



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes - Draft
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, October 10, 2024

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

A. **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson David Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:01 pm stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, October 10, 2024, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762. This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. **ROLL CALL**

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 4 - Chair David Rochlen, Kathryn Fortener, Jennifer Ross, and Steve Kaplan

Absent: 2 - Benjamin Calderon, and Chip Smith

Others present:

Associate Planner, Mariana Melin-Corcoran

C. **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Seeing no speakers at this time Chair Rochlen closed the Public Comment.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [24-1765](#) HDC24-0137; 603 E Liberty Street, re-face with digital signs, SSHD

Attachments: 603 E Liberty SR.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT:

Commissioners Chip Smith and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. Chair Rochlen reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for 603 East Liberty Street, a contributing structure in the State

Street Historic District, to replace three changeable message sign panels on the Michigan Theater marquee to electronic message signs, on the condition that any images or words shown on the sign may not change more than once per hour, and the images or words may not move or be animated. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts and signs; and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for storefronts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Ross, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Calderon, and Smith

F-2. [24-1766](#) HDC24-0141; 544 Third Street, alter windows on additions, OWSHD

Attachments: 544 Third SR replace windows w Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Associate Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT:

Commissioners Chip Smith and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. Chair Rochlen reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Fortener that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 544 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove and replace 11 vinyl windows – widening three of them – and 1 vinyl sliding glass door with clad wood windows and door. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of F-3 (p. 4) the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9, and the guidelines for building site and windows, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for windows

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Ross, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Calderon, and Smith

F-3. [24-1767](#) HDC24-0142; 509 W Liberty Street, rear addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 509 W Liberty SR.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT:

Commissioners Chip Smith and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. Chair Rochlen reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Ross seconded by Commissioner Fortener that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 509 West Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a single-story rear addition, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Additions and New Construction, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the Guidelines for District/Neighborhood, Building Site, New Additions, and Windows.

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Ross, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Calderon, and Smith

F-4. [24-1768](#) HDC24-0144; 609 Second Street, alter rear roof and windows, OWSHD

Attachments: 609 Second SR addition w Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

*Associate Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report.
[See attached in agenda packet]*

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT:

Commissioners Chip Smith and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. Chair Rochlen reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Ross that:

For all of the work except for the windows on the former porch:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 609 Second Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to extend the roof and wall over the basement stairs, repair and replace the rubber roof over the southern bump out, repair and replace the foundation under the southern bump out, add an egress window and well on the south elevation, replace the rear exterior door, install new vents and a radon system at the rear of the house, and install a skylight on the south roof surface, as proposed. This work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9, and the guidelines for building site, roofs, wood, windows, entrances and porches, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all roofs, wood, windows, doors, and mechanical equipment.

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Ross, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Calderon, and Smith

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Ross that:

For the windows on the former porch:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 609 Second Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove two historic windows on the east elevation and reinstall them on the south elevation in place of two casement windows with simple trim and use one of the casements from the south elevation with the existing two casement windows on the east side, installed as shown. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the F-5 (p. 7) surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9, and the guidelines for building site, roofs, wood, windows, entrances and porches, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all roofs, wood, windows, doors, and mechanical equipment.

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 3-1.

Yeas: 3 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, and Kaplan

Nays: 1 - Ross

Absent: 2 - Calderon, and Smith

F-5. [24-1769](#) HDC24-0145; 630 S Ashley Street, rear addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 630 S Ashley SR.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT:

Commissioners Chip Smith and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. Chair Rochlen reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries.

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Ross seconded by Commissioner Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 630 S Ashley Street, a vacant lot in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a duplex and a detached garage with an accessory dwelling unit on a vacant lot, on the following condition: that all windows with divided lites use muntins applied to the exterior and interior of the glass, and a corresponding spacer between the glass. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All New Construction, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for Building Site and District/Neighborhood.

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Ross, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Calderon, and Smith

F-6. [24-1792](#) HDC24-0136; 514 Sixth Street, retractable screens, OWSHD

PUBLIC HEARING:

Chair Rochlen noted that this application was staff approved.

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

G. **NEW BUSINESS**

G-1. [24-1774](#) Appointment of nominating committee

Historic District Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher asked for volunteers for the Nominating Committee for Historic District Commission elections.

Commissioner Kaplan noted that he did not want to be an officer for his next term.

Commissioner Ross volunteered to be on the Nominating Committee.

G-2. [24-1775](#) Design Guidelines assignment and review

Attachments: DG Memo to HDC - Intro.pdf, DG - Introduction Comments for HDC.docx

Historic District Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher noted that the Design Guidelines Draft is ready to be reviewed and has been emailed to the Commissioners.

Associate Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran noted that the formatting of the document will be redesigned.

Historic District Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher

encouraged the Commissioners to leave feedback on the document.

The commissioners noted that they had trouble leaving feedback.

Chair Rochlen requested that the work be broken into a sections to set clear goals.

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [24-1770](#) September 12, 2024 HDC Meeting Minutes

Attachments: September 12, 2024 HDC Meeting Minutes.pdf

The September 12, 2024 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

None.

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. [24-1771](#) Review Committee: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 at 12pm, for the Thursday, November 14, 2024 Regular Meeting

Commissioner Steve Kaplan volunteered for the Tuesday, November 12, 2024 HDC Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

None.

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Ross asked Historic District Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher about staff approvals for replacing windows.

Historic District Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher noted that the application heard earlier today came before the HDC because the applicant wanted to enlarge the windows and that replacing windows only

requires staff approval.

Commissioner Ross suggested that changing window sizes on non-contributing portions of a building could be added to the Staff Approvals list.

M. **COMMUNICATIONS**

- M-1.** [24-1772](#) Various Communication to the HDC
Received and filed.

N. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:39 pm.

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
Mariana Melin-Corcoran, Associate Planner
Brittany Alexander, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.