



City of Ann Arbor
Formal Minutes - Draft
Historic District Commission

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

Thursday, October 12, 2023

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council Chambers

This meeting will be broadcast live on CTN Cable Channel 16, ATT Channel 99, and online at a2gov.org/watchCTN

To speak at public comment call 206-337-9723 or 213-338-8477 or Toll Free 877-853-5247 or 888-788-0099 Enter Meeting ID: 965 3669 9762

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson David Rochlen called the meeting to order at 7:03 pm stating:

Welcome to the Thursday, October 12, 2023, in-person and electronic (hybrid) meeting of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. Public comment will be via in-person, via Zoom or via telephone. To speak during any of the public comment opportunities please call 877-853-5247 (Toll Free) or 213-338-8477 and enter meeting ID 965 3669 9762 This information is also available on the published agenda, in the public notices section of the city website, and on the broadcast of this meeting on CTN channel 16, AT&T channel 99, and online at www.a2gov.org/watchctn.

B. ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll

Present: 5 - Chair David Rochlen, Jessica Quijano, Kathryn Fortener, Jennifer Ross, and Benjamin Calderon

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented.

D. PUBLIC COMMENT - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

No speakers.

FOR ZOOM PARTICIPANTS, PHONE CALLERS CAN PRESS *9 TO RAISE HANDS AND *6 TO UNMUTE THEIR PHONES WHEN CALLED UPON TO SPEAK.

E. **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

None.

F. **HEARINGS**

F-1. **23-1697** HDC23-0173; 204 N Fourth Ave, Front Yard Patio; FAHD

Attachments: 204 N Fourth Staff Report-Patio.pdf, 204 N Fourth Attachments Patio.pdf

HEARINGS:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and Jessica Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The applicant was not present to respond to the Commission’s enquiries. Noting no speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Fortener seconded by Commissioner Quijano that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 204 N Fourth Ave, a contributing property in the Fourth/Ann Historic District, to install a 13’ x 21’ paver patio in front of the building at the southwest corner of the site, abutting the

public right-of-way, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for District or Neighborhood Setting, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to Residential Decks and Patios, All New Construction and New Construction in Historic Residential Settings.

On a roll call vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, and Calderon

Nays: 0

F-2. [23-1698](#) HDC23-0175; 215 S Main, Rebuild and Addition; MSHD

Attachments: 215 S Main Staff Report-Rooftop Add-10-23.pdf, 215 South Main Attachments.pdf

HEARINGS:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and Jessica Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please

see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Quijano seconded by Commissioner Ross that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 215-217 South Main Street, a contributing property in the Main Street Historic District, to demolish all but the front façade and side walls and east two story wall of the existing building and construct a new five story building within those walls on the following conditions; that the two story east elevation on the alley is retained in it's current form, that the new rear additions are differentiated by materials, and that final drawings are approved by staff for consistencies with these conditions and the list of additional required information presented by staff in the October 12 presentation. Further, the referenced drawings were received by staff on October 11, 2023. As conditioned the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, especially for additions to commercial buildings, new construction, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, 5, 6, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for alterations/additions for a new use, additions, district or neighborhood setting, building site, masonry, and setting.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion denied. Vote: 0-5.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Denied.

Yeas: 0

Nays: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, and Calderon

F-3. [23-1699](#) HDC23-0177; 331 E Ann, Rear Addition; OFWHD

Attachments: 331 E Ann Staff Report-Addition.pdf, 331 E Ann Attachments.pdf

HEARINGS:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and Jessica Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Quijano seconded by Commissioner Calderon that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 331 East Ann Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to add a second-floor addition on top of an existing single story rear wing and a single-story addition behind the rear wing. The work includes replacing a non-historic side door, changing a window into a door on the rear porch, new aluminum storm windows, installing several basement egress windows and skylights, and formalizing four gravel parking spaces. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions, roofs and windows, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, landscaping features, roofs, porches, doors, paved areas, and mechanical equipment.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, and Calderon

Nays: 0

F-4. [23-1700](#) HDC23-0178; 526 Detroit St, Addition and Garage Alteration; OFWHD

Attachments: 526 Detroit Staff Report-addition ADU.pdf, 526 Detroit Attachments addition adu.pdf

HEARINGS:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Kathy Fortener and Jessica Quijano visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

The Applicant was present to respond to the Commission's enquiries. Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Quijano seconded by Commissioner Calderon that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 526 Detroit Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to add to the house 185 square foot and 135 square foot rear additions, a composite privacy fence, and a condenser, infill a historic rear door opening maintaining the exterior trim and add four skylights; also, to convert the noncontributing garage into an accessory dwelling unit and install a patio. As proposed, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10 and the guidelines for building site, additions, roofs and

windows, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for all additions, residential additions, landscaping features, roofs, doors and mechanical equipment.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0.

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, and Calderon

Nays: 0

G. NEW BUSINESS

G-1. [23-1701](#) 1003 West Liberty Street; Application for Historic Marker

Attachments: 1003 W Liberty Historic Marker Plaque Application.pdf, 18800213 Initial Purfield Purchase.pdf, 19080620 Purfield to Russell.pdf

STAFF PRESENTATION:

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

Moved by Commissioner Ross seconded by Commissioner Fortener that the Historic District Commission approve the plaque proposed for 1003 West Liberty Street, a historic marker plaque application for the property.

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0.

Yeas: 5 - Chair Rochlen, Vice Chair Quijano, Secretary Fortener, Ross, and Calderon

Nays: 0

H. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- H-1. [23-1702](#) September 14, 2023 Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes
No minutes were presented.

I. **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

None.

J. **ASSIGNMENTS**

- J-1. **Review Committee: Monday, November 6, 2023 at noon, for the Thursday, November 9, 2023 Regular Meeting**
Commissioners Jessica Quijano and David Rochlen volunteered for the Monday, November 6, 2023 HDC Review Committee.

K. **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

Chair Rochlen questioned an email received. City Planner Jill Thacher suggested reading the section regarding preservation as the Secretary of Interior has updated some of their standards for alternate materials.

Chair Rochlen questioned an email received from City mentioning and Old Fourth Ward reclassifying. Historic District Coordinator Jill Thacher gave an update on the Old Fourth Ward Kick Off Meeting.

L. **CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

None.

M. **COMMUNICATIONS**

- M-1. [23-1703](#) Various Communications to the HDC
None.

N. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 10:30 pm.

David Rochlen, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner

Mia Gale, Administrative Assistant
Courtney Manor, Administrative Assistant

Please note it is possible that telephone or electronic public comment may encounter technical difficulties that prevent your participation. For the greatest assurance that your comments will be heard, submit them in writing ahead of the meeting or attend in person.

These meetings are typically broadcast on Ann Arbor Community Television Network Comcast 16 / AT&T 99 live, and recent meetings can also be streamed online from the CTN Video On Demand page of the City's website <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>.

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at <https://a2gov.org/watchctn>, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.