



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

City Planning Commission

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Tuesday, April 21, 2020

7:00 PM

Electronic Meeting

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call: 877 853 5247 (Toll Free) or 888 788 0099
Enter Meeting ID: 932 6940 8487

1 **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson Alex Milshteyn called the electronic meeting to order at 7:00 pm.

2 **ROLL CALL**

Planning Manager Brett Lenart called the roll.

Present 9 - Woods, Briggs, Mills, Milshteyn, Gibb-Randall, Ackerman, Sauve, Abrons, and Hammerschmidt

3 **INTRODUCTIONS**

None

4 **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Moved by Shannan Gibb-Randall, seconded by Wendy Woods to Approve the Agenda as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

5 **MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

20-0363 February 20, 2020 City Planning Commission Meeting Minutes

Moved by Sarah Mills, Seconded by Erica Briggs, to approve the February 20, 2020 meeting minutes as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried unanimously.

6 **REPORTS FROM CITY ADMINISTRATION, CITY COUNCIL, PLANNING MANAGER, PLANNING COMMISSION OFFICERS AND COMMITTEES, WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

6-a **City Council**

Councilmember Zach Ackerman reported from the previous City Council's meeting: Council approved City staff to move forward pursuing 'affordable housing' opportunities for several City sites (415 W. Washington & 350 S. Fifth (former Y Lot) were mentioned); Council received the Climate Action Strategic Report for the City; Council tabled a proposed Transit (T-1) Zoning District until the mandated pandemic Stay At Home order is lifted.

6-b **Planning Manager**

Planning Manager Brett Lenart reported that he anticipated the Ordinance Revisions Committee discussing Planned Project modifications at their April 28th electronic meeting.

6-c **Planning Commission Officers and Committees**

6-d **Written Communications and Petitions**

20-0460 Various Correspondence to the City Planning Commission

Received and Filed

7 **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes about an item that is NOT listed as a public hearing on this agenda. Please state your name and address for the record.)**

8 **PUBLIC HEARINGS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT BUSINESS MEETING**

20-0565 Public Hearings Scheduled for the May 5, 2020 Planning Commission Meeting

Received by the Commission and Filed

9 **REGULAR BUSINESS - Project Presentation, Staff Report, Public Hearing and Commission Discussion of Each Item**

- 9-a [20-0566](#) Valhalla Ann Arbor Site Plan, Annexation, and Rezoning for City Council Approval - Proposed multiple-family residential project containing 454 units and townhomes with parking located under the buildings and along the private drives. Project includes annexation of parcels from Pittsfield Township and petitioner is requesting a conditional R4E multiple-family zoning designation of this 9.8-acre site, located at 31-163 Valhalla Drive and 2065, 2099 South Main Street. Requesting Postponement
- Anthony Leeds and Brad Moore joined as meeting panelists to respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

STAFF MEMO:

City Planner Matt Kowalski reviewed the memo requesting postponement.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Daryl Fisher, 2251 S. Main, Ann Arbor, Main Street Condos Association President explained they are close neighbors to the Valhalla project. Fisher said we already have issues with run-off from the golf course next to us; we are concerned about water and traffic issues and are not excited about this proposed project.

Stephanie Savarino, 117 Golfview Lane, Ann Arbor, stated that development is inappropriate at this area/location; I was annexed in on a township island years ago, and requested R1A single-family zoning classification. She said having a multiple-family development at South Main among the existing dwelling units that are intended to promote single family uses doesn't fit. Savarino said, I strongly object to this development and proposal.

Jean Holland, 111 Golfview Lane, Ann Arbor, said, I support everything that Stephanie Savarino (previous speaker) says; the proposed density is not appropriate at this location. Holland added, I don't have a problem with people or with developing this site, but it should be single-family.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing postponed until item returns before the Commission.

Moved by Sarah Mills, Seconded by Shannan Gibb-Randall to postpone the Valhalla rezoning, site plan, and related actions until June 2, 2010 meeting. On a roll call vote the Chair declared the

motion carried unanimously. Vote: 9-0

Yeas: 9 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

- 9-b** [20-0567](#) Greenhills School Track & Field Site Plan and Landscape Modification for Planning Commission Approval - The petitioner proposes to remove and replace the track and field facilities. The 6-lane track will be replaced with an 8-lane track while the grass infield will be replaced by artificial turf. A new storm water detention system is proposed underneath the infield. The petitioner is requesting a landscape modification for this 30.49-acre site located at 850 Greenhills Drive, zoned Single-Family (R1-B). Staff Recommendation: Approval

PRESENTATION BY PETITIONER:

Joe Vig, Vig Construction Inc., John Nickel, Peter Fayroian and Emily McKinnon, Smith Group, 201 Depot Street, Ann Arbor, representing the petitioner, provided an overview of the proposed project.

STAFF REPORT:

City Planner Jeff Kahan provided the Staff Report.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Rita Roth, 782 Greenhills Drive, Ann Arbor, said she's a resident of Earhart Village Homes, the neighboring Condominium Association. She expressed concern with landscaping buffers that should've been installed as part of the school's previously approved site plan. Roth said the landscaping is incomplete, and should be improved. She also is concerned about construction traffic and their environmental impacts.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Zach Ackerman, Seconded by Shannan Gibb-Randall, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the Greenhills School (850 Greenhills Drive) Site Plan for Planning Commission Approval.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. Vote: 9-0

Yeas: 9 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

Moved by Zach Ackerman, Seconded by Shannan Gibb-Randall, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the proposed landscape modifications according to the Unified Development Code section 5.30.2 (Landscape Modifications).

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. Vote: 9-0

Yeas: 9 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

- 9-c** **20-0568** 1043 North Main Street Rezoning for City Council Approval - The petitioner proposes to rezone this 6,446 square foot parcel from AG (Agricultural) to R1D (Single-Family) to accommodate the construction of a single-family home. Prior to the construction of a new single family home, the petitioner will need to remove the existing home on the site. Staff Recommendation: Approval

PRESENTATION BY PETITIONER:

Robert Fowler, 5550 Fox Run, Saline, Fowler Construction, representing the petitioner, provided an overview of the proposed project.

STAFF REPORT:

City Planner Jeff Kahan provided the Staff Report.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ellie Abrons, Seconded by Sarah Mills. that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the 1043 North Main Street R1D Zoning.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

They agreed that any improvement to the existing property was greatly needed.

AMENDMENT I

Moved by Sarah Mills, Seconded by Erica Briggs to amend the motion, adding the following: "...subject to the property owner committing to a public access easement or other steps necessary to construct and maintain a public sidewalk along the property frontage."

VOTE ON AMENDMENT I

On a roll call vote the Chair declared the amendment passed unanimously. Vote: 9-0

Yeas: 9 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

CONTINUED COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Gibb-Randall noted that this site is located in the Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT) right-of-way (ROW) so anything proposed in that ROW will need to be vetted and approved by them as well.

Milshteyn said he supported the project, and with an added sidewalk it will help improve this entry to the City.

The Commission agreed.

VOTE ON MAIN MOTION AS AMENDED:

On a roll call vote, the Chair declared the amended motion carried.

Vote: 9-0

Yeas: 9 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

- 9-d** [20-0569](#) 950 Greene Street Revised Landscape Plan (Tree Mitigation Plan) Site Plan for Planning Commission Approval - Two landmark trees were damaged during construction and are proposed to be replaced by providing 200% replacement. This will result in a total of 9 replacement being planted on-site and 10 replacement trees being planted in the adjacent lawn extensions. The site plan was originally approved in 2019 for this 1.63-acre parcel, zoned Business Service (C2B). Staff Recommendation: Approval

PRESENTATION BY PETITIONER:

Jennifer Roth, REDICO, One Towne Square, Suite 1600, Southfield, representing the petitioner, reviewed the proposed project with the Commission.

STAFF REPORT:

City Planner Jeff Kahan provided the Staff Report.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Julie Weatherbee, 108 E. Davis Street, Ann Arbor, said Jennifer from Redico has been great to work with. Weatherbee wanted to bring attention to an issue she is noticing throughout the City - not so much on this particular site since this block is very treed; however, what's happened during construction is that other adjacent trees have been damaged due to construction vehicles. She said perhaps the City could consider planting trees on other sides of the site.

Noting no further public speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Sarah Mills, Seconded by Wendy Woods, that the Ann Arbor City Planning Commission hereby approves the 950 Greene Site Plan for Planning Commission updating the Natural Features Mitigation Plan and the Landscaping Plan.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented petition and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Mills enquired if these specific trees were taken down by mistake or if they were damaged during the course of construction, and had to be removed.

Roth explained that due to intense underground construction work, City staff believes it resulted in damage to the tree roots.

Lenart noted that City staff conducted site inspections, and at that time deemed the damaged trees to be a public danger since they were located in the public right-of-way area.

Kahan added that the City wants everyone to be cognizant of the importance of taking care of natural features on sites, because having to mitigate and replace them becomes extremely costly to the developer.

Gibb-Randall said it might be difficult for the petitioner to find the specified 3-inch caliper trees and she hoped that the City could work with them if that becomes an issue, in either using a smaller caliper tree and increasing their financial donation, or planting additional trees on adjacent sites.

On a roll call vote, the Chair declared the motion carried. Vote: 9-0

Yeas: 9 - Wendy Woods, Erica Briggs, Sarah Mills, Alex Milshteyn, Shannan Gibb-Randall, Zachary Ackerman, Elizabeth Sauve, Ellie Abrons, and Sara Hammerschmidt

Nays: 0

10 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (Persons may speak for three minutes on any item.)

None

11 **COMMISSION PROPOSED BUSINESS**

Erica Briggs requested an update on the status of the Master Plan, which Lenart provided.

Alex Milshteyn said he was in favor of moving forward the Transit oriented T1 zoning district discussion.

Sarah Mills, referencing updating the UDC (Unified Development Code) asked if staff was aware of other scrivener's errors, such as the Accessory Dwelling Units (ADU) being omitted from the R2A zoning district. And if so, could such errors all be reviewed and considered at the same time as this ADU correction.

Milshteyn said he would like for the Commission to treat the ADU correction as such.

12 **ADJOURNMENT**

Moved by Sara Hammerschmidt, Seconded by Wendy Woods, to adjourn the meeting at 9:35 pm. On a voice vote the motion carried unanimously.

Alex Milshteyn, Chairperson
/mg

eComments for the Commission may be left via our Legistar calendar page (column to the very right)
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Commission public meetings are held the first and third Tuesday of each month. Both of these meetings provide opportunities for the public to address the Commission. All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to: City Clerk's Office, 301 E. Huron St., Ann Arbor, MI 48104. Requests need to be received at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting. Planning Commission meeting agendas and packets are available from the Legislative Information Center on the City Clerk's page of the City's website (<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>). Agendas and packets are also sent to subscribers of the City's email notification service, GovDelivery. You can subscribe to this free service by accessing the City's website and clicking on the 'Subscribe to Updates' envelope on the home page.

(If an agenda item is postponed, it will most likely be rescheduled to a future date. If you would like to be notified when a postponed agenda item will appear on a future agenda please contact Planning staff. You may also call Planning and Development Services at 734-794-6265 during office hours to obtain additional information about the review schedule or visit the Planning page on the City's website (www.a2gov.org.)

(Public Hearings: Individuals may speak for three minutes. The first person who is the official representative of an organized group or who is representing the petitioner may speak for five minutes; additional representatives may speak for three minutes. Please state your name and address for the record.)

(Comments about a proposed project are most constructive when they relate to: (1) City Code requirements and land use regulations, (2) consistency with the City Master Plan, or (3) additional information about the area around the petitioner's property and the extent to which a proposed project may positively or negatively affect the area.)

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live at 7:00 p.m. on the first and third Tuesdays of the month and replayed the following Saturdays at 8:00 PM. Recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>. The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.