

City of Ann Arbor

*301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>*



Meeting Minutes - Final

Thursday, August 15, 2019

7:00 PM

**Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council
Chambers**

Historic District Commission

A CALL TO ORDER

Chair John Beeson called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 6 - Robert White, John Beeson, Evan Hall, David Rochlen, Anna Epperson, and Jessica Quijano

C APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

INTRODUCTIONS

Presentation of Certificate to Max Cope

D AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

None

E UNFINISHED BUSINESS

ROLL CALL

Commissioner Evan Hall excused himself for conflict of interest and left the Council Chamber.

Present: 5 - Robert White, John Beeson, David Rochlen, Anna Epperson, and Jessica Quijano

Absent: 1 - Evan Hall

E-1 19-1531 HDC19-111 544 Sixth Street; Rear Addition; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Anne Hall, 544 Sixth Street, Ann Arbor, applicant was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission; she showed samples of proposed building materials.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 544 Sixth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 512 square foot addition off the rear of the house, and add a skylight, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting and New Additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Beeson, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Absent: 1 - Secretary Hall

ROLL CALL

Commissioner Evan Hall rejoined the HDC meeting in the Council Chamber.

Present: 6 - Robert White, John Beeson, Evan Hall, David Rochlen, Anna Epperson, and Jessica Quijano

HEARINGS

F-1 [19-1532](#) HDC19-126 211 E Liberty Street; Awning-Signage; MSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Evan Hall, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 211 East Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to install a new awning in the design proposed, on the condition that the frame is mounted through mortar joints, not through masonry units. As conditioned, the proposed work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

F-2 [19-1533](#) HDC19-130 307 W William Street; Driveway; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Kristi Gilbert and Doug Bernardin, 307 W William Street, applicants, were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 307 W William Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to pave the driveway, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for paved areas and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

F-3 [19-1534](#) HDC19-131 620 Second Street; Addition; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Sheila and William Hall, along with Andrew Hall, 42361 Fountain Park Drive, Apt 162, Novi, owners were present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Dale Babcock, Architectural Resource, LLC, 2301 Platt Road, Ann Arbor, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Mike Hagen, 2675 W. Joy Road, contractor, was present to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Commissioner Beeson noted the Commission had received letters of support from the following neighbors:

Jessica Yurasek, 626 Second Street, Ann Arbor

Ruth Peete, 623 Third Street, Ann Arbor

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 620 Second Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to remove a modern rear addition and construct a two-story rear addition and patio, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All

Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting and New Additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

F-4 **19-1535** HDC19-133 603 W Washington Street; Addition; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Chad Weiler and Bill Barbour, Forward Design Build Remodel, Architects for the project, 6087 Jackson Road, Suite 100, were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 603 West Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a rear two-story addition and skylight, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the

house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting and New Additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

F-5 **19-1536** HDC19-146 1127 W Huron; Basement Egress Window; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Anna Epperson, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1127 W Huron Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a new basement egress window and well, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially those for windows

and safety codes, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for windows, neighborhood setting, and health and safety.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

G **NEW BUSINESS**

G-1 **19-1537** Sign Guidelines Amendment

Jill Thacher explained there has been a recent uptick in banners being hung downtown, and several businesses have asked whether long-term (weeks or months) banners may be hung on historic properties. Banners have historically been prohibited by Ann Arbor's sign code, but the new sign code is proposed to allow them. Therefore, staff requests that the Historic District Commission add to their design guidelines a prohibition on fabric and vinyl banners and pennants (or similar).

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Anna Epperson, to approve the revised Ann Arbor Historic District Sign Guidelines to include information on banners, and direct staff to post this information on the City website and include banners in a future update of the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

The Commission expressed the need to amend the sign guidelines to read: Banners, pennants, and similar temporary signs that are often made of fabric or vinyl are not appropriate in Ann Arbor's local historic districts. All signs must also meet the sign code: Chapter 61 of the Ann Arbor City Code, Sign & Outdoor Advertising.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-1

Yeas: 5 - Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 1 - White

H **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

H-1 [19-1538](#) Minutes of the July 11, 2019, HDC Meeting

The July 11, 2019 HDC meeting minutes were unanimously Approved. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

Commissioner Jessica Quijano reported that she attended Cobblestone Farm's monthly meeting last Monday. She noted they are delighted to have City Parks and Recreation Deputy Manager, Josh Landefeld, attend their meetings. She said the Board is working on a longterm sustainability plan.

J **ASSIGNMENTS**

Review Committee: Monday, September 9, 2019 at 5 PM for the September 12, 2019 Regular Meeting

John Beeson and Evan Hall, volunteered for the September HDC Review Committee. Jessica Quijano and Bob White would review their schedules for possible volunteering and get back with Jill Thacher.

K **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

Jill Thacher reviewed an email from Mr. Martinez, living on Traver Street, to see if the Commission would require more material than what has been emailed, in order to bring the project before the whole Commission, for the front wall to be selectively reconstructed.

Beeson suggested that plans would show foundation details of the existing beams, roofline, heights, porch, and then proposed changes.

Rochlen suggested the owner give a brief statement of what his intention and plan is, along with any proposed work that would include any existing doors and windows.

19-1539 July 2019 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L CONCERNS OF COMMISSION

The Commission spoke of a house located in the Old West Side Historic District (in the vicinity of Seventh and Jefferson Streets) that has installed exterior lighting, including whole house facade up-lighting.

Jill Thacher noted the City's Design Guidelines state up-lighting is inappropriate and should not be installed; she would follow-up on the concern.

M COMMUNICATIONS

19-1540 Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 900 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

John Beeson, Chair
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/

