

## ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

### Staff Report

**ADDRESS:** 818 W Washington Street, Application Number HDC22-1248

**DISTRICT:** Old West Side Historic District (OWSHD)

**REPORT DATE:** December 8, 2022

**REPORT PREPARED BY:** Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

**REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE:** Monday, December 5, 2022

	<b>OWNER</b>	<b>APPLICANT</b>
<b>Name:</b>	Audra Baleisis	Theresa Angelini
<b>Address:</b>		Angelini & Associates 200 Huronview Blvd Ann Arbor, MI 48103
<b>Phone:</b>	(312) 399-8808	(734) 476-3461

**BACKGROUND:** This 2 ½ story gable-fronter features gable corner returns, an ornate, full-width front porch, and a first-floor bumpout on the west elevation near the rear.

**LOCATION:** The site is located on the north side of West Washington Street, east of S Seventh and west of Mulholland Streets.

**APPLICATION:** The applicant seeks HDC approval to demo a non-historic rear porch and roof deck, add a 1 ½ story rear addition and a one-story bumpout on the west side, replace the front porch decking and stairs with matching materials and dimensions, install a new asphalt roof and three new skylights, add a new attic window in a new opening in the rear gable, and remove the brick chimney.

#### APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

**From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (other SOI Standards may also apply):**

- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- (5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.



- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property will be unimpaired.

**From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):**

### **Additions**

*Recommended:* Constructing a new addition so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials and so that character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

Locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of a historic building; and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Designing new additions in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

Placing new additions such as balconies and greenhouses on non-character-defining elevations and limiting and size and scale in relationship to the historic building.

Designing additional stories, when required for the new use, that are set back from the wall plane and are as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.

*Not Recommended:* Attaching a new addition so that the character-defining features of the historic building are obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

Designing a new addition so that its size and scale in relation to the historic building are out of proportion, thus diminishing the historic character.

Designing and constructing new additions that result in the diminution or loss of the historic character of the resource, including its design, materials, workmanship, location, or setting.

Constructing additional stories so that the historic appearance of the building is radically changed.

### **Building Site**

*Recommended:* Retaining the historic relationship between buildings, landscape features, and open space.

Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

Removing or relocating buildings or landscape features thus destroying the historic relationship between buildings and the landscape.

Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape.

## Windows

*Recommended:* Designing and installing additional windows on rear or other non-character defining elevations if required by new use.

Designing and installing additional windows on rear or other non-character-defining elevations if required by the new use. New window openings may also be cut into exposed party walls. Such design should be compatible with the overall design of the building, but not duplicate the fenestration pattern and detailing of a character-defining elevation.

*Not Recommended:* Introducing a new design that is incompatible with the historic character of the building.

**From the *City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*** (other guidelines from this document may also apply):

### Guidelines for All Additions

*Appropriate:* Locating a required addition on the least character-defining elevation and keeping it subordinate in volume to the historic building.

Placing a new addition on a non-character defining or inconspicuous elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic property.

Designing the addition so it is compatible in terms of massing, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and proportion of openings.

*Not Appropriate:* Designing a new addition that requires the removal of significant building elements or site features.

Designing an addition to appear older or the same age as the original building.

## Chimneys

*Appropriate:* Designing and installing additional windows on rear or other non-character-defining elevations if required by the new use. New window openings may also be cut into exposed party walls. Such design should be compatible with the overall design of the building, but not duplicate the fenestration pattern and detailing of a character-defining elevation.

## STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The house is currently 1,487 square feet and has no modern additions. The proposed new floor area is 524 square feet, or 35% of the original. The footprint is currently 784

square feet; proposed new is 203, for an increase of 26%.

2. The rear addition has a rectangular 10' x 14'7" footprint and is inset 7" from the rear northeast corner of the house, 7" from the rear northwest corner of the house (on the second floor only). On the first floor, a one-story addition on the west side is 4'7" x 13'11" and is inset 2'2" from the rear northwest corner of the bumpout. A small covered porch with composite decking, fascia and railings leads into the one-story addition. Both additions are built on a crawl space with concrete masonry unit walls and a stucco coating.
3. Cladding is currently aluminum siding. The underlying siding type is unspecified. The additions are proposed to be clad in 4" fiber cement lap siding with Boral window and door trim. The new roof throughout is asphalt, which matches the current material.
4. The front porch repairs are appropriate if the graspable handrail is wood. The suggested motion contains this condition.
5. The skylights on the east roof faces of the main house block and two additions are appropriate. The one on the main house block is set back from the street, is reasonably sized and will provide a required means of egress. The simple brick chimney is near the rear of the main house block and has no distinguishing characteristics other than being a brick chimney. A new window in the rear-facing gable of the main house block is small and appropriate. New windows are aluminum-clad. A complete materials list is included in the attachments.
6. Staff believes the proposed work is compatible in size, materials, and composition to the historic house and neighborhood and meets applicable standards and guidelines.

**POSSIBLE MOTIONS:** (Note that the motion supports staff findings and is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 818 W Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 1 ½ story rear addition and a one-story bumpout on the west side, replace the front porch decking and stairs with matching materials and dimensions, install a new asphalt roof and three new skylights, add a new attic window in a new opening in the rear gable, and remove the brick chimney, on the following condition: that the graspable handrail is wood. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, in particular the guidelines for residential accessory structures and paved areas.

**ATTACHMENTS:** application, drawings, photos, materials information

818 W Washington Street (May 2008 survey photos)

