



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes - Draft
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, July 11, 2024

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

A. **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson David Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:01 pm stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, July 11, 2024, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. **ROLL CALL**

Planning Manager Brett Lenart called the roll noting there was a quorum and three affirmative votes would be needed to approve an item.

Present: 4 - Chair David Rochlen, Benjamin Calderon, Chip Smith, and Steve Kaplan

Absent: 2 - Kathryn Fortener, and Jennifer Ross

Chair Rochlan noted new City Planner Julia Shake.

Others present:

Planning Manager Brett Lenart

*Associate Planner Mariana Melin- Corcoran
Associate Planner Julia Shake*

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

Seeing no speakers Chair Rochlen closed the Public Comment.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

E-1. 24-1310 HDC23-0214; 903 W Huron, rear door modification, OWSHD

Attachments: HDC23-0214; 903 W Huron SR with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

*Associate Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report.
[See attached in agenda packet]*

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Calderon seconded by Commissioner Smith that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 903 W Huron, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to replace a rear window with a door with

wood trim and add a new stoop, stairs, a switchback ramp with the guard and post being cedar material with a post brick veneer for access. The proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, and 9, and the guidelines for accessibility and entries and porches, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to residential porches.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see the available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Fortener, and Ross

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [24-1311](#) HDC24-0072; 223 S Main Street, vents without permits, MSHD

Attachments: HDC24-0072; 223 S Main SR with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

*Associate Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report.
[See attached in agenda packet]*

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Calderon seconded by Commissioner Smith that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the three exterior masonry penetrations for ventilation on the south elevation with a brick shaped cutout, flush vent caps, paint to match all at the same elevation of 223 S Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District. The work as completed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, and 9 and the guidelines for masonry and mechanical systems; and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for masonry and mechanical equipment.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Fortener, and Ross

F-2. [24-1312](#) HDC24-0092; 207 N State Street, addition, OFWHD

Attachments: HDC24-0092; 207 N State Street SR with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Associate Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Smith seconded by Commissioner Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 207 N State Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to add two dormers; remove the egress stairs on the front elevation; rebuild the egress stairs on the rear elevation; install mini splits at the rear of the house; add skylights to the roof; install new entrances and infill openings on the rear elevation; remove the south side porch; remove the stairs on the north side porch and install a new railing, on the condition that the railing follows the Design Guidelines; extend the basement stairs and add a new person door and window; remove the non-historic windows on the third floor of the front elevation and replace them with siding that matches the historic and two new windows, provided that the new windows are approved by staff; repair the second-story windows on the north elevation; install three new egress windows on the west elevation; and install three new egress windows on the basement of the north elevation and one on the south elevation, with the exception of the windows closest to North State Street on the drawings. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions, roofs, wood, windows, mechanical systems, health and safety, and entrances and porches; as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, roofs, wood, windows, mechanical equipment, and residential porches.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application

and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Fortener, and Ross

Moved by Commissioner Smith seconded by Commissioner Calderon that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 207 N State Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, install new egress windows on the basement of the north elevation, located 6 ft and 3 in from the front elevation, and one on the south elevation, located 6 ft from the front elevation. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for windows; as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Fortener, and Ross

F-3. [24-1313](#) HDC24-0093; 203 N State Street, rear second-story addition, OFWHD

Attachments: HDC24-0093; 203 N State Street SR with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

*Associate Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report.
[See attached in agenda packet]*

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Calderon seconded by Commissioner Smith that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 203 N State Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to add a 180 square foot second-floor rear addition; remove the non-historic siding and repair the historic siding; remove the faux shutters at the front elevation and replace them with wood shutters; rebuild the egress stairs on the north elevation; install mini splits at the rear of the house; and install three new egress windows on the basement of the north elevation, with the exception of the one closest to North State Street on the drawings. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions, roofs, wood, windows, mechanical systems, and health and safety; as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, roofs, wood, windows, and mechanical equipment.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Fortener, and Ross

Moved by Commissioner Calderon seconded by Commissioner Kaplan that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 203 N State Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to remove the basement covering; relocate the basement entrance on the west elevation and new egress window on the west side to be reverse from north to the south, including the door and stair; install a new egress window on the west elevation; and install an egress window on the north elevation 6 ft and 3 inches from the front elevation. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for windows and entrances and porches, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all windows and residential porches.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format.]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote 4-0.

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Fortener, and Ross

F-4. [24-1314](#) HDC24-0095; 549 S First Street, porch and siding, OWSHD

Attachments: HDC24-0095; 549 S First Street SR with Attachments.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

*Associate Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran presented the staff report.
[See attached in agenda packet]*

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioner Steve Kaplan visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Commissioner Kaplan seconded by Commissioner Smith that:

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 549 S First Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove and rebuild the front porch and roof and to remove and replace deteriorated siding, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, and material to the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5 and 9 and the guidelines for entrances and porches, wood, building site, and roofs; as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for residential porches and wood siding, trim, and architectural details.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 4-0

Yeas: 4 - Chair Rochlen, Calderon, Smith, and Kaplan

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - Secretary Fortener, and Ross

G. NEW BUISNESS

None.

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [24-1315](#) June 13, 2024 HDC Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 6-13-2024 HDC_Meeting_Minutes.pdf

The June 13, 2024 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

None.

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. [24-1316](#) Review Committee: Monday, August 5, 2024 at 5pm, for the Thursday, August 8, 2024 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Kaplan and Smith noted that they will be absent for the August 8, 2024 Historic District Commission meeting.

Commissioner Calderon volunteered for the Monday, August 5, 2024 HDC Review Committee. Chair Rochlan noted he would volunteer if other Commissioners cannot attend the Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

None.

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Calderon noted that he was unable to get into contact with

a representative from Cobblestone Farms.

M. **COMMUNICATIONS**

None.

N. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:51 pm.

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
Associate Planner Mariana Melin-Corcoran

Brittany Alexander, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.