

ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Staff Report

ADDRESS: 211 East Ann Street, Application Number HDC15-118

DISTRICT: Fourth/Ann Historic District

REPORT DATE: August 13, 2015

REPORT PREPARED BY: Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator

REVIEW COMMITTEE DATE: August 10, 2015

OWNER	APPLICANT
Name: Peter Bilakos, et. al.	Michael Bruner
Address: 203 E. Ann St. Ann Arbor, MI 48104	539 S. First St. Ann Arbor, MI 48103
Phone: (734) 994-3333	(734) 223-3431

BACKGROUND: This one-story masonry building was built in 1947 and the original occupant was the Symons Bros & Co. Wholesale Grocery. It appears as a motorcycle repair shop on the 1959-1971 Sanborn Map, and has had a variety of other occupants, including a pizza shop in 1971 and, most recently, a fitness studio. The building shares a lot with the 1836 building next door at 201 East Ann Street, which was first occupied by the Bank of Washtenaw. This portion of the lot was vacant prior to this building's construction.

LOCATION: The building is located on the north side of East Ann Street, east of N Fourth Avenue and West Liberty Street and west of the alley running north/south from East Ann Street and Catherine Street between North Fourth Avenue and North Fifth Avenue.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to alter the existing storefront by building up the front parapet, reconfiguring the display windows and recessing the entry door.

APPLICABLE REGULATIONS:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- (9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.



From the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (other SOI Guidelines may also apply):

Storefronts

Recommended: Designing and constructing a new storefront when the historic storefront is completely missing. It may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or be a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, material, and color of the historic building.

Not Recommended: Introducing a new design that is incompatible in size, scale, material, and color.

From the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines (other Guidelines may apply):

Storefronts

Appropriate: Designing and constructing a new storefront when the historic storefront is completely missing. It may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or may be a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, and material of the historic building. New designs should be flush with the façade and be kept as simple as possible.

Not Appropriate: Removing or radically changing storefronts and their features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that the character is diminished.

Signs

Appropriate: Installing signage that is subordinate to the overall building composition.

Not Appropriate: Installing signs that are too large or that are made from a material that is incompatible with the historic building or district.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The concrete masonry unit building has a brick veneer on the front elevation, and very little other architectural detail. The building appears relatively unchanged from a 1971 file photo. It is a non-contributing structure.
2. The proposed changes to the storefront will provide more light into the building and a code-compliant front door. The design is contemporary, though it uses classical elements. Staff does not believe that it will be mistaken for a historic storefront because of the proportions of the windows and door and the busyness of the design. Building the parapet 1'4" higher will give the building a little more presence on East Ann Street without negatively affecting the historic resources nearby.
3. Drawing SK-4 shows a new door on the west elevation leading to a proposed exterior seating area. Details are not provided, but if the door matches the design of the front

door, staff is amenable to allowing more light and another way to exit the building. Staff would review and confirm this at the building permit application stage.

4. Staff believes the modifications to the storefront display windows and entries meet the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines* and the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*.

POSSIBLE MOTIONS: (Note that the motions below are only a suggestion. The Review Committee, consisting of staff and at least two Commissioners, will meet with the applicant on site and then make a recommendation at the meeting.)

I move that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the application at 211 E Ann Street, a contributing property in the Fourth/Ann Historic District, to alter the storefront windows, install a new front door, install a new side door in a new opening, raise the front parapet, and install wood façade detailing, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, in particular standards 2 and 9, and the guidelines for storefronts, as well as the *Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines*, particularly as they pertain to storefronts.

MOTION WORKSHEET:

I move that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work at 211 E Ann Street in the Fourth/Ann Historic District

_____ Provided the following condition(S) is (ARE) met: 1) STATE CONDITION(s)

The work is generally compatible with the size, scale, massing, and materials and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, standard(S) number(S) (*circle all that apply*): 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10

ATTACHMENTS: application, drawings, photos.

211 E Ann Street (applicant's photo, 2015)

