



City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Action Minutes

Energy Commission

Tuesday, June 11, 2019

6:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St,
Second floor, City Council Chambers

Special Meeting - This meeting has been changed to a regular meeting after originally scheduled as a Work Session

CALL TO ORDER

Acting Chair Clevey called the meeting to order at 6:06 PM.

ROLL CALL

Present: 11 - Charles Hookham, Brigit Macomber, Mike Shriberg, Mark Clevey, Shoshannah Lenski, Noah Levin, John Mirsky, Carlene Colvin-Garcia, Jack Eaton, Jeff Hayner, and Jay Zocher

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

A motion was made by Lenski, seconded by Mirsky, that the Agenda be Approved. On a voice vote, the acting Chair declared the motion carried.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Mirsky, seconded by Zocher, that the Minutes be Approved. On a voice vote, the acting Chair declared the motion carried.

PUBLIC INPUT

No public input.

ENERGY REPORT - NEWS FROM THE ENERGY OFFICE AND COMMISSIONERS

Staff MacDonald informed the commission of the following two events:

- Mayor's Green Fair on Main Street on June 14th from 6 – 9 PM
- Ann Arbor Summer Festival on June 15th

Staff MacDonald informed the commission that an Energy Efficiency RFP has been released to evaluate energy efficiency upgrades 13 municipal sites that represent the largest energy users and iconic places. Staff MacDonald informed the commission that a Solar Installation RFP should be released in the coming weeks.

Staff MacDonald informed the commission that the Office of Sustainability and Innovation is looking for solar installers to purchase panels and oversee volunteer labor at Fire Station 6. Staff MacDonald informed the commission that there will be a ballasted fence installed while volunteers work. Acting Chair Clevey and Staff MacDonald discussed the date of the install based on finalizing financing with a hopeful target of late July. Commissioner Hookham and Staff MacDonald discussed the charter for Fire Station 6, along with electric vehicle readiness and lithium ion battery safety considerations.

Staff MacDonald informed the commission that the Sustaining Ann Arbor Together Grant program has been spent out, and will restart on July 1 for new applications.

Staff Stults discussed the budget update, and informed the commission that City Council voted to keep the budget as initially requested, with full support programmatically. Staff Stults discussed that the 5 Year Work Plan is a living document, and will be updated as needed.

Councilmember Hayner discussed an MIT Technology Review article that stated that training a single AI model can emit as much carbon as five cars in their lifetimes, and discussed implications for economic development. Councilmember Hayner discussed a solar presentation for municipal energy consumption. Councilmember Eaton discussed that Wheeler Center is not within Ann Arbor city limit, but rather under township jurisdiction. Councilmember Eaton discussed Ann Arbor Airport solar installation discussions with the township, which did not occur due to a sense of disfavor over unrelated issues.

Commissioner Hookham discussed a recent 2% efficiency gain in solar panels.

Commissioner Mirsky discussed cryptocurrency energy consumption, and the potential to power the industry with renewable energy. Commissioner Mirsky inquired about the timeline for a presentation on a greenhouse gas inventory. Staff MacDonald informed the commission that data will hopefully be presented at the next month's meeting, and discussed ensuring that the information presented is based on sound data. Acting Chair Clevey discussed sharing the results with Washtenaw County.

High School Presentation on Streetlights

An Ann Arbor high school student at Pioneer High School, and presented on the state of street light in Ann Arbor with respect to their experience traveling to school. They discussed advancements of street lighting, including LED streetlights around downtown. They discussed the incoming light proposal, and

asked that more rural neighborhood be given priority. They discussed that while downtown Ann Arbor and the University of Michigan have streetlights. They discussed higher rates of crime in rural neighborhoods. They suggested purchasing street lighting from more local companies to benefit the local economy.

Acting Chair Clevey and the student discussed other project topics.

Acting Chair Clevey and the student discussed receiving more youth input, as office holders are making decisions that will impact youth in their future. Acting Chair Clevey proposed collecting input from high school government teachers. Staff MacDonald discussed possibly having a youth commissioner to make sure the voice of young people is heard. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that Washtenaw County has a Youth Commission, and there are preliminary discussions for one in Ann Arbor. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the Police Oversight Commission has a seat for a youth member. Councilmember Eaton discussed previous obstacles experienced when including youth on task forces, including challenges for young people to get to an evening meeting.

Sense of Commission - Commemorating Wayne Appleyard

Acting Chair Clevey introduced the topic of recognizing past Chair Wayne Appleyard.

Staff Stults recognized that Wayne Appleyard has served on the Energy Commission since 1992 for over 26 years. Staff Stults discussed past Chair Appleyard's role as educator, actively engaging with youth and University of Michigan Students and encouraging knowledge and passion about energy. Staff Stults acknowledged the time past Chair Appleyard contributed to the Office of Sustainability and Innovations. Staff Stults recognized past Chair Appleyard's policy development work both locally and across the state. Staff Stults recognized Chair Appleyard's constant drumbeat for energy work. Staff Stults presented past Chair Appleyard with a plaque recognizing his service to Ann Arbor.

Past Chair Appleyard informed the commission that he enjoyed being on the commission, and hopes to continue to be involved with subcommittees to move efforts forward.

Acting Chair Clevey read the Sense of Commission. A motion was made by Commissioner Lenski, seconded by Commissioner Hookham, that the Sense of Commission be accepted. On a voice vote, the acting Chair declared the motion carried.

Commissioner Mirsky discussed that past Chair Appleyard does live out of town, which requires additional votes for re-election. Commissioner Mirsky discussed that while past Chair Appleyard lives in Grass Lake based on where his wife works, his architectural firm has been based in Ann Arbor for over 30 years. Commissioner Mirsky discussed two recent resignations from the commission, and that no one has waited for more than six months to serve on the commission. Commissioner Mirsky stated that this will be a loss to the commission and Ann Arbor and a pity.

Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the City Charter sets up Commissions with term limits of six years, requiring a three year lapse before re-election. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that no person can serve more than six years, with a 26 year term being unprecedented. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that 13 people have applied to be on the commission, with 12 living within the City. Councilmember Eaton stated that he votes against re-election of non-residents when there are residents to serve on the Commission who can provide the same expertise. Commissioner Mirsky discussed the timeline of when the applications were received relative to City Council's vote on the re-election of past Chair Appleyard. Councilmember Eaton stated that the applications were received before City Council's vote on past Chair Appleyard's appointment. Commissioner Mirsky requested the dates the applications were received.

Commissioner Mirsky stated that the commission looks to provide the best service to Ann Arbor. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that past Chair Appleyard has been to every meeting, is the best prepared, and has the best bookmarks. Commissioner Mirsky stated that he hopes that someone with the same experience is appointed to the Chair position.

Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that typically City Council has a month notice for re-election decisions. For this meeting, 46 appointments were announced, and past Chair Appleyard's reappointment was not brought to City Council's attention until it was on the agenda, and did not have advance warning and therefore could not provide a warning that the appointment would be challenged. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that on the first reading, Councilmember Lumm informed past Chair Appleyard that the appointment would be challenged based on the fact that past Chair Appleyard does not live within Ann Arbor. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that both he and Councilmember Lumm subscribe to providing priority to residents over non-residents.

Councilmember Eaton discussed hesitations having a third Energy Commission member who works for a major utility company, regarding an appointment from Mayor Taylor. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the power to appoint is vested solely with the Mayor, and the power to confirm appointments are solely vested with City Council. Councilmember Eaton stated that this set of appointments was botched based on external circumstances, in that City Council did not have as much notice as they would have liked.

Commissioner Shriberg asked Councilmember Eaton if he votes against anyone who has more than six years of service. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the term length was not the point in this case. Commissioner Shriberg discussed the over 30 years past Chair Appleyard's firm has been in the City of Ann Arbor. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that City Council is still working through this, as the language of the Charter establishes a norm, but is not attached to the Energy Commission, as it was not created by that Charter. Councilmember Eaton stated that commission members can serve again after a lapse of three years, which allows for the opportunity for fresh ideas on boards and commissions, and broadens participation. Commissioner Shriberg discussed that it may or may not be a sensible rule, and may or may not be raised in the bylaws, and that he would have appreciated that issue being raised. Councilmember Eaton

informed the commission that he spoke with the City Attorney for an opinion to reflect this in the bylaws.

Commissioner Mirsky restated Staff Stults' statement that hopefully past Chair Appleyard will continue to serve on subcommittees and working groups. Commissioner Shriberg stated that the commission should draw on past Chair Appleyard's experience for as long as possible, added thanks to past Chair Appleyard, and that he saw this as a poor decision by City Council.

Councilmember Hayner discussed that the residency requirement only increases the number of votes required for a majority. Councilmember Hayner discussed that energy is a regional issue. Councilmember Hayner discussed that there is an unfortunate back and forth between the Mayor's Office and City Council. Councilmember Hayner stated that past Chair Appleyard exemplified a person whose knowledge adds a lot of value to the City, and that the City has appreciated his service. Councilmember Hayner stated that it can seem like a lot of police occurs in the Energy Commission.

Energy Commission Elections

Acting Chair Clevey informed the commission that the Chair and Vice Chair positions are open. Acting Chair Clevey informed the commission that he will accept nominations from the floor, and that based on feedback from commissioners, both nominations and elections will occur during the meeting.

Acting Chair Clevey opened the floor to nominations for the position of Chair.

Commissioner Lenski nominated Commissioner Colvin-Garcia for Chair (declined). Commissioner Colvin-Garcia nominated Commissioner Lenski for Chair (accepted). Commissioner Hookham nominated acting Chair Clevey for Chair (accepted). Commissioner Zocher nominated Commissioner Mirsky for Chair (declined).

Acting Chair Clevey opened the floor to comments from nominated parties.

Commissioner Lenski stated that she would be happy to serve in that position. Commissioner Lenski discussed the roll of Chair in a collaborative commission with experts in different areas, and that this has never been a commission where the Chair dictates, rather than coordinates with an organizational role and responsibilities. Commissioner Lenski stated that she would bring a lot of experience to the Chair position, and is open to continuing to support lots of ideas.

Acting Chair Clevey stated that continuity is all-important. Acting Chair Clevey informed the commission that he first started working with the City in the 1980s, and has remained active since then. Acting Chair Clevey stated that he has the perspective of having worked with utilities to put the first solar installation up in 1984 to demonstrate its feasibility. Acting Chair Clevey informed the commission that he has worked at both the County and State level to direct public policy, and has a unique understanding of how to bring forces together. Acting Chair Clevey stated that he is a strong advocate for solar energy and

energy efficiency.

Commissioner Mirsky and Councilmember Eaton discussed the order of voting, and the commission decided to vote on the Chair position first.

Commissioner Hookham inquired about the impacts of term limits. Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that Vice Chair and Chair limits are both for one year, and the term for Chair and Commissioner overlap. Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that the term began on June 1, and that the elected Chair will serve for the remainder of the one year term. Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that the commission will then vote in January for the following year's Chair and Vice Chair.

Commissioner Macomber stated that other Commissioners have term limits for members, and that it is unclear whether that applies to this commission or not. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that no commissioner's term runs out before May 2020, and that the next set of appointments would come up prior to May 31 of 2020.

Acting Chair Clevey informed the commission that the elected Chair will serve for the duration of the term, with elections held as normal in January. Acting Chair Clevey discussed the issue of another utility member serving on the commission. Commissioner Hookham informed the commission that he works for a non-regulated holding company, not a utility.

On a roll-call vote, the acting Chair declared Commissioner Lenski elected to chair (5-4).

Commissioner Lenski – Commissioner Colvin-Garcia, Commissioner Macomber, Commissioner Shriberg, Commissioner Mirsky, Commissioner Lenski
Acting Chair Clevey – Commissioner Zocher, Commissioner Levin, Acting Chair Clevey, Commissioner Hookham

Acting Chair Clevey opened the floor to Vice Chair Nominations. Commissioner Clevey nominated Commissioner Colvin-Garcia (declined). Commissioner Lenski nominated Commissioner Clevey (declined). Commissioner Zocher nominated Commissioner Mirsky (accepted).

On a roll-call vote, the acting Chair declared Commissioner Mirsky elected to Vice Chair (9-0).

Proposed Changes to Energy Commission Structure - Bylaws

Staff MacDonald informed the commission of proposed changes to bylaws, including the following changes to the standard agenda: Recommendation to change "Energy Notes" to "Sustainability Notes", Opportunity for City Council members to provide updates, as well as including the Energy Commission in Master Plan discussions.

Commissioner Mirsky stated that he would propose the suggested updates.

Commissioner Shriberg stated that once resolutions are passed, it would be helpful to receive a status report and a regular check in on where things sit. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that when the Energy Commission adopts resolutions, they are sent to the Agenda Committee, not City Council directly.

Commissioner Hookham suggested the commission provide expertise on topics if someone is unsure of a technical matter. Acting Chair Clevey discussed the Five Year Office of Sustainability and Innovations Work Plan, which includes liaison with the Energy Commission and explicitly draws out expertise. Commissioner Hookham discussed hiring consultants when the Energy Commission provides a great body of knowledge, and should be given the opportunity to help. Councilmember Hayner discussed encouraging a feedback loop and determining the best method for City Council to reach out for expertise.

Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that Work Sessions allow for an opportunity for staff to inform the commission of status updates. Councilmember Eaton discussed that asset management is a new frontier for staff, which will have budgetary implications. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that City Council asks questions not to challenge, but to learn from experience. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that there will be a similar work session in September about Solid Waste. Councilmember Eaton stated that the City is not using resident experts' intellect. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the City hired a consultant for \$250,000 to devise a solid waste Master Plan, whereas in the past, City Council would have organized a citizen with taskforce with excellent results.

Commissioner Hookham stated that Ann Arbor is a research town with many top experts, and discussed bridging that expertise with the City.

Councilmember Eaton stated that the Office of Sustainability and Innovation informs City Council of upcoming work, so that City Council can be prepared.

Staff MacDonald informed the commission that Commissioner Hookham has been helpful on Fire Station 6.

Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the Dark Skies Ordinance represents the commission advising City Council on the topic of street lighting, and similarly with Solar Access, by advising without overstepping. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that subcommittees serve to advise City Council to make progress.

Commissioner Hookham discussed that many new topics are arising with a changing climate. Councilmember Eaton discussed that the biggest challenge is resilience. Acting Chair Clevey confirmed the resilience is a topic of this commission, according to the Sustainability Framework and the commission's bylaws. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the next subcommittee would likely be focused on resilience.

COMMITTEE UPDATES

Solar Access Ordinance

Commissioner Hookham informed the commission that the subcommittee met in May. Commissioner Hookham discussed the Charter for the subcommittee, which provides resources and member information. Commissioner Hookham informed the commission that the subcommittee is looking at an ordinance or process for zoning and building permitting for an avenue for success, so that existing solar installations that someone has been invested in that may be blocked by new development or vegetation are addressed. Commissioner Hookham informed the commission that the subcommittee is currently doing a survey of what other places have done, and seeing how things moved forward and their impacts on growth, zoning heights, etc., and what might be the best practice for Ann Arbor. Commissioner Hookham informed the commission that the subcommittee hopes to have a document prepared by November 10, if one is needed. Commissioner Hookham stated that he hopes the commission will be a sounding board.

Acting Chair Clevey inquired whether the issue of solar residence could be addressed in this subcommittee. Commissioner Hookham informed the commission that the current charter does not include solar readiness, which is a different topic, and that a change in charter would be required to address the topic.

Lighting Ordinance

Commissioner Mirsky summarized the scope of the Lighting Ordinance. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the Planning Commission is considering the ordinance on June 19. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the subcommittee has reached out to a lighting engineering company, who is a large distributor of street lights, and received comments regarding glare and defining and measuring glare in objective terms. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the subcommittee is in contact with lighting experts at the University of Michigan and the Dark Skies Association to address those concerns so that the ordinance can be properly enforced. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the subcommittee is setting up a meeting with those who served on the Working Group with City staff to discuss specifics relating to City street lights.

Acting Chair Clevey and Commissioner Mirsky discussed lighting purchasing from previous meetings, which is not discretionary or addressed by the ordinance. Councilmember Hayner discussed dark skies concerns and contrast concerns. Councilmember Hayner informed the commission that the City can make changes in future bids.

Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the Lighting Ordinance does not address where lighting is placed and how it is spaced.

Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission and public that the companies that manufacture streetlights are large companies, and while he is not sure

where manufacturing is located, he is not aware of any significant street lighting companies within the City of Ann Arbor. Councilmember Hayner informed the commission that some bids route through a system that is maintained by the State, so there may not always be a choice of who responds to bids. Commissioner Mirsky discussed leveraging buying power at that level to take advantage of more favorable pricing. Councilmember Hayner discussed increasing transparency of bids. Councilmember Eaton informed the commission that the City Attorney has in the past advised not to favor local artists for public art. Councilmember Hayner discussed that other cities mandate that public art should be sourced from local artists, and discussed adjusting bid scoring to reflect a larger set of goals of investing in the City of Ann Arbor.

Councilmember Eaton informed the commission and public of the ten year moratorium for installing any new streetlights, and that now crosswalks, busy streets, and areas around schools are being prioritized in the near future within a finite budget, which was increased this year.

In regards to walking to school early in the morning, Commissioner Lenski discussed the Safe Routes to Schools committees which work with schools to address barriers for students to walk or bike to school, and would also encourage considering sustainability as a factor for encouraging alternative commutes.

Commissioner Colvin-Garcia discussed that solar streetlights were a strong solution for cost, payback, and sustainability.

Energy Audit Disclosure Ordinance

Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that three companies will talk about their experience on the West side of Michigan with energy audits and energy efficiency upgrades. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the commission has draft language from a few municipalities, but has not started a detailed discussion of ordinance language yet.

EV Readiness Ordinance

Commissioner Zocher informed the commission that the subcommittee has started working through Commissioner Mirsky and Wayne Appleyard's language and edits to residential and commercial parking tables.

Staff MacDonald informed the commission that the Energy Institute at the University of Michigan is holding a commercial sector information session regarding EV chargers with the Volkswagen settlement and DTE rebates.

Outreach to Schools

Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that there will be a solar installation at the Ann Arbor STEAM School this summer. So far, \$21,000

has been raised, and the system will be expandable. Commissioner Colvin-Garcia informed the commission that the School District will not be looking at volunteer labor.

Report from Environmental Commission

Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that three new Working Groups were created addressing Natural Features, Solid Waste, and Water-Related Issues. Regarding the Solid Waste Working Group, Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that the subcommittee will work on developing zero-waste concepts and recommending metrics for potential use on the sustainability dashboard.

Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission of the fourth Solid Waste Advisory Committee, which has requested an additional meeting and associated funding. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that a final report is scheduled to be completed by the end of July, providing recommendations by sector, and general recommendations relating to education and outreach. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that priorities were identified at the prior meeting. Commissioner Lenski and Commissioner Mirsky discussed concerns regarding the need for year-round residential compost collection. Councilmember Hayner discussed commercial compost collection. Regarding the commercial sector, Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that service expansion was most highly favored, along with increased enforcement and education. Commissioner Mirsky informed the commission that there is a webpage dedicated to the update of the Solid Waste Management Plan, with every document reviewed by the committee posted.

PUBLIC INPUT

No public input.

ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA

GHG Inventory
Commissioner Hookham: Information for Fire Station #6
Commissioner Colvin-Garcia, Councilmember Eaton, and Staff MacDonald discussed next steps for updating formatted agenda in Bylaws.

ADJOURNMENT

Acting Chair adjourned the meeting at 7:57 PM.

All persons are encouraged to participate in public meetings. Citizens requiring translation or sign language services or other reasonable accommodations may contact the City Clerk's office at 734.794.6140; via e-mail to: cityclerk@a2gov.org; or by written request addressed and mailed or delivered to:

City Clerk's Office
301 E. Huron St.
Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Requests made with less than two business days' notice may not be able to be accommodated.

Visit www.a2energy.org for community energy information in Ann Arbor,
or
www.a2gov.org/energy to learn more about the City's Energy Programs

Regular meetings shown Live and replayed on CTN Channel 16 and at
www.a2gov.org/ctn