



---

Approved Minutes

May 19, 2016

Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors

Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 6:30 p.m.

Board: Mike Allemang, Jack Bernard, Eli Cooper, Sue Gott, Prashanth Gururaja,  
Larry Krieg, Eric Mahler (Chair)

Absent with Notice: Gillian Ream Gainsley, Stephen Wade

Staff: Michael Benham, Terry Black, Matt Carpenter, Bill De Groot, Dawn  
Gabay, Mary Stasiak, Phil Webb, Chris White

Local Advisory Council: Rebecca Burke

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Chairman Eric Mahler declared that a quorum was present and called the meeting to order at 6:32 p.m.

1.0 Public Hearing

There was no public hearing.

2.0 Communications and Announcements

Mr. Mahler appointed Jack Bernard Acting Secretary.

Larry Krieg announced that the Regional Transit Authority board unanimously approved the Michigan Avenue Corridor Study. Mr. Krieg characterized this as a major milestone as there could have been a block, if all counties had not voted in favor of the study.

Eli Cooper announced National Bike to Work Week, and National Bike to Work Day on May 20, 2016. Mr. Cooper encouraged people to bike to work. Mr. Cooper noted that AATA was the first transit authority in the nation to have a fully bicycle rack equipped urban fleet.

### 3.0 Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items

Jim Mogensen appeared before the board. Mr. Mogensen made a clarification about Mr. Bernard's questions from the April 21, 2016 board meeting regarding Mr. Mogensen's mother trying to get on the bus. Mr. Mogensen confirmed that two things happened: Mr. Mogensen's mother struggled to get on the bus as she didn't realize that she needed to ask the driver to lower the ramp to accommodate using a walker, but she was able to get on the bus. Mr. Mogensen reported that his mother also had a pass-by and had to continue on her trip in another way. Mr. Mogensen did not request an amendment to the minutes.

Carolyn Grawi appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi expressed appreciation for the expanded bus service and complimented staff at the Blake Transit Center for directing passengers to their buses. Ms. Grawi requested that drivers are trained and required to honor ADA requests, and that drivers understand that it is not appropriate to ask customers to remind them of requests.

No one further appearing, Mr. Mahler declared Public Time closed.

### 4.0 Review and Approval of Minutes of April 21, 2016

Larry Krieg moved approval of the minutes with support from Prashanth Gururaja. Mr. Krieg recommended getting clarification from Ms. Grawi on the following item in the minutes:

#### 3.0 Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items

Ms. Grawi shared details of ARide trips, and suggested that the Will Call policy is prohibitive.

Mr. Krieg questioned whether Ms. Grawi used the word "prohibitive", and suggested that Ms. Grawi be given the opportunity to make a clarification.

Mr. Mahler invited Ms. Grawi to provide clarification. Ms. Grawi reported that because the Will Call policy does not allow passengers to get on and off service, especially at medical appointments, it is not giving people the same opportunity to use the system as people who use buses.

Mr. Mahler suggested that the wording be changed to "the Will Call policy needs improvements". Ms. Grawi agreed with the change.

The motion, with the amendment, carried. Sue Gott abstained.

## 5.0 Board and Staff Reports

### 5.1 Chief Executive Officer

Mr. Carpenter reported on the successful roll out of a major service expansion on May 1. There were no significant operational issues. There were a couple of malfunctioning destination signs on the first day of service. The great majority of riders were aware of the changes and staff was able to handle the volume of information requests without issue. The number of complaints received in the first two weeks of May was slightly lower than same period last year.

Mr. Carpenter reported that staff have been committed to listening to all comments. There have been some issues with afternoon peak-hour service on Route #32 which adds time for commuters to the Miller Road park and ride lot. Staff is looking at making a service adjustment to improve the situation. Mr. Carpenter noted that additional service increases, although much smaller in scale, are planned for August 2016 and August 2017 to fulfill the promise made to voters in 2014.

Mr. Carpenter reported on receipt of a letter from the Ann Arbor Commission on Disability Issues raising some questions about accessibility issues and sensitivity training. Staff will be reaching out to Commission leadership to find out more details, and work with them on resolving the concerns.

#### 5.1.1 New Service Update

An update on new service was provided under item 5.1.

#### 5.1.2 Budget 2017 Update

Mr. Carpenter reported on execution of an expedited interim budget process starting in June with a new draft Work Plan and new draft Capital Plan format; a five-year rolling schedule for both planning documents. Mr. Carpenter will seek board member reactions to the plans in committee. If things proceed along the proposed schedule, the Work Plan and Capital plan documents will form a good part of the input into the FY2017 budget. Mr. Carpenter reported that approval of the capital and operating budgets will be sought in August or September.

### 5.2 Planning and Development Committee

Mr. Krieg reported on the Planning and Development Committee meeting. The committee revisited a motion tabled in April to introduce new service on route 6

(6C) and a new route 61. The committee endorsed moving a resolution forward to the full board for consideration. Committee members discussed a number of suggestions for consideration in medium and long-term service planning. Mr. Krieg noted that service on new route 67 turns short of the originally designated turnaround point of the Walmart/Roundtree shopping center. This is due a reluctance on the part of shopping center management due to pavement conditions. Mr. Krieg contacted township authorities, but no resolution has been reached.

### 5.3 Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee

Mr. Allemang reported on the Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee meeting. The committee received a report from Chris White confirming that the University of Michigan (UM) has agreed to a new pricing formula for the MRide Agreement based on the Third-Party Fare Policy approved by the AAATA board in January. Other language in the MRide contract is being finalized. Staff provided an update on new service, as well as a brief report about preliminary planning and strategy regarding renewal of the millage. Staff reported on a request for additional funding for construction expenses for the Blake Transit Center, and supported moving forward a resolution for consideration by the full board. Staff presented the financial report which is favorable and consistent with what has been reported in the past several months. The performance data is similar to recent reports with fixed-route ridership down, and ARide ridership up compared to last year. The committee continued discussions about ridership trends and received a report on the revenue effects of ridership declines. Revenue losses amount to \$86,000 which is not significant in a \$40Million annual budget. However, if the trend continues, it will be important to identify the implications. It is expected that staff will report back on revenue effects in two or three months.

### 5.4 Local Advisory Council

Ms. Burke reported on the Local Advisory Council (LAC) meeting. LAC discussed how well the transition of RideCorp providing lift van service is going. There was one minor technology glitch that was resolved. LAC is pleased to have its newest members of the Executive Committee, Laura Padalino and Steve McNutt, on board. LAC reviewed a draft version of the revised A-Ride User's Guide. The Guide is scheduled to be mailed to riders in the coming month.

### 5.5 Washtenaw Area Transportation Study

Mr. Krieg reported that the Washtenaw Area Transportation Study Policy Committee meeting for May was canceled.

## 5.6 Governance

Mr. Mahler reminded the board of the Governance Retreat scheduled for June 20 at Weber's Inn. Susan Radwan will facilitate the retreat and review basic concepts to get policies up and running and in workable order.

## 6.0 Question Time

Mr. Krieg asked if consideration had been given to a suggestion he made at PDC to change head signs that read "Blake Transit Center" to "Ann Arbor" to make it easier for people to understand where the bus is going. Mr. Krieg added that the current font size is very small.

Mr. Carpenter responded that there had not been a chance to discuss the suggestion, but made a commitment to take the matter under advisement.

Mr. Bernard reported that he has been engaging with representatives from the Commission on Disability Issues due to a breakdown in communications. Mr. Bernard provided Commission representatives with Mr. Carpenter's contact information.

Mr. Gururaja asked about plans to disseminate information about the service change to people returning to the area in August and September who did not experience the change in May. Ms. Stasiak responded that would be occurring, and staff is working on identifying a process for the best way to share the information.

## 7.0 Old Business

Mr. White reported on a request made in April to implement added service in August that is included in the Five-Year Transit Improvement Program (5YTIP), but scheduled for a different implementation time. The request came from Pittsfield Township to add a new route #61 to provide peak hour service between Saline and Ann Arbor to connect business parks along the State Street Corridor, and expand route #6 to connect #61 riders with the rest of transit service. Mr. White explained that there were plans in FY2014 to implement a new route between Ann Arbor and Saline, but Saline did not want to go forward. The proposed new route is intended to serve the same purpose during peak hours, only by circulating through the business parks and connecting to a bus stop on Airport Boulevard near Costco and other employment destinations. PDC agreed that the change could move forward with the public input component of adding service having been satisfied through public meetings in Pittsfield Township.

Mr. White responded to impacts on the budget and fleet requirements indicating that the cost implications are included in the 5YTIP as a whole, and Pittsfield Township is paying a substantial portion through their Purchase of Service Agreement for FY2016. There is no change to overall fleet requirements.

Mike Allemang moved the following resolution with support from Eli Cooper.

7.1 5YTIP Revisions for August, 2016

Resolution 19/2016

5YTIP Revisions for August, 2016 Implementation

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) Board of Directors adopted the Five-Year Transit Improvement Program (5YTIP) in January, 2014, and

WHEREAS, AAATA promoted the 5YTIP as the basis for the transit millage election in May, 2014, and the AAATA promised to implement the 5YTIP if the election was successful, and

WHEREAS, the AAATA Board of Directors adopted a procedure to amend the 5YTIP, and

WHEREAS, a route in the plan with service for Saline and Pittsfield Township was not implemented in May, 2014 as scheduled at Saline's request and

WHEREAS, Pittsfield Township wishes the portion of the route within Pittsfield Township (route #61) to be implemented separately now, and

WHEREAS, an increase in service frequency on the #6 Ellsworth route which includes service to Airport Boulevard is included in the 5YTIP to be implemented in August, 2017, and

WHEREAS, there is a coordinated transfer between Route #61 and the expanded service on route #6 at Costco on Airport Boulevard, and

WHEREAS, Pittsfield Township has requested implementation of the Pittsfield portion (route #61) of the Saline/Pittsfield route and earlier implementation of the route #6 expansion, and

WHEREAS, Pittsfield Township considered these revisions at public meetings in October, 2015 and January, 2016, and is prepared to pay their share of the cost of this service, and

WHEREAS, a Title VI, Service and Fare Equity Analysis was conducted on the 5YTIP before adoption, and the recommended revisions do not constitute a major change from the adopted plan,

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors hereby adopts the revised service changes effective August 2016 briefly described as follows:

- Route 61: Implement weekday peak service connecting business parks along either side of State Street south of Ellsworth (Avis Farms)
- Route 6: Implement service every 15 minutes between the BTC and Meijer (Carpenter) including a route deviation on Airport Boulevard (Costco)

The motion carried. Larry Krieg abstained.

## 8.0 New Business

Mr. Carpenter introduced the resolution seeking additional funding to conclude payments for the Blake Transit Center. In December 2015 staff brought forward what was believed to be the final costs to close out the project. It was discovered shortly thereafter that there was an outstanding bill. There was an error when the project retainage fee was misunderstood to be a previous change order for permit fees which was a similar amount. Mr. Carpenter apologized for the error and made a commitment for significant improvements to handling capital projects going forward.

Mr. Allemang reported that the PMER Committee reviewed the proposal and resolution and recommend approval by the board. The committee also discussed with the CEO lessons learned on the BTC project. Mr. Allemang added that procedures will be put in place to ensure that these kinds of problems don't occur in future capital projects and projects of all kinds.

Mr. Cooper noted that hundreds of transactions are processed during the life of a construction project. Mr. Cooper expressed appreciation for the transparency in which the situation was handled, and indicated that he was confident that systems will be in place to avoid future errors.

Ms. Gott suggested that the BTC project was a learning opportunity for the board and staff. Ms. Gott provided background on the project which began with a proposed \$3.5Million budget and expanded to a nearly \$8.5Million investment. Ms. Gott encouraged the board to get enough information during planning and design for future capital projects, and consider industry standards for contingencies that might prevent overages.

Larry Krieg moved the following resolution with support from Eli Cooper.

8.1 Blake Transit Center Update

**Resolution 20/2016**

**APPROVAL OF ADDITIONAL FUNDS FOR THE  
BLAKE TRANSIT CENTER RECONSTRUCTION CLOSEOUT**

**WHEREAS**, on December 17, 2015, the Board approved an additional \$175,000, from \$8,254,988 to \$8,429,988, to cover increased costs for architectural fees and construction management change orders, and

**WHEREAS**, construction has been completed and the building is open to the public, and

**WHEREAS**, 10% retainage for the construction management firm was not previously billed to the Authority and this retainage was also not included in the previous accounting of the closeout of the BTC project, and

**WHEREAS**, funding is available in existing Federal and State of Michigan formula grants for additional project costs requested without negatively affecting existing programs or services, therefore,

**IT IS RESOLVED**, that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors increase the total project amount authorized for the Blake Transit Center by \$46,920, from \$8,429,988 to \$8,476,908.

The motion passed unanimously.

9.0 Public Time

Jim Mogensen appeared before the board. Mr. Mogensen commented on the MRide agreement and the third-party fare calculation. Mr. Mogensen requested that information on calculating transfers and incorporation of transfers in the third-party fare calculation discount be made available to the public as soon as possible in the event there is a need to raise fares. Mr. Mogensen commented on the availability of service to East Ann Arbor Medical Center and urged the board to make sure that people who live in the eastern part of county are included in that policy and have equal access. Mr. Mogensen commented on the terms of lease of the Central Campus Transit Center. Mr. Mogensen referred to the June 20 Governance Retreat. Mr. Mogensen commented on non-profit entities vs. public bodies and having conversations in a particular context; detail as opposed to policy. Mr. Mogensen commented on his interest in AAATA having a more robust community match program.



No one further appearing, Mr. Mahler declared Public Time closed.

10.0 Executive Session

Jack Bernard moved to adjourn to Executive Session for the purpose of discussing legal advice. Sue Gott supported the motion. The motion carried on a unanimous roll call vote: Cooper – Yes; Gururaja – Yes; Krieg – Yes; Allemang – Yes; Gott – Yes; Bernard – Yes; Mahler – Yes. The Executive Session commenced at 7:32 p.m.

Larry Krieg moved to adjourn the Executive Session with support from Jack Bernard. The motion carried, and the Executive Session adjourned at 9:25 p.m.

11.0 Adjourn

Sue Gott moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Jack Bernard. The motion carried, and the meeting adjourned at 9:30 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Jack Bernard, Acting Secretary