



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Thursday, February 11, 2016

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Bushkuhl called the meeting to order at 7:03 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Jill Thacher called the roll.

Staff Present: Jill Thacher

Present: 7 - Robert White, Ellen Ramsburgh, Thomas Stulberg,
Benjamin L. Bushkuhl, John Beeson, Jennifer Ross, and
Evan Hall

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

E **HEARINGS**

E-1 **16-0189** HDC16-010; 223 E Ann, Unit 13 - Balcony Addition - OFWHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Ramsburgh visited the site as part of their review.

Ramsburgh reported that one of the things they noted during their visit was the remarkable attention to architectural detail on this building and the fact that it still reads as an armory because of its' castle like imposing

frontage. She said she noted the very strong horizontal lines of the cement bands as seen in the photographs, and they are very character defining features of the building.

Stulberg added that the prominence of the building, particularly on the front façade and the other face side elevation, and he wouldn't think to approve this application if it were proposed on one of those two faces.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Douglas Kelbaugh, 223 E. Ann Street, Unit 13, Ann Arbor, owner was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission. He reviewed the application in detail with the Commission (see video of hearing).

Olga Bilakos, Ann Arbor resident, said this building has sat for many years and she felt that as it reaches its' 100th anniversary it will become a major consideration for the Old Fourth Ward as a Historical building. She said the addition or the proposed adornment can be seen readily walking east to Fifth Avenue. She said the building is very aesthetic, has symmetry, and once that balcony and door opening goes in, it will be a bad embellishment on the west side of that building. She expressed concern that others living in the building would also want to add balconies that don't add any benefit to the structure, and the public would be facing it for the next 150 years. She said she was present to say No to this addition, which adds no value to the structure, and she asked the Commission not to let it happen.

Kelbaugh added that he felt the proposed balcony was much less invasive or transformative than the changes that were made during the conversion from an armory to condominium units, and it won't be seen from the front. He noted that he is an architect and has worked with architectural design and felt that the balcony would be an enhancement to the building.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 223 East Ann Street Unit 13, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to: construct a 12' x 6.5' metal balcony and convert a window to a door on the second floor of the west elevation, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the

surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for entrances and porches and building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential porches.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:4-3

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 4 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 3 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, and Secretary Ross

E-2 **16-0190** HDC16-009; 530 S Seventh - Rear Addition - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Ramsburgh visited the site as part of their review.

Ramsburgh reported that the staff report was very thorough and she had nothing more to add.

Stulberg commented that being on site you see how short the roof is and one can imagine how difficult it is for them to use the space very well as is, and he felt the application was appropriate in that it was not changing the footprint of the house and still making it livable.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Jeff Brown, Dexter Builders, 8820 Jackson Road, Ann Arbor, contractor and applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beeson, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 530 South Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to raise the roof height on the first rear addition, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

E-3 [16-0191](#) HDC16-011; 529 Sixth - Remove Tree - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Ramsburgh visited the site as part of their review.

Ramsburgh commended the owners of the house on their wonderful restoration of the house. She reported that the tree in question is a huge black walnut tree that is very healthy.

Stulberg said he had nothing to add.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Justin and Allison Waugh, 529 Sixth Street, Ann Arbor, owners were

present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Susan Perry, 1708 Fair Street, Ann Arbor, read from a prepared statement, asking the Commission to deny the request or postpone taking action to allow further information to be provided.

Lynn Borset, 322 Virginia Avenue, Ann Arbor, said she has been working with the City's Forestry Department since 2009, and requested that any action on the tree removal be delayed to allow for further options and facts to be explored and provided.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Stulberg, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a Notice to Proceed for the application at 529 Sixth Street to remove a mature black walnut tree, as proposed. The Commission finds that the tree constitutes a hazard to the safety of one of the structure's occupants, and that the proposed work is necessary to substantially improve or correct this condition.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

Moved by Stulberg, seconded by White, to withdraw motion.

Motion withdrawn.

Moved by Stulberg, seconded by Ramsburgh, to postpone taking action until the March 2016 HDC meeting.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as following, with the Chair declaring the motion carried.

Vote: 4-3

Action Postponed

Yeas: 4 - Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Vice Chair Beeson, and Hall

Nays: 3 - White, Chair Bushkuhl, and Secretary Ross

Jill Thacher presented the staff report. See attached in agenda packet.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Stulberg and Ramsburgh visited the site as part of their review.

Ramsburgh reported that during the site visit they observed that this location is probably the least troubling location for an egress well. She said they noted that none of the restoration work had been done yet, which was problematic.

Stulberg added that he thought it was problematic to have a pit and putting a ladder into a pit is just trying to get away from what the Commission was trying to avoid, which is making it a welcoming entrance. He said this exit is meant to be for emergency egress only, but he still has concerns that this exit will be too inviting for an entrance; rather than for use as an egress exit window.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Kristie Gilbert, OX Studio Inc, 302B South State Street, Ann Arbor, from applicant's office was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission. She thanked staff and the Commission for working with them through the issues.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ross, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1310 Hill Street, a contributing property in the Washtenaw/Hill Historic District, to add a basement egress window. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for windows, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The members of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows, with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 7-0

Certificate of Appropriateness Granted

Yeas: 7 - White, Ramsburgh, Stulberg, Chair Bushkuhl, Vice Chair Beeson, Secretary Ross, and Hall

Nays: 0

F UNFINISHED BUSINESS

G NEW BUSINESS

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

16-0038 Minutes of the December 10, 2015 HDC Meeting

The Commission requested additional comments be included from the rebuttel provided by Robert Carson during The Glen agenda item.

Minutes were unanimously postponed.

16-0193 Minutes of the January 14, 2016 HDC Meeting

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to the City Council.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J ASSIGNMENTS

Review Committee for the March Regular Meeting

Commissioners Bushkuhl and Ramsburgh volunteered for the March Review Committee.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF

K-1 [16-0194](#) January 2016 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

K-2 **March 5 Retreat Planning**

Thacher reported that this year's Annual HDC Retreat would be held on Saturday, March 5th, from 8:30 to 12:00 in the Cobblestone Farm House.

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Hall brought concerns regarding current legislation being discussed, noting some cities have put together resolutions opposing the bills. He asked if Ann Arbor is working on any such resolutions.

Thacher replied that Councilmember Sabra Briere is working on a resolution opposing the legislation and will present it next week to City Council.

Thacher explained that the HDC Commission could write their own resolution in addition to a Council resolution, but advised that they should wait until after Council has taken action on the issue.

Ramsburgh brought up mini-splits on the side of the house and the lines going into the house at 1310 Hill, noting they are a real distraction from the house itself. She said she would put forth a motion that the mini-splits should not be allowed outside of that house, where they currently are located, and the lines should be located inside together with the HVAC equipment. She asked if there are ways to reverse the mini-splits and lines.

Thacher said she wants to discuss the matter with the City's mechanical inspectors and will bring back a response to the Commission, possibly at the retreat, suggesting that the Commission include the matter during their discussion of design guidelines.

M COMMUNICATIONS

[16-0195](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:30 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- *Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx*
- *Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.*

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.