the building dates to 1926 and is a contributing structure, but it was extensively remodeled in 1949, including replacement of all of the storefronts seen today.
2. Storefront systems and windows: It is not known why the southernmost storefront on this half of the building has a higher sill. An interior photo in the application shows brick infill that reduced the glazing. Lowering the sill to match the previous height would not impact any other historic structures or the district. Replacing the storefront systems and existing entry doors is appropriate since they are from 1949 if the new windows are compatible with the building and district. An aluminum slimline window that imitates steel is proposed, with mullion locations matching the existing. The same windows are proposed for the seven vertical pairs and one single window on the first floor north elevation. These windows are glass block above (installed by 1950, per photographs) in the original 1926 openings. After 1975, seven of the eight windows had an additional equal sized opening placed below them, with a fixed metal sash. The fixed sashes and glass block would be removed, each to be replaced with a one-over-one aluminum window. Additionally, a small horizontal window in a bay immediately west of the main entrance would be removed and replaced with a storefront window matching the height of the other large windows and width of the infilled opening. This area used to be covered in Maul-Macotta paneling that tied in to the columns and sign band that wrapped the front of the building on the first floor.
3. The limestone base beneath the large storefront windows shows obvious deterioration. Replacing it with a cast stone base that is close in appearance is appropriate.
4. The location for rooftop dunnage and mechanical units is in the central part of the rooftop, invisible from the street, and is appropriate.
5. The food pickup locker is proposed within the door inset on W Washington, at the rear of the building. Details on its installation and overall size are not provided, though it is approximately 3' x 7'. This area has Maul Macotta paneling which is not from the period of significance. This portion of the building is an addition that may have been constructed during the 1949 remodel. The lockers are akin to ATM machines which the commission

has determined are not appropriate on primary elevations of buildings in historic districts; this location, however, is barely visible. The commission will need to decide on the appropriateness of food lockers in this location.

6. The column at the northeast corner was originally clad in Maul-Macotta panels, which were replaced at some point by small ceramic tiles. Recladding in cast stone is a neutral approach that would blend in with the storefront. The size of the cast stone pieces (small squares? Horizontal bands? Large slabs?) is not indicated but would be helpful.
7. Painting the Maul-Macotta paneling that remains on the west end of the north elevation requires commission approval since it is not currently a painted surface. While the panels look to be in need of repair, staff has concerns about painting over problem areas. Also, allowing paint should only be contemplated by the HDC if it is removable without damage to the underlying panels.
8. Staff believes the proposed design is compatible with the rest of the non-historic wood storefront and surrounding historic district.

POSSIBLE MOTION: (Note that the motion is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will visit the site and make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 200 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to lower the sill on one storefront window; replace all storefront windows and entry doors with a new aluminum storefront system; replace eight glass block windows and seven fixed-sash windows on the north elevation with new aluminum windows that keep the existing sill; expand the storefront on the north/W Washington elevation to replace a narrow horizontal window; replace the storefront's failing limestone base with cast stone; add rooftop dunnage and mechanical units; add a food pickup locker near the storefront at the rear of the store on W Washington; reclad a tiled column at the northeast corner of the first floor with cast stone; and paint Maul-Macotta paneling at the northwest corner of the building to match the EFIS, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines* for storefronts, and *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

ATTACHMENTS: photos, drawings, product information

200 S Main (April 2007)

