

It is the Mission of the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority to provide accessible, reliable, safe, environmentally responsible, and cost-effective public transportation options for the benefit of the Ann Arbor Area Community.

Proposed Minutes
Thursday, August 20, 2015
Ann Arbor Transportation Authority
Board of Directors Meeting
Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 6:30 p.m.

Board Present: Mike Allemang, Jack Bernard, Eli Cooper, Gillian Ream Gainsley, Sue Gott, Charles Griffith (Chair), Larry Krieg, Eric Mahler, Stephen Wade

Absent with Notice: Susan Baskett

Staff: Michael Benham, Jan Black, Terry Black, Matt Carpenter, Ron Copeland, Bill De Groot, Ed Robertson, Mary Stasiak, Phil Webb, Chris White

LAC Representative: Rebecca Burke

Recording Secretary: Karen Wheeler

Charles Griffith declared that a quorum was present and called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

1.0 Public Hearing

There was no Public Hearing.

2.0 Communications and Announcements

Mr. Griffith appointed Gillian Ream Gainsley Acting Secretary.

Mr. Griffith announced that Jack Bernard and Larry Krieg would serve as the Nominating Committee for Board elections to take place in September. Board members were asked to convey their interest in serving as an officer to Mr. Bernard or Dr. Krieg.

3.0 Public Time – Comment on Agenda Items

Jim Mogensen appeared before the Board. Mr. Mogensen commented on the FY2016 Work Plan noting the following: 1. any reductions to the paratransit service levels would be a challenge, and notice should be given as soon as possible; 2. the item on the MRide agreement should include the renegotiation of the contract over the next year; 3. consideration be given to including the WATS human services coordinated plan in the

Work Plan.

Michelle Barney appeared before the Board. Ms. Barney spoke favorably about the recent expanded ARide and fixed-route bus service in Ypsilanti. Ms. Barney inquired as to whether both services could be expanded further to provide access to UM and St. Joe for patients on Saturday and Sunday, and for employees on Friday evening and the weekend. Ms. Barney expressed concern that hours of operation and service area information on NightRide and HolidayRide is not included in the manual. Ms. Barney indicated that there is a desire for NightRide and HolidayRide in Ypsilanti, and inquired as to whether there are plans to expand the services.

Linda Rama appeared before the Board. Ms. Rama commented on overcrowding on buses in general, and specifically route #4. Ms. Rama conveyed details of a recent trip on route #4 on Sunday going to Ypsilanti where the conditions were unsafe, noting that the situation will likely get worse with the return of students. Ms. Rama recommended that the Board look into providing more buses on routes #4 and #6. Ms. Rama thanked the Board for their consideration.

No one further appearing, Mr. Griffith declared Public Time closed.

4.0 Review and Approval of Minutes

4.1 Review and Approval of Minutes of June 25, 2015

Sue Gott moved approval of the minutes as written with support from Eric Mahler. The motion carried. Jack Bernard and Larry Krieg abstained.

5.0 Board and Staff Reports

5.1 Chief Executive Officer

Matt Carpenter reported on events over the past month. Mr. Carpenter met with the Washtenaw County Regional Transit Authority board members and discussed reestablishing communication links and meeting more regularly. There was a joint meeting of AAATA and Downtown Development Authority board members. Mr. Carpenter noted that he is into his third month of onboarding. He is concluding the learning phase having received a number of technical briefings on a wide variety of issues, met at least twice with the board committees, once with the Local Advisory Council (LAC), and has held numerous meetings with community leaders and elected officials. Mr. Carpenter reported that he will be moving forward into the direction phase, and will continue meetings with POSA partners, regional leaders and citizens.

Mr. Carpenter referred to a letter included in the board packet responding to

Michelle Barney's comments at the last board meeting. Mr. Carpenter noted recent concerns suggesting that the amount of ARide service has decreased. Mr. Carpenter reported that the LAC and AAATA staff are working diligently to investigate the details of the criticism of the service. Mr. Carpenter noted that it has been a struggle reconciling the perception with data as ARide ridership in July was higher than the same period last year. Mr. Carpenter reported on an event hosted by AAATA in July launching a new Allison transmission.

5.2 Planning and Development Committee

Sue Gott presented the Planning and Development Committee (PDC) meeting report. The committee received comments about ARide during PDC public time. Ms. Gott thanked Mr. Carpenter for looking into the concerns. Staff reported to PDC on the Ypsilanti Transit Center (YTC). The YTC project team has been engaged in the discovery process, holding many conversations and working to understand the aspirations of the community and range of interests for the transit center. The committee endorsed a two-phased approach to implementing improvements to the YTC recommended by staff. Phase 1 will involve direct implementation of what is needed to get the existing facility in good repair including improved seating, repairs to the restrooms, and the addition of a back-up power source. Phase 2 will take place over 18-24 months and provide the opportunity to look at other transit agencies as examples of what might be opportunities and affordable scenarios for redevelopment.

The committee endorsed the FY2016 Work Plan following a third and final review of the document. Staff provided updates on the RTA, and the North-South Rail and CAD-AVL projects. A question was raised about renumbering routes as part of the 2016 service improvements. Staff agreed to discuss the renumbering system with the Board when ready to bring the recommendations forward.

5.3 Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee

Eli Cooper presented the Performance Monitoring and External Relations (PMER) Committee report. The committee discussed metrics and numbers, and reviewed details related to the requests for action on the marketing contract, audit contract, CAD-AVL change order, and a revision to the Donations Policy. The Committee supported the four action items on the board agenda for new business. Mr. Cooper reported that the committee spent a fair amount of time addressing the marketing contract. The positive millage vote resulted in expanded service and an adjusted budget to begin to deliver a higher level of service. One component of service delivery is communicating to the broader community to deliver messaging. The outreach and communications work completed was within budget, however, the modest period of time within which

the work was required to be finished was done outside of the authorization that the Board allotted for that work. The PMER committee was notified as soon as staff became aware of an imbalance. Committee members discussed the fundamental question of how specific resolutions should be when the Board has already adopted a budget which outlines spending. Mr. Cooper reported that the resolution for consideration would allow for the work to be authorized.

Mr. Cooper reported that an internal selection committee reviewed the auditing proposals and there was a clear leader. The committee supported the request from staff for Clever Devices to install the CAD/AVL system instead of bus manufacturer Gillig. This approach will achieve a cost savings and provide opportunities for technology advances. Mr. Cooper referred to the materials in the Board report detailing the proposed revision to the Community Donations Policy. Staff provided an update on the Blake Transit Center which has been open for more than a year. The Committee received reports on the financial and performance statistics. Mr. Cooper noted concerns about the level of service available on ARide indicating that statistics show that the same number of customer trips are being provided.

5.4 Washtenaw Area Transportation Study Policy Committee

Larry Krieg reported on the Washtenaw Area Transportation Study (WATS) Policy Committee meeting. The Committee received news that no long-term transportation funding measure has passed through the national legislature. Michael Ford, Regional Transit Authority (RTA) CEO, presented a comprehensive overview of the work the RTA is doing, including future plans to increase transit service in the region.

5.5 Local Advisory Council

Rebecca Burke reported on highlights from the Local Advisory Council (LAC) meeting. LAC received a presentation on the Ypsilanti Transit Center redevelopment project. The project is of great interest as LAC membership expands to include members from outlying jurisdictions. LAC received an update on the call center. While there is not total satisfaction, there seems to be a feeling that overall the center is operating at an acceptable level. CEO Matt Carpenter attended LAC and engaged in a robust conversation with members which allayed a lot of fears. Ms. Burke reported that applications to the LAC Executive Committee will be presented to the Board for approval in September.

6.0 Question Time

Jack Bernard noted concerns that there may be plans to decrease ARide and Senior services. Mr. Bernard asked Matt Carpenter to address whether that is the plan, or if

there are clearly no plans along those lines.

Mr. Carpenter responded there are no plans to lower the level of ARide service anywhere in the service area indicating that the plan is the opposite, with gradual expansion outlined in the 5-Year Transportation Improvement Plan. Mr. Carpenter noted that as fixed-route bus service expands in scope, paratransit service must accompany the expansion. Mr. Carpenter reported on an additional small expansion of paratransit service in Pittsfield Township, scheduled for September, through a revised Purchase of Service Agreement. Mr. Carpenter restated that there are no plans to decrease the level of service, only plans to increase, and those are spelled out in the public plans.

Stephen Wade commented on the Ypsilanti Transit Center redevelopment project supporting the conversation about adding benches and bike racks to the site. Mr. Wade encouraged staff to talk with representatives from the City of Ypsilanti about adding paint to crosswalks to designate flow changes related to new bus service, and make every effort to amplify AAATA's investment in Phase 1 and make the facility more useful.

7.0 Old Business

There was no Old Business for the Board to consider.

8.0 New Business

Sue Gott moved the following resolution with support from Eric Mahler.

8.1 Consideration of **Resolution 32/2015 Approve FY 2016 Work Plan**

WHEREAS, Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) Staff developed a Work Plan for Fiscal Year 2016 to help guide programs and projects that are important to the advancement of public transportation, and

WHEREAS, the Work Plan and Work Plan Major Projects were presented to the Board Planning and Development Committee (PDC), and

WHEREAS, the programs and projects contained within the FY 2016 Work Plan have been incorporated into the FY 2016 Operating Budget in order that they may be appropriately funded,

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the FY 2016 Work Plan prepared by Staff and reviewed by the PDC is hereby approved by the AAATA Board of Directors, and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the FY 2016 Work Plan is assigned to the Performance Monitoring and External Relations Committee for appropriate monitoring of AAATA's

activities, and progress toward goals and objectives associated with it, during Fiscal Year 2016.

Board members engaged in a lengthy discussion about the Work Plan. Specific questions were around the Website, MRide Agreement, timing associated with objectives, snow removal, and the prospect of providing additional service in Ypsilanti.

In response to a question about the status of the Website, Mary Stasiak provided an update. The base operating system will be upgraded in order to implement changes requested to the rider tools and allow for the tools to be viewed on any type of screen. Modifications to the real-time tools are being made on a consistent basis to keep the tools working. The CAD/AVL system, planned to be fully operational by June 2016, will make drastic changes to the real-time tools including a better user interface system for tracking buses. Staff was asked to provide regular updates on the website and mobile customer interface.

An observation was made that some of the objectives are on a continuum, while others should have an end date. It was suggested that timing could be added to the objectives with an expected completion. It was noted that the PMER Committee conducts a quarterly review of the Work Plan and would be aware of the status of Work Plan items.

The traffic signal priority system concept was highlighted as an opportunity for a valuable service enhancement, and "BikeRide" identified as an innovative solution for a non-motorized connection to the last mile of a commute.

Staff was asked to consider snow removal as a possible separate item in the Work Plan and investigate ways to make snow removal at stops more reliable. It was suggested that snow removal could be an addition to the Adopt-A-Stop program, and staff was encouraged to look for opportunities to engage more program partners.

Jack Bernard made a statement for the record that it might be useful to talk about adding NightRide and HolidayRide in Ypsilanti. Chris White responded that this is not an easy issue primarily because NightRide has worked within the City of Ann Arbor which is a compact service area. The service may not be expandable to a large service area without redesign. Mr. White added that while the desire for the service is known, it was not identified as a priority in the 5-Year Transportation Improvement Plan.

Matt Carpenter reported that during a recent tour of Ypsilanti he sensed a fundamental equity concern between communities and service levels. Service expansion has differed based on funding sources. Mr. Carpenter identified NightRide, AirRide, and the transit centers as examples of the differences. Mr. Carpenter acknowledged the desire to balance equity and catch new members up.

As a point of clarification, Sue Gott noted that the Work Plan outlines the major activities planned for the coming year and associated resources needed upon which the operating budget is based. Ms. Gott suggested that the Plan could be amended, if an unanticipated action or influence arises that necessitates a shift in priorities, particularly if a change could have an impact associated with the budget.

Matt Carpenter noted that there was an oversight regarding Work Plan item 3.12 on the MRide Agreement indicating that the document should include an entry for “Renegotiation and update of the MRide Agreement.” Charles Griffith requested a friendly amendment to the motion to include the item.

Mr. Griffith noted scheduled completion of the Sustainability Plan. Mr. Griffith suggested that monitoring should be conducted in accordance with the Plan. Mr. Griffith requested a friendly amendment to insert an item under item 5.04 Monitoring execution and performance in accordance with the Sustainability Plan.

Ms. Gott accepted the friendly amendments to add references to the Work Plan on the MRide Agreement renegotiation as well as the Sustainability Plan.

Gillian Ream Gainsley proposed a friendly amendment to add an entry in Section 2 Research and Development Initiatives: “Staff explore options for working with local businesses or local municipalities to address pedestrian access to stops, especially in winter.” Ms. Gott further amended the motion to include opportunities for greater outreach for snow removal.

The amended motion passed unanimously.

Sue Gott moved the following resolution, on behalf of the Governance Committee, to approve authorization of reimbursement of relocation expenses for the AAATA CEO, Matthew Carpenter, in the amount of \$20,000. Mike Allemang supported the motion.

8.2 **Consideration of Resolution 33/2015 Approval of Reimbursement of CEO Relocation Expenses**

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) Board of Directors (Board) approved an Agreement with Matthew Carpenter for employment as the AAATA Chief Executive Officer (CEO) beginning June 1, 2015, and

WHEREAS the Agreement includes terms for reimbursement of certain relocation expenses, and

WHEREAS Mr. Carpenter has provided copies of receipts for eligible expenses,

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority

Board of Directors hereby authorizes the reimbursement of relocation expenses for AAATA CEO Matthew Carpenter in the amount of \$20,000.

Charles Griffith reported that the employment agreement with Mr. Carpenter requires approval of the expenses by the full Board and that Mr. Carpenter provided detailed receipts which were included in the Board materials.

It was noted that relocating from Canada can be expensive. Mr. Carpenter was complimented for being conscientious in his documentation and for his desire for transparency.

The motion passed unanimously.

Eli Cooper moved the following resolution with support from Jack Bernard.

8.3 **Consideration of Resolution 34/2015 Authorization to Amend Awarded Amount for Marketing and Public Relations Services to Conform to Budgeted Amounts**

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors approved Resolution 36/2012 on July 16, 2012 awarding contracts for Quack! Media and Pace & Partners (recently renamed GUD) to provide marketing and public relations services for a contract term of three years at an amount not to exceed \$300,000, with an option to extend such contracts for two one-year periods at \$100,000 each year, and

WHEREAS, changes in marketing and public relations priorities required additional services by the vendors resulting in an increase in expenses, and

WHEREAS, the total annual approved budgets for marketing and public relations services were respected, and

WHEREAS, the authorized contractual amounts need to be adjusted to align with the approved budgeted amounts, and

WHEREAS, Administration is requesting the authorized contractual amount for the first three contract years be adjusted to align with corresponding expenditures within budgets,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors amends the previously approved resolution for professional marketing and public relations services for the first three contract years to \$450,900.

Board members commented on the resolution. An inquiry was made about when the Board might be apprised of processes to prevent an imbalance from happening again. Matt Carpenter responded that a process had been developed and was being piloted to track expenses vs. finite dollar amounts in contracts to waive a red flag, if there is a problem. Mr. Carpenter estimated that the process would be complete by year's end.

Eli Cooper clarified the issue the Board was addressing; approval of an expenditure exceeding Board authorization in a resolution. Mr. Cooper confirmed that the amount spent was within the budget approved by the Board.

It was noted that while approving multi-year contracts may pose some challenges as it is sometimes uncertain what is going to happen in out years, the Board may not want to have to consider contracts every year for vendors with whom the agency has long term relationships. Mr. Carpenter reaffirmed the steps underway to conduct internal checks and balances.

The motion passed unanimously.

Eli Cooper moved the following resolution with support from Larry Krieg.

8.4 **Consideration of Resolution 35/2015 Award of a Contract for Auditing Services**

WHEREAS, the auditing services provided for fiscal year 2014 was the end of a four-year contract between Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) and Plante & Moran to provide financial auditing services, and

WHEREAS, AAATA's Auditor Rotation Policy limits an auditing firm to two (2) four-year contracts for a maximum of eight (8) consecutive years, and

WHEREAS, on June 23, 2015, AAATA issued Request for Proposal (RFP) 2015-17 for Auditing Services and received seven (7) proposals, including a proposal from the incumbent, and

WHEREAS, the proposals were reviewed by an Evaluation Team, which included three (3) AAATA staff members and an AAATA Board Member, and

WHEREAS, Plante & Moran has performed AAATA's auditing services for only four (4) consecutive years, and

WHEREAS, the proposal from Plante & Moran has been determined to be the most advantageous to AAATA, therefore

IT IS RESOLVED, that the Board authorizes the Chief Executive Officer to enter into a two-year contract with two one-year options with Plante & Moran in an amount not-to-exceed \$108,000 over the duration of the contract.

Board members commented on the resolution. Jack Bernard cautioned that the proposal for auditing services could fluctuate over time and recommended not identifying a specific dollar amount. Mr. Bernard suggested that the Board review their process for approving exacting amounts for contracts, especially for services for which there is no choice but to perform.

Phil Webb responded to questions about the auditing contract. Mr. Webb reported that the audit is based on a major transit cluster with two major programs. The addition of a third program would cost more. Mr. Webb indicated that a change order could be requested, if additional work is required. There was some discussion about the conflict between Board members wanting to have a specific amount in resolutions when approving contracts versus having to revisit contracts.

Eric Mahler proposed an amendment to the final clause in the resolution.

IT IS RESOLVED, that the Board authorizes the Chief Executive Officer to enter into a two-year contract with two one-year options with Plante & Moran in an amount not-to-exceed \$108,000 over the duration of the contract, **unless as authorized by the Board.**

The friendly amendment was accepted. The amended motion carried. Jack Bernard abstained.

Jack Bernard moved the following resolution with support from Gillian Ream Gainsley.

8.5 **Consideration of Resolution 36/2015 Contract Change Order for Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) Computer Aided Dispatch and Automated Vehicle Locator (CAD-AVL System)**

WHEREAS, The Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) Board of Directors previously approved a contract with Clever Devices LTD for the provision, installation and implementation of a new Computer Aided Dispatch and Automated Vehicle (CAD/AVL) system at an amount not to exceed \$3,617,000 which included 10% contingency, and

WHEREAS, funds to install CAD/AVL on-board equipment were previously included in the first new bus order for fourteen (14) fixed route buses (Resolution 32/2014) awarded to Gillig before the CAD/AVL system was determined at a price of \$325,290, and

WHEREAS, Staff plans for Clever Devices to install new CAD/AVL on the new delivered buses at a lower cost of \$270,615, and

WHEREAS, Staff had been planning for a FY2016 project to implement wireless downloads for on-board videos to improve safety, responsiveness, and significant staff time, at an estimated cost of \$55,000 for a stand-alone system, however an opportunity to incorporate a cost and resource-effective Wireless Download system for on-board videos on Fixed Route buses has arisen through Clever Devices at a cost of \$28,141, and

WHEREAS, applying \$325,390 to the CAD/AVL project and paying for installation of CAD/AVL for fourteen (14) buses plus wireless downloads allows \$26,534 savings to be retained in the project contingency, maintaining 9% contingency for the project, and

WHEREAS, the original CAD/AVL scope included installation on six (6) small buses for

paratransit service owned by AAATA at the time of approval. However AAATA is in the process of acquiring an additional nine (9) small buses for paratransit service requiring CAD/AVL at a cost of \$61,642 and

WHEREAS, the total cost for these 9 small buses including CAD/AVL is within the amount programmed for this purchase in the Capital and Categorical Grant program, and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board authorizes the Chief Executive Officer to authorize a contract change order with Clever Devices LTD at an amount not to exceed \$386,932.

Staff was complimented for their strategic work and due diligence on the CAD/AVL project.

The motion passed unanimously.

Eric Mahler moved the following resolution with support from Eli Cooper.

8.6 Consideration of **Resolution 37/2015 Revision of Community Donations Policy**

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) has an established policy to provide fare media donations, including tokens, passes and scrip coupons to organizations that offer programs and services consistent with the priorities identified by the Washtenaw Community Collaborative and/or the Washtenaw United Way, and

WHEREAS, AAATA Staff have identified the need to update the policy to reflect donation limits consistent with the current fixed route fare and to permanently adjust the annual fare media Match Donation limit to a total of \$2,000, and the Non-Match Donation limit to \$8,000,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the AAATA Board of Directors does hereby agree that the Community Donations Policy be revised in accordance with the staff recommendations, and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the AAATA Board of Directors reserves the right to provide assistance beyond the policy for special circumstances.

Mary Stasiak reported on the Community Donations Program. The Community Donations Program was established and approved by the Board in 2007. The program allows for the donation of fare media to qualifying agencies. The annual allotment is \$10,000 per fiscal year and split 20/80 between Match Funds (up to \$150 per organization) and Non-Match funds (up to \$600 per organization).

Ms. Stasiak reported that Non-Match funds have been depleted with increased acceleration over the past few fiscal years, with the funds exhausted in the first month of the current year. Ms. Stasiak requested an update to the policy to reflect donation

limits consistent with a multiple of the current fixed-route fare and changing the Match donation amount to \$2,000 per year and the Non-Match donation limit to \$8,000 per year. Ms. Stasiak noted that specifying the current fare, as opposed to a specific fare in the policy, will prevent the Board from having to revisit the policy each time there is a fare change.

There was discussion among board members that more clarity may be needed in terms of the direction being sought from the Board with regard to revising the policy. Specifically, whether the resolution needed to include language that a Board committee reviewed the policy.

Eli Cooper moved to amend the resolution as follows:

WHEREAS, the Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority (AAATA) has an established policy to provide fare media donations, including tokens, passes and scrip coupons to organizations that offer programs and services consistent with the priorities identified by the Washtenaw Community Collaborative and/or the Washtenaw United Way, and

WHEREAS, AAATA Staff have identified the need to update the policy to reflect donation limits consistent with the current fixed route fare, ~~and to permanently adjust the annual fare media Match Donation limit to a total of \$2,000, and the Non-Match Donation limit to \$8,000,~~

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the AAATA Board of Directors does hereby agree that the Community Donations Policy be revised in accordance with the staff recommendations, and

~~BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the annual fare media Match Donation limit is set to a total of \$2,000 and the Non-Match Donation limit to \$8,000, and~~

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the AAATA Board of Directors reserves the right to provide assistance beyond the policy for special circumstances.

Ms. Stasiak confirmed that the amendment suggested by Mr. Cooper is consistent with what was taken to the PMER Committee for consideration.

Mr. Mahler accepted the amendment.

There was further discussion about whether it was necessary to specify limits in the resolution as opposed to referring to the actual Policy as being approved by the Board. Ms. Stasiak confirmed that the revised language in the resolution captures the essence of the policy change the Board was being asked to make. Ms. Stasiak indicated that it was imperative that the financial piece of the policy be updated and approved by the Board.

It was noted that 501c3 organizations do not include schools and libraries. Ms. Stasiak indicated that those organizations are covered under the Non-Match portion of the policy.

The amended motion passed unanimously.

10.0 Public Time

Jim Mogensen appeared before the Board. Mr. Mogensen commented on the ARide and Good as Gold service delivery model noting Federal Transit Administration base requirements that AAATA has traditionally exceeded. Mr. Mogensen encouraged the Board to keep the base requirements in mind as the service delivery model changes. Mr. Mogensen commented on the Community Donations Program and suggested outreach to the Office of Community and Economic Development to determine if there is a need, instead of leaving money in the fund at the end of the year. Mr. Mogensen referred to a legal notice issued by Greyhound for FTA 5311(f) Operating and Capital Assistance.

Matt Carpenter referred to Work Plan item 1.03 about the ARide and Good as Gold service delivery model. Mr. Carpenter clarified that the reference speaks to the way in which the service is delivered, and whether it be in-house or contracted. The parameters, level or quality of service should not change simply because of a change in the method of service delivery.

Michelle Barney appeared before the Board. Ms. Barney commented on snow removal in Ypsilanti and the difficulty navigating in snow and ice. Ms. Barney inquired as to whether citizens could help with the snow removal, and with whom she could consult at AAATA. Ms. Barney questioned why NightRide and HolidayRide is different between Ann Arbor and Ypsilanti and asked what can be done to get the service in Ypsilanti. Ms. Barney was appreciative of the A-Ride call-takers conveying accurate information about trip availability.

Carolyn Grawi appeared before the Board. Ms. Grawi was complimentary of the CEO's responsiveness to questions and concerns, and his accessibility to the community. Ms. Grawi commented on reinstatement of the Will Call policy, and questioned ridership statistics noting that there is more service and additional riders which means more competition for rides. Ms. Grawi commented on crowded buses and urged the Board to figure out how to keep expanding service. Ms. Grawi expressed a desire for CIL involvement with pedestrian access in Ypsilanti and discussions about BikeRide. Ms. Grawi requested that programs include consideration for people who use other forms of mobility. Ms. Grawi commented on the accessibility of bus stops in the winter and the need to clear a three foot space at each stop so that the ramp can be deployed. Ms. Grawi urged the Board to continue explore expanding weekend service to include medical facilities and major employers so that people can get to those destinations at all times.

No one further appearing, Mr. Griffith declared Public Time closed.

11.0 Adjourn

Larry Krieg moved to adjourn the meeting with support from Eric Mahler. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 8:48 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Gillian Ream Gainsley, Acting Secretary