



City of Ann Arbor

Formal Minutes - Final

Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, December 8, 2022

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

Join from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device:

<https://a2gov.zoom.us/j/96536699762?pwd=KzhoREg5eHgyUCtjV0NWY0lhUIMvQT09>

Passcode: 880017

Or join by phone:

Call: 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099

Webinar ID: 965 3669 9762

A. **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson Anna Epperson called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, October 13, 2022, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. The meeting is being held in this mode to protect public health and safety due to the COVID-19 virus and to comply with orders issued by the governor, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services and/or the Washtenaw County Health Department and the City of Ann Arbor. We intend to conduct this meeting similarly to an in-person meeting. However, please be patient if there are technical issues. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 978 6401 4515 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. **ROLL CALL**

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 4 - David Rochlen, Kathryn Fortener, Chair Anna Epperson, and Beverly K Willis

Absent: 3 - Jessica Quijano, Robert White, and Jennifer Ross

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

No comments.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

F. HEARINGS

F-1. [22-1976](#) DUPLICATE

Attachments: 543 Detroit Staff Report - Doors windows dormer.pdf, 543 Detroit Attachments.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Beverly Willis visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Dormer, Slider, Outdoor Lights

Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Kathryn Fortener, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of

the application at 543 Detroit Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to add a shed dormer on the rear of the second floor roof; add a slider with sidelights in a 6” bump out on an exposed rear basement wall; add two coach lights on the rear elevation. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for roofs, windows and lighting and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the Guidelines for roofs and windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:4 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, White, and Ross

Convert Front Door to Window and Rear Windows to Picture Window

Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Beverly Willis, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the portion of the application at 543 Detroit Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to infill a front door with a 2’ 8” x 4’5” casement window with a decorative panel below, and to remove a pair of historic kitchen windows and replace them with a 2’11” by 7’4” picture window on the rear elevation, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for windows and residential doors, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the Guidelines for windows and entrances and porches.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Vote on Convert Front Door to Window and Rear Windows to Picture Window

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion failed. Vote: 0 - 4

Convert Front Door to Window and Rear Windows to Picture Window request DENIED

Yeas: 0

Nays: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and K Willis

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, White, and Ross

F-2. [22-1977](#) HDC22-1206; 425 Second; Trex Deck; OWSHD

Attachments: 425 Second Staff Report - Trex Deck.pdf, Second St Attachments.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Beverly Willis visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathryn Fortener, Seconded by David Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 425 Second Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to demo an existing rear deck and build a new 675 square foot two-level deck as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and

relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for Residential Decks and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 9 and 10 and the Guidelines for District/Neighborhood and Setting.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:4 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, White, and Ross

F-3. [22-1978](#) HDC22-1229; 718 Lawrence, Windows Replaced without Approval; OFWHD

Attachments: 718 Lawrence Staff Report-Replace Windows after the fact.pdf, 718 Lawrence Attachments.pdf, 718 Lawrence Windows December 2022.pdf, Hoskins Support Letter from Lawrence.pdf, Johnson and Whaley.pdf, Support Letter from Miner, Hauff.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Beverly Willis visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beverly Willis, Seconded by David Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 718 Lawrence Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to replace 17 post-1945 wood windows with clad wood windows, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for windows, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 2, 5, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:4 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, White, and Ross

F-4. [22-1979](#) HDC22-1246; 320 S Seventh, Rear Addition; OWSHD

Attachments: 320 S Seventh Staff Report - Addition v2.pdf, 320 S Seventh Attachments.pdf, Support Letter from Maturo.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Beverly Willis visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Shaun Hoskins, co-owner, spoke about previous work they've done on the house as well as their goals with the addition.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Kathryn Fortener, Seconded by David Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 320 South Seventh Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a two-story rear addition that extends behind the existing house and over the rear wing, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site and additions, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for all additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion failed. Vote: 0 - 4

Application DENIED

Yeas: 0

Nays: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and K Willis

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, White, and Ross

F-5. [22-1980](#) HDC22-1248; 818 W Washington; OWSHD

Attachments: 818 W Washington Staff Report - Rear Addition.pdf, 818 W Washington Attachments.pdf, 2022.12.08 Drawing Set.pdf, Original SITE PLAN.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Beverly Willis visited the site as

part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, Seconded by Kathryn Fortener, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 818 W Washington Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a 1 ½ story rear addition and a one-story bumpout on the west side, replace the front porch decking and stairs with matching materials and dimensions, install a new asphalt roof and three new skylights, add a new attic window in a new opening in the rear gable, and remove the brick chimney, on the following condition: that the graspable handrail is wood. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, in particular the guidelines for new additions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:4 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, White, and Ross

F-6. [22-1981](#) HDC22-1249; 118 W Liberty, Storefront Windows; OWSHD

Attachments: 118 W Liberty Staff Report-Storefront Windows-rev.pdf,
118 W Liberty Attachments.pdf

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Anna Epperson and Beverly Willis visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was available to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Beverly Willis, Seconded by David Rochlen, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 118 West Liberty Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to replace three mullioned storefront display windows with a wood four-sash folding window system, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for storefronts.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, White, and Ross

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:4 – 0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 4 - Vice Chair Rochlen, Fortener, Chair Epperson, and K Willis

Nays: 0

Absent: 3 - Secretary Quijano, White, and Ross

G. NEW BUSINESS

G-1. [22-1983](#) 2023 HDC Meeting Calendar

Attachments: 2023 HDC MEETING SCHEDULE-DRAFT.pdf

The Commission suggested an asterisk be added after August 17th date on the public calendar.

Moved by Kathryn, Seconded by Beverly Willis, to Approve the Historic District Commission Meeting Schedule, as presented.

H. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

H-1. [22-1984](#) October 13, 2022 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes

Attachments: 2023-10-13 HDC Approved Minutes.pdf

The October 13, 2022 Historic District Commission meeting minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission and forwarded to City Council.

I. REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS

J. ASSIGNMENTS

J-1. Review Committee: Monday, January 9, 2023 at 12 Noon for the Thursday, January 12, 2023 Regular Meeting

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and David Rochlen volunteered for the Monday, January 9, 2023 HDC Review Committee.

K. REPORTS FROM STAFF

Jill Thacher provided a verbal report on permit applications, noting that she is hoping the new STREAM software will be able to be configured to provide monthly reports on all HDC applications/staff reviews that are received.

She reported that the Service Unit has a new Deputy Planning Manager, Hank Kelley.

She reported that the Michigan Historic Conference will be held May 10 -13, 2023 on Mackinac Island this year, and if any HDC members are interested in attending they should let Thacher know as soon as possible. She explained she would check if there was any available funding to assist with travel costs to attend this conference.

L. CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Commissioners requested further discussion on the possibility of Braun Court becoming a Historic District, as they would like to support this suggestion. They asked for Braun Court to be placed on the next HDC agenda in January 2023.

Thacher would provide the Commission with any further information she has as it relates to Braun Court.

M. COMMUNICATIONS

M-1. [22-1975](#) Communication to HDC

Attachments: Tabaczka re Braun Court.pdf, Support Letter from Lawrence.pdf, Support Letter from Maturo.pdf, Support Letter from Miner, Hauff.pdf, Johnson and Whaley.pdf, 718 Lawrence Windows December 2022.pdf

Received and Filed

N. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:30 pm.

Anna Epperson, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Mia Gale, Administrative Assistant

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.