

## ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

### Staff Report

**ADDRESS:** 1510 Broadway Street, Application Number HDC22-1180

**DISTRICT:** Broadway Historic District

**REPORT DATE:** September 8, 2022

**REPORT PREPARED BY:** Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

**REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE:** Tuesday, September 6, 2022

	<b>OWNER</b>	<b>APPLICANT</b>
<b>Name:</b>	Patricia McLaughlin	David Lewis Lewis Greenspoon Architects
<b>Address:</b>	1520 Broadway Street Ann Arbor, MI	440 S Main Suite 2 Ann arbor, MI 48104
<b>Phone:</b>		(734) 786-3757

**BACKGROUND:** This high-style Italianate was built in 1862 (though newspaper articles place it somewhat earlier, at 1857 or before) as the home of Jay C. and Harriet Taylor. It features paired brackets and arch-topped six-over-six windows. The Taylor's descendants owned the home until 1974. On the property is a 1 3/4 story barn along the west property line. The barn uses the address 1510 and the house 1520 Broadway.

**LOCATION:** The site is located on the south/east side of Broadway, between Jones Drive and Cedar Bend Drive.

**APPLICATION:** The applicant seeks HDC approval to install a new wood door in a new opening on the rear wall of a barn that is a contributing historic structure.

#### **APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:**

##### **From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:**

- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- (5) Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

**From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):**

**Accessibility**

Recommended: Designing new or additional means of access that are compatible with the historic building and its setting.

**Entrances and Porches**

Recommended: Designing and installing additional entrances or porches when required for the new use in a manner that preserves the historic character of the buildings, i.e., limiting such alteration to non-character-defining elevations.

Not Recommended: Cutting new entrances on a primary elevation. Altering utilitarian or service entrances so they appear to be formal entrances by adding paneled doors, fanlights, and sidelights.

**STAFF FINDINGS:**

1. The homeowner is currently finishing the interior of the barn into an art studio. On the ground floor, building code requires a means of egress other than the sliding barn door. On the second floor, two hinged hay doors will be fixed shut as part of the studio project.
2. The proposed door is solid wood with panels and will be installed on the rear elevation of the building. This change to the structure is minimal and won't be seen from the street or sidewalk. The door, a Jeld-Wen solid wood door with panels, will be painted red to match the barn and is appropriate.
3. Staff believes the addition of a new person door on the rear elevation of the barn is compatible with the existing structure, neighboring buildings, and the surrounding historic district, and meets both the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

**POSSIBLE MOTIONS:** (Note that the motion is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1510 Broadway Street, a contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to install a new wood door in a new opening on the rear elevation of the barn. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9, and the guidelines for accessibility and entries and porches.

**ATTACHMENTS:** drawings, photos.

1510 Broadway (2021 Google Street View Photo)



1520 Broadway (2021 Google Street View Photo)

