

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 436 S Seventh Street, Application Number HDC20-010

DISTRICT: Old West Side Historic District

REPORT DATE: February 13, 2020

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: August 13, 2018

OWNER

Name: Basil Dufallo & Cathy Sanok
Address: 436 S Seventh
 Ann Arbor, MI 48103
Phone:

APPLICANT

Encore Custom Contracting, Inc.
 18501 Grass Lake
 Manchester, MI 48158
 (734) 417-0092

BACKGROUND: This 2 ½ story gable-fronter features a full-width front porch with parged concrete walls and tapered square half-columns and wide wood lap siding with mitered corners. A two-story addition was built on the south side sometime after 1947.

LOCATION: The site is located on the west side of South Seventh Street, between West Liberty and West Madison Streets.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to shorten the height of an original window opening by raising the sill 6", and to replace a rear window and opening with a new door and opening and a small deck.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- (5) Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.



From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Windows

Not Recommended: Changing the number, location, size, or glazing pattern of windows, through cutting new openings, blocking-in windows, and installing replacement sash which does not fit the historic window opening.

Removing or radically changing windows which are important in defining the historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished.

Accessibility

Recommended: Designing new or additional means of access that are compatible with the historic building and its setting.

Entrances and Porches

Recommended: Designing and installing additional entrances or porches when required for the new use in a manner that preserves the historic character of the buildings, i.e., limiting such alteration to non-character-defining elevations.

Not Recommended: Cutting new entrances on a primary elevation. Altering utilitarian or service entrances so they appear to be formal entrances by adding paneled doors, fanlights, and sidelights.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Guidelines may apply):

Residential Porches

Appropriate: Installing a new porch and entrance on secondary elevations may be appropriate if it does not diminish the building's architectural character and the design and materials are compatible with the building and the site.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The one-over-one window on the north side of the house is proposed to be shortened by raising the sill from 48" to 42". This work would accommodate a kitchen counter and sink under the window. The contractor told staff that the windows have replacement sashes. The new window would be vinyl clad one-over-one.
2. On the rear elevation, a window that is drawn as approximately 30" x 36" would be replaced by a full-lite fiberglass door, with aluminum-clad jambs, leading to a small 4' x 6' deck with three stairs down. The stairs are shown on the west side of the deck on the west elevation drawing, and the north side on the deck detail. Staff believes either location is appropriate. The deck guardrail is a simple design. This work is not visible from the public right-of-way.

3. Staff believes the replacement of a north facing window with a 6” shorter one is appropriate if the contractor is correct that the window has already had the sashes replaced. This will be addressed at the Review Committee site visit. The alteration of the rear window into a door is compatible with the existing structure, neighboring buildings, and the surrounding historic district, and meets both the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motion is only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 436 South Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to shorten the height of an original window opening by raising the sill 6” and installing a new vinyl-clad window, and to replace a rear window and opening with a new door and opening and a small deck. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9, and the guidelines for windows, accessibility, and entries and porches, as well as the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, particularly as they pertain to residential porches.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 436 South Seventh Street in the Old West Side Historic District

_____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: application, drawings, photos.

436 S Seventh Street (July 2008 Courtesy Google Streetview)

