

**Ann Arbor Downtown Development Authority Meeting Minutes**

**Wednesday, April 1, 2020**

**Virtual Meeting—Zoom Link: <https://zoom.us/j/407330638>**

**or by Phone: 1-877-853-5257 (Meeting ID: 407 330-638#)**

Place: DDA Office, 150 S. Fifth Avenue, Suite 301, Ann Arbor, 48104

Time: Chair Orr called the meeting to order at 12:13 p.m.

**1. ROLL CALL**

Present: Micah Bartelme, Tom Crawford, Alexandra Dieck, Bob Guenzel, Tyler Kinley, Marie Klopf, Jessica A.S. Letaw, Molly McFarland, Darren McKinnon, Rishi Narayan, Keith Orr

Absent: Phil Weiss

Staff: Susan Pollay, Executive Director  
Sara McCallum, Deputy Director  
Jada Hahlbrock, Parking Services Manager  
Maura Thomson, Communications Manager  
Amber Miller, Capital Projects Manager  
Kelley Graves, Management Assistant  
Liz Rolla, Project Manager

Others: Mike McKiness/Republic Parking System  
Chris Simmons/getDowntown

Public: Members of the public were on the Zoom meeting but did not identify themselves.

**2. NEW BUSINESS**

Virtual Meeting Guidelines: Mr. Orr read the virtual meeting guidelines outlining the authority given to municipalities to hold electronic meetings for a period of time during the COVID-19 pandemic to conduct necessary business of public bodies as outlined in Governor Whitmer's Executive Order #2020-15.

Ms. Letaw moved and Mr. Bartelme seconded the following resolution.

**RESOLUTION TO AUTHORIZE ANN ARBOR DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY TO HOLD VIRTUAL MEETINGS**

Whereas, Governor Whitmer's Executive Order #2020-15 authorized the use of teleconferencing and other technologies to support virtual public meetings by public bodies and other governmental entities in Michigan who must continue to meet during the COVID-19 emergency;

Whereas, This Executive Order required that these virtual meetings continue to allow:

- \* Two-way communication for board members and the public to hear and address each other
- \* Participants to record or broadcast the board meeting

\* Participants to address the board during the public comment period

Whereas, The DDA has assembled appropriate technology to ensure public access to its meetings, and has ensured it will continue to appropriately notice and publicize its meetings as required;

Whereas, The DDA must continue to meet to attend to necessary business;

RESOLVED, The DDA authorizes virtual meetings of its board as needed during the COVID-19 emergency.

**A roll call vote on the resolution showed:**

**Ayes:** Bartelme, Dieck, Guenzel, Kinley, Klopff, Letaw, McFarland, McKinnon, Narayan, Orr

**Nays:** None

**Absent:** Weiss

**Recused:** Crawford

**The resolution passed.**

Mr. Guenzel moved and Ms. Letaw seconded the following resolution:

**RESOLUTION FOR ACH AND ELECTRONIC TRANSACTIONS**

WHEREAS, On December 30, 2002, the Governor of the State of Michigan approved Act No. 738 of the Public Acts of 2002 authorizing the use of electronic transactions by designated officers of local governmental units; and

WHEREAS, The DDA Board deems that it is in the best interest of the DDA to make certain financial transactions using electronic transactions as described in the Act;

RESOLVED, The DDA approves the following policy for the use of electronic transactions:

- (a) The Treasurer or Accounting Director shall be responsible for establishing all ACH arrangements for the local unit;
- (b) The Treasurer or Accounting Director shall draft a written policy to be followed in accordance with the act and presented to the governing body;
- (c) The Treasurer or Accounting Director shall be responsible for payment approval, accounting, reporting, and generally overseeing compliance or shall appoint an employee to perform such duties;
- (d) The Treasurer or Accounting Director shall submit documentation to the governing body, or person responsible for approving payments by resolution or charter requirements, detailing goods and services purchased, the cost of goods or services, the date of payment, and the department levels serviced;
- (e) All ACH transactions shall be approved by the Treasurer or Accounting Director BEFORE payment is made.

Mr. Crawford asked for clarification on the approval process to which Ms. McCallum responded that the proposed procedure follows the guidelines published by the MML. She stated the DDA's by-laws require Board approval for any expenses over \$25k, that a policy will be created for ACH and electronic transactions and that a report of all transfers and checks written can be generated from the BS&A software for secondary review and verification.

**A roll call vote on the resolution showed:**

**Ayes:** Bartelme, Dieck, Guenzel, Kinley, Klopf, Letaw, McFarland, McKinnon, Narayan, Orr

**Nays:** None

**Absent:** Weiss

**Recused:** Crawford

**The resolution passed.**

**3. APPROVAL OF BOARD MEETING AGENDA**

Mr. McKinnon moved and Mr. Bartelme seconded the motion to approve the Board meeting agenda.

**A roll call vote on the motion showed:**

**Ayes:** Bartelme, Dieck, Guenzel, Kinley, Klopf, Letaw, McFarland, McKinnon, Narayan, Orr

**Nays:** None

**Absent:** Weiss

**Recused:** Crawford

**The motion passed.**

**4. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION**

None.

**5. REPORTS FROM CITY BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS**

Downtown Area Citizens Advisory Council: The meeting was cancelled. No report.

**6. DDA MEMBER COMMUNICATIONS**

Ms. Letaw reported her March livestreamed Downtown Hall meeting was well attended and covered DDA and City matters as well as other subjects. She will be holding a May Downtown Hall meeting. More details to be provided on social media and at the May Board meeting. Everyone is always welcome to attend.

**7. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT**

Ms. Pollay asked if a resolution being brought forward from staff regarding parking permits could be deferred until by the Board for consideration until the Operations Committee portion of the meeting; there was consensus to defer action until later in the agenda under as part of the Operations Committee report.

**A consensus vote of the Board members present showed no objections to deferring action on the resolution to the Operations Committee report.**

<b>8. APPROVAL OF MINUTES</b>
-------------------------------

Ms. Letaw moved and Mr. Bartelme seconded the motion to approve the March minutes.

**A consensus vote on the motion showed no objections.**

**Ayes: Bartelme, Dieck, Guenzel, Kinley, Klopff, Letaw, McFarland, McKinnon, Narayan, Orr**

**Nays: None**

**Absent: Weiss**

**Recused: Crawford**

**By voice vote, minutes were approved.**

<b>9A. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS - OPERATIONS COMMITTEE</b>
--

Mr. Guenzel moved and Ms. Klopff seconded the following resolution:

**RESOLUTION TO APPROVE A CONTRACT FOR DETERRENT FENCING INSTALLATION AT THE ANN ASHLEY PARKING STRUCTURE**

Whereas, The DDA has managed the public parking system since 1992 in support of its mission;

Whereas, In 2017 the DDA installed deterrent fencing at the roof levels of all its above ground parking structures;

Whereas, Since 2017 the DDA has been adding additional deterrent fencing below the rooftop levels at many structures;

Whereas, An invitation to bid for one level of below rooftop fencing at the Ann Ashley Structure was distributed to qualified companies, and three companies submitted bids;

Whereas, Adrian Tecumseh Fence submitted the lowest responsible bid in the amount of \$33,597.00;

RESOLVED, The DDA Board authorizes the Executive Director to sign a contract with Adrian Tecumseh fence for fencing at Ann Ashley, in the amount of \$33,597.00, with funds coming from the DDA Parking Maintenance Fund.

**A roll call vote on the resolution showed:**

**Ayes: Bartelme, Dieck, Guenzel, Kinley, Klopff, Letaw, McFarland, McKinnon, Narayan, Orr**

**Nays: None**

**Absent: Weiss**

**Recused: Crawford**

**The resolution was approved.**

Ms. Letaw moved and Mr. McKinnon seconded the following resolution:

**RESOLUTION TO APPROVE A CONTRACT FOR DETERRENT FENCING AT THE FOURTH AND WASHINGTON PARKING STRUCTURE**

Whereas, The DDA has managed the public parking system since 1992 in support of its mission; Whereas, In 2017 the DDA installed deterrent fencing at the roof levels of all its above ground parking structures;

Whereas, Since 2017 the DDA has been adding additional deterrent fencing below the rooftop levels at many structures;

Whereas, Given the unique design of the Fourth & Washington structure the addition of barrier cables rather than fencing is necessary to supplement existing rails on the two levels below the rooftop;

Whereas, An invitation to bid for barrier cable installation at two levels below the rooftop was distributed to qualified companies, and four companies submitted bids;

Whereas, Adrian Tecumseh Fence submitted the lowest responsible bid in the amount of \$26,861.00.00;

RESOLVED, The DDA Board authorizes the Executive Director to sign a contract with Adrian Tecumseh fence for barrier cable installation at the Fourth & Washington structure, in the amount of \$28,861.00, with funds coming from the DDA Parking Maintenance Fund.

**A roll call vote on the resolution showed:**

**Ayes:** Bartelme, Dieck, Guenzel, Kinley, Klopff, Letaw, McFarland, McKinnon, Narayan, Orr

**Nays:** None

**Absent:** Weiss

**Recused:** Crawford

**The resolution was approved.**

Ms. Pollay said staff were bringing the following resolution to the DDA board to receive policy guidance. Efforts to curtail the spread of the COVID-19 virus had led to near complete shutdown of commercial, educational, social and entertainment activity in the downtown. This meant meter and off-street hourly parking revenues have disappeared and it may take a lengthy period of time for hourly revenues to rebuild. She underscored that this significant revenue loss will impact the DDA's ability to meet its obligations for debt service, providing funds to the City, and operating and maintaining the parking system. The resolution being presented for Board action was in response to requests from monthly permit holders asking to forego payments; instead staff

recommend the DDA support deferment of late-payment penalties to allow time for stakeholders with cash-flow issues.

Ms. Klopf moved and Mr. Guenzel seconded the following resolution:

**RESOLUTION DIRECTING REPUBLIC PARKING TO TEMPORARILY DEFER PENALTIES ON UNPAID OR LATE MONTHLY PARKING PERMIT ACCOUNTS UNTIL JUNE 1, 2020**

Whereas, The DDA has managed the Ann Arbor Public Parking System in support of its mission since 1992;

Whereas, State and local efforts to curtail the COVID-19 pandemic have led to near complete shutdown of commercial and social activity;

Whereas, The financial impacts of the COVID-19 emergency on the Ann Arbor public parking system are not yet understood, but it is clear that there will be a substantial reduction in parking revenue, both immediately, and for a period of time in the future;

Whereas, In recognition of the impact to Downtown stakeholders, it has been recommended that the DDA suspend collection penalties on unpaid March, April, and May 2020 monthly permit accounts, including deactivating permit for nonpayment, until June 1, 2020 at which time normal penalties and permit deactivations will be reinstated;

Whereas, Other than permits required by City site plans, all other monthly permits can be returned to the system at any time, as patrons have a variety of other parking payment options;

RESOLVED, The DDA Board directs Republic Parking to defer late payment penalties on unpaid March, April, and May 2020 monthly permits until June 1, 2020; after which standard late payment processes will resume including permit deactivation, penalties, and forwarding past due accounts to collection agencies.

There was a great deal of discussion regarding the current status of and impact on the parking system and the community as a whole due to the COVID-19 pandemic and the Governor's "Stay Home, Stay Safe" Executive Order. Ms. McCallum said that DDA staff had developed 3-6-12 month revenue and expenditure models as a way of trying to ascertain what the projected impact may be on the DDA's fund balances and its ability to meet its obligations for debt service and payment to the City. Ideas were shared on how to handle fees for parking permits holders. Questions were asked and answered.

Mr. McKinnon moved and Ms. Letaw seconded an amendment to the final RESOLVED of the resolution as follows:

Ann Arbor DDA Monthly Meeting

April 1, 2020

7

*RESOLVED, The DDA Board directs Republic Parking to defer late payment penalties on unpaid ~~March, April, and May 2020~~ monthly permits until ~~June 1, 2020~~; **further notice** after which standard late payment processes will resume including permit deactivation, penalties, and forwarding past due accounts to collection agencies.*

**A roll call vote on the amendment to the resolution showed:**

**Ayes:** Bartelme, Dieck, Guenzel, Kinley, Letaw, McFarland, McKinnon, Narayan, Orr

**Nays:** Klopf

**Absent:** Weiss

**Recused:** Crawford

**The amendment to the resolution was approved.**

Mr. Narayan moved and Mr. Orr seconded an amendment to the amended RESOLVED clause, as follows:

*RESOLVED, The DDA Board directs Republic Parking to ~~defer~~ **waive** late payment penalties on unpaid monthly permits until further notice after which standard late payment processes will resume including permit deactivation, penalties, and forwarding past due accounts to collection agencies.*

**A roll call vote on the amendment to the amended RESOLVED clause showed:**

**Ayes:** Bartelme, Dieck, Guenzel, Kinley, Klopf, Letaw, McFarland, McKinnon, Narayan, Orr

**Nays:** None

**Absent:** Weiss

**Recused:** Crawford

**The amendment to the amended RESOLVED clause was approved.**

It was noted that the fourth Whereas clause contained content that had been changed in the RESOLVED clause, and thus should be deleted. Mr. McKinnon moved and Mr. Narayan seconded an amendment to the resolution to remove the fourth Whereas that read as follows:

*Whereas, In recognition of the impact to Downtown stakeholders, it has been recommended that the DDA suspend collection penalties on unpaid March, April, and May 2020 monthly permit accounts, including deactivating permit for nonpayment, until June 1, 2020 further notice at which time normal penalties and permit deactivations will be reinstated;*

**A roll call vote on the amendment to the resolution showed:**

**Ayes:** Bartelme, Dieck, Guenzel, Kinley, Klopf, Letaw, McFarland, McKinnon, Narayan, Orr

**Nays:** None

**Absent:** Weiss

**Recused:** Crawford

**The amendment to the resolution was approved.**

The fully amended resolution reads as follows:

**RESOLUTION DIRECTING REPUBLIC PARKING TO TEMPORARILY WAIVE PENALTIES ON UNPAID OR LATE MONTHLY PARKING PERMIT ACCOUNTS UNTIL FURTHER NOTICE**

Whereas, The DDA has managed the Ann Arbor Public Parking System in support of its mission since 1992;

Whereas, State and local efforts to curtail the COVID-19 pandemic have led to near complete shutdown of commercial and social activity;

Whereas, The financial impacts of the COVID-19 emergency on the Ann Arbor public parking system are not yet understood, but it is clear that there will be a substantial reduction in parking revenue, both immediately, and for a period of time in the future;

Whereas, Other than permits required by City site plans, all other monthly permits can be returned to the system at any time, as patrons have a variety of other parking payment options; RESOLVED, The DDA Board directs Republic Parking to waive late payment penalties on unpaid monthly permits until further notice; after which standard late payment processes will resume including permit deactivation, penalties, and forwarding past due accounts to collection agencies.

**A roll call vote on the fully amended resolution showed:**

**Ayes:** Bartelme, Dieck, Guenzel, Kinley, Klopf, Letaw, McFarland, McKinnon, Narayan, Orr

**Nays:** None

**Absent:** Weiss

**Recused:** Crawford

**The resolution as amended was approved.**

When approving the resolution, the Board members stated they would like to continue discussing the parking system situation during the pandemic in more detail at the next Operations Committee meeting in hopes that additional tools could be added to a toolbox to support downtown stakeholders. Mr. Narayan recommended and there was consensus to move the April Ops meeting up one-week earlier to April 22nd, to allow more time to review data and consider options before the May Board meeting.

The next Operations Committee meeting will be scheduled for Wednesday, April 22 at 11:00 am.

**9B. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS – FINANCE COMMITTEE**

The next Finance Committee meeting is scheduled for Thursday, April 30 at 9:30 am (new time).

**9C. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS – CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS COMMITTEE**

The next Capital Improvements Committee meeting will be on Wednesday, April 15 at 11:00 am.



**9D. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS- PARTNERSHIPS COMMITTEE**

Mr. Kinley reported that the focus of the March meeting with partners was on how each agency was responding to the COVID-19 emergency.

The next Partnerships Committee meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, 8 at 9:00 am.

**9E. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS- EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

The next Executive Committee is scheduled for Wednesday, May 6 at 11:00 am

**10. NEW BUSINES**

April Committee Meetings: There was consensus to keep the current April Committee meetings and the May 6<sup>th</sup> Executive Committee meeting on the schedule as previously approved with the understanding that one or more of them may be cancelled if it is determined there wasn't sufficient business to attend to in committee. These will be virtual meetings until further notice.

**11. OTHER AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION**

Mr. Simmons reported TheRide has reduced its routes until further notice, directing riders to the Sunday route schedule for basic route information. They may also reach out to him directly a [chris@getdowntown.org](mailto:chris@getdowntown.org) as well. He directed people to [www.getdowntown.org](http://www.getdowntown.org) for resource information on transit, restaurants offering curbside pick-up service, etc. under the COVID-19 Information tab. Ms. Sendelbach expressed her concern that DDA approved the resolution waiving penalties on late parking permit fees, citing the seriousness of the situation for businesses and recommending that all parking permits fees be waived for a few months.

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no other business, Mr. McKinnon moved and Ms. Klopf seconded the motion to adjourn. A consensus vote showed no objections. Mr. Orr declared the meeting adjourned at 12:52pm.

ANN ARBOR DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY OPERATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, April 1, 2020

Virtual meeting—Zoom link: <https://zoom.us/j/407330638>

or by Phone: 1-877-853-5227 (Meeting ID: 407 330 638#)

Place: DDA Office, 150 S. Fifth Avenue, Suite 301, Ann Arbor, 48104

Time: 12:00 Noon

Committee Present: Robert Guenzel, Tyler Kinley, Darren McKinnon, Keith Orr

Committee Absent: Phil Weiss

Other Board Mbrs: Micah Bartelme, Tom Crawford, Alexandra Dieck, Marie Klopf, Jessica A.S. Letaw, Molly McFarland, Rishi Narayan.

Staff: Susan Pollay, Sara McCallum, Jada Hahlbrock, Amber Miller, Maura Thomson, Kelley Graves, Liz Rolla

Other Attendees: Mike McKiness/RPS, Chris Simmons/GetDowntown

Public: Members of the public were on the Zoom meeting but did not identify themselves.

Virtual Meeting Guidelines: Mr. Orr read the virtual meeting guidelines outlining the authority given to municipalities to hold electronic meetings for a period of time during the COVID-19 pandemic to conduct necessary business of public bodies as outlined in Governor Whitmer's Executive Order #2020-15.

Fencing Installation Resolutions: Ms. Hahlbrock provided an overview of the resolutions to approve a contract with Adrian Tecumseh Fence to install deterrent fencing at the Ann Ashley and 4<sup>th</sup> & Washington parking structures. Approval of the resolutions will allow DDA staff to authorize Adrian Tecumseh Fence to order the supplies. Installation scheduling will be determined at a later date. Questions were asked and answered. A roll call of the Operations Committee members showed consensus to take both resolutions to the Board.

Public Comment: None.

The next Operations Committee meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, April 22, 2020.

Mr. McKinnon moved and Mr. Kinley seconded the motion to adjourn the meeting. A roll call of the Operations Committee members showed approval of the motion. The motion passed. The meeting adjourned at 12:13 pm.

Respectfully submitted by  
Susan Pollay, Executive Director

**ANN ARBOR DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY  
CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES  
Wednesday, April 15, 2020 11:00 am**

Place: Virtual Meeting: <https://zoom.us/j/886553908> or by Phone:  
1-877-853-5257 (US Toll-free) or 1-929-436-2866  
Meeting ID: 886 553/Password: 032456

Time: 11:00 a.m.

Committee Present: Alexandra Dieck, Tyler Kinley, Jessica A.S. Letaw, Molly McFarland

Committee Absent: Micah Bartelme

Other DDA Present: Darren McKinnon, Keith Orr

Absent: Bob Guenzel, Marie Klopff, Rishi Narayan, Phil Weiss

Staff: Susan Pollay, Amber Miller, Maura Thomson, Liz Rolla, Jada Hahlbrock,  
Sara McCallum, Kelley Graves

Public: Members of the public were on the Zoom meeting but did not identify themselves.

Virtual Meeting Guidelines: Ms. McFarland read the virtual meeting guidelines outlining the authority given to municipalities to hold electronic meetings for a period of time during the COVID-19 pandemic to conduct necessary business of public bodies as outlined in Governor Whitmer's Executive Order #2020-15.

Introduction and Check-in: Members of the committee, other board members and Ms. Pollay shared their thoughts and observations of the impact and possible outcomes of the COVID-19 health crisis on the community. All agreed it will be a gradual comeback and that it will be require adjusting to a 'new normal.' Ms. Pollay shared that in conversations with other DDA's across the state, they, like us, are looking for ways to help that are in alignment with our missions to steward downtown and foster resiliency. She noted the A2 DDA's strengths, which include its focus on short and long-term goals, and through its use of its 10-year plan to manage resources. She said in her role she had witnessed the devastating impact of 9/11 and the '08-'09 recession, and in both cases downtown bounced back. She expressed confidence that downtown will come back again, different but, strong. Ms. Miller stated that through this global, national and local crisis, it is important to remember the DDA's role in public improvement.

SmithGroup Presentation: Mr. Doyle and Mr. Kiley discussed how infrastructure investments like those undertaken by the City and the DDA build resilient communities. Resilient communities prepare for, recover from and adapt and grow from crises. These initiatives stimulate the economy, improve and maintain systems that provide critical services, prepare for development, create spaces that provide access to jobs, goods and services and, build and

support the community. Key elements of resilience in street design projects include ensuring equity, building streets that adapt to evolving use patterns and systematic stress, manage carbon emissions, reduce impacts of urban heat island, build strong and flexible infrastructure systems with capacity for managing extreme climate events and, support human health and wellness.

People Friendly Streets Phase 2: Mr. Doyle and Mr. Kiley said that SmithGroup is hearing from their clients that they, like Ann Arbor, are still experiencing the stresses of the crisis but want to focus on how to move forward while being mindful of the health and safety of all involved. This is the time to stay informed, work on project planning and design to be prepared to move forward and be in a position to take advantage of potential additional federal stimulus funding that is currently being discussed. This includes planning for public engagement and data collection and ready to make adjustments as needed to construction schedules as well as short and long term needs for social distancing and the potential impacts on street design.

Ms. Miller reported that the Huron and William Street projects are essential under the Governor's Executive Order and are underway and that the First and Ashley project is slated to begin 5/1. Ms. Rolla reported streetlight, paver installation and tree planting on N. Huron are underway and milling and paving are anticipated to start next week depending on when the asphalt plants open. There are a few punch list items to be completed on Huron. The contractor, Fonson, is able to work more quickly due to the reduced traffic and they are adhering to all safety protocols regarding social distancing. Current timeline is early to mid-May for completion of Huron. Pavement marking on William will be underway once temperatures reach a consistent 50+ degrees and sunny. Mr. McKinnon questioned whether First and Ashley should be delayed; Ms. Miller reported that starting First and Ashley is in alignment with city projects, and that the team will continue to monitor the state orders on what is allowed and will adjust the schedule if necessary. Ms. Pollay agreed, saying that City and MDOT initiatives are moving forward.

Public Comment: None.

The next Capital Improvements Committee meeting will be on Wednesday, May 19 at 11 am.

The meeting adjourned at 12:32 pm

Respectfully submitted,  
Susan Pollay, Executive Director

**Meeting of the Ann Arbor DDA Operations Committee  
Wednesday, April 22, 2020**

Place: Virtual Meeting--Zoom Link: <https://zoom.us/j/242151204>  
by Phone: 1-877-853-5257 (Meeting ID: 242 151 204 Password: 020499)

Time: 11:00 am

Committee Present: Robert Guenzel, Tyler Kinley, Darren McKinnon, Keith Orr

Committee Absent: Phil Weiss

Other DDA Present: Rishi Narayan, Tom Crawford

Other DDA Absent: Micah Bartelme, Alexandra Dieck, Marie Klopf, Jessica A.S. Letaw, Molly McFarland

Staff: Susan Pollay, Sara McCallum, Jada Hahlbrock, Amber Miller, Maura Thomson, Kelley Graves

Other Attendees: Mike McKiness/RPS, Chris Simmons/GetDowntown

Public: Members of the public were on the Zoom meeting but did not identify themselves.

Virtual Meeting Guidelines: Mr. Orr read the virtual meeting guidelines outlining the authority given to municipalities to hold electronic meetings for a period of time during the COVID-19 pandemic to conduct necessary business of public bodies as outlined in Governor Whitmer's Executive Order #2020-48.

A2 DDA Core Responsibilities: Ms. Pollay provided an overview of the events of the last month due to the COVID-19 pandemic, emphasizing that impacts on downtown, both temporary and some permanent are still unknown. She also emphasized that this is likely to be a very long, drawn out period of time, and a great deal of need will be coming, but it may be months away. In light of this evolving environment, she stated her view that it is essential that the DDA look at its core goals and objectives established in the Development Plan to guide us moving forward. DDA staff will prioritize its expenditures relative to the significantly reduced revenues and remain mindful of the DDDA's responsibility to debt service, operations and CIP's related to safety. And, all of this is in the context of ensuring the parking system remains economically self-supporting and a vital part of the downtown's ongoing stability and vitality for many years to come.

Current Impact on Parking Revenues: Ms. Hahlbrock compared FY20 budgeted revenues against FY20 actual and FY19 actual totals for the three parking system revenue streams. She spoke to the impact of the pandemic over the initial 6-week period of March 2<sup>nd</sup> to mid-April 2020. On-street meter revenues saw three significant drops due to: U of M closure, local

schools' closures and Governor's Stay Home/Stay Safe order. Off-street hourly followed a similar track to last year, until March 16<sup>th</sup> when COVID safety measures and the Governor's orders required sending RPS staff home ; no hourly revenues have been collected since that time. Off-street permits are billed monthly. As of mid-April, 18% of all permit fees had been collected. Collections are usually at 90% at this point in the billing cycle. Ms. Hahlbrock noted that many permit holders may be availing themselves of the 4/1/2020 decision by the DDA Board to waive all late payment penalties, until further notice. She reported that it will take some time to assess the full impact on the system's revenues. Questions were asked and answered.

Potential Revenue Impacts: Ms. McCallum laid out a worst-case and an optimistic scenario of the potential financial impact on the parking system through FY23 based on certain assumptions about the timing of re-openings and how quickly a cure can be found and distributed. She emphasized that these are predictions, and staff will continue to modify them as new information becomes clear. Even with capital and operating parking expenditures significantly reduced, optimistic predictions show the DDA's Parking Fund balance expended by the end of FY21 and in the red by FY22 due to very reduced revenues. Fund balance by law may not be negative. And, the DDA's required fund balance policy as previously approved by the Board is 10% of expenditures. Mr. Crawford stated the City's fund balance policy is 15-20% and is based on account type. Questions were asked and answered.

Parking Permits: There was a detailed discussion regarding whether the DDA should provide some level of financial assistance to monthly permit holders during this time. It was suggested that relief should be given as a sign of goodwill to businesses. Mr. Orr asked why parking permits were seen as essential to their business operation, since parking is available and there are other payment options available. Mr. Narayan stated that it is not the DDA's role to determine what each business considers essential. Mr. Kinley suggested conducting a customer outreach survey to help the DDA make an informed decision. Mr. Orr stated the importance of any assistance as being equitable. Several ideas were put forward, including working with each permit account on a case-by-case basis, waiving one-month of parking fees and offering grants for small businesses. Ms. Pollay stated that she would check with the DDA's attorney, but she did not believe municipal entities like the DDA are legally allowed to give grants to businesses. Mr. Orr suggested and there was consensus to bring to the Board a resolution to give a discount of the fee for one permit, for one-month for each of the approximately 620 accounts. The group also supported the addition that permits required by contract and site plan would be excluded from this discount.

Rate Change Schedule: Ms. Hahlbrock reminded the Committee that the next rate increase is due to take effect on 7/1/2020. The Committee and staff agreed that delaying the increase until 1/1/2021 is the right decision. A resolution will be brought to the Board.

Operations Committee

April 22, 2020

2

Public Comment: None.

The next Operations Committee meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, May 27, 2020 at 11 am.

The meeting adjourned at 1:10 pm.

Respectfully submitted by Susan Pollay, Executive Director