



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes

Design Review Board

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Wednesday, May 20, 2015

3:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St,
Basement, conference room

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson Tamara Burns called the meeting to order at 3:05 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Staff Present: Jill Thacher

Present 7 - Richard (Dick) Mitchell, Tamara Burns, Paul Fontaine,
William Kinley, Geoffrey M. Perkins, Shannan
Gibb-Randall, and Gary Cooper

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The Agenda was unanimously approved with the addition of "
Process Discussion" at the end of the agenda. On a voice vote, the
Chair declared the motion carried.

D **INTRODUCTIONS**

E **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

[15-0638](#) Design Review Board Meeting Minutes of April 15, 2015

**A motion was made by Mitchell, seconded by Fontaine, that the
Minutes be Approved by the Board and forwarded to the City
Council. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

F **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

None

G **NEW BUSINESS**

G-1 **15-0639**

The Madison on Main Design Review II - A revised design for a new 7-story residential building with retail use at the ground floor, including a parking garage, to be located at 600 S. Main St. Exterior materials continue to include a street-level stone "base", a brick "main body" and metal panel "top". Revisions have been made to further compliment the neighborhood to the west and the surrounding developments, still providing traditional architectural values and pedestrian scaling. The original design was reviewed by the Board on March 18, 2015. (Ward 5)

(Project Numbers DR15-001, SP15-022)

The Design Review Board met on May 20, 2015 to re-review the proposed design for a new development, "Madison on Main" at 213 West Kingsley Street. The following report contains a summary of the discussion and the priority issues the Board would like the developer to consider in finalizing the design proposal and subsequent site plan submittal.

Description of Project

Dan Kettlaar and Mark Ehgotz represented the design team.

Ehgotz presented changes made to the design of the building since March 18 when the DRB originally viewed the plans. The west and south elevations have the most substantial changes. The drive entrance onto South Main was recessed an additional six feet to help keep cars out of the traffic lane and sidewalk. There is an additional interior stair.

The north elevation has brick, manufactured stone, and clad wood windows. A second floor terrace and pergola were added on the west elevation.

On the east elevation (Main Street), the area above the garage entrance is still standing seam, but the stone base on ground level floor continues to the corner. The bumpout on the corner is now all brick and stone, not stainless steel.

The west elevation, he feels, is now consistent with the rest of the building. It features planes of burnished block with gaps to daylight the parking behind them.

At the front corner, many architectural details were added. The base is higher, and there are stone lintels. Parking features 12 spaces off Main Street (drive down) and 12 more spaces off Madison (drive up). The two

parking levels are not connected. The retail on first floor is 1,312 SF. A bike storage room was added.

The Board asked several clarifying questions about trash pickup, the parking structure, mechanical equipment, shading on neighboring properties, the neighborhood meting,

Summary of Priority Issues

The Design Review Board concluded that the project meets the intent of the Downtown Design Guidelines, particularly those for buildings and building elements. Specific suggestions were offered to enhance the application and improve the design to better meet the intent of the Guidelines.

Examples of especially applicable guidelines are noted below in parenthesis; the full text of each referenced guideline is provided at the end of the summary. Please note that the First Street character area guidelines also apply.

Context and Site Planning

The proposed design should be stepped down at the northwest corner to reduce the massing adjacent to small homes to the west (A.1.1). Also, the canopy at 15'8" is out of scale with the pedestrian experience and should possibly be lowered to the level of the transom (A.1.3). Concerning natural systems, there is significant shading of the houses to the west, which does not meet the design guidelines (A.2.2). On parking, the board felt that a truncated dome surface at curb cuts is desirable to give pedestrians a natural change when crossing the driveway (A.4.1&2).

Buildings

The proposed design's massing at the northwest corner is too abrupt with the single family homes on Madison (B.1.1).

Building Elements

Building operational systems should be incorporated into the design of the building and shown on the plans, including the roof, south alley, hydrants, transformers, condensers, and parking exhaust (C.6.2).

Referenced Sections of the City of Ann Arbor Downtown Design Guidelines:

A.1. When considering urban pattern and form, the petitioner should assess the character of the adjacent streetscape, open spaces, and buildings to determine how they function as places and facilities supporting human use.

A.1.1 Identify and then reinforce the positive characteristics of adjacent sites.

A.1.3 Corner sites are an opportunity to express an architectural gateway or focal point and a dominant architectural feature.

A.2.2 Site designs should accommodate solar access and minimize shading of adjacent properties and neighborhoods.

A.4.1 Locate and size driveways, access points, service entries, alleys, loading docks, and trash receptacles to minimize impact on pedestrians and maintain pedestrian safety, circulation, and comfort.

A.4.2 Provide a pedestrian-friendly street edge at street level adjacent to surface parking areas and enclosed parking structures. Provide a landscape buffer appropriate for urban conditions at the edges of surface parking areas.

B.1.1 Design a building to minimize its impact on adjacent lower-scale areas.

Suggested strategies include:

- a) Step taller building elements away from adjacent lower-scale buildings and/or neighborhoods*
- b) Locate taller building elements at the intersection of streets*
- c) Provide variation in building massing to reflect the underlying pattern of established lot widths*

C.6.2 Locate and sufficiently screen mechanical systems to minimize or eliminate noise impacts on adjacent sites and buildings.

First Street Character District

The First Street character area lies to the west of the Main Street and Kerrytown districts, and forms the eastern edge of the Old West Side Historic District. The topography forming the Allen Creek Valley with its flood plain, the buried/piped Allen Creek, the Ann Arbor Rail Road track with its historic, turn of the century industrial architecture, and the proposed future Allen Creek Greenway, are distinct aspects of this district needing recognition during any First Street District proposed project design. The mixture of historic and non-historic residential and industrial architecture, and the valley land form, gives this area a distinct difference from other downtown character districts.

The area is a mixed use linear district (north to south) that follows the railroad tracks' older industrial railroad buildings, some of which have been converted into occupied industrial, construction, and other office uses, occasional art and dance studio activities, bars and nightclubs. The district also includes residential frame two and three story structures. The relatively quiet mixed-use neighborhood streets are highlighted by elevated train tracks with trestle bridges above east-west crossing streets from Washington Street north to Miller, and with wooden warehouse-like structures along the tracks, some of which are currently empty. The presence of the Allen Creek Flood Plain and the railroad track and its trestles are unique attributes worthy of design consideration.

The district's urban landscape largely consists of tree lined streets with relatively consistent lot spacing, and an occasionally vacant parcel. At times, a triangular shaped parcel caused by the orientation/alignment of the tracks is in contrast with the local streets. The future Allen Creek Greenway should be given design consideration as a potential element of all First Street Character District proposals.

H PLANNING COMMISSION COMMUNICATIONS - STAFF REPORTS

I COMMUNICATIONS

15-0640

Various Communications to the Design Review Board

A resolution for Chet Hill was signed by the DRB members.

J PUBLIC COMMENTARY (3 MINUTE MAXIMUM SPEAKING TIME)

None

K **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 4:30 p.m.