



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Draft

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, September 14, 2023

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson David Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, September 14, 2023, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 4 - Chair David Rochlen, Jessica Quijano, Kathryn Fortener, and Benjamin Calderon

Absent: 1 - Jennifer Ross

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

No speakers.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

F. HEARINGS

F-1. 23-1504 HDC23-0030; 515 S First, Rear Addition; OWSHD

Attachments: 515 S First Staff Report - Rear Addition.pdf, 515 S First - Attachments.pdf

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Ben Calderon, Chair David Rochlen and Staff visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Quijano that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 515 S First Street, a contributing property in the

Old West Side Historic District, to construct a second story addition on top of the single-story rear wing, on the following conditions: that other than the second story window the addition will replace, no additional windows, or exterior doors are removed or replaced and that the exterior portion of the chimney is not removed. The egress window will be a casement window. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for additions and building site; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for additions and safety codes.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, and Calderon

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-2. [23-1505](#) HDC23-0144; 507 E Kingsley, Expand Driveway; OFWHD

Attachments: 507 E Kingsley Staff Report - Extend Driveway.pdf, 507 E Kingsley Attachments.PDF

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Ben Calderon, Chair David Rochlen and Staff visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the

Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Quijano seconded by Commissioner Fortener that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 507 E Kingsley Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to repave the asphalt driveway with concrete and extend it an additional 17', as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for paved areas and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, and Calderon

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-3. [23-1506](#) HDC23-0153; 226 Buena Vista, Remove Door and Window; OWSHD

Attachments: 226 Buena Vista Staff Report - Door, Rear Porch Window Infill.pdf, 226 Buena Vista Attachments.pdf

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Ben Calderon, Chair David Rochlen and Staff visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Calderon that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 226 Buena Vista Street, a non contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a window on the south elevation of the house as proposed, to demolish and replace the rear porch; alter rear door and windows; replace the south side door; and add two skylights. This proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for windows, and entries and porches as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to windows and residential porches.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, and Calderon

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-4. [23-1507](#) HDC23-0154; 311 E Liberty, Barrier Free Entrance; SSHD

Attachments: 311 E Liberty Staff Report - Ramp.pdf, 311 E Liberty Attachments.pdf

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Ben Calderon, Chair David Rochlen and Staff visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was not present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Calderon seconded by Commissioner Quijano that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 311 E Liberty Street, a contributing property in the State Street Historic District, to construct a new barrier-free ramp along the east side of the building and install a new door in a new opening, on the condition the design and the material, guard and skirt are approved by staff prior to permitting. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for Entrances and Porches, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Barrier Free Accommodations.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the

motion carried. Vote: 4-0.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, and Calderon

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Ross

F-5. **23-1508** HDC23-0146; 1218 W Huron, Notice to Proceed Demo Garage; OWSHD

Attachments: 1218 W Huron Staff Report-Notice to Proceed, Garage.pdf, 1218 W Huron Attachments.pdf

STAFF REPORT:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Ben Calderon, Chair David Rochlen and Staff visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Quijano seconded by Commissioner Calderon that the Commission issue a Notice to Proceed for the application at 1218 W Huron Street to demolish a garage that is a contributing structure in the Old West Side Historic District, as proposed. The Commission finds that the garage constitutes a

hazard to the safety of one of the structure's occupants, and that the proposed work is necessary to substantially improve or correct this condition.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion denied. Vote: 0-4.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, and Calderon

Absent: 1 - Ross

Moved by Commissioner Quijano seconded by Commissioner Fortener that the Commission issue a Notice to Proceed for the application at 1218 W Huron Street to demolish a garage that is a contributing structure in the Old West Side Historic District, as proposed. The Commission finds that the retention of the resource is not in the interest of the majority of the community and that the proposed demolition is necessary to substantially improve or correct this condition.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion denied. Vote: 0-4.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, and Calderon

Absent: 1 - Ross

G. NEW BUSINESS

None.

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [23-1187](#) June 8, 2023 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 6-8-2023 HDC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

The June 8, 2023 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission, and forwarded to City Council.

H-2. [23-1352](#) July 13, 2023 Historic District Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 7-13-2023 HDC Approved Meeting Minutes.pdf

The July 13, 2023 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission, and forwarded to City Council.

H-3. [23-1509](#) August 17, 2023 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 8-17-2023 DRAFT HDC Meeting Minutes.pdf

Commissioner Quijano noted the name of the board member who seconded the motion on item 536 Sixth Street was missing and Chair Rochlen noted the vote count on the same item was incorrect.

The August 17, 2023 Historic District Commission meeting minutes, as amended, were unanimously approved by the Commission, and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

None.

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. Review Committee: Tuesday, October 10, 2023 at noon, for the Thursday, October 12, 2023 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Kathryn Fortener and Benjamin Calderon volunteered for the Tuesday, October 10, 2023 HDC Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

Historic District Coordinator Jill Thacher reported:

-She will be meeting with HDC admins to discuss communication

between board and Staff.

-Two applicants had been received for the open HDC positions.

L. **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

Commissioner Quijano asked about the Chase Bank location at Main Street and Washington and property owners not knowing they are in the Historic District and if there were a way to inform them.

M. **COMMUNICATIONS**

M-1. **23-1510** Various Communications to the HDC

None.

N. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:44 pm.

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Mia Gale, Administrative Assistant
Courtney Manor, Administrative Assistant

Please note it is possible that telephone or electronic public comment may encounter technical difficulties that prevent your participation. For the greatest assurance that your comments will be heard, submit them in writing ahead of the meeting or attend in person.

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.