



# City of Ann Arbor

## Formal Minutes

### Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/  
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

---

Wednesday, August 9, 2017

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second  
floor, City Council Chambers

---

#### **A**      **CALL TO ORDER**

*Vice Chairperson Beeson called the meeting to order at 7:04 p.m.*

*He welcomed everyone to the meeting, introduced HDC members, and asked newest member Anna Epperson to provide some background on herself.*

*Epperson said she is an intern Architect at the local O/X Studios in Ann Arbor, and much of her architectural expertise has been in historic restoration work in St. Louis and she recently got back from The Upper Peninsula where she has been working on three historic off-shore. Lighthouses.*

*Beeson welcomed two former HDC Commissioners, Ellen Ramsburgh and Benjamin Bushkuhl. He thanked them for their service to the City and the Historic District Commission, and presented them with a Resolution of Appreciation.*

*Jill Thacher thanked Ellen Ramsburgh for serving on the HDC Commission for nine (9) years, and Benjamin Bushkuhl for seven and a half (7.5) years.*

#### **B**      **ROLL CALL**

*Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll and provided the Ann Arbor District Library Summer Game code.*

**Present:** 6 - Robert White, John Beeson, Evan Hall, Max Cope, David Rochlen, and Anna Epperson

#### **C**      **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

**The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.**

**D AUDIENCE PARTICIPATIONS- PUBLIC COMMENTARY- (3 Minutes per Speaker)****E UNFINISHED BUSINESS****F HEARINGS****F-1**      **17-1167**      HDC17-162; N Fifth & Detroit Street - Rebuild Brick Street - OFWHD

*Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners Max Cope and Bob White visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Amber Miller, Downtown Development Authority (DDA) and Robert Doyle, SmithGroupJJR, 201 Depot Street, 2nd Floor, Ann Arbor, applicant, were present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Cope, seconded by White that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at North Fifth Avenue and Detroit Street, contributing properties in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to rebuild the brick streets using existing and new infill brick, reconfigure portions of the streets, and remove and reuse the stone curbs found in the project area, as detailed in the application. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the district and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 9 and 10.**

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please*

*see available video format]*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, and Epperson

**Nays:** 0

**F-2**      **17-1168**      HDC17-158; 328 South Seventh Street - Rear Addition - OWSHD

*Commissioners Evan Hall and David Rochlen recused themselves from this agenda item and any project discussion by leaving the Chambers*

*Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

**REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Commissioners Max Cope and Bob White visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

**PUBLIC HEARING:**

*Raymond Maturo, applicant, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Cope, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 328 South Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a non-original rear porch and construct a 1 ¾ story rear addition with two shed dormers and a new covered rear porch; replace the front porch stair and skirting; add a window on the south elevation of the original house; remove the brick chimney and add three sun-tunnel skylights on the roof; install a backyard patio; and raise the wood-frame garage up to 9 1/2" on new concrete walls. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions and residential patios, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and**

**Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2,5, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, Windows, and Masonry.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6 0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, and Epperson

**Nays:** 0

**F-3**      [17-1169](#)      HDC17-148; 537 Detroit Street - Rear Parking Area - OFWHD

*Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

*REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:*

*Commissioners Max Cope and Bob White visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*Dana Dever, 301 S. Main Street, Ann Arbor, Attorney representing the applicant, and Zaki Alawi, the owner was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Epperson, seconded by White, that the Commission finds that the gravel work expanding the driveway and done without permits does not qualify for a certificate of appropriateness, and that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 537 Detroit Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to demolish a non-contributing garage and construct a 24' x 32' foot gravel parking area, on the following conditions:**

(1) The driveway does not exceed 10 feet in width from the curb to the south or the structure on the lot to the south, and the gravel will be removed from the lawn along the driveway, and grass restored between the driveway and concrete walk; and

(2) Either the driveway and parking area must be constructed as specified in the application and the lawn restored to its former condition within 60 days, or the lawn must be restored to its former condition, prior to the installation of gravel, within 60 days.

The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for district or neighborhood setting and building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to paved areas and landscape features.

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, and Epperson

**Nays:** 0

**F-4**      [17-1170](#)      HDC17-156; 235 Buena Vista - Rear Deck- OWSHD

*Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]*

*REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:*

*Commissioners Max Cope and Bob White visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.*

*PUBLIC HEARING:*

*Noah Courant, 235 Buena Vista, Ann Arbor, owner, was present to explain the application and respond to enquiries from the Commission.*

*Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.*

**Moved by Hall, seconded by White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 235 Buena Vista Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace a window with a door and construct a composite deck off the rear of the house as detailed in the applicant’s submittal. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, material, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9 and 10 and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Entrances and Porches, and Decks and Patios.**

*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

*The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]*

**On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0**

**Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.**

**Yeas:** 6 - White, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, Rochlen, and Epperson

**Nays:** 0

**G      NEW BUSINESS**

**H      APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**H-1      17-0895      Minutes of the April 20th, 2017, HDC Meeting**

**Without objection, the minutes were unanimously approved and**

**forwarded to Council.**

**H-2**      [17-0896](#)      Minutes of the May 11th, 2017, HDC Meeting

**Without objection, the minutes were unanimously approved and forwarded to Council.**

**H-3**      [17-1181](#)      Minutes of the June 8th, 2017, HDC Meeting

**Without objection, the minutes were unanimously approved and forwarded to Council.**

**I**      **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

**J**      **ASSIGNMENTS**

**J-1**      **Review Committee: Monday, September 11, 2017 at 5 pm for the September 17, 2017 Regular Meeting**

*Epperson and Cope noted they would not be present for the September meeting.*

*Evan Hall and John Beeson said they would probably be able to volunteer for the September HDC Review Committee.*

**K**      **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

**K-1**      [17-1182](#)      June and July, 2017 HDC Staff Activities

**Received and Filed**

**L**      **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

**M**      **COMMUNICATIONS**

**M-1**      [17-1172](#)      Various Communications to the HDC

**Received and Filed**

**N**      **ADJOURNMENT**

**The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:35 p.m.**

Live Web streaming is one more way, in addition to these listed below, to stay in touch with Ann Arbor City Council and board and commission actions and deliberations.

- Video on Demand: Replay public meetings at your convenience online at [www.a2gov.org/government/city\\_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx](http://www.a2gov.org/government/city_administration/communicationsoffice/ctn/Pages/VideoOnDemand.aspx)
- Cable: Watch CTN Channel 16 public meeting programming via Comcast Cable channel 16.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at [www.a2gov.org/ctn](http://www.a2gov.org/ctn), on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>), or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

John Beeson, Vice Chairperson  
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner  
mg/