



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Draft

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, March 13, 2025

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:03 PM stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, March 13, 2025, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762. This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 4 - Chair David Rochlen, Kathryn Fortener, Chip Smith, and Steve Kaplan

Absent: 2 - Jennifer Ross, and Benjamin Calderon

Others present:

*Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher
City Planner, Mariana Melin-Corcoran*

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Seeing no speakers at this time Chair Rochlen closed the Public Comment.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [25-0232](#) HDC24-0188; 808 W Washington Street, addition dormer ADU, OWSHD

Attachments: 808 W Washington SR dormer and attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present in person and via Zoom to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

**Moved by Commissioner Kathy Fortener seconded by
Commissioner Steve Kaplan that**

**I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness
for the application at 808 West Washington Street, a contributing**

property in the Old West Side Historic District, to rebuild a non-historic mudroom on the rear of the house in a footprint that is 24 square feet larger; and construct a 27'2" x 27'7" garage with a second-floor accessory dwelling unit. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions, windows and alterations for a new use, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions and accessory structures.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ross, and Calderon

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Chip Smith

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 808 West Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 23-foot-wide shed dormer with a skylight on the south roof of the main house block and to remove the chimney. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions, roofs, windows and alterations for a new use, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions, roofs, and accessory structures.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried as amended. **Vote 3-1.**

Yeas: 3 - Chair Rochlen, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 1 - Secretary Fortener

Absent: 2 - Ross, and Calderon

F-2. [25-0539](#) HDC25-0001; 210 Koch Ave, addition: OWSHD

Attachments: 210 Koch SR and attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan item not seconded

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 210 Koch Avenue a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a 185-square foot rear addition. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions,

residential additions, and roofs.

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

F-3. [25-0231](#) HDC25-0004; 229 Buena Vista Ave, addition, OWSHD

Attachments: 229 Buena Vista SR Addition w Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

City Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Kaplan

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 229 Buena Vista Ave, a noncontributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a 340 square foot rear addition, replace the existing roof and vinyl siding, and limewash the brick veneer. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the guidelines for district or neighborhood setting, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for new construction and new construction in historic residential settings.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ross, and Calderon

F-4. [25-0540](#) HDC25-0031; 919 W Washington St, second floor addition: OWSHD

Attachments: 919 W Washington SR and attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Chip Smith seconded by Commissioner Kaplan

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 919 West Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a 114 square foot second-story addition and a mini-split on the back of the house. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for

Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions and roofs, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for additions.

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ross, and Calderon

F-5. [25-0541](#) HDC25-0032; 234 Eighth St, porch, deck, replace door with window: OWSHD

Attachments: 234 Eighth SR with attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was not present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Fortener

I move that the Commission approve the application at 234 Eighth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a new rear deck, remove an original rear door opening, install a new triple window on the rear elevation overlooking the deck, construct a paver walkway from the driveway to the new deck, construct a wooden trash enclosure with pad next to the garage, and construct a backyard pond and paths, on the following

condition: that the concrete masonry unit door infill is inset 2" or more to leave a visual record of the former door location. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for building site, district or neighborhood setting, and entrances and porches, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for residential doors and residential landscape features.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ross, and Calderon

Moved by Commissioner Smith seconded by Commissioner Kaplan

I move to postpone the application to the Thursday, April 10, 2025 Historic District Commission meeting

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Smith

I move that the Commission approve the application at 234 Eighth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace the front porch with a new concrete porch with a fieldstone veneer and bluestone pavers on the new concrete deck and stairs. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the

guidelines for building site, district or neighborhood setting, and entrances and porches, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for residential landscape features and residential porches.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ross, and Calderon

G. NEW BUSINESS

G-1. [25-0542](#) Staff Approvals List: Changing windows on non-historic additions

Attachments: Staff approvals windows 03132025.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher presented the proposed request.

The board agreed to a motion to approve the addition of a Staff Approvals List item to allow alterations to windows and doors on post-1944 additions as presented.

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. **Vote 4-0.**

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Secretary Fortener, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Ross, and Calderon

G-2. [25-0543](#) 2025 HDC Retreat

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher asked the board to email her suggestions and or ideas for the 2025

Historic District Commission retreat.

G-3. [25-0544](#) 2024 Annual Report

Attachments: 2024 HDC Annual Report to CC.pdf, 2024 HDC Annual Report to SHPO.pdf

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher noted the 2024 Annual Report was attached in the meeting packet.

G-4. [25-0230](#) Design Guidelines assignment and review

City Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented Chapter Four Design Guidelines for Residential Properties.

Commission Discussion:

The Commission discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [25-0228](#) January 9, 2025 HDC Meeting Minutes

Attachments: FINAL 1-9-2025 HDC Meeting Minutes.pdf

The January 9, 2025 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

None.

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. [25-0545](#) Review Committee: Monday, April 7, 2025, at 5pm, for the Thursday, April 10, 2025, Regular Meeting

Commissioners Ben Calderon and Steve Kaplan volunteered for the Monday, April 7, 2025 HDC Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

None.

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Chair Rochlen asked if there was a status on the Historic District Commission board vacancy.

M. COMMUNICATIONS**M-1. 25-0578 Various Communication to the HDC**

Attachments: GMAR - Historic District Commission.pdf

Historic Preservation Coordinator and Principal Planner, Jill Thacher discussed the Green Rental Housing Ordinance communication included in the packet.

Received and filed.

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:57 pm.

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Courtney Manor, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.