



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, March 9, 2017

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

A **CALL TO ORDER**

Vice Chair Beeson called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

B **ROLL CALL**

Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner called the roll.

Present: 5 - Ellen Ramsburgh, John Beeson, Evan Hall, Max Cope, and David Rochlen

Absent: 2 - Robert White, and Benjamin L. Bushkuhl

C **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - PUBLIC COMMENTARY - (3 Minutes per Speaker)**

None

E **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

E-1 **17-0324** HDC17-012; 330 S Main Street - New Access Ramp - MSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Craig Gilbert, 30141 Brookview, Livonia, the Applicant, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the

Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by Hall, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 330 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to construct a new barrier free ramp in front of the building. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the house and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for Entrances, and the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Barrier Free Accommodations.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The member of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion defeated. Vote: 0-5

Application Denied

Yeas: 0

Nays: 5 - Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Absent: 2 - White, and Bushkuhl

F HEARINGS

F-1 [17-0325](#) HDC17-026; 722 East Kingsley Street - Replace Window - OFWHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Peter Deininger, 2615 English Oak Drive, Ann Arbor, the Applicant, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by Cope, that the Commission approve the application at 722 E. Kingsley, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to remove a vinyl first floor window and a wood second floor window and replace them with the proposed clad wood casement windows, and remove a fire escape, all on the west elevation, on the condition that the fire escape is removed before the replacement windows' permits receive final approval. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 9, and the guidelines for windows and neighborhood setting, and the Ann Arbor Historic Guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The member of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Bushkuhl

F-2 [17-0326](#) HDC17-029; 508 Third Street - Rear Addition, Dormers - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Beeson visited the site as part of their review.

They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Marc Rueter, 515 Fifth Street, Ann Arbor, Architect, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Larry and Kathy Bates, 5234 Echo Road, Bloomfield Hills, Owners, were also present.

Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Hall, seconded by Cope that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 508 Third Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to add a one story rear addition and 12' x 12' brick patio; remove one vinyl slider door and one double hung vinyl window on the second floor rear elevation and replace them with a casement clad wood window; add a new single lite fixed window on the north elevation near the front; on the north elevation replace two modern double hung windows with three new clad wood double hung windows; on the west elevation add a new double hung window in a new opening on the filled in porch wall; add dormers to the front and rear of the modern garage; replace eight existing vinyl windows on the garage with clad wood windows; replace the garage door; move a person door from the side to the front of the garage; replace existing chain link fence with metal picket fence; and put a new asphalt roof on the house and garage. as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, architectural details, residential patios, and residential fencing, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, and Windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The member of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

Motion withdrawn by Hall, accepted by Cope.

Moved by Ramsburgh, seconded by Hall, to Postpone until the April 20th HDC meeting.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Postponed

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Bushkuhl

F-3 [17-0327](#) HDC17-031; 428 South Seventh Street - Move windows - OWSHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Scott Diels, 1414 Iroquois, Ann Arbor, Architect, was present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by Ramsburgh, that the Commission approve the application at 428 S. Seventh, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to: remove a non original window and infill the opening; shift a previously approved (but not yet installed) slider approximately 2' to the south; and install a new double hung window in a new opening to the north of the slider, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 and 9, and the guidelines for windows and neighborhood setting, and the Ann

Arbor Historic Guidelines for windows and additions.*COMMISSION DISCUSSION:*

The member of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Bushkuhl

F-4 **17-0328** HDC17-020; 307 South Fifth Ave - Re-align roof -- ELHD

Jill Thacher presented the staff report.

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Hall and Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Adrian and Lori Iraola, Applicants, were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Vice Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Cope, seconded by Ramsburgh, that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 307 South Fifth Avenue, a contributing property in the East Liberty Historic District, to change the roof pitch, increase the height of the parapet, and install mechanical equipment on the front addition, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the garage and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2 , 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site and district or neighborhood setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The member of the Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter.

On a roll call, the vote was as follows with the Vice Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted

Yeas: 5 - Ramsburgh, Vice Chair Beeson, Hall, Cope, and Rochlen

Nays: 0

Absent: 2 - White, and Bushkuhl

G NEW BUSINESS

G-1 Retreat Date: March 25, 2017

The Commission discussed potential topics for their retreat.

H APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1 [17-0329](#) Minutes of the January 12, 2017, HDC Meeting

The minutes were unanimously postponed until a future meeting.

I REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

John Beeson provided a report on the Lowertown Meeting.

Ellen Ramsburgh reported from the Citizens Action Committee for the Allen Creek Greenway Master Plan.

J ASSIGNMENTS

J-1 Review Committee: Monday, April 17, 2017, at 5pm for the April 20, 2017 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Cope and Hall volunteered for the April Review Committee.

K REPORTS FROM STAFF**K-1** [17-0330](#) February 2017 HDC Staff Activities**Received and Filed****L CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS****M COMMUNICATIONS****M-1** [17-0331](#) Various Communications to the HDC**Received and Filed****N ADJOURNMENT****The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:10 p.m.**

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

Ben Bushkuhl, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/