

City of Ann Arbor

301 E. Huron Street
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
<http://a2gov.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>



Meeting Minutes - Final

Thursday, September 12, 2019

7:00 PM

Larcom City Hall, 301 E Huron St, Second floor, City Council
Chambers

Historic District Commission

A CALL TO ORDER

Chair John Beeson called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

B ROLL CALL

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher called the roll.

Present: 6 - Robert White, John Beeson, Evan Hall, David Rochlen, Anna Epperson, and Jessica Quijano

C APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was unanimously approved as presented. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

D AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION - (3 Minutes per Speaker)

E UNFINISHED BUSINESS

F HEARINGS

F-1 19-1715 HDC19-142 542 Fourth Street; 2-Track Driveway; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the

application at 542 Fourth Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to install a two-track driveway, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding resources and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Guidelines for paved areas and landscape features, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 1, 2, and 10, and the guidelines for building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

F-2 **19-1716** HDC19-153 448 Fifth Street; Solar Panels; OWSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Jessica Quijano, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 448 Fifth Street, a contributing property in the Old

West Side Historic District, to install a black-on-black solar array on the south-facing roof, on the condition that panels are parallel to the roof and no more than 8" from the roof surface. The work, as conditioned, is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs, energy efficiency, and mechanical systems, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to solar installations.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the amended motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

F-3 **19-1717** HDC19-159 332 E William; Radon Unit; WSHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by John Beeson, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 332 East William Street, a contributing structure in the East William Historic District, to install a radon mitigation unit on the west side of the building, with the following conditions: that the entire radon unit is painted to match the brick color, and that it is not located farther north than the seam where the decorative brick and the common brick meet and that all fasteners will be mounted through mortar joints, not masonry units. As conditioned, the work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the building and the surrounding area and meets The City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for mechanical equipment, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10, and the guidelines for mechanical systems.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the amended motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

F-4 [19-1719](#) HDC19-161 346 E Kingsley; Skylight; OFWHD

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Evan Hall, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 346 E Kingsley Street, a contributing property in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District, to install a skylight on the south-facing roof, as proposed. The work is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for roofs, windows, and building site, as well as the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines, particularly as they pertain to windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 6-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 6 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

F-5 **19-1720** HDC19-167 421 W Jefferson; Rear Addition; OWSHD

Commissioner David Rochlen recused himself due to a possible conflict of interest.

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and John Beeson visited the site as part

of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by Evan Hall, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 421 W Jefferson Street, a contributing property in the Old West Side Historic District, to construct a single-story, 370 square foot addition on a crawl space. The work as proposed is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, materials, and relationship to the house and the surrounding area and meets the City of Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for All Additions, and The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 2, 9 and 10 and the guidelines for New Additions, District or Neighborhood Setting, Building Site, and Windows.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote:5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Epperson, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Recused: 1 - Rochlen

F-6 [19-1721](#) HDC19-168 613-619 E William; Storefronts; SSHD

Commissioner Anna Epperson recused herself due to a possible conflict of interest.

Historic District Coordinator and City Planner Jill Thacher presented the staff report. [See attached in agenda packet]

REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Commissioners Jessica Quijano and John Beeson visited the site as part of their review. They reported their findings and recommendations to the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING:

Applicants were present to explain the application and to respond to enquiries from the Commission.

Noting no further speakers, the Chair declared the public hearing closed.

Moved by David Rochlen, seconded by Bob White, that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 613-619 E William Street, a contributing property in the East William Historic District to install new storefronts along the extent of the two-story building, and replace a side door facing East William Street on 342 S State, in the existing opening, on the following condition: that sign lighting is limited to: two fixtures on the signs on 613 and 619, one on 617, and none on the two bracket signs. The work as conditioned is compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets the Ann Arbor Historic District Design Guidelines for storefronts, windows, and signs, and The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, in particular standards 1, 2, and 9 and the guidelines for storefronts, windows, and building site.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commission took into consideration the presented application and discussed the matter. [For a complete record of the discussion, please see available video format]

On a voice vote, the vote was as follows with the Chair declaring the motion carried. Vote: 5-0

Certificate of Appropriateness was Granted.

Yeas: 5 - White, Chair Beeson, Secretary Hall, Rochlen, and Quijano

Nays: 0

Recused: 1 - Epperson

G **NEW BUSINESS**

H **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

[19-1722](#) Historic District Commission Meeting Minutes of August 15, 2019

Without objection, the meeting minutes of the August 15, 2019 Historic District Commission, were approved. On a voice vote, the Chair declared the motion carried.

I **REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

J **ASSIGNMENTS**

Review Committee: Monday, October 7, 2019 (at Noon) for the October 10, 2019 Regular Meeting

Anna Epperson and Dave Rochlen volunteered for the October HDC Review Committee, meeting at noon.

K **REPORTS FROM STAFF**

[19-1723](#) August 2019 HDC Staff Activities

Received and Filed

L **CONCERNS OF COMMISSION**

M **COMMUNICATIONS**

[19-1724](#) Various Communications to the HDC

Received and Filed

N **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 9:13 p.m.

Community Television Network Channel 16 live televised public meetings are also available to watch live online from CTN's website, www.a2gov.org/ctn, on "The Meeting Place" page (<http://www.a2gov.org/livemeetings>).

The complete record of this meeting is available in video format at www.a2gov.org/ctn, or is available for a nominal fee by contacting CTN at (734) 794-6150.

John Beeson, Chairperson
Jill Thacher, HDC Staff Coordinator/Planner
mg/