



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
[http://a2gov.legistar.com/
Calendar.aspx](http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx)

Thursday, April 13, 2023

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second
floor, City Council Chambers

**This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and
online at a2gov.org/watchCTN**

**To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247
or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762**

Join from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device:

<https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/96536699762?pwd=KzhoREg5eHgyUCtjV0NWY0lhUIMvQT09>
Passcode: 880017

Or join by phone:

Call: 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099

Webinar ID: 965 3669 9762

A. CALL TO ORDER

*Chairperson Anna Epperson called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm
stating:*

*Welcome to the Thursday, April 13, 2023, in-person and electronic
(hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. The
meeting is being held in this mode to protect public health and safety due
to the COVID □19 virus and to comply with orders issued by the
governor, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services
and/or the Washtenaw County Health Department and the City of Ann
Arbor. We intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person
meeting. However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public
comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak
during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247
(Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762. This
information is also available on the published agenda, in the public
notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting
on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at
www.a2gov.org/watchctn.*

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Historic District Commission members, Epperson, Fortener, Rochlen, White, and Willis, were physically present at City Hall of Ann Arbor, 301 E Huron Street, Ann Arbor, Michigan.

Present: 5 - David Rochlen, Kathryn Fortener, Chair Anna Epperson, Robert White, and Beverly K Willis

Absent: 2 - Jessica Quijano, and Jennifer Ross

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Kitty Kahn, Old West Side Historic District, spoke in opposition to the proposed height, scale, and massing for the 415 W Washington Street zoning and/or future project.

Tom Stulberg, Lower Town, spoke in opposition to the 415 W Washington Street application for a Planned Unit Development (PUD).

Ann Colvert(?), neighbor near 415 W Washington, spoke in support of an appropriate building for the 415 W Washington site, that they can all be proud of. She thanked the Commission for their work.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the Public Comment closed.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

E-1. [23-0625](#) HDC23-0007; 200 S Main Street, Takeout Window; MSHD

Attachments: 200 S Main Staff Report - Food Locker.pdf, 200 S Main Attachments.pdf, 200 South Main Street Ann Arbor Historic District Commission Submission.pdf, G-2 415 W

Washington Memo.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathy Fortener, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 200 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to add a food pickup locker in the vestibule near the northwest corner of the building; reclad a tiled column at the northeast corner of the first floor with new tiles and wood, and replace the tile floor; and paint enameled steel paneling at the northwest corner of the building to match the EFIS on the front of the building, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Quijano, and Ross

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [23-0626](#) HDC23-0023; 634 Turner Park Court, Replace Windows; OWSHD

Attachments: 634 Turner Park Staff Report - Window Infill.pdf, 634 TPC Attachments.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortner and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beverly Willis, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 634 Turner Park Court, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace two steel windows with similar windows and to partially infill two other window openings with stone masonry and shortened metal sashes, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 9 and the guidelines for windows and architectural metals, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Quijano, and Ross

F-2. [23-0627](#) HDC23-0035; 814 W Liberty, Remove Chimney; OWSHD

Attachments: 814 W Liberty Staff Report - Remove Chimney.pdf, 814 W Liberty - Attachments.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortner and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 814 West Liberty, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove the brick chimney, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Roofs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 6 and 9 the guidelines for Roofs.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please

see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Quijano, and Ross

F-3. [23-0628](#) HDC23-0042; 315 Mulholland, Remove Chimney; OWSHD

Attachments: 315 Mulholland Staff Report - Chimney Windows.pdf, 315 Mulholland Attach 1.pdf, 315 Mulholland Attach 2.pdf, 315 Mulholland South Elevation.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortner and David Rochlen visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

MOTION ON WINDOWS AND DOORS:

Moved by Beverly Willis, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 315 Mulholland Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace four modern windows with clad windows; replace a sliding glass door with a pair of French doors; replace a modern entry door with a full lite door; and install four skylights, and replacement garden window, trimmed out in casing, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the garage and the

surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 3, 5, 6 and 9 and the guidelines for roofs and windows, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for roofs and windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

VOTE ON WINDOWS AND DOORS:

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the friendly amended motion carried. **Vote: 5 – 0**

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Quijano, and Ross

MOTION ON CHIMNEY:

Moved by Kathy Fortener, Seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 315 Mulholland Avenue, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a masonry chimney as proposed.

VOTE ON CHIMNEY:

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. **Vote: 3 – 2**

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 3 - Vice Chair Rochlen, White, and K Willis

Nays: 2 - Fortener, and Chair Epperson

Absent: 2 - Secretary Quijano, and Ross

G. NEW BUISNESS

G-1. 23-0629 Staff Approvals List Additions: Clad Windows and Signs

Attachments: G-2 Staff Approvals Memo Signs, Clad Windows.pdf

At the annual retreat in March, the Historic District Commission discussed additions to the Staff Approval List. Attendees requested that two items be proposed at a regular meeting: signs and clad windows.

Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Bob White, to Approve the Modifications to Staff Approvals List as follows:

Signs

31) Signs and lighting on signs, provided the work meets the requirements of the Historic District Design Guidelines and the Sign Guidelines and has no visible junction boxes and minimal visible conduit.

Clad Windows

38) Replacement of post-1944 wood windows with clad wood windows that meet the Historic District Design Guidelines on the following conditions: the windows are not visible from the public right-of-way; the dimensions of the glass surface of the wood windows is maintained; the wood windows are not replicas of the building’s pre-1945 windows; and no specifications of the building’s pre- 1945 windows exist.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the agenda item and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Yeas: 5 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Quijano, and Ross

23-0630 415 W Washington Discussion

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the agenda item and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

G-2. **23-0826** 415 W Washington Discussion

Attachments: G-1 415 W Washington Memo Final.pdf

(See Memorandum Attached)

Moved by Bob White, Seconded by Kathy Fortener, that the Historic District Commission Accepts the Memorandum to Ann Arbor City Council, dated April 13, 2023 from Ann Arbor Historic District Commission regarding 415 W Washington Street. (See Attached)

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5 – 0

Yeas: 5 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, White, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Quijano, and Ross

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. **23-0631** February 9, 2023 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 2-9-2023 HDC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

The February 9, 2023 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

H-2. **23-0632** March 9 , 2023 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 3-9-2023 HDC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

The March 9, 2023 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. Review Committee: Monday, May 8, 2023 at 5:00p, for the Thursday, May 11, 2023 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Jennifer Ross and Beverly Willis volunteered for the Monday, May 8, 2023 HDC Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

Jill Thacher addressed an anonymous letter the Commission had received related to chainlink fences in front yards. She explained while there are still a few existing, historic, chainlink fences in front yards that remain in the historic districts, once they are removed they will not be allowed to be replaced with new chainlink fences, as the City's current ordinance doesn't allow for such. However, as long as these old historic fences are in place, they are allowed to stay and the City not make owners remove them.

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

M. COMMUNICATIONS

[23-0633](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Attachments: Mitchell - Re 415 W Washington.pdf, Ritter-Support the Resolution to Study Braun Court.pdf

Received and Filed

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 8:46 pm.

Anna Epperson, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Mia Gale, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.