

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**Staff Report****ADDRESS:** 628 S First Street, Application Number HDC22-1173**DISTRICT:** Old West Side Historic District**REPORT DATE:** September 8, 2022**REPORT PREPARED BY:** Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator**REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE:** Tuesday, September 6, 2022

	OWNER	APPLICANT
Name:	Jessica Hoard	Same
Address:	628 S First Street Ann Arbor, MI 48103	
Phone:	(734) 417-8778	

BACKGROUND: This tiny two-story I-house features a full-width front porch and gable corner returns. It appears in the 1894 Polk City Directory as the Fiegal home at 126 South First, but its construction date is unknown. The two-story front and one-story rear wings appear on the 1925 and 1948 Sanborn Maps. The HDC approved the replacement of a more modern shed roof addition on the rear with a new addition of approximately the same size in 2017.

LOCATION: The site is on the west side of South First Street, just north of West Mosley Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to construct an 11' x 18' brick accessory building in the backyard.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:**From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:**

- (2) The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- (10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property will be unimpaired.

From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Building Site

Recommended: Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserve the historic relationship between a building or buildings, landscape features, and open space.

Retaining the historic relationship between buildings, landscape features, and open space.

Identifying, retaining, and preserving buildings and their features as well as features of the site that are important in defining its overall historic character.

Not Recommended: Introducing new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture or which destroys historic relationships on the site.

Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building site so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Guidelines may apply):**Residential Accessory Structures**

Not Appropriate: Introducing new structures or site features that are out of scale with the property or the district or are otherwise inappropriate.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The application says the accessory building will be used as a workout room. No plumbing is proposed to be run to the building. The accessory building is more than 100' from the front lot line. Its location in the rear corner of the yard is appropriate.
2. The 11' x 18' accessory building is a similar size to historic small single-car garages. The south elevation, facing the backyard, features a wall of windows and a sliding patio door. Two light sconces flank the windows and are unlikely to cast light onto any neighboring properties. The east elevation also has a window wall. The north (side) and west (rear) walls have no openings. There are privacy fences parallel to the building on both the north and west sides. The foundation is concrete masonry units, and the cladding is grey brick veneer. It has a shed roof.
3. The location on this deep lot, small size, and inconspicuous nature of this accessory building are appropriate. Staff recommends approval of the application and believes that the design, size, location, and materials of the shed are appropriate and will not detract from the historic character of the surrounding neighborhood.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS (Note that the motion is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 628 South First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a new accessory structure in the backyard as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2 and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, particularly as they pertain to residential accessory structures.

MOTION WORKSHEET

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at _____ in the _____ Historic District

____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: drawings, photos, materials description

628 South First (May 2008 Survey Photo)

